

Citizen Participation and Public Petitions Committee  
Wednesday 9 October 2024  
15th Meeting, 2024 (Session 6)

## PE2105: Safeguard Scottish Listed Buildings at risk of unnecessary demolition

### Introduction

**Petitioner** Lydia Franklin on behalf of SAVE Britain's Heritage

**Petition summary** Calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Government to set a minimum evidence requirement to prevent unnecessary use of emergency public safety powers to demolish listed buildings.

**Webpage** <https://petitions.parliament.scot/petitions/PE2105>

1. This is a new petition that was lodged on 6 June 2024.
2. A full summary of this petition and its aims can be found at **Annexe A**.
3. A SPICe briefing has been prepared to inform the Committee's consideration of the petition and can be found at **Annexe B**.
4. Every petition collects signatures while it remains under consideration. At the time of writing, 3,489 signatures have been received on this petition.
5. The Committee seeks views from the Scottish Government on all new petitions before they are formally considered.
6. The Committee has received submissions from the Scottish Government and the Petitioner which are set out in **Annexe C** of this paper.

### Action

7. The Committee is invited to consider what action it wishes to take.

**Clerks to the Committee**  
**October 2024**

## **Annexe A: Summary of petition**

### **PE2105: Safeguard Scottish Listed Buildings at risk of unnecessary demolition**

#### **Petitioner**

Lydia Franklin on behalf of SAVE Britain's Heritage

#### **Date Lodged**

6 June 2024

#### **Petition summary**

Calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Government to set a minimum evidence requirement to prevent unnecessary use of emergency public safety powers to demolish listed buildings.

#### **Background information**

The emergency powers in the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 can, in our view, allow for the demolition of listed buildings without sufficient evidence to justify the decision. This is in conflict with planning safeguards in the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997. The following policy controls are needed to address this loophole in legislation and to ensure listed buildings (LBs) are not exposed to unjust demolition:

1. Enhanced policy guidance on the minimum evidence and processes required by local authorities before making decisions on the demolition of LBs under emergency powers.
2. A mandatory policy requirement for local authorities to engage with conservation accredited engineers in all cases involving LBs.

## Annexe B: SPICe briefing on PE2105



### Brief overviews of the issues raised in the petition

**Listed buildings:** [Historic Environment Scotland](#) (HES), working on behalf of Scottish Ministers, maintains a list of historic buildings which are deemed worthy of statutory protection from unauthorised alteration, extension or demolition where this would affect their character as a building of special architectural or historic interest.

The term “building” is very broadly defined and can include structures as diverse as bridges, walls, pillar boxes, chimneys, statues, war memorials and mile posts. Listing always covers both the interior and exterior of a building.

To be listed, a building need not be functioning for the purpose for which it was originally intended: for example, a church may be listed even though it has been converted to a block of flats or a pub. Similarly, a building’s state of repair is not normally a relevant factor in HES’s consideration of its architectural interest or historical association. It only becomes a factor when the building’s condition has devalued the particular architectural or historic interest to the degree that it can no longer be regarded as special.

**Demolition of listed buildings:** Anyone wishing to demolish a listed building must first obtain listed building consent from the relevant planning authority, in addition to any other consents required for demolition.

Separate from the listed building system, local authorities are required by law to intervene where a building presents a danger to people in or about that building; to the public generally; or to adjacent buildings or places. A local authority must carry out work to prevent access to the dangerous building and any other areas that are in danger due to the state of the building. Where the authority considers that urgent action is needed to remove or reduce any danger, it can carry out any necessary work to the building. This can include demolition. Such action can be carried out without first obtaining the usual statutory consents.

The process to be followed by a local authority when dealing with a potentially dangerous building is set out in Chapter 10 of the [Scottish Building Standards Procedural Handbook](#). Where a building is of a historic nature, the Handbook states that the local authority should consult Scottish Ministers, HES, the planning authority, and other relevant parties. Where time critical action needs to be taken, which precludes such consultation, the guidance states that:

“It is however still good practice to limit the action taken in relation to a historic building to the minimum needed to protect the public until the proper consultations have taken place.”

## **Government Action**

The Scottish Government has not recently considered any changes to the system for managing dangerous buildings.

## **Scottish Parliament Action**

To date, the Scottish Parliament has not considered this issue in any detail.

**Alan Rehfish**  
**Senior Researcher**  
12 June 2024

SPICe research specialists are not able to discuss the content of petition briefings with petitioners or other members of the public. However, if you have any comments on any petition briefing you can email us at [spice@parliament.scot](mailto:spice@parliament.scot)

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in petition briefings is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware however that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Published by the Scottish Parliament Information Centre (SPICe), an office of the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

## **Annexe C: Written submissions**

### **Scottish Government submission, 8 July 2024**

#### **PE2105/A: Safeguard Scottish Listed Buildings at risk of unnecessary demolition**

I have considered the issues raised by the petition and information is provided below on the building standards system in Scotland including enforcement powers for local authorities to take action on dangerous buildings under the Building (Scotland) Act 2003.

#### **The building standards system**

The building standards system in Scotland is established by the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 (the Act). The system is pre-emptive and is designed to check that proposals meet building regulations. The main principles of the system are that a warrant must be obtained before work commences on site and a completion certificate is accepted by a verifier if, after undertaking reasonable inquiry, they are satisfied the building work meets the building regulations, prior to the building being occupied.

The thirty two local authorities in Scotland are appointed by Scottish Ministers as verifiers to administer the building standards system for their own geographic area. Verifiers undertake independent checks of buildings at design stage and carry out reasonable inquiry during construction prior to accepting a completion certificate.

The purpose of the building standards system is to protect the public interest. It is not intended to provide protection to a client in a contract with a builder. The system is intended to ensure that building work on both new and existing buildings results in buildings that meet the standards, which are set out in building regulations.

The owner or developer is reliant on other professionals (design/construction) to assure them that the work meets building regulations. Building owners are ultimately responsible for the ongoing safety of their own buildings.

#### **Local Authority Enforcement Powers**

Building owners are responsible for preventing their buildings falling into a dangerous condition. Should a local authority become aware of a building, which includes a wall, that constitutes a danger to persons about it, or to the public generally, then it has a duty to act under section 29 of the Building (Scotland) Act 2003.

The Act gives local authorities a range of enforcement powers. Local authorities can take enforcement action to deal with buildings they consider to be defective or dangerous. They can serve a notice, and carry out work if the notice is not met, undertake emergency work on dangerous buildings, and recover their costs.

When a local authority considers a building to be dangerous it has a duty to act and it is expected that it will respond immediately. This might include taking urgent action

to carry out work, including demolition, as it considers necessary to reduce or remove the danger.

Alternatively where the local authority considers that other urgent action is needed to reduce or remove the danger it may, after giving the owner such notice (if any) as the circumstances permit, carry out the necessary work, or prevent access to any adjacent parts of a road or public place which appear to be at risk.

Where the local authority carries out the work they can recover the associated costs from the relevant owners.

It is for the local authority to determine the most appropriate course of action, taking into account the particular circumstances of each case. The satisfactory management of dangerous building incidents by local authorities is essentially the result of appropriate risk assessment. Each dangerous building case should be dealt with on its own merits, as the local authority considers necessary.

It is not possible for guidance to be specific about the approach required when the instances of dangerous buildings are unique and require a risk-based approach to determining the appropriate action. There are a considerable number of factors which can influence the approach to be taken, examples include:

- the nature and/or severity of the danger (structural decay or damage, fire damage, impact damage, missing building safety features, loose parts of building elements or building fixtures, sudden subsidence, etc..)
- the physical proportions and nature of the building (low-rise, medium-rise, high-rise, spire or tower, viaduct, etc..)
- the geographical location (city centre, rural, remote, etc..)
- the location of the danger (internal only, internal but could affect whole building, external affecting curtilage of building, external affecting a public area, ease of accessibility to do the emergency work etc..)
- the extent of the danger (several affected buildings, only one building or part of building affected, several parts of one building element, or just one part etc..)
- the persons at risk from the danger (general public passing by, building occupiers, unauthorised persons frequenting the building etc..)
- the time of year and/or day (school holidays, public holidays, night time, rush hour etc..)
- the building owner(s) (finding the owner(s), the number of owners, the owner's willingness to recognise danger and resolve matters, the financial/construction resources available to the owner etc..)
- the building occupier(s) (the occupier's willingness to recognise danger, need to temporarily rehouse occupiers, disruption to occupier's business etc..)

- the attendance of other statutory bodies at or permanent surveillance of, the dangerous building (police, fire service, security guards, etc..)
- the availability of emergency contractors (demand for other emergency repairs, public holidays etc..)
- the local weather forecast (high winds, flooding, period of calm etc..).

Local authorities are autonomous bodies whose powers are set out in statute and are entirely separate from the Scottish Government. As long as they act lawfully, it is the responsibility of each local authority to manage its day-to-day business appropriately. Scottish Ministers do not have general powers that would enable them to call on a local authority to account for its action.

### **Consultation for historic and listed buildings**

Section 35 of the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 sets out consultation requirements and limitations for buildings under the following categories:

- scheduled ancient monuments
- listed buildings
- buildings subject to preservation orders, and
- those buildings in conservation areas subject to control of demolition

Ancient monuments are those included in the schedule of monuments compiled and maintained under section 1 of the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979. Listed buildings are those included in a list of buildings of special architectural or historic interest compiled or approved under section 1 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, preservation notices are under section 3 of that Act and control of demolition of unlisted buildings in conservation areas is under section 66 of that Act.

Before serving a notice that requires work (including demolition) in relation to a type of building defined above there must be consultation with Historic Environment Scotland, the planning authority (where this is not the local authority) and anyone else the local authority consider necessary. Where the planning authority is within the same local authority there should still be a properly recorded consultation.

However, where a dangerous building notice is to be served, or urgent work is needed to remove a danger, consultation must be carried out only “if reasonably practicable”. This is intended to cover problems requiring immediate action necessary to reduce or remove a danger; in these instances the relevant authorities should be notified subsequently of any such action.

In these instances the relevant authorities should be notified subsequently of any such action as soon as possible. Works undertaken without prior consultation should be limited to the minimum necessary needed to protect the public until the proper consultations have taken place and any necessary consents sought.

There is also an important limitation on the notices. The effect of the notices on a person required to do work is restricted to work that is not inconsistent with any provisions of the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 or the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, i.e. that where the works required by the notice are of a nature that would normally require listed building consent, conservation area consent or scheduled monument consent, that requirement is not affected or removed by the provisions of section 35 of the Act. Even if there has been prior consultation on the serving of the notice, the relevant consents would still be required before carrying out works.

When looking to establish if the affected building is of a type to which section 35 applies, local planning authorities hold GIS data on designated and non-designated historic environment assets, and this should always be the first port of call to determine whether or not a building falls under the requirements of section 35.

I suggest that the existing powers contained in building standards legislation, relevant supporting guidance, and the consultative approach taken by local authorities as part of their enforcement duties, are sufficient to ensure appropriate safeguards are in place to protect listed buildings from unnecessary demolition.

### **Published guidance**

The Scottish Government, through Building Standards Division, publishes guidance which local authorities can refer to when making decisions on dangerous buildings and taking enforcement action. These publications include the [Procedural Handbook](#) updated in 2024 and the [Enforcement Handbook](#) first edition published in 2023.

### **Building Standards Division**

### **Petitioner written submission, 29 August 2024**

#### **PE2105/B: Safeguard Scottish Listed Buildings at risk of unnecessary demolition**

I thank the Scottish Government for its written submission considering petition **PE2105: Safeguard Scottish Listed Buildings at risk of unnecessary demolition**. We set out below new information and clarification on our petition.

SAVE Britain's Heritage fully recognises the paramount importance of making dangerous buildings safe, as established by the Building (Scotland) Act 2003. We further recognise that the provisions of Section 35 of the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 do not remove the requirements of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

Petition PE2105 seeks to address a loophole in legislation that allows a council to demolish listed buildings under Section 29 of the Building (Scotland) Act 2003 without providing sufficient evidence to justify their actions.

Section 35 of the Act requires a local authority to consult the below persons before serving a dangerous buildings notice or carrying out works on a historic building:



- Historic Environment Scotland
- The planning authority (where the planning authority is not the local authority)
- Such other persons as the local authority thinks fit

It is set out within the *Building Standards Procedural Handbook* (2024) para 10.3.2, that when serving a dangerous building notice or carrying out urgent work under section 29(3) of the Act prior to consultation, it is good practice to limit the action taken in relation to a historic building to the **minimum needed** to protect the public until proper consultations have taken place.

In order to adhere with Section 35 of the Act, the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 and good practice as set out in para 10.3.2 of the *Building Standards Procedural Handbook* (2024), enhanced guidance is needed to set out the minimum structural evidence and processes required before undertaking demolition works to listed buildings on public safety grounds, including consulting national heritage advisor Historic Environment Scotland.

Appropriate consultation should include the expertise of a conservation accredited structural engineer to determine the *minimum* works necessary to a listed building to protect the public and to advise on the necessary measures to make a listed building safe which avoids excessive or total demolition.

In cases where immediate action is taken on a dangerous building, the necessary consents, including listed building consent as required by the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997, must be sought. Whilst we fully acknowledge the importance of works for public safety, the use of retrospective listed building consent for emergency works which carry out excessive or total demolition sets an alarming precedent for listed buildings in Scotland. Seeking retrospective listed building consent as a normal and accepted procedure removes the control the planning system has over the emergency measures taken, such as instances where works would have been refused.

We appreciate that instances of dangerous buildings are unique and require a risk-based approach to determine the appropriate action. However, we do not consider that this prevents the publication of additional guidance on the provision of the appropriate expertise when assessing a dangerous building. On the contrary, the unique nature of historic buildings benefits from a case-by-case approach as determined by specialist examination.

Under the current system, historic buildings are being needlessly and excessively demolished under emergency safety powers. [SAVE Britain's Heritage](#) has encountered this in our recent and active campaigning to protect a historic listed building in Scotland. We consider that enhanced guidance on the appropriate expertise to assess historic buildings is of the utmost importance to ensure local authorities adhere to the legislation and guidance set out above.

I ask that you keep me informed of further decisions or consultations regarding this petition.