



OFFICIAL REPORT  
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

DRAFT

# Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 18 June 2024

Session 6



The Scottish Parliament  
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - [www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

---

**Tuesday 18 June 2024**

**CONTENTS**

	<b>Col.</b>
<b>TIME FOR REFLECTION</b> .....	1
<b>BUSINESS MOTION</b> .....	3
<i>Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn]—and agreed to.</i>	
<i>Amendment moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and disagreed to.</i>	
Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con) .....	3
The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn) .....	5
<b>TOPICAL QUESTION TIME</b> .....	11
Home Energy Scotland Grant and Loan Scheme .....	11
Dental Provision (Greenock and Inverclyde) .....	14
<b>BUSINESS MOTION</b> .....	17
<i>Motion moved—[Jamie Hepburn]—and agreed to.</i>	
<b>AGRICULTURE AND RURAL COMMUNITIES (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3</b> .....	18
<b>AGRICULTURE AND RURAL COMMUNITIES (SCOTLAND) BILL</b> .....	177
<i>Motion moved—[Mairi Gougeon].</i>	
The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands (Mairi Gougeon) .....	177
Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con) .....	180
Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab) .....	182
Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green) .....	184
Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD) .....	185
Elena Whitham (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP) .....	187
Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con) .....	189
Richard Leonard (Central Scotland) (Lab) .....	191
Ariane Burgess .....	192
Colin Smyth (South Scotland) (Lab) .....	194
Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con) .....	195
Mairi Gougeon .....	197
<b>PARLIAMENTARY BUREAU MOTIONS</b> .....	200
<i>Motions moved—[Jamie Hepburn].</i>	
<b>DECISION TIME</b> .....	202

---



# Scottish Parliament

*Tuesday 18 June 2024*

*[The Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]*

## Time for Reflection

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):** Good afternoon. The first item of business is time for reflection. Our time for reflection leader today is Bilal Wardak.

**Bilal Wardak:** Good afternoon.

I am Bilal Wardak, and I am honoured to be here today at the Scottish Parliament. Three years ago, my family and I moved to Scotland from Afghanistan, seeking a fresh start.

Before arriving here in Scotland, I spent decades working within the conflict zones of Afghanistan, striving to bring stability and peace to my people and nation. I held senior roles within law enforcement and the European Union police mission in Afghanistan, and I also worked as a senior political adviser for the Foreign, Commonwealth and Development Office of the United Kingdom in Kabul. Currently, I serve as a community councillor in Inverclyde, and I assist refugees in various parts of Scotland.

Reflecting on my journey, I would say that leaving one's homeland is never easy. I lost my home, village, garden, job, relatives and friends. It is a journey filled with uncertainty, hope and resilience. Scotland warmly welcomed us, for which we are deeply grateful. Speaking as someone who is ethnically Pashtun, I can say that values such as hospitality, honesty, integrity and welcoming guests hold great importance in our culture. During my three years here in Scotland, I have witnessed the strength and spirit of the Scottish people. It is a community that values solidarity, compassion and inclusivity.

As we all know, our world faces numerous challenges, from conflicts and displacement to social and economic inequalities. However, in difficult times, the true character of a community shines through. In Scotland, I see a dedication to bridging divides, fostering understanding and creating a society where everyone can thrive. In this world filled with conflicts and uncertainties, global leaders and politicians must stand together to bring peace and stability, making this small world, or global village, peaceful for everyone.

As we gather for this time for reflection, I urge us all to embrace the diversity that enriches our nations. Let us continue to support those who seek refuge and new beginnings, just as Scotland

has supported my family and me. Together, let us work towards making our communities places of safety, hope and opportunities for all.

In closing, I would like to share a Pashto proverb that has guided me through many challenges: "Pa Yawa Gul na Pasrlay Kegi"—"A single flower does not bring spring." It reminds us that, together, we can create a brighter future.

Thank you for allowing me to share my reflections with you today, and kind regards.

## Business Motion

14:03

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-13692, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme.

*Motion moved,*

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 18 June 2024—

delete

8.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

and insert

7.30 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 19 June 2024—

delete

*followed by* Stage 3 Debate: Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill

delete

6.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

5.00 pm Decision Time—[*Jamie Hepburn.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Meghan Gallacher to speak to and move amendment S6M-13692.1.

14:03

**Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con):**

On 8 May this year, the Scottish Conservatives held a debate on gender identity services for children and young people and the Cass review. Every party except the Scottish Greens voted for an update from the Scottish Government on the Cass review before summer recess. The Scottish Conservatives voted in good faith that the matter would be taken seriously, so as to support vulnerable children and young people experiencing gender distress in Scotland, yet here we are, with only six sitting days to go, and there has been no update from the Scottish Government.

I give the kindly reminder that I requested a ministerial statement, which has yet again been refused by the Scottish National Party. This time, the excuse was purdah rules. That makes no sense whatsoever.

An update on the Cass review was promised before the general election was called, and we have heard nothing from the Scottish Government since. The matter of national health service

services for children who are experiencing gender distress is, of course, devolved to Scotland. At no point has the minister approached the Opposition to advise us why the update would not take place before summer recess.

Children, young people and families do not have the time to wait. Child and adolescent mental health services waiting lists are through the roof, young people with gender distress are waiting years for an appointment, and there are currently no measures in place to ensure that children who receive support at gender clinics are receiving the right care and psychological support. That simply is not good enough.

**Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab):** Is it not correct that the motion that the Parliament agreed to also requested a timeline for getting at the great delay in support that our young people are facing? In addition, the motion sought the publication of documents. Neither of those issues can be affected by the purdah rules, because they sit with the Scottish Government.

**Meghan Gallacher:** Martin Whitfield is absolutely spot on. This is about getting the right care and support for young people.

The parties that voted with the Scottish Government on the issue back on 8 May did so in good faith. Since that debate, I have held an event in the Parliament with families who have been impacted by gender clinics in Scotland. Their testimonies are heartbreaking, and they deserve to know what the Government will do to support them.

All the while, we have heard rumblings from media reports that a new NHS child gender service will be set up in Scotland. However, that does not appear to be a balanced approach. That is why we need an update in Parliament. Young people, children, families and parents need to know what is going on and what the next steps will be. They need to know how the Scottish Government will address the serious concerns that are being raised and how it will reassure everyone that it will take a scientific and evidence-based approach.

I understand that some items cannot be discussed because of the on-going election; I am certain that all MSPs understand that. However, it is imperative for the Scottish Government to share with members what correspondence the Minister for Parliamentary Business has had with the relevant portfolio holders and to explain on the record why an update cannot be given to the Parliament. Otherwise, the update that Parliament voted for and which families have been calling for will be yet another broken promise of the Scottish National Party Government.

I move amendment S6M-13692.1, to insert at end:

“(c) Thursday 20 June 2024—

after

*followed by* Stage 3 Proceedings: Gender Representation on Public Boards (Amendment) (Scotland) Bill

insert

*followed by* Ministerial Statement: Applying the Cass Review Recommendations to Scotland

delete

4.25 pm Decision Time

and insert

4.55 pm Decision Time”.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Jamie Hepburn to respond on the Parliamentary Bureau’s behalf.

14:07

**The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn):** Presiding Officer, as I set out in writing to you and other party business managers yesterday, I do not intend to schedule a ministerial statement on the applicability of the Cass review recommendations for NHS Scotland this week. In line with the request that Ms Gallacher has just made, I am more than happy to make that letter public with the agreement of other business managers; I have no problem in doing so.

The work of the multidisciplinary team on the recommendations of the Cass review in the context of services in Scotland has not yet concluded. I am able to update Parliament that ministers are informed that activity is well advanced, and the multidisciplinary team is expected to provide a draft report to the chief medical officer shortly. Ministers have not yet had sight of the work that has been done and cannot therefore comment on its findings at this time. I made that point in the letter that I referred to, and I think that any reasonable person would surely recognise that that means that no meaningful update can be provided by ministers at this time.

**Meghan Gallacher:** Why, then, did the Government promise that an update would be provided before summer recess? If the Government makes that promise, it cannot go back on its word.

**Jamie Hepburn:** I was about to come to that point. The commitment was made in good faith, but it was made before the United Kingdom election was called. I heard the points made by Ms Gallacher and Mr Whitfield that that has nothing to do with the Scottish Government’s ability to provide a statement to Parliament. I have, however, just made the point that, as a

consequence of the period that we are now in, the report that is coming to ministers to enable us to provide an update is delayed.

In line with that, the chief medical officer’s ability to update Parliament has also been affected. He had been due to speak to the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee to provide details of the activity of the multidisciplinary team, again in line with the commitment that had previously been given to update the Parliament before recess. However, that had to be carefully considered against the published pre-election guidance from the permanent secretary. That guidance has already had an impact on other activity that the Government had committed to do in advance of recess. We had said that we would bring forward a programme for government, too; we are no longer able to do that, but I see that Ms Gallacher is not trying to compel the Scottish Government to do that at this stage.

As the Cass review has been the subject of debate during the pre-election period in recent weeks, it is regrettable that, in line with the guidance, the chief medical officer has had to write to postpone his appearance before the committee. Crucially, he wrote to inform the committee of that before the request for a statement was made. Again, the Parliament was fully apprised of the context in which we are operating.

**Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con):** In the minister’s attempt to create an excuse for not bringing forward a statement, he is comparing apples with oranges. The Cass review has got nothing to do with the election, and he promised that there would be a statement before recess. There is no reason for this whatsoever. The minister is comparing apples with oranges and trying to weave his way out of this.

**Jamie Hepburn:** I am afraid that I have to urge Mr Whittle to look at the letter from the chief medical officer to the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee. The point that I have just made is one that the chief medical officer has made; as a consequence of the issue being tied up with the election debate, he and the Government are concerned that it could impact on the election.

This is unusual. Normally, we would be decried if we sought to go against guidance from the permanent secretary on what we could or could not say before an election. We are trying to operate in compliance with the guidance, which I imagine that Mr Whittle, Ms Gallacher and other members would expect us to do.

Given that ministers are reliant on information from the multidisciplinary team and the chief medical officer, and given that we do not have that information, it is simply not possible to provide any meaningful form of statement to the Parliament

this side of recess. However, we have made a commitment to a statement, and I am happy for us to bring the matter back to the chamber as soon as possible. I made that point in my letter to Meghan Gallacher and other business managers yesterday. I am happy to return to the issue at the earliest possible opportunity, and I propose to do that once we are back from recess.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment S6M-13692.1, in the name of Meghan Gallacher, which seeks to amend motion S6M-13692, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

There will be a short suspension to allow members to access the digital voting system.

14:12

*Meeting suspended.*

14:17

*On resuming—*

**The Presiding Officer:** We come to the vote on amendment S6M-13692.1, in the name of Meghan Gallacher. Members should cast their votes now. [*Interruption.*] The vote is still running. I will call you for a point of order—[*Interruption.*]

Bear with me, Ms Haughey. I am just checking. Are you receiving advice that we are voting on amendment S6M-13692.1?

**Clare Haughey (Rutherglen) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The system says that the amendment was lodged by Jamie Hepburn, not by Meghan Gallacher.

**The Presiding Officer:** Bear with me, Ms Haughey.

We will pause the vote for a moment—we are going to stop this vote. We will run the vote again in a moment.

Thank you, colleagues. The question is, that amendment S6M-13692.1, in the name of Meghan Gallacher, which seeks to amend motion S6M-13692, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, be agreed to. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care (Neil Gray):** On a point of order, Presiding

Officer. Apologies—I could not connect to the system. I would have voted no.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Gray. I will make sure that your vote is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)



Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by  
 Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Mairi (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division on amendment S6M-13692.1, in the name of Meghan Gallacher, is: For 51, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment disagreed to.*

**The Presiding Officer:** The next question is, that motion S6M-13692, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, be agreed to.

*Motion agreed to,*

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 18 June 2024—

delete

8.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

and insert

7.30 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 19 June 2024—

delete

*followed by* Stage 3 Debate: Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill

delete

6.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

5.00 pm Decision Time

## Topical Question Time

14:23

### Home Energy Scotland Grant and Loan Scheme

1. **Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to reported claims that its net zero targets are at serious risk if solar is not reinstated to the Home Energy Scotland grant and loan scheme. (S6T-02046)

**The Minister for Climate Action (Gillian Martin):** We recognise that solar power has an important role to play in decarbonising our energy supply and supporting a just transition to net zero. However, we cannot meet our climate targets without ending the use of polluting heating systems in our buildings and moving to cleaner heat alternatives. In the context of the real-terms cuts to the Scottish Government's capital funding as well as drastic reductions in financial transactions, that change is necessary to ensure that the available funds that are allocated are targeted at measures that best support the direct decarbonisation of heat in homes.

**Sarah Boyack:** By ending a vital source of funding for home owners for solar photovoltaics and battery tech, the Scottish Government is disincentivising climate action, damaging the solar installation industry and negatively impacting on solar and storage supply chains in Scotland. What impact has the Scottish Government assessed that that will have on those vital green jobs, given the warnings from the sector about undermining certainty for Scottish businesses, jobs and supply chains?

**Gillian Martin:** Although solar panels are a well-established technology, they are also a popular technology that households have voluntarily invested in. However, we in the Scottish Government are clear that the limited funds that we have for decarbonisation and for improving the heat in people's homes have to be directed at the types of heating that affect climate change—gas boilers—so we are investing not solely in heat pumps but in solar panels that are associated with heat pumps. Solar is a popular technology that is viable without Government support, and we continue to engage with the solar industry on the proposed ambition of 4 to 6GW of solar by 2030.

**Sarah Boyack:** Will the minister not accept that, for many Scottish households, the ability to install solar panels would have been followed by the installation of heat pumps and storage systems but this decision will make it too expensive for our constituents to take that vital action to reduce

bills? Given the popularity of the products, will the Scottish Government reinstate this vital funding to tackle climate change, create jobs and bring people's energy bills down now?

**Gillian Martin:** It is a case not of reinstating "vital funding" but of focusing that funding on the areas that will decarbonise household heat more. Our financial transactions allocation has been slashed. Our capital has been reduced in real terms by almost 9 per cent. If a Labour Government gets in and wants to reinstate £28 billion for tackling climate change, we will gladly take the consequentials and look at the programme again. However, until more money comes the Scottish Government's way, we have had to make what is a very difficult decision.

**Colin Beattie (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP):** The Scottish Government's budget has had its financial transactions slashed. Does the minister agree that the likely incoming Labour Government should commit to reversing those cuts to Scotland's budget to enable grant and loan schemes such as this one to flourish? Otherwise, the sector will continue to be affected by the impact of Westminster austerity.

**Gillian Martin:** I cannot agree more with Colin Beattie. I have mentioned how much our capital budget has been reduced and the fact that £28 billion has been pledged by the potentially incoming Labour Government for tackling climate change; more money for us would be associated with that. However, there has been a 62 per cent reduction in our financial transactions allocation since 2022-23. In combination, that puts extreme pressure on the budgets in question and the programmes that rely on them.

In addition, we cannot decarbonise energy in Scotland without significant investment in not just Scottish but shared systems across the whole United Kingdom, and in the reform of the UK energy markets.

We are weeks away from a change in UK Government. If Labour is concerned about the impact on grants of those reductions, that is fine: it needs to put its money where its mouth is and commit to immediately reversing the cuts to our capital budget. If it does not do so, it is clear that the austerity of the Tories will continue under Labour, and the effect of that will be felt up and down the country.

**Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con):** The Scottish Government has consistently underestimated the impact that solar can have, especially in conjunction with wind power. Why on earth do we have buildings without solar panels on the roof, given that those take up no more room? Why is every new home not built with solar panels? Why do we not have local networks—for

example, for car charging points, especially in rural areas that are off-grid? Those are the things that we should do to support the move to green energy.

**Gillian Martin:** A number of the things that Brian Whittle mentioned go across a range of Government portfolios. He will be aware of the pledge to increase the number of electric vehicle charging points over the next couple of years, which sits of course with Fiona Hyslop.

However, we have the twin challenges of fuel poverty and climate change. In order to identify and focus the limited money that we have, we need to ensure that we put money towards reducing fuel poverty. Incidentally, 150,000 households that are at risk of fuel poverty have been supported by the warmer homes Scotland scheme, which still exists, and can still apply for solar. The scheme that we are discussing here is a particular Home Energy Scotland scheme, in which we have to prioritise decarbonising existing heating sources.

**Mark Ruskell:** The Government's commitment to a solar target is welcome, but does the minister agree that it would be a missed opportunity if that target was met only through solar farms? Household solar battery and storage systems cut electricity bills and transport costs and enable householders to secure preferential electricity tariffs. Does the minister recognise that there are wider benefits and will she commit to ensuring that loan funding is there for both solar PV and batteries, even if it remains conditional on also decarbonising heating systems?

**Gillian Martin:** Yes, I do, because it is about having a combination of solar and heat pumps, and that is what the move has done. I would love to be able to give funding for the installation of solar panels. That is what we started out doing, and it would be terrific if I had the opportunity to reinstate it, but, unfortunately—for all the reasons that I have mentioned on our capital budget—we do not have that luxury.

If more money is forthcoming in our budget allocation, of course we can look at it again. However, for now, it has to be a combination of heat pumps or low-emissions heating and solar panels, not just solar panels. I regret that that is the case, but that is the financial position that we are in.

**Liam McArthur (Orkney Islands) (LD):** It is difficult to square the cut with the Government's stated intention to redouble efforts to meet our climate targets, having dumped the interim target for 2030.

However, I raise the case of some of my constituents who applied for a grant for solar and battery last year, supported by Orkney

Renewables. Initially, they were told that the application would be successful but, due to weather and other delays, the installation did not take place until earlier this year. They have now been told that they are not going to get the grant that they were promised. I can write to the minister with more details, but will she undertake to investigate the circumstances to ensure that my constituents receive the support to which they are entitled?

**Gillian Martin:** I will investigate that, because anyone who has had an allocation has nine months in which to spend the money and get the heating put in place. If he writes to me, I will investigate the particular situation that he mentioned.

### Dental Provision (Greenock and Inverclyde)

**2. Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions it has had with NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde regarding dental provision in the Greenock and Inverclyde constituency. (S6T-02048)

**The Minister for Public Health and Women's Health (Jenni Minto):** The Scottish Government continues to work closely with NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde to understand its plans for dental provision, including mitigations for practice closures.

Current plans include a pilot in the Greenock and Inverclyde constituency to provide emergency dental services in Greenock health centre. In addition to targeted local action, Inverclyde qualifies for national support schemes such as the Scottish dental access initiative, which pays out up to £100,000 for establishing, relocating or extending practices, and for recruitment and retention allowances, which pay up to £37,500 to new dentists in the first three years of practice.

**Stuart McMillan:** The minister will be aware that the dental practice Mydentist wrote to its thousands of patients last week to tell them that it will be closing on 9 August. As per my email to the Presiding Officer yesterday, I inform the chamber that that is my current dental practice.

The closure affects private and NHS patients, but NHS patients in particular. Yesterday, my office called every dental practice in Inverclyde and found that none is currently taking on NHS patients, apart from one that is taking on new NHS patients who are aged under 18.

What is the Scottish Government doing to ensure that my constituents have access to an NHS dentist, if that is what they choose?

**Jenni Minto:** The Scottish Government is committed to maintaining access to NHS dentistry

in Scotland, and our reformed fee structure has been designed to make continued delivery of NHS care more attractive to independent practices.

Despite our significant reform, I acknowledge that access remains challenging in Greenock and Inverclyde. Therefore, as I set out to the member in my previous response, my officials are building closer working relationships with NHS boards—including NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde—on localised matters to ensure that there are mitigating actions to support access to urgent and emergency dental care, while also supporting boards to be innovative and flexible.

**Stuart McMillan:** Like many of my colleagues, I have been raising issues regarding the dental sector for some time, especially since the issues have been exacerbated by the Covid pandemic. Those challenges are not exclusive to Scotland. From anecdotal evidence, I understand that Scotland is still in a better position than other parts of the United Kingdom. However, we cannot be content with how things are at present.

I know that the Scottish Government is working with the sector to make NHS dental work more desirable for practices and to encourage more people into the profession. Nonetheless, will the minister advise on the model that is currently used to remunerate dentists who carry out NHS work? I know that that topic was raised when the minister visited the Weir and McClafferty dental practice in Gourrock earlier this year.

**Jenni Minto:** I found my visit to Weir and McClafferty very informative, and it re-emphasised to me the importance of having dentists on our high streets. Mr McMillan is right to say that the situation is not unique to Scotland. However, we have a strong track record in recruiting dentists, with 57 dentists per 100,000 of our population, compared with 42 in England and 46 in Wales.

On 1 November 2023, the Scottish Government delivered a significant intervention through the introduction of root-and-branch NHS dental payment reform. That preserved the activity-based payment, which dentists are used to, but it also updated fee levels to ensure that they reflect the increased costs of modern dentistry. In that way, we aim to provide longer-term sustainability and encourage the dental sector to increase its existing NHS provision. Our reform has been largely welcomed and well received by dentists. I am encouraged by the sector's positive actions as it continues to get on with the job of providing NHS care to patients.

**Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (Con):** Two years ago, I undertook the same exercise that Mr McMillan has just described. Even back then, dentists were not accepting new patients. I raised the issue with ministers and was promised that

action would be taken. Two years later, people still cannot access dentists. Just because patients have been able to register does not mean that they can then get an appointment. The problem is that people in places such as Inverclyde simply cannot afford to go private. When it comes to dentistry, why have people in my region been given the unacceptable choice of going private or not going at all?

**Jenni Minto:** I recognise that payment reform is not the remedy to the problem of ensuring sustainability for all. As well as introducing such reform, the Scottish Government is considering a range of workforce initiatives to improve the recruitment and retention of dentists, including using the direct access model and utilising dental therapists to provide more NHS care. NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde is keen to be involved in that. The chief dental officer, his team and I are also working with the other UK nations to increase the pipeline of dentists coming from overseas, which I hope will improve our ability to sustain dentistry services in Scotland.

**Paul O'Kane (West Scotland) (Lab):** Thus far, the minister's answers have been quite extraordinary. People in Inverclyde do not want warm words from the Government, nor do they want visits from the minister or comparisons with England; they want dental services to be there to serve the people who need them. The reality is that Mydentist is not the first practice in Inverclyde to close. With the remaining practices either being closed to new NHS patients or dealing with ever-expanding waiting lists, the area is a dental desert. I see that the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care is in his place in the chamber, so he might want to reflect on the issue, too. Why has it taken so long for any intervention to come? Given that, across the country, four out of every five practices are not accepting new NHS patients, when Inverclyde residents ask who is responsible for the lack of dentistry provision that they face, surely the only answer can be that it is this Scottish National Party Government.

**Jenni Minto:** Over the past year we have been working hard to achieve the correct payment structures to ensure that we can have sustainable dentistry services. Unfortunately, Brexit has resulted in a reduction in the pipeline of dentists from overseas coming to Scotland and to the rest of the UK. That is why, in one of my earlier responses, I highlighted that I have been working across the four nations, with the public health ministers in Wales, Northern Ireland and England, to ensure that we can work together to increase that pipeline and that dentists who are practising in Scotland but who are from overseas can improve their access to the exams that allow them to practise the full range of dentistry services in Scotland.

## Business Motion

14:39

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-13670, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a timetable for the stage 3 consideration of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill. Any member who wishes to speak to the motion should press their request-to-speak button now.

*Motion moved,*

That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limits indicated, those time limits being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended (other than a suspension following the first division in the stage being called) or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 3: 1 hour 15 minutes

Groups 4 to 6: 2 hours 10 minutes

Groups 7 to 9: 3 hours 5 minutes

Groups 10 to 12: 4 hours.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]

*Motion agreed to.*

## Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

14:40

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2—Scottish Parliament bill 33A—the marshalled list and the groupings of amendments. The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for around five minutes for the first division of the stage 3 proceedings. The period of voting for each division will be 45 seconds. Thereafter, I will allow a voting period of one minute for the first division after a debate.

Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak buttons or enter RTS in the chat box as soon as possible after I call the first amendment in the group. Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

### Section 1—Overarching objectives of agricultural policy

**The Presiding Officer:** We move to group 1. Amendment 18 is grouped with amendments 19 and 20. I call Ariane Burgess to speak to and move amendment 18 and to speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green):** Thank you, Presiding Officer. The Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill is critically important because it will set the way forward for how farmers and crofters are supported to grow food and respond to the climate and nature emergencies. Our land is our biggest natural defence against climate change and home to the majority of biodiversity. It is also home to people, and rural communities are a crucial part of the picture. The bill gives us the opportunity to transform how we support communities to steward our land, produce our food and take up new opportunities and, therefore, to thrive.

Agriculture is the dominant land use in Scotland and it is associated with almost a fifth of climate emissions. As agriculture, on the whole, continues to intensify and consolidate, it drives biodiversity loss. Forestry also has major implications for climate and nature—some positive and some negative, when it comes to large monoculture plantations. Therefore, we need to get this right.

My amendment 18 relates to the overarching objectives of agricultural policy, and it would add

the words “and between-farm” to the objective that is set out in section 1(1)(c), which is the facilitation of on-farm nature restoration, climate mitigation and adaptation. Adding “and between-farm” would recognise the importance of ecological connectivity between farms. It is not necessarily about funding activity on land between farms, but it would remind ministers to consider the impact that agricultural policy will have on that in-between land, and it would also encourage the development of policies to promote landscape-scale efforts to restore nature and to mitigate and adapt to climate change. After all, climate change and nature are not confined by each farm gate.

I turn to the other amendments in the group. Rachael Hamilton’s amendment 19 would add to the objectives

“the acknowledgement and preservation of the traditions and cultural role of farmers and crofters.”

**Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con):** I thank Ariane Burgess for taking an intervention. Before we decide how we will vote on amendment 18, I want to be clear specifically what outcome would be achieved by adding the words “and between-farm”.

**Ariane Burgess:** As I have said, I am keen that we acknowledge that what happens on farms does not stop at the farm gate and that there are issues that affect the whole of an area of land. I want us to ensure that we support that large-scale landscape collaboration between farms and between different land managers.

I will find my place again. I was talking about Rachael Hamilton’s amendment 19, which would include as an objective

“the acknowledgement and preservation of the traditions and cultural role of farmers and crofters.”

We all recognise the importance of farming and crofting to Scotland’s culture, but I am concerned that the wording of amendment 19 is not clearly defined enough and could lock us into preserving practices that are damaging to nature and climate. I am sure that that is not Ms Hamilton’s intention, but an objective of preserving traditions could be taken to mean no change, and we know that change is needed. Therefore, the Scottish Greens want to see more nuance around that.

Ms Hamilton’s amendment 20 seeks to remove the power for ministers to amend the objectives in the bill, but it is standard practice for bills to include such a power. There could be good reason to add to the objectives in future without requiring a completely new bill, with all the parliamentary time that that would require.

I move amendment 18.

14:45

**Rachael Hamilton:** Amendment 19 seeks to add to the bill an objective to acknowledge and preserve the traditions and cultural role of farmers. Many farmers and crofters have told me that they feel that their way of life is under threat. Legislation passed in the Scottish Parliament by parties except the Scottish Conservatives, such as the Hunting with Dogs (Scotland) Act 2023 and the Wildlife Management and Muirburn (Scotland) Act 2024, has impacted their ability to, for example, control predators and protect important biodiversity.

We know that the Scottish National Party has a track record of proposing legislation that threatens lives and livelihoods—for example, its proposed legislation on highly protected marine areas threatened those of coastal communities—so I am very concerned that the cultural role of farmers could be under threat if we do not recognise that in the bill.

Agriculture has played a central role in society, shaping landscapes, economies and communities. Agriculture is more than an economic sector. Farmers are seen as experts in their communities, who support livelihoods, heritage, landscapes and the environment. It is appropriate to cement farmers’ unique place in rural society by stating that explicitly in the bill’s objectives.

Ariane Burgess wants change, but she dismisses the cultural significance of farmers. Rewilding and the reintroduction of certain species have had a distinct impact on the livelihoods of farmers. That has not been recognised and farmers have not been engaged. For example, the reintroduction of beavers in the Cairngorms has had a distinct impact on farmers.

I turn to my other amendment in the group. At stage 2, an amendment was agreed to that provided the power to amend by regulation the objectives of agricultural policy, with any such amendments to be made through the use of the affirmative procedure. The updated supplementary delegated powers memorandum notes:

“This will provide flexibility that allows the Scottish Ministers to ensure that those objectives stay aligned with future Scottish agricultural policy needs. This ensures that the section 1(1) objectives can remain relevant over time.”

Amendment 20 would remove the ability to amend the objectives and would therefore remove the risk of fundamentally changing the policy direction of the bill, should ministers wish to do so.

On Ariane Burgess’s explanation of amendment 18, although I understand the connection and connectivity between farms and farming enterprises, which is so important for our ecology, I do not believe that there is a distinct connection to the bill or that an outcome would be achieved

by inserting the words that amendment 18 proposes to insert.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands (Mairi Gougeon):** In relation to amendment 18, I highlighted during stage 2 that section 1 sets out the key objectives for agricultural policy, which is why one of the objectives specifically refers to on-farm support. The objectives seek to link agricultural policy and food production intrinsically with the need for there to also be on-farm nature restoration, climate mitigation and adaptation.

The bill enables a much wider range of support, but section 1 is focused on agriculture and is not the place for any wider objectives. It is not clear what is meant by “between-farm” nature restoration—legislation should be unambiguous.

At meetings in recent weeks, I have discussed with Ariane Burgess the fact that the bill already includes powers that enable ministers, should they wish to do so, to support farmers, crofters and land managers to contribute to achieving landscape-scale outcomes. That includes the provision of funding for third-party support to deliver grants and support to enable such collaborations to occur. I therefore ask Parliament not to support amendment 18.

I turn to amendment 19. The culture and traditions of farming and crofting are very important, as Rachael Hamilton outlined, and are worth preserving. The powers in the bill are wide enough to enable ministers to provide support for traditional activities. Even so, the amendment does not tell us what is meant by traditions and culture or how ministers might go about meeting the proposed objective. What the effect of the amendment would be is therefore too uncertain, and it detracts from the other objectives in section 1. For those reasons, I am not able to support amendment 19.

On amendment 20, I know that Rachael Hamilton is seeking to reverse an amendment that was lodged by Colin Smyth and agreed to at stage 2. I have sought to ensure that the bill’s objectives have been drafted sufficiently broadly and at a high enough level to capture the vision for agriculture and to ensure that we have flexibility on how that will be realised.

**Rachael Hamilton:** The Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee warned against using Henry VIII powers. That is what I am concerned about. That warning came specifically from the DPLR Committee, which my colleague Tim Eagle sits on. It considered that a couple of weeks ago.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I think that that warning was made in reference to another power, but I am more than happy to be corrected if I am wrong about that.

On what is important about Colin Smyth’s amendment that we considered at stage 2, I recognise that, over time, it might be appropriate to change the objectives of agricultural policy, and the bill is, on the whole, a framework bill. I do not see any reason to reverse the change that we agreed to at stage 2, and I do not think that there is a good reason to do that. That is why I ask members not to support Rachael Hamilton’s amendment 20.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Ariane Burgess to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 18.

**Ariane Burgess:** On my amendment 18, which would add “and between-farm” to the objective, I appreciate that the Government is wary of signalling that it would provide support to land between farms from its agricultural budget when the budget is limited. It is not my intention to signal that with the amendment, and I do not think that it does so; instead, it merely reminds us that the goal of restoring nature and tackling climate change is everywhere. The amendment would encourage ministers to keep that in mind in designing agricultural policy that will have impacts on climate and nature beyond the farm gate.

I heard the points that Rachael Hamilton put forward. As I have said, we all recognise the importance of farming and crofting to Scotland’s culture, but I am still concerned that the wording of amendment 19 is too broad and that it could lead to continued support for practices that are not compatible with reversing the decline in our natural world as we start to understand the impacts of climate.

On amendment 20, the cabinet secretary outlined why it is important that ministers retain the power to amend the legislation. The Scottish Greens agree with that.

I ask members to vote for my amendment 18 and not to support amendments 19 and 20. I press amendment 18.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 18 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. As this is the first division at stage 3, I will suspend the meeting for around five minutes to allow members to access the system.

14:52

*Meeting suspended.*

14:58

*On resuming—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing):** We proceed to the division on amendment 18, in the name of Ariane Burgess. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**Clare Haughey (Rutherglen) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Haughey. Your vote will be recorded.

**The Minister for Higher and Further Education; and Minister for Veterans (Graeme Dey):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was in the same situation as Clare Haughey. I would have voted no.

15:00

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Dey. Your vote will be recorded.

I have a point of order online, from Angus Robertson.

Mr Robertson, is your microphone on? You need to turn on your microphone; we cannot hear you.

As we cannot hear you, I cannot record your vote. As we are about to note, your vote would not have made any difference to the outcome of the vote as a whole in any event.

#### For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)



Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 7, Against 104, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 18 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 19 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 19 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 19 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 20 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 20 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Justice and Home Affairs (Angela Constance):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was slow in connecting. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Constance. Your vote will be recorded.

#### For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 20 disagreed to.*

## Section 2—Rural support plan

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 2 is on the rural support plan and the evaluation and monitoring of schemes. Amendment 2, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, is grouped with amendments 21, 8, 8A to 8C, 9, 22 to 25, 11, 11A, 10, 10A to 10E, 26 and 12.

**Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD):** Amendment 2, in my name, would require the rural support plan to set out

“how the plan will be supported by an indicative multi-year financial framework”.

I listened to what the cabinet secretary said at stage 2 about it not being possible for the Scottish Government to commit to the inclusion of multiyear financial frameworks. However, that does not prevent the Scottish Government from including an indicative version. That would provide the sector with information about the Scottish Government’s intentions, which would inform farmers’ and crofters’ planning and investment in their businesses in order to deliver the bill’s objectives. That is particularly relevant to the agriculture sector, which operates over longer timescales.

I ask members to support amendment 2, and I leave it to others to speak to their amendments in the group.

I move amendment 2.

**Ariane Burgess:** I have a number of amendments in this group that seek to strengthen the rural support plan, because the plan is what will determine whether we meet the bill’s four objectives and wider objectives such as achieving net zero and reversing nature loss.

Amendment 21 would require the rural support plan to include

“targets to reduce agriculture’s environmental impact in relation to biodiversity, including indicators to measure progress towards these targets”.

It is a probing amendment that aims to clarify the Government’s intention regarding nature targets in legislation. If the bill does not include nature targets, where and when will they be added into law? We are living in a nature emergency, as the Scottish Government has recognised, and Scotland is towards the bottom of international league tables on biodiversity. That situation will not change unless we take steps to reduce the pressure that we put on nature and allow it to thrive.

We need to work with nature, not against it. A flourishing natural world is not an optional extra that can be considered if there is money left over in a budget; it underpins our human lives through ecosystem services such as clean water, fertile soil, pollination and a stable climate, and it will help agriculture, too. The Scottish Greens are clear that nature targets are essential, so I will listen with interest to the cabinet secretary’s response to amendment 21.

Amendment 22 would give ministers the power to describe how the support that will be provided under the plan will help achieve several important climate and nature outcomes, including reduced emissions, reduced nitrogen loss, an increased amount of land under organic management, improved animal welfare and improved water quality. I encourage members to vote for amendment 22, and I trust that ministers will use the power to reassure us that all plans will deliver for the climate and for nature.

Amendment 24 would simply give ministers the power to modify the list of

“information that may be included in a rural support plan.”

That would be subject to parliamentary approval under the affirmative procedure.

Amendment 25 pertains to the list of statutory duties that ministers

“must have regard to”

when

“preparing or amending a rural support plan”.

The list includes agriculture, biodiversity and the environment, but forestry is missing, despite the fact that the bill enables ministers to provide support for it. Amendment 25 would correct that omission by adding forestry to the list, so that ministers must consider their duties related to forestry, including the duty to promote sustainable forestry management when designing a rural support plan.

Amendment 26 would require the rural support plan to be externally evaluated by an independent

body. It sets out timings for when the evaluations must occur before and after each plan period, which are similar to the approach in the EU, with an exception for the first plan, which would be assessed halfway through.

The cabinet secretary's amendments 9 and 12 will require ministers to monitor and report on the impacts of each support scheme, but there is no commitment to monitoring being conducted by an independent body or consultant. Many stakeholders feel that, to date, the agriculture directorate does not have a good track record of conducting monitoring and evaluation, and strongly believe that independent evaluation would provide a more objective and non-partisan view of how the plans and payment schemes deliver value for money and how well they progress us towards meeting the bill's objectives.

Again, I will listen with interest to the cabinet secretary's response on that issue. I understand that the agriculture budget is already on Audit Scotland's radar, given that there will soon be many new payment schemes involving a large amount of public money. I recognise that it might be appropriate for the Scottish Government to conduct its own assessment first, which could inform any future scrutiny by Audit Scotland or another independent body. However, I wanted to raise the issue for discussion, because the Scottish Greens are clear that significant changes are needed in agriculture and land use, and we will not achieve them without significant changes to the support and incentives provided through the rural budget. We have not yet seen evidence of sufficient changes to the budget, so that needs to be discussed.

Unfortunately, I cannot speak to all the amendments in the group, because we are tight for time, but I will highlight Rhoda Grant's amendments 10A to 10C, which the Scottish Greens strongly support. Currently, half of all farm support payments go to just 6.6 per cent of recipients—those with the most land. Many already have the most wealth, too, which leaves very little for farmers, crofters and growers with less land. The situation incentivises the continued consolidation of farm businesses and makes it very difficult for new entrants to break into the sector. The Scottish Greens therefore urge members to vote for Rhoda Grant's amendment 10B to support a more equitable distribution of funds. We also strongly support Ms Grant's amendment 10A, on fair work, and her amendment 10C.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I thank members across the chamber for the constructive and helpful discussions that we have had on the amendments in this group and for their input. I believe that the amendments that I will speak to balance the

competing demands for detail and for flexibility. They reflect our route map transition period and the realities of being constrained by legacy EU common agricultural policy schemes while we continue to co-develop the detail of future support using the powers in the bill. In doing so, we will ensure that the rural support plan is proportionate and robust and will deliver both now and long into the future.

My amendment 8 will provide greater clarity on each plan period; address the calls for more information to assist with scrutiny; and give farmers, crofters and land managers more information on what to expect. That includes information on the expected total amount of support, the structure of support, allocation of support and the timetable for that support, as well as on measures to benefit small producers, tenant farmers and crofters, and any specific outcomes that Scottish ministers want to achieve.

Amendment 11 will address the issue of consultation by adding a new section on rural support plan engagement, and it lists representative groups alongside specified organisations that Scottish ministers must consult. A statement describing the consultation that is undertaken will have to be laid before Parliament alongside any plan.

**Richard Leonard (Central Scotland) (Lab):** For the record, they are not listed, but would the cabinet secretary expect trade unions to be consulted on the rural support plan?

**Mairi Gougeon:** That was not raised with me in discussion, but I am more than happy to consider that going forward.

Amendment 11 and what we have outlined in relation to it provide important clarity on the engagement and consultation that already take place and which will continue to take place, while not constraining our approach to co-development or any statutory requirements as part of secondary legislation.

Amendment 10 will add a new section on the scrutiny of and reporting on plans. It sets out a series of matters that a report must cover, including the total amount of support provided, a breakdown of that support, a description of any non-financial support, the distribution of support provided and an assessment of the effectiveness of the strategic priorities, the delivery of outcomes, the progress towards objectives and the impact of any use of the section 9 power to cap support and assistance. Reporting will include legacy CAP schemes; there will be flexibility to prepare interim or other reports; and the report must be laid before Parliament and published. That provides the clarity requested on reporting to assist with on-going scrutiny.

15:15

Amendments 9 and 12 address monitoring and evaluation. As substantial amounts of public funding are given to farmers, crofters and land managers, it is only right that we seek a meaningful return on that investment of public money, ensuring that progress can be charted in delivering on the bill's objectives, outcomes and statutory duties. These amendments require the rural support plan to set out how the impact of each support scheme will be monitored, with amendment 12 introducing a section on the monitoring and evaluation of schemes, which requires the Scottish ministers to report on the impact and effectiveness of each support scheme and of any other support that is provided outwith a scheme. Those reports must be laid before Parliament and published. Such an approach strikes a balance between setting clear requirements and having the flexibility to determine the appropriate timescale, method and publication to ensure a robust and evidence-led approach.

Turning now to some of the other amendments in the group, I absolutely understand the rationale behind amendment 2, in the name of Beatrice Wishart. However, I point out that, as we have progressed through each stage of the bill, I have set out the difficulties of providing detail on future budgets. I make it clear that we have no guarantees from the United Kingdom Government as of next year. Prior allocations were made on an annual basis, and we no longer have the assurance of the multi-annual programme budgets that we had under the EU CAP.

It will be for the incoming UK Government to provide future funding guarantees, and I hope that the Parliament will support me in pressing for urgent talks on the issue. In the absence of those funding guarantees, amendment 8 provides us with the flexibility to add that information in future, should the situation change. For those reasons, unfortunately, I am unable to support amendment 2, and I ask Beatrice Wishart not to press it.

I thank Ariane Burgess for lodging amendment 21. We should be wary of requiring the establishment of targets where the legal effect might be unclear and the duty to achieve those targets is unqualified. The Scottish biodiversity strategy to 2045, which sets out our clear vision for halting biodiversity loss, will be supported by a series of rolling delivery plans that will include tangible actions for all sectors, including agriculture. It is crucial that the bill retains the flexibility to adapt to future challenges and opportunities without being tied to developing targets, which might not necessarily help us tackle the biodiversity crisis in the right way. The bill already includes powers to support farmers and

crofters to deliver on their biodiversity ambitions, and the rural support plan will enable future Governments to set out how they will use that support to do so. Therefore, I ask Ariane Burgess not to move amendment 21.

On amendments 8A to 8C, a plan can only ever provide "an indication of" something at the point when it is drafted, laid and published. The first version of the plan will be a living document and will therefore be iterative, given the phase and period of transition that we are in as we move from legacy CAP schemes into our new co-developed four-tier framework.

With regard to amendments 8A and 8B, I have already discussed the lack of future funding guarantees from the UK Government from 2025. As for amendment 8C, the time periods are subject to active co-development and require secondary legislation, subject to parliamentary timetables, to enact any change. The plan will provide an indication of the dates, and the route map will be updated as and when more detail is known. Overall, that is a sensible approach, as it balances the requirement for detail with the need for flexibility, and for those reasons, I am unable to support amendments 8A to 8C.

As amendments 22 and 24 helpfully balance the competing demands to provide greater detail with the need to retain flexibility during the phased transition, which is subject to parliamentary scrutiny, I am happy to support them. Amendments 23 and 11A, though, provide no proportionality with regard to the scale and type of any amendment to the rural support plan, nor do they consider the existing role of Parliament and committees when scrutinising changes via secondary legislation and in committee evidence sessions. What they propose would add an additional layer of bureaucracy and a resource demand that is neither proportionate, nor normal practice, so I ask that Parliament rejects both.

**Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con):** Given the comments that the cabinet secretary has just made, does she not agree with the Law Society of Scotland? It suggests that

"the need for flexibility"

in approach needs to be

"balanced against ... clarity in the law, appropriate levels of parliamentary scrutiny underpinning legislative and policy developments, and meaningful stakeholder consultation."

It also went on to note:

"It is crucial to upholding the rule of law that the law is clear, comprehensible, and transparent so that requirements can be understood by those affected."

Are we not running a risk that, without a rural support plan at this stage, farmers are no clearer about how the future legislation will impact them?

**Mairi Gougeon:** I disagree with that comment. As I have said, we are going through a period of transition. We have set out as much detail as we can on when we expect to provide more information on the route map. In response to the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, as well as to the DPLR committee, I published a draft version of what that rural support plan might look like to give an indication of the type of information that it would contain. That is as much information as we can provide at this stage.

I turn to amendment 25. At stage 2, Ariane Burgess lodged an amendment requiring that, for support to be available under the bill, the creation of areas of woodland must have positive impacts on biodiversity, carbon and public amenity. I am grateful to Ariane Burgess for engaging constructively with me on the issue over the past few weeks, and amendment 25 now makes it clear that Scottish ministers must have regard to statutory duties relating to forestry when preparing or amending the rural support plan, including the duty to promote sustainable forest management. I am happy to support amendment 25.

I understand the sentiment behind amendment 10A, which is why, at stage 2, the matters that ministers must have regard to when preparing or amending a plan were amended to include the desirability of the agricultural sector operating with fair work principles. As that stage 2 amendment covers how support has been obtained via the rural support plan, I ask Rhoda Grant not to move amendment 10A.

I agree with the sentiment behind amendments 10B and 10C. That is why, at stage 2, we agreed to amendments that require consideration of the benefits of a diverse and resilient agricultural sector, including small producers, tenant farmers, crofters and agricultural co-operative societies, in preparing the plan. I have also lodged stage 3 amendments that require the plan to set out any measures that are intended to benefit small producers, tenant farmers and crofters, and to ensure that reporting includes the distribution of support that is provided, including geographically and by sector.

On the section 9 use of powers to cap support and assistance, we made the use of that power subject to affirmative procedure at stage 2 in order to give Parliament a scrutiny role. Amendment 10, on reporting, includes an assessment of the impact of any use of section 9 powers. Taken together, the amendments cover the distribution of support and scrutiny of any use of capping during reporting, monitoring and evaluation, and I think that they address the issue comprehensively. I therefore think that Rhoda Grant's amendments are not necessary and I ask her not to move them.

On amendments 10D and 10E, we need to ensure that we can do the right reporting at the right time to deliver the right output across a range of different types of support. Arbitrary requirements risk creating reports for the sake of reporting, which could divert time and resource away from the co-development and delivery process without providing any tangible or useful output. I therefore ask Rachael Hamilton not to move amendments 10D and 10E, and if she does, I ask Parliament not to support them.

Finally, on amendment 26, which replaces existing EU common agricultural policy evaluation requirements, such requirements work in a CAP context, because of the long lead times and limited change within long programme periods. Our agricultural reform programme takes a different approach, with continual co-development and reduced programming periods. I have lodged amendments to cover the plan's reporting and monitoring and evaluation requirements, which I believe better reflect our approach and this period of phased transition. I hope that those amendments assure Ariane Burgess that we will take a flexible but robust approach to monitoring and evaluation, and I ask her not to move amendment 26.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I am grateful for the opportunity to speak to my amendments in the group. I thank the cabinet secretary for meeting me and my colleagues to discuss the Government's intention to introduce important safeguards into the bill as has been widely called for by stakeholders and colleagues.

The rural support plan is incredibly important. It sets out the strategic objectives and priorities, including how ministers will use the powers that are given to them to provide rural support for different purposes that are set out in the bill. My amendments in the group seek to strengthen amendment 8, in the cabinet secretary's name, by providing further safeguards.

Amendment 8 requires further detail to be contained in the rural support plan, including an overview of how support is to be provided for, how it will be structured and how it will benefit producers. That is something that we called for at stage 2. Although I support the amendment, which aims to provide that additional clarity, I believe that it still fails to provide the necessary detail that would be useful and beneficial to the rural support plan.

Amendments 8A, 8B and 8C are designed to strengthen the cabinet secretary's amendment 8 by removing the references to "an indication". The amendments would therefore place requirements on the Government to provide commitments as to the total amount of support, how the support is to be divided between schemes and how long the

schemes will last, which is in the same vein as the amendment that I lodged at stage 2.

In a similar vein, my amendments 23 and 11A seek to improve the safeguards in this framework bill to ensure that the relevant committee has oversight of and involvement in the co-design of the rural support plan. So far, the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee has had very little of that; although the cabinet secretary said that she had recently sent the committee some detail around the rural support plan, it was really just place markers and no detail. We have waited six years to get to this point of giving farmers detail.

Jeremy Moody from the Central Association of Agricultural Valuers Scotland described the rural support plan as the “ghost” in the agriculture bill. That is why it is so important. However, as has been widely noted, framework bills lack specified mechanisms for robust parliamentary scrutiny. Amendments 23 and 11A would provide the Parliament with an additional level of scrutiny and oversight of the development of the rural support plan.

Taken together, my amendments 10D and 10E would introduce the requirement for ministers to prepare a yearly report on the amount of support that is provided during regular periods of a rural support plan. Scottish Environment LINK supports amendment 10D and notes that it

“strengthens scrutiny and ensures that agricultural policy can continue to develop based on evidence and experience.”

I do not accept the cabinet secretary’s description of that as taking away from or adapting the policy objectives of the bill as we go along.

I support Beatrice Wishart’s amendment 2, which recognises the importance of an “indicative multi-year financial framework” on the effectiveness of the rural support plan. We had much debate at stage 2, and I engaged fully with the cabinet secretary about the points that I was making. However, I do not accept the cabinet secretary’s argument that the UK Government should come forward with a financial statement on funding given that the Scottish Government pulled ring-fenced funding of £46 million. Where is the clarity, transparency and commitment from this Government when it is asking for something from the UK Government?

I am happy to support amendment 25, in the name of Ariane Burgess, because it is important to add forestry to that list.

**Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab):** I will speak to my amendments 10A, 10B and 10C and the other amendments in the group. This group of amendments is the nub of the bill—the rural support plan is what the bill is about. I welcome the cabinet secretary’s amendments and

her taking into consideration the amendments that were lodged at stage 2 by other members, including my colleague Colin Smyth. I am also grateful to the cabinet secretary for sharing drafts and considering requests to add to her amendments.

The amendments that I lodged at stage 2 were not accepted by the cabinet secretary, but I hope that I can persuade the Parliament to accept my amendments today.

Amendment 10A seeks to embed fair work principles in the rural support plan. Although I acknowledge that amendments regarding fair work practices were added to the bill at stage 2, the amendment would add those principles to the rural support plan. It would result in support that would ensure a fair return for small farmers and crofters, and it would mean that larger enterprises receiving support would practice fair work principles for their workforce.

Amendment 10B is about the outcomes that the Scottish Government must report on at the end of a plan. My amendment asks that the report include “the redistribution of support provided, to ensure a more equitable distribution of funds”.

The bill allows for capping and redistribution of funds, and amendment 10B, along with amendment 10C, would simply mean that the Government should report on and analyse how it used that power and the impact that it had during the term of the plan.

Beatrice Wishart’s amendment 2 asks for an indicative budget for the duration of the plan. We support that, because we accept that agricultural funding comes from the UK Government and that the Scottish Government is therefore dependent on that budget to enable it to provide figures for the plan. If the Scottish Government itself does not know what funding will be available for the lifetime of the plan, it is therefore useful to have indicative figures.

15:30

For the same reason, I cannot support Rachael Hamilton’s amendments 8A, 8B and 8C, which would mean that the Government would have to give the total amount of support to be delivered throughout the term of the plan, because that would be impossible if the Government did not have those figures for the lifetime of the plan.

**Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I will speak to a few amendments, if I may. Before I do so, I remind members of my entry in the register of members’ interests. I am a third-generation farmer in Moray and have been farming for 40 years in a family farming partnership. I farm 500 acres that I own, 500 acres

that I rent and 10 acres under an Agricultural Holdings (Scotland) Act 1991 tenancy. I employ three people and I produce beef, barley and vegetables. I receive payments under the current scheme. I think that is about as full and frank as I can be.

Beatrice Wishart's amendment 2 is extremely useful. The Pack review and other previous reviews of agricultural policy led to a complete change in where subsidies are paid, so it would be useful to have an indicative multi-year financial framework that could allow farmers to see where the money is going. I also like the cabinet secretary's amendment 8 about the overview of support and I support the amendments in Rachael Hamilton's name, especially amendments 23 and 11A. They prove the importance of the Parliament's committee system—we do Parliament a disservice if we do not recognise the importance of that system.

I do not support amendment 22, in the name of Ariane Burgess, because it appears that she wants the way that farming should be carried out to be written into the bill. I do not think that is a role for politicians; it is the role of farmers in response to guides and nudges by politicians about what they want to achieve.

I support amendment 11, in the name of Mairi Gougeon. It is really important to support engagement and the people who engage with the process. That is something that I pushed for by lodging amendments at stage 2 and I am delighted to see that embodied in the cabinet secretary's amendments at stage 3. I do not always say such nice things about the cabinet secretary, but it is a pleasure to do so.

It is also a pleasure to support amendment 10. I am not sure what amendment 10B would achieve, because the bill includes the ability to cap payments and I do not think that amendment 10B is much help.

Amendment 26 has already been covered, so I think that that is enough from me. Those were some thoughts on some of the amendments.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Beatrice Wishart to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 2.

**Beatrice Wishart:** The number of amendments lodged by colleagues from across the chamber indicates the importance of the rural support plan to this legislation. It is therefore important to ensure that it is robust, that money is targeted, that we know how schemes will be monitored and that, at the same time, there is flexibility and co-design in development.

I thank the cabinet secretary for her views on my amendment 2. I remain of the view that an

indicative multiyear financial framework should be included in the rural support plan and, therefore, I press amendment 2.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 2 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**Clare Haughey:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to vote. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Haughey. Your vote will be recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)



**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 48, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 2 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 21 not moved.*

*Amendment 8 moved—[Mairi Gougeon].*

*Amendment 8A moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 8A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**The Minister for Climate Action (Gillian Martin):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The app froze on me. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Martin. Your vote will be recorded.

**For**

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)

(SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 8A disagreed to.*

*Amendment 8B moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 8B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 8B disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Does Rachael Hamilton wish to move amendment 8C?

**Rachael Hamilton:** On the basis that I do not think that I will win on amendment 8C, I will not move it.

*Amendment 8C not moved.*

*Amendment 8 agreed to.*

*Amendment 9 moved—[Mairi Gougeon]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 22 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 22 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 86, Against 28, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 22 agreed to.*

*Amendment 23 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 23 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 47, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 23 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 24 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.*

**Section 3—Rural support plan: matters to be considered**

*Amendment 25 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.*

**After section 3**

*Amendment 11 moved—[Mairi Gougeon].*

*Amendment 11A moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 11A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote]

cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 45, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 11A disagreed to.*

*Amendment 11 agreed to.*

*Amendment 10 moved—[Mairi Gougeon].*

*Amendment 10A moved—[Rhoda Grant].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 10A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 28, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 10A disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10B moved—[Rhoda Grant].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 10B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**George Adam (Paisley) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The voting platform refused to work again. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Adam. Your vote will be recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 28, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 10B disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10C moved—[Rhoda Grant].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 10C be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)



Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 54, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 10C disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10D moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 10D be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Doney, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 46, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 10D disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10E moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 10E be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame East) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 46, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 10E disagreed to.*

*Amendment 10 agreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Ariane Burgess to move or not move amendment 26.

**Ariane Burgess:** Given the cabinet secretary's comments on evaluation of the rural support plan, I will not move amendment 26.

*Amendment 26 not moved.*

#### **Section 4—Power to provide support**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We now turn to group 3. Amendment 28, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 27 and 29. I call Rachael Hamilton to move and speak to amendment 28 and to speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. Before I speak to my amendment, I wish to take this opportunity to thank the members of the bill team for their support throughout the passage of the bill. They have been incredibly thorough and efficient and I really appreciate their time. I say that on my behalf and on behalf of my colleagues on the Scottish Conservative benches.

Farmers and food producers deserve clarity about funding to allow them to plan for the future. Farm plans often work in multiyear cycles. Amendment 28 requires that support is provided through a multiyear financial framework and, where appropriate, ring-fenced funding. The amendment provides certainty and reassurance to farmers who want to plan and invest for their future. A commitment to multiyear funding has been consistently called for by farmers and producers, members across the chamber and key stakeholders.

The National Farmers Union Scotland notes that

“without the inclusion of this amendment, there is a risk that agricultural businesses will be restricted to annual commitments which could result in a diminishing or reduced ability to deliver high-quality agricultural produce as well as helping to tackle climate change and enhance biodiversity which are expected of them.”

Providing for a multiyear financial framework would represent a long-term commitment to Scottish farmers and food producers.

Amendment 27 is a redrafted amendment from stage 2, following discussions with the Scottish Crofting Federation. This amendment enshrines in the bill the provision that any future peatland restoration or agroforestry support schemes must be accessible to tenant farmers and crofters. That would help to remove barriers that tenant farmers and crofters often face when applying for support schemes. I look forward to hearing Ariane Burgess's explanation for amendment 29 before I consider how to vote on it. As for a spoiler, I do support engagement with stakeholders.

I move amendment 28.

**Ariane Burgess:** With regard to the power to provide support, my amendment 29 would require

ministers to engage with affected communities and consult with other appropriate persons before making regulations about supporting forestry projects. That was prompted by the Royal Society of Edinburgh's inquiry into the use of public funds to subsidise commercial conifer planting. It found that communities were confused and frustrated by poor and unclear engagement around forestry proposals for their areas.

The cabinet secretary has assured me that work is on-going to improve guidance on multistage community engagement for each forestry project, but the bill creates an opportunity for Government to set out consultation requirements for all projects that will receive public funding. Right now, trust in the transparency and social responsibility of large-scale conifer projects is low. Just one example is the campaign to oppose a large commercial Sitka spruce plantation in Stobo Hope that is intended to be used for carbon offsetting. The campaign's crowdfunder page says that

"the views of the local community appear to have been sidelined".

Meanwhile, the Scottish Government has given more than £2 million to a trust fund based in the tax haven of Guernsey, which bought the land for that project.

I will listen with interest to the cabinet secretary's response and I may not move amendment 29. However, I want to highlight the issue, which is keenly felt by communities around the country.

16:00

I turn to Rachael Hamilton's amendment 28 on the multiyear financial framework, which was discussed in the previous grouping. I briefly repeat that the Scottish Greens do not support making that a requirement, as it would be impossible to fulfil without more certainty from Westminster.

We fully support the principle of Ms Hamilton's amendment 28, which would ensure that all support provided for peatland restoration and agroforestry is available to tenant farmers and crofters. We want everyone to join the effort on the ground to fight climate change, but we are concerned that the amendment could be unworkable for some funding streams and could hold back money going to peatland restoration and agroforestry.

The Land Reform (Scotland) Bill will improve tenants' ability to participate in and benefit from such activities, and the Scottish Government assures me that other work is under way to help improve landowner-tenant relationships, which would help to achieve the same goal. The Greens therefore feel that the amendment is unnecessary and could be counterproductive.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** As we are nearing the agreed time limit, I exercise my power under rule 9.8.4A(c) of standing orders to allow the debate on this group to continue beyond the limit in order to avoid the debate being unreasonably curtailed.

**Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP):** I rise to oppose amendment 29. The arguments that I will adduce apply mutatis mutandis, as the lawyers say, to amendments 61 and 63, so I will not repeat them to avoid detaining members unduly.

I am a great supporter of the four Fs, which are, of course, farming, fishing, forestry and field sports. They are a staple of the rural economy in Scotland. They must remain so, and in our endeavours we must provide all support to them for the excellent, invaluable work that they do. Rewilding is often a preface to redundancy, so replotting is what we should aim for.

According to Confor—the Confederation of Forest Industries—amendment 29 would lead to significant delay, administrative burden and cost. It is unnecessary, vague and damaging, and it should not be in the bill. The industry wishes to engage, and it does engage. Confor wants to build on the good relationship that it has with the Government to see how that could be improved. However, imposing a general duty in this way—willy-nilly and lacking definition, guidance and clarity—is open to abuse, and, for that reason, should be rejected.

The other point that I want to make is that there is an apparent ingrained antipathy among the Green Party to commercial species. In particular, Sitka spruce has been named and shamed by Ariane Burgess. I am bound to ask—to paraphrase Monty Python, or at least the Greens—"What has Sitka spruce ever done to us?" Sitka spruce, although much maligned, is highly suited to the Scottish climate, grows very effectively and is invaluable for the commercial forestry sector, both for panel products and sawmills. Without a reliable, continuous supply of Sitka spruce and other commercial species, those industries, which contribute £1 billion to the Scottish economy and support 26,000 jobs, mostly in rural Scotland, would be lost. Indeed, I know from when I was cabinet secretary that investments made by leading panel products companies were made only after rigorous examination that there would be sufficient supply of Sitka spruce in future.

I regret that there has been a reduction of 41 per cent in the financial support for forestry. Perhaps that was due to the influence of the Green Party as a result of the now-defunct co-operation agreement. Now that that Faustian pact has been ripped up, as it deserved to be, I hope

that in rejecting amendments 29, 61 and 63, we can drive Mephistopheles out of the room as well.

**Edward Mountain:** It is always dangerous to request to speak after Mr Ewing has eloquently made your case for you. However, three or four years ago, when Mr Ewing was in charge of forestry, we heard of the dire shortfalls that there were going to be in our forestry sector. In fact, by 2036, there was going to be no way that it had enough timber to keep the industry in Scotland going.

I am concerned that amendment 29 would put on the backburner across the Highlands and across Scotland the industry that produces timber that we can use in our houses.

I am further concerned that amendment 29 would undermine the Mackinnon review and the work that is being done to try to speed up some forestry and the appropriate planting of appropriate trees in the appropriate places to ensure that our industry across Scotland is able to keep going without massive job losses. I therefore ask members not to support amendment 29.

**Mairi Gougeon:** On amendment 28, I want to make it absolutely clear that I would love nothing more than to set a multiyear budget that provides all of us—not least our farmers and crofters—with certainty, as we had with the CAP when we were in the EU. However, the UK Government has failed to meet its own promise to engage with the devolved Governments in meaningful discussion on the future of agriculture spending, which means that we have absolutely no certainty after next year that there will be any funding at all in the future. That is completely unacceptable. While that remains the case, I cannot accept amendment 28.

Amendment 27 is very similar to an amendment that Rachael Hamilton lodged at stage 2. It seeks to make specific examples of support accessible to specific groups—tenant farmers and crofters. I absolutely agree with the intention behind Rachael Hamilton's amendment, because I am fully committed to ensuring that tenant farmers and crofters are given equal opportunity to access the new agricultural support framework, and to ensuring that the four tiers within that framework work for all types of land tenure.

However, some of the current barriers to that, especially in relation to peatland restoration and agroforestry, relate to the landowner and tenant farmer relationship and to where powers currently lie. That is why there are provisions in the Land Reform (Scotland) Bill, which I introduced in Parliament in March, that seek to remedy the barriers that we know tenant farmers face.

On crofting, I am absolutely delighted that the crofting law reform consultation was launched on 6 June. One of the proposals would make provision

for crofter-led projects and landlord collaborations that will make it easier to initiate environmental projects on common grazings.

However, amendment 27 would be counterproductive in that support could be provided to other persons—to agroforestry and arable systems, for example—only if that support was also made available to tenant farmers and crofters, even if tenant farmers and crofters as a whole would not benefit from the type of support that was being provided. I therefore encourage Rachael Hamilton not to press the amendment.

Ariane Burgess's amendment 29 proposes a precondition being placed on the Scottish ministers to engage with any communities or persons who might be affected by forestry activities prior to making regulations under section 4 in relation to support for forestry. Although I understand the rationale behind the amendment, I think that the burden that would be created by it would be unreasonable.

As I mentioned at stage 2, the forestry support that will be provided by the bill extends far beyond woodland creation alone. I am concerned that amendment 29 could result in an unreasonable duty being placed on the Scottish ministers. Consultation and co-design will be at the heart of creating support for forestry, as was the case when the current forestry grant scheme was being created.

I also reassure Ariane Burgess that existing guidance relating to creating new woodland and forest planning already has robust engagement and consultation procedures built in. Further to that, both of the Scottish forestry guidance documents are currently being updated to bring them into line with "Scottish Land Rights and Responsibilities Statement 2022". I hope that that demonstrates sufficiently that engaging with stakeholders and communities is already a part of forestry processes and that amendment 29 is not required.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur):** I call Rachael Hamilton to wind up and to press, or seek to withdraw, amendment 28.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Having considered Ariane Burgess's amendment 29 and listened to what was said, we will support it, because it has been requested by farmers and communities across our constituencies—not crofters in this particular example, in relation to Sitka spruce, because that is absolutely impossible. The community has spoken thoroughly about the issue. The Royal Society of Edinburgh report that Ariane Burgess has referred to is an important document that considered the adverse experiences of communities when their views have not been heard and recognised.

I ask members: how can swathes of Sitka spruce provide local jobs, as Fergus Ewing described? I have spoken to people in communities who have seen livestock being removed from the uplands and swathes of Sitka spruce being planted by investment companies that do not, in those particular circumstances, have the best interests of communities at heart. I worry, with regard to food security, that we are taking away livestock and reducing their numbers.

**Fergus Ewing:** I think that I and Rachael Hamilton support both farming and forestry. There are jobs in planting trees, in silviculture—looking after trees during their lifetime—and in felling them. There are jobs in panel products, sawmills and house building. Wood is a sustainable material that should surely be supplanting concrete and brick, and we should be growing more of our own and relying less on imports. Britain imports more wood as a proportion of its total consumption than every country in the world, apart from China.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I completely understand that we need to ensure that we have United Kingdom provenance in our forestry supply chain.

However, the wording of amendment 29 does not take away from the fact that it is clear from communities and people who live in the relevant areas that jobs are not going to them. If we could steer some of those employment opportunities in our wonderful forestry industry and supply chain towards them, that would be another thing—but I am going off topic. That is not to say that I do not support forestry—I was at a recent industry event in the chamber, which was sponsored by Fergus Ewing. I just do not want to see a monoculture landscape.

On my amendment 28 regarding multiyear funding, I ask the cabinet secretary whether it would be okay if I were to ask the Scottish Government for a spending commitment before its budget announcement. The UK Parliament provided year-on-year funding across a session of Parliament, with a Bew uplift to support Scottish agriculture. It said that that was what was going to do and that it would not announce something before a spending review.

However, the Scottish Government using that ring-fenced funding for something else takes away from it. The Scottish Government deferred the funding and £46 million has disappeared from the rural affairs budget, which supports agriculture. The Scottish Government expects farmers to do the heavy lifting in its aspirations to meet net zero targets.

**Mairi Gougeon:** It is important to point out that Rachael Hamilton is absolutely not comparing like with like in describing the different scenarios.

Parliament outlined exactly why the savings were made and why they were taken: it was down to the fact that they were ring fenced and had to be spent on our rural communities. That is the very nature of ring fencing. That money will be returned to the portfolio, as was committed to at the time by the then finance secretary and First Minister.

We can compare that to the situation that we are in with the UK Government. Funding is confirmed and allocated only on an annual basis. It is therefore impossible for me, and it would be completely irresponsible of me, to commit to a multiyear financial framework when I do not have that certainty, confirmation and commitment from the UK Government.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I thank the cabinet secretary for trying to justify the Scottish Government's actions in deferring the money—£46 million of funding, of which only £15 million has been promised for 2025-26. What certainty does that give farmers? They need to know that they can get support from the Scottish Government to meet net zero targets and provide food security for this country. I believe that farmers should be supported, because they have faced significant global challenges over the past couple of years.

That is all I have to say on the group of amendments.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 28 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)

McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caitness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

16:15

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 49, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 28 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 27 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 27 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**Edward Mountain:** On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. I voted, but I am not sure whether my vote has been recorded. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Your vote has been recorded, Mr Mountain.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 49, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 27 disagreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Ariane Burgess to move or not move amendment 29.

**Ariane Burgess:** I have listened to the cabinet secretary and I accept her assurances on the guidance being updated. Given the strength of feeling on consulting communities, I trust that the forestry sector is listening to that, too. In that light, I will not move amendment 29.

*Amendment 29 not moved.*

#### After section 6

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 4 is on distribution and capping of support and assistance. Amendment 30, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 31 to 36.

**Ariane Burgess:** This group consists of seven amendments about redistribution of the agricultural budget. I know that some of my colleagues in the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee proposed similar amendments to achieve the same intention at stage 2, so I trust that there will be contributions to the debate on this crucial issue.

The intention behind all the amendments is to increase support for more people to make a good living from farming, crofting, growing, nature restoration and other good green jobs on the land. That will not only help rural communities to grow



and thrive; it is essential for tackling the climate and nature emergencies.

As I said earlier, when speaking to Rhoda Grant's amendment 10B, half of all farm support payments currently go to just 6.6 per cent of recipients—that is, those with the most land. Basic payments are known as income support, but many of the largest farms do not need income support. Richard Leonard made the point clearly at stage 2 that the largest payments go to landowners like the Duke of Buccleuch, the Earl of Moray, the Duke of Roxburghe and the Earl of Rosebery, who received between £1 million and £2 million in so-called income support in one year. That leaves too little for small-scale food producers, for new entrants and for more targeted incentives to support the climate and nature.

Each of my amendments in the group will ensure that public funds are better targeted to support more people carrying out activities in the public interest. Some of them could also help to slow the continued consolidation of larger and larger holdings that are owned by fewer and fewer people, which is incentivised through the current area-based system.

**Finlay Carson:** On the point that landowners are sometimes the biggest recipients of support, what evidence does the member have that those recipients are not delivering good value for money for the taxpayer in delivering climate change adaptations, given that we know that some of Scotland's largest rural estates contribute significantly to the rural economy, to biodiversity and to climate change mitigation?

**Ariane Burgess:** With my amendments, I am seeking to create some distribution so that we support smaller producers.

Section 9 of the bill gives ministers the power to cap and/or taper farm support payments. Amendment 31 would change that power to a duty, amendment 32 would restrict that duty to apply only to basic income support, and amendment 36 defines "basic income support", which is likely to be under tier 1 of the new framework.

Amendments 33 and 34 would require ministers to use a front-loading mechanism to redistribute a relatively small portion of the agriculture budget. EU member states are now required to redistribute at least 10 per cent of their agriculture budget. In Ireland, recipients now receive a higher payment per hectare for their first 30 hectares. Amendment 33 would set the threshold at 30 hectares, and amendment 34 would leave it open to the Scottish Government to determine the figure.

Amendment 35 would, in effect, create a minimum income floor, as there is no real living wage in agriculture. I heard the cabinet secretary's

concern at stage 2 that that could result in payments to people who were not delivering the desired outcomes, but surely that is one of the issues with the current payment system, whereas, under the future payment framework, more stringent conditions will have to be met in order to qualify for support, as my amendment alludes.

Amendment 30 is a last resort if my other amendments fail to receive support. It would not place a duty on ministers to redistribute any of the budgets or to ensure that farmers and crofters could make a living while delivering public goods, but it would require them to consider redistribution when designing support schemes and to report on any measures that they planned to take to achieve that and the impact that those would have on the distribution of payments.

I move amendment 30.

**Richard Leonard:** I rise in support of Ariane Burgess's amendments in this group. We have recently lost one of our greatest poets, novelists and thinkers, with the sad death of John Burnside, and every time I heard the protesting cries of the Scottish Land & Estates lobby over the past few days, I could not help but think of him. Not only did John Burnside call for a genuine redistribution of land and wealth and an end to subsidies to rich individuals and corporations; in one of his great memoirs, he wrote that he had nothing against money

"although I did feel it should be more evenly distributed, and any argument against doing exactly that struck me as specious, cowardly or self-serving."

Moreover, the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government has said to Parliament on a number of occasions that where the money goes is a reflection of our values. So, we need to decide whether we want to feather-bed the biggest, the richest and the wealthiest or whether we want to level the payment system up.

I think that Ariane Burgess is right in lodging these amendments, which are important for reasons of transparency, but I also think that John Burnside was right: we need a genuine redistribution. As Karl Marx said, it is not enough to interpret what is happening and where the money is going; the point is to change it.

**Mairi Gougeon:** A number of the amendments in this group reflect amendments that were previously lodged at stage 2 and that called for capping, redistributive action and front loading.

In relation to amendment 30, the actual detail of changes, including new schemes in the different tiers, will be provided for in secondary legislation using the proposed powers of the bill. That will involve further consultation through the associated impact assessments, along with parliamentary scrutiny. I have been clear that our approach is to

always co-develop with our industry and wider partners to ensure that legislation and regulation are best fitted to work and deliver the outcomes.

I understand the sentiment of amendment 30, and I can provide reassurance that any new schemes will be co-developed and that any redistributive mechanisms will be implemented as required and, in each case, adapted to the needs of the recipients in question, which may be much wider than is provided for in the proposed new section in amendment 30. After all, some support schemes might be focused on sustaining our rural communities rather than just agriculture. Amendment 30 is therefore inflexible and unnecessary, as the powers that are required are contained elsewhere in the bill and the appropriate checks and balances will form part of the rural support plan and the monitoring and evaluation of schemes.

Amendment 31 would make capping and tapering mandatory. I think that the intention, through amendment 32, is that that would affect only basic income support, and a definition of “basic income support” is provided by amendment 36. However, as was previously outlined, decisions on capping need to be worked through as part of the co-design process, in consultation with persons whom the Scottish ministers consider appropriate to deliver exactly what is needed in each case. I therefore urge Parliament not to support those amendments.

Amendments 33 to 35 seek to address matters that are related to our smaller producers. I have already made clear my commitment to ensuring that smaller producers continue to thrive, and we, too, want to see more of them. Capping and front loading continue to be portrayed as a solution, but we also need to consider more nuanced approaches to support smaller producers, which is exactly what we are doing as part of the small producer pilot.

The powers in the bill provide us with the ability to think more creatively about supporting small producers. It may be that, after engaging with persons whom the Scottish ministers consider appropriate, capping and/or front loading are considered to be an appropriate approach. However, to specify that in the bill would pre-empt that engagement and go against our commitment to co-development with the industry. I therefore ask Parliament not to support amendments 33 to 35, to allow that co-development to take place.

**Ariane Burgess:** I thank the cabinet secretary and my colleague Richard Leonard for their contributions. I have listened to the cabinet secretary and I take on board many of the points that were raised. However, I still believe that the amendments are essential if we are to create a fairer payment system and realise the objectives

of the bill, including thriving rural communities. None of the amendments would lock in area-based payments, because capping, tapering, front loading and a minimum income floor could apply regardless of the criteria for qualification for income support, but the amendments would assure small producers that the Scottish Government is serious about supporting them.

The cabinet secretary highlighted that her amendment 10 requires the report on the rural support plan to include the distribution of support that is provided. However, that could cover only distribution between sectors or geographical regions; it does not specify redistribution between larger and smaller farms or among all recipients of support. Therefore, I believe that my amendment 30 adds value.

The Scottish Greens urge members to vote for all the amendments in the group, and I press amendment 30.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 30 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**Foyso Choudhury (Lothian) (Lab):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

16:30

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Choudhury. Giving yourself a little more time to connect may help, but I will ensure that that vote is recorded.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)

Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)

McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 50, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 30 disagreed to.*

#### Section 9—Power to cap support and assistance

*Amendment 31 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 31 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire South) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 31 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 32 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 32 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)

Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 32 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 33 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 33 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 33 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 34 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 34 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 34 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 35 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 35 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice (Shirley-Anne Somerville):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Somerville. I will ensure that that is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 35 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 36 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 36 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)



Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 36 disagreed to.*

### **Section 10—Refusal or recovery of support where in the public interest**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We move to group 5, which is on the refusal or recovery of support where in the public interest. Amendment 37, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 38, 39 and 40.

**Ariane Burgess:** I will try to be brief on my amendments in this group, as they are quite self-explanatory.

Amendment 37 would give ministers the power to refuse to provide support if that would not align with the objectives of agricultural policy that are set out in the bill. That could be because of the intended activity or, for instance, if the recipient had previously engaged in tax evasion. The bill already includes the power for ministers to refuse to provide support if they consider that the provision of support would not be in the public interest, but “public interest” is quite a flexible concept. The amendment would add clarity by linking back to the policy objectives, and ministers could use that if they wished.

Amendment 38 continues with the same principle, but it specifies that ministers could refuse to provide support for land management for driven grouse shooting, where that is the “primary activity” of the landowner on that land. It is important to provide an explicit power to refuse to provide support in such circumstances, because managing land for driven grouse shooting is so clearly at odds with the objectives of the bill. Burning large swathes of heather and killing wild animals that compete with grouse or pheasants is clearly in direct opposition to the bill objective on

“nature restoration, climate mitigation and adaptation”,

and maintaining large areas of land as no-go areas for local communities does not promote thriving rural communities.

Amendment 39 would give ministers the power to refuse to provide support to or to recover support from

“any person found guilty of a wildlife crime or who has had a section 16AA licence revoked under the Wildlife and Countryside Act 1981”.

That section, which was introduced through the recent Wildlife Management and Muirburn (Scotland) Act 2024, establishes a licensing scheme for killing or taking certain birds in limited circumstances. If a person knowingly abuses such a licence, they should not be eligible for public support, and amendment 39 would grant ministers the power to refuse to provide such support.

I move amendment 37.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Edward Mountain to speak to amendment 40 and the other amendments in the group.

**Edward Mountain:** I will start with the positive one, which is amendment 40. The reason why I lodged it is that, where a grant or subsidy has been reclaimed, it is entirely right and equitable that the person who has had their grant or subsidy reclaimed can appeal to the Scottish ministers on the decision. It would then be up to the Scottish ministers to hear the appeal and dismiss it or to review it—that is the whole point of the amendment. It seems perfectly equitable to me that, if a decision is made, there should be a right of appeal.

I turn to the other amendments in the group. Amendment 37 is quite subjective and not objective in the way that it comes across. Because of that subjectivity, I am afraid that I cannot support it, and I urge members not to support it.

On amendment 38, I totally accept Ariane Burgess's dislike of grouse shooting, but grouse shooting still happens to be a legal activity in Scotland. Therefore, it is wrong to say that, because the "primary activity"—I want to dwell on what that means—on the land is grouse shooting, the landowner should not be able to get a subsidy.

16:45

Ariane Burgess has failed to define what "primary activity" is. How do you define "primary activity"? Is it the number of people who are employed, the income that comes in or the expenditure that goes out? Is it based on the number of sheep and cattle on the holding or on the number of grouse? It is too vague. If the member had really meant to do this, she ought to have been a lot clearer about what she meant. Because she has not been clear, and because grouse shooting remains legal in Scotland, it would be entirely wrong to do this. Grouse shooting can improve habitats on hills, especially where moorland management is carried out to protect and manage all species, not just one. I think that she is wrong.

Regarding amendment 39, the cabinet secretary has incredible powers when it comes to cross-compliance. If farmers or landowners who are claiming subsidies clearly fail to abide by the cross-compliance conditions, the cabinet secretary can stop their grant anyway. That is the whole point, so amendment 39, although well meaning, is not required.

I look forward to hearing the cabinet secretary's answers to those questions and hope that she

thinks that amendment 40 is fair and in line with natural justice.

**Richard Leonard:** I rise to support amendment 37, in the name of Ariane Burgess, because it is my considered view that alignment and consistency are extremely important here.

Let me share with Parliament an example. I recently corresponded with the cabinet secretary on the strange case of a major financial institution receiving major amounts of public money to plant trees in the Cairngorms national park while at the same time ramping up its investments in North American oil, gas and coal shares. According to *The Ferret*, in 2023, abrdn increased the value of its shareholdings in 33 coal, oil and gas firms in the USA by £234 million. In August 2023, it received a £2.5 million grant of public money, under the forestry grant scheme, for tree planting on the Far Ralia estate and for peatland restoration.

When I challenged that, the cabinet secretary explained in a letter to me:

"Scottish Forestry does not restrict funding to companies based on their wider business interests."

Well, I think that Scottish Forestry should look at wider business interests and activity. We need to take on corporate hypocrisy and big-money greenwashing, so I believe that amendment 37 takes us in the right direction.

**Mairi Gougeon:** Regarding amendment 37, objectives are overarching principles that are supported by the powers of the bill, and all support for those objectives is co-developed. Schemes will be developed only if they contribute to the objectives. Section 10 of the bill relates to instances in which a support payment should be refused or recovered, so amendment 37 is therefore not required.

On amendment 38, numerous landowners undertake grouse shooting alongside activities that we may want to support, because they deliver outcomes that are part of our vision for agriculture—namely, the production of high-quality food, climate mitigation and adaptation, and nature restoration. Peatland restoration is a good example of such an activity. There are some really important peatland restoration sites on land that is also used for grouse shooting, so precluding them from receiving support could have unforeseen long-term consequences.

Although I understand the sentiment of amendment 39, the amendment is not necessary for the purpose of withholding or recovering support. The inclusion of any specific circumstances in which support might be refused or recovered might imply that other convictions that are not included in the bill would not result in

the refusal of payment, which could add some confusion.

Therefore, for the reasons that I have set out, I ask members not to support amendments 37, 38 and 39.

Amendment 40 seeks to enable the Scottish ministers to make provisions by regulation about “the manner and circumstances in which a person who has had support refused or recovered under subsection (1) may ... have the Scottish Ministers review their decision ... or ... appeal the decision.”

The Scottish public finance manual describes the duty of best value in public services, which extends to the provision of support that is the purpose of this power.

However, it is equally important that there is transparency, and I agree that it is reasonable for there to be an appeal process to ensure appropriate application of the power.

**Finlay Carson:** Will the cabinet secretary give way?

**Mairi Gougeon:** I am just closing.

I am therefore happy to support amendment 40.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I invite Ariane Burgess to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 37.

**Ariane Burgess:** I appreciate the cabinet secretary’s comments and also the comments from my colleague Richard Leonard, who gave a good example of why it is important to consider not providing support if activity does not align with objectives.

On amendment 38, I listened with interest to the point that, in some situations, estates that have grouse moors also do peatland restoration and provide some jobs, but they do not provide nearly as many as would be created through nature-based businesses or, where possible, food production on land. Fundamentally, however, the Greens are clear that the main point is that public money should not be channelled into blood sports.

I will leave it there. I encourage all members to ensure that public funds are used for public good by voting for my amendments 37, 38 and 39. I press amendment 37.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 37 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Graeme Dey:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies—I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Dey. I will make sure that that is recorded.

**Michael Marra (North East Scotland) (Lab):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. [*Interruption.*] However, I think that my vote has now gone through.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I can confirm that your vote has been recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)

FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 37 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 38 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 38 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Graeme Dey:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies—again, I could not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Dey. I will make sure that that is recorded.

**Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Con):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Balfour. I will make sure that that is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 25, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 38 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 39 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 39 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

Members will note that we will shortly reach the next time limit. As a consequence, I am minded to accept, under rule 9.8.5A, a motion without notice that the time limit be extended by up to 30 minutes. I invite Jamie Hepburn to move such a motion.

*Motion moved,*

That, under rule 9.8.5A, the time limit for groups 4 to 6 be extended by up to 30 minutes.—[Jamie Hepburn.]

*Motion agreed to.*

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by  
 Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 39 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 40 moved—[Edward Mountain].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 40 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)

Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 104, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 40 agreed to.*

### Section 13—Regulations about support

17:00

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 6 is on eligibility for, assessment of, monitoring et cetera of, and information about support. Amendment 41, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 42, 43, 46, 48 and 49. I call Ariane Burgess to move amendment 41 and speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Ariane Burgess:** My amendments in this group aim to ensure that small producers have a route to receiving direct payments from the core agricultural budget and not only from separate support schemes that may be time limited and less secure.

Currently, farmers, crofters and growers who are on less than three hectares of land are ineligible for basic payments, but smaller farms and market gardens tend to produce the most food per hectare and to use nature-friendly farming methods, not to mention contributing to thriving local communities; they should be supported.

I discussed amendment 41 at stage 2, and I am bringing it back to highlight the principle that it would be ideal if regulations allowed applicants the choice of being assessed for support either based on land area or on productive agricultural activity. However, I have reflected on points that were made in meetings with the cabinet secretary, who suggested two alternative amendments to achieve that intention, so I will not press amendment 41.

Amendment 43 would allow ministers to vary the minimum amount of land that is required to be eligible for support for different types of farming. That means that local vegetable growers could potentially qualify for support even if they have less than three hectares.

Amendment 42 would enable ministers to make provision for making support dependent on meeting a certain turnover threshold rather than on owning a certain amount of land. Stakeholders brought that solution to my attention, and I suggested it to the Scottish Government many months ago, so I am pleased to be able to move that amendment today with the Government’s support.

Amendment 46 would ensure that those who are receiving rural support payments would need to act in accordance with land reform and land access aims, as set out in the Scottish land rights and responsibilities statement. Those principles include:

“contribute to public interest and wellbeing, and balance public and private interests.”

If the Government believes that explicitly mentioning the land rights and responsibilities statement is not necessary, I am interested to hear its arguments for that.

The Scottish Greens oppose Edward Mountain's amendment 48, which would restrict the level of penalty that is due for overclaiming support. Overclaims could be very large sums—particularly when they are submitted by large landowners. Restricting the penalty to only 10 per cent of the overclaim could make for a disproportionately low penalty, even if it is the recipient's first overclaim, and particularly if the overclaim support does not have to be paid back.

We also strongly support Richard Leonard's amendment 49.

I move amendment 41.

**Edward Mountain:** I will speak only to my amendment, rather than to the other amendments in the group, because it is important.

In a previous life, I had to fill in numerous single-farm payment sheets. During the worst year, I think I had to fill in 15. It was probably the most traumatising period of my life. If just looking at them did not cause me to have grey hairs, I had them by the time I got to the end of the sheets.

The reason for that is that the complexities are such that it is very easy to make an unintentional mistake. There was no aim to be dishonest, but it is easy to make a mistake. For example, one could argue that, if someone has grazing on the foreshore for at least 12 hours of the day, they have grazing right the way down to the low-water mark, but it could be argued that, on high tide, they only have it to the high tide mark, or it could be somewhere in between. If someone tried to claim for that reasonably and made a mistake, under the old system they could lose their entire claim. One of the major problems that farmers had is that if they genuinely made a mistake they got absolutely hammered by the European Union, which demanded huge quantities of money back.

Amendment 48 is to say that, in the first instance, if someone genuinely makes a mistake, they should obviously pay back all of the money that they made a mistake in claiming, but the fine on top of that should be limited to 10 per cent. If, after that, a person makes another error, in another year, they would lose that money, as a proviso.

That approach is a genuine attempt not to have farmers spending half the night filling in their forms, as I often used to do. I am sure that everyone who is involved in agriculture will have heard farmers say, "If we make a genuine mistake, treat it as such. If we have made a mistake, we will accept it."

**Rachael Hamilton:** I often receive casework inquiries from farmers who have made simple calculation errors of the type that Edward Mountain has described, such as mistakes in areas of land caused by GPS issues. Penalising them costs them dearly, because such subsidies represent their livelihoods. It is important that we recognise that, as Mr Mountain has described so well, farmers sometimes make genuine mistakes, as we all do. His amendment 48 recognises that very well.

**Edward Mountain:** I agree with Rachael Hamilton. I also agree with Ariane Burgess that if someone has dishonestly claimed money they should lose their subsidy. They should lose all their subsidy, as far as I am concerned. However, if they have made a mistake, they should not be fined for that. I do not accept Ms Burgess's argument that big landowners who make large claims will get away with more. They would have to pay all the money back and also receive a 10 per cent fine. For example, if they misclaimed a subsidy of £50,000—members will be able to do the maths—they would have to pay back the £50,000 plus a £5,000 fine. That is quite draconian when subsidies probably make up 18 to 20 per cent of farmers' income.

I urge members to support my amendment 48. It represents nothing more than a way of trying to make the long nights of filling in claim forms easier for farmers, in the knowledge that if they genuinely make a mistake, say through misdeclaring a small amount of area, they will not lose all their subsidy.

**Richard Leonard:** I thank the cabinet secretary for her constructive approach to my amendment 49, which is designed to promote openness and transparency on the ownership and control of a business or farm that is in receipt of public funds under the farm payment system. After all, we are talking about £0.5 billion or more in public funds in any one year, so this is a matter of public interest.

The level of transparency that amendment 49 provides would prevent the misuse of UK corporate structures. It would also improve prevention of economic crimes such as fraud, money laundering and tax evasion, and it represents good audit practice. Since 2016, people with significant control have had to be registered with Companies House. Since 2022, overseas entities have also had to be declared to the register kept at Companies House. Since April 2022, the Scottish Government has required that a controlling interest in land in Scotland has to be declared in the land register that is maintained by Registers of Scotland.

**Finlay Carson:** During the committee's evidence taking there was no suggestion that there had been any fraud on a large scale. Can Mr Leonard point to any examples in which



agricultural support payments have been fraudulently claimed at the level that he suggests?

**Richard Leonard:** What I am suggesting is a preventative strategy, in which openness will drive out the possibility of any such crimes being committed. I am really just pointing out standards that are mainstream, and have been introduced under the auspices of a Conservative Government, to prevent money laundering in all sorts of spheres of the economy. The point of amendment 49 is to publish more information, including the ultimate owner or controller of a business or farm that is in receipt of such moneys. Limited administrative burdens would be placed on those required to make such disclosures, precisely because they already have to be made to Companies House and to Registers of Scotland.

In the stage 1 debate, I mentioned, as an example, that the recipients of the two largest farm payments in 2022 were Queensberry Farming Limited, which received £1.8 million, and Bowhill Farming Limited, which received £1.7 million. Both of those companies are owned by the Duke of Buccleuch—but you would not know that from the published data. This amendment seeks to close that gap. Perhaps we should not be surprised to learn that Scottish Land & Estates does not support this amendment, but, unusually for it, it is very shy about telling us the reasons why.

This information should be openly available and transparent; it should not need to be subject to freedom of information requests or journalistic digging. Passing this amendment would herald an important breakthrough on the road to making the agricultural payments system more transparent, more accountable and more open, allowing us in Parliament—but also the people—to see who ultimately makes decisions and who ultimately benefits from these payments of public money.

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):** Thank you. I call the cabinet secretary.

**Mairi Gougeon:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. As highlighted at stage 2, amendment 41 would create a situation in which recipients could choose to have support based on either land area or productive activity. From a practical standpoint, that would result in a complex and, in my view, unworkable administrative process, so I ask Parliament not to support that amendment.

The changes that are proposed by Ariane Burgess in amendments 42 and 43 are helpful in clarifying the scope of the powers in sections 13 and 14 of the bill, and I am happy to support them.

I thank Ariane Burgess for lodging amendment 46 because it highlights the importance of our land rights and responsibilities statement under the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2016. The principles in the land rights and responsibilities statement

apply to everyone who has rights and responsibilities in relation to land, including those who will receive support under our future financial framework. Compliance with the principles is voluntary. Ministers must promote the principles as set out in the land rights and responsibilities statement, and that duty applies to them when using any of the powers under the bill. Where appropriate, ministers would, for example, require to have regard to the principles when providing for conditions for support under section 6 of the bill.

However, the land rights and responsibilities principles are high level and policy focused. They are not designed to apply to everyone, and, in particular, they do not set out conditions that could properly be applied to every person who receives support under the bill, as is proposed by this amendment. Although the amendment is well intentioned, it is not needed and it does not work. For that reason, I asked Ariane Burgess not to move it.

On amendment 48, I understand that Edward Mountain is keen to ensure that farmers and crofters are not hit by a disproportionate penalty for a first mistake. It is important that penalties are proportionate. We have already used our powers under the Agriculture (Retained EU Law and Data) (Scotland) Act 2020 to simplify and improve penalty rules. However, amendment 48 risks making penalties less proportionate; it might mean that ministers would be unable to provide for a penalty that would have the right dissuasive effect and, in particular, it would prevent appropriate penalties being applied should public funds have been fraudulently claimed.

The bill is a framework bill and it must be possible to exercise it flexibly over the long term. Future administrative penalties should be fully considered with farmers, crofters and other stakeholders as part of the co-design process that we have committed to.

**Edward Mountain:** I hear what the cabinet secretary says on that particular point. Given that some of that provision will be carried forward in regulation, will she undertake to discuss those regulations to ensure proportionality—so that the fines meet the crimes—because that might help me to decide not to move the amendment?

**Mairi Gougeon:** As I hope that I have just outlined in my comments, that is very much part of our process of co-design. We want to discuss that with farmers and crofters as we go forward and bring forward any regulations in that regard.

On amendment 49, I absolutely agree with Richard Leonard that ministers should be able to make regulations that provide for the publication of information about persons who own or control the recipient of support. That is why I am happy to

support this amendment, and I want to thank him for working constructively with me on that following stage 2.

I am sure that we are all supportive of making clear the ability of Scottish ministers to report upon the end destination of future public support for agriculture, but we will, of course, work with stakeholders to co-design any regulations that we make under that power and consult the Scottish Information Commissioner.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Ariane Burgess to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 41.

17:15

**Ariane Burgess:** Many larger farms employ sustainable and regenerative methods in contributing to local economies. My amendments are not intended to ignore or diminish those benefits, but I reiterate the importance of giving secure support to small-scale farmers, crofters and growers. Many peer-reviewed publications assert that smaller farms tend to produce higher yields and more biodiversity per hectare, and they tend to provide more jobs per hectare, as they use less mechanisation than many larger farms. Further, small producers usually value the local distribution of their food above the production of commodities for export.

Small producers also deserve support, so the Greens encourage members to support my amendments 42 and 43. I will not press amendment 41, which has the same aim.

I heard what the cabinet secretary said about my amendment 46, so I will not move it, as I trust that other mechanisms will ensure that landowners abide by the land rights and responsibilities statement. With that, I seek to withdraw amendment 41.

*Amendment 41, by agreement, withdrawn.*

### Section 14—Eligibility criteria for support

*Amendment 42 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 42 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 88, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 42 agreed to.*

*Amendment 43 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 43 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**Bill Kidd (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Kidd. We will ensure that your vote is recorded.

#### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 88, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 43 agreed to.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Group 7 is on fair work, temporary migrant workers and workers' accommodation. Amendment 44, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 45, 47, 53 and 56.

**Ariane Burgess:** All the amendments in the group are concerned with safeguarding vulnerable seasonal workers on farms. The Scottish Government has recognised the problems with the seasonal worker visa that was created by the UK Government to mitigate the shortage of workers due to Brexit. Unfortunately, Scotland cannot change the seasonal workers scheme, as migration is a reserved matter, but my amendments in the group offer a way to mitigate some of the harms.

Amendment 53 would place a duty on ministers to publish a register of farms that employ temporary migrant workers and that have put certain measures in place to protect them. If such a register existed, seasonal workers could consider a prospective employer and make an informed decision about whether to enter into an employment contract with them. That is particularly important in the case of seasonal workers because their contracts are linked to their accommodation and their visa. If something goes wrong in their job, they are disincentivised to speak out for fear of losing their place to stay or even having to leave the country.

In the housing sector, letting agents must provide certain information to join the Scottish letting agent register so that the Government can ensure that they are fit and proper persons to let accommodation. The register and related powers also enable ministers to seek information to monitor compliance and to conduct inspections. That is just what is needed to protect vulnerable seasonal workers.

My amendment 45 would allow ministers to include fair work principles within the eligibility criteria for support for persons who employ temporary migrant workers. Amendment 44 is similar, but it would add inclusion on the employer register as a potential criterion for support. It also sets out three fair work considerations:

“the wages paid to workers ... the availability of channels for workers' representation”,

such as unions, and

“any history of tax avoidance”

by the employer. Those considerations mirror those that are set out in the fair work guidance for public sector grants.

The Scottish Greens consider that any employer who receives public funds should offer fair work conditions. We therefore urge members to support amendments 53, 45 and 44 and amendment 47, which simply defines “temporary migrant worker”, drawing on definitions in relevant legislation.

Richard Leonard's amendment 56 would enable agricultural officers to make inspections of accommodation that is provided for seasonal workers to ensure that it is “fit for human habitation”. I have been raising the issue with the Scottish Government for several months. Last year, the Worker Support Centre Scotland supported 63 farm workers on housing issues, including holes in caravans, damp, black mould, rodent infestations, broken toilets and windows that would not open. I am very grateful that Mr Leonard has persevered and that the Government is supporting amendment 56. I encourage other members to do the same.

I move amendment 44.

**Richard Leonard:** I remind members of my voluntary register of trade union interests.

The Scottish Agricultural Wages Board sets the minimum rates of pay and other conditions of service for agricultural workers in Scotland. Those include a daily accommodation offset for workers for accommodation other than a house. In 2024, that offset increased by 9 per cent to £9.99 per day, which is directly deducted from wages. The Scottish Government estimates that there are between 6,000 and 7,000 seasonal workers in Scotland in any one year, and they invariably have that direct deduction taken from their wages.

When the cabinet secretary told us at stage 2 that she did not want to

“bring housing matters into the bill”,—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 15 May 2024; c 87.]

it was too late. They are already there. They are a fundamental part of the fabric of our rural communities, of agricultural life in Scotland and of employment contractual relations, especially on farms where accommodation is tied to employment.

We receive report after report containing irrefutable evidence that migrant seasonal workers brought over by labour providers on six-month visas under the seasonal worker visa scheme are not living but barely existing on farms in portakabins or static caravans that are not insulated and that are damp and covered in mould, which have security and personal safety issues and which are infested with rodents, and where there are no laundry facilities and unsanitary conditions are all too common. We hear of examples of shared facilities in situations where as many as 30 people are sharing the one facility.

All those findings have been unearthed by the authoritative Worker Support Centre Scotland. That is why I have lodged my amendment 56—to set some standards of decency and dignity, and to ensure that seasonal workers should have

“satisfactory facilities for the washing and cleaning of laundry”

and that

“water, heating and power should be included in any accommodation charge”

rather than people being charged extra. It is my simple contention that, as the Scottish Agricultural Wages Board is responsible for setting the daily rate for temporary accommodation, it should be ensuring that that accommodation is fit for human habitation.

Why do I continue to press this matter? Well, in a letter to me last week, the cabinet secretary

revealed that not one farm or business with seasonal workers anywhere in Scotland has been selected for a control test inspection by the agricultural wages enforcement team in the past five years—not one. Even if there had been an inspection, the cabinet secretary informs me,

“the standard of accommodation is not part of the routine questioning as it is not covered by the Agricultural Wages (Scotland) Order.”

Of course, the daily accommodation offset is covered by the Agricultural Wages (Scotland) Order 2024. That letter of last week, in the cabinet secretary’s own words, makes the case for amendment 56 far better than I ever could.

There is a huge gap in regulation and in enforcement, and so in protection. It is worse, because at stage 2 the cabinet secretary spoke of local authority duties in this area, but the problem with that is that the “tolerable standard” that is set out in the Housing (Scotland) Act 1987 does not currently apply to accommodation for seasonal workers. It is true that the Caravan Sites and Control of Development Act 1960 makes provision for the oversight of caravans, and it is also true that local authorities license and inspect sites under that act, but seasonal agricultural accommodation is excluded.

We are told that we have to wait for the delivery of the housing to 2040 strategy and for a future cross-tenure housing bill to address those severe deficiencies. In the same letter that I quoted, however, the cabinet secretary was forced to admit that we will have to wait until 2025 before even the consultation on that bill will start. If past consultations are anything to go by, that legislation will not reach the statute book in the current session of Parliament.

To members of Parliament, I say what about the workers arriving in Scotland in the coming weeks for the fruit harvest? What about the workers arriving in Scotland in the coming months for vegetable and crop harvesting? What happens next week? What is the cabinet secretary going to do about that? Will she tell Parliament today? Do we not owe it to those migrant workers to take on the responsibility to act now? Justice delayed is justice denied, so let us get on with it.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I will turn first to amendments 44, 45, 47 and 53, in the name of Ariane Burgess. Those amendments seek to enable or require ministers to take action to safeguard the interests of temporary migrant workers. However, they cover not only workers in agriculture but all migrant workers. I agree that it is important that workers in agriculture—indeed, all workers—are treated fairly. The Government is committed to fair work and we are doing what we can to promote it.

The powers in the bill enable ministers to provide grant-in-aid for the purposes that are set out in schedule 1, and it is Scottish Government policy, as part of our commitment to fair work, that grant-in-aid that is paid under the bill will be subject to fair work conditions. It is a standard condition that the grantee shall ensure that all staff aged 16 and over who are directly employed and work in Scotland, including apprentices, are paid at least the real living wage. It is a standard condition that the grantee shall demonstrate that all workers employed within their organisation have access to effective workers' voice channels, including agency workers.

17:30

We amended the bill at stage 2 so that ministers must, when preparing a rural support plan, have regard to

“the desirability of the agricultural sector operating with fair work principles”.

We have to be careful that we do not stray into territory that is outwith our devolved competence, which is why the amendment that was introduced at stage 2 was drafted as it was.

Ariane Burgess seeks to provide for a new register of employers at stage 3, but that kind of reform needs much more consideration and consultation than has been possible at such a late stage in the process. For example, it is not clear whether the proposed register is to be a register of all persons who might employ migrant workers or a register only of employers of migrant workers who are considered to operate with fair work principles. It is not clear how compliance with any registration requirement would be enforced, or even whether it could be, and it is not clear whether the register is to be a public register. However, it is clear that any requirement to register would impact the privacy of employers. That is why we should consult the Scottish Information Commissioner before making any such requirements, which has not happened in this case.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I listened carefully to what Richard Leonard said about some of the conditions in which migrant workers are living in caravans. Local authorities have the ability to inspect, so, if the things that Richard Leonard has talked about are true, why is the Scottish Government not ensuring that monitoring and compliance are being achieved?

**Mairi Gougeon:** I have not yet turned to Richard Leonard's amendment, but I will, I hope, answer that query when I do.

In relation to Ariane Burgess's amendments, as I have said, it is important that workers in agriculture—indeed, all workers—get a fair deal.

However, we need to keep in mind that employment and immigration powers are reserved, so there are limits to what we can do within devolved legislative competence. For all those reasons, I strongly urge members not to support Ariane Burgess's amendments.

Richard Leonard has raised a number of very important points, and we met to discuss many of the issues that he raised at stage 2. Amendment 56 seeks to fill a perceived gap in the duty of agricultural wages inspectors, whose role is to ensure the correct observance of the Agricultural Wages (Scotland) Act 1949, which does not cover accommodation standards. Although I completely understand why Richard Leonard has raised concerns, unfortunately, I cannot accept his amendment, because it would not work, as it would provide for the delegation of functions that do not exist.

While dealing with routine or complaint inspections, members of the agricultural wages enforcement team already report to the appropriate local authority any concerns that are raised by employees about the condition of their accommodation. That is procedural practice and allows the appropriate authority to deal with housing issues.

The legislation in this area is extremely complex, particularly in connection with mobile homes, caravans and migrant workers. The Government is committed to working with all parties, and it would therefore be more suitable for any potential changes to be considered in the round, because the issue affects more than just agricultural workers.

The Scottish Government aims to publish a public consultation on our new cross-tenure housing standard in 2025. It is anticipated that the consultation will include consideration of a new standard for all homes—new ones and existing ones—including agricultural properties, mobile homes and tied accommodation.

**Richard Leonard:** What is the cabinet secretary's answer to the question that I asked at the end of my contribution? What is going to happen this year when people arrive? The Government is proud of its record on encouraging immigration, which I support, but we need to treat people properly when they arrive, and it is obvious from the evidence that we have seen that that is not happening, so we cannot wait until 2026 or 2027. What will happen next week? What will happen next month?

**Mairi Gougeon:** I absolutely appreciate the points that Richard Leonard has made, but there is no getting around the fact that, as I have outlined, this is a complex area. As well as meeting Richard Leonard directly, I met the Worker Support Centre

to hear directly about some of the issues that people are experiencing on the ground.

The issues cut across a number of different areas and, unfortunately, I cannot wave a magic wand to make them all immediately disappear. I want to ensure that we continue our work, so I offer Richard Leonard a meeting with me and Paul McLennan, the Minister for Housing, so that we can start to get to grips with and address some of the issues, because they are hugely important. I hope that he will take me up on that offer of a meeting to see how we can take things forward.

However, given the nature of the issue and the fact that it cuts across different areas and is so complex, I urge Richard Leonard not to move amendment 56.

**Ariane Burgess:** Seasonal workers who labour on our farms are inherently vulnerable. They are not in the UK for long enough to earn rights against unfair dismissal, and many do not speak any English and come from countries where it can be dangerous to speak up to authority. They are not represented by unions or directly by MSPs, but we still have a responsibility to care about them when they are working in Scotland. There have been a relatively small number of incidents of unfair treatment of seasonal workers on Scottish farms, but recently the Worker Support Centre has found four serious breaches of the agricultural wages order.

Even one case of seasonal worker mistreatment or exploitation is one too many. We cannot build Scotland's agricultural success on the mistreatment of others who are doing key work to put food on our tables. However, I have listened carefully to the cabinet secretary's comments on my amendments on a number of issues, including the need for more consultation and for consideration to delve more into the detail to get more understanding on compliance, on whether the register will be public and on the need to consult the Information Commissioner.

Through our conversations in the lead-up to stage 3, I understand that there could be complications to do with reserved matters. I will therefore seek to withdraw amendment 44 and I will not move my other amendments in this group. I look forward to constructive collaboration with the cabinet secretary on this important issue.

*Amendment 44, by agreement, withdrawn.*

*Amendments 45 to 47 not moved.*

### **Section 16—Checking, enforcing and monitoring support**

**The Presiding Officer:** Amendment 48, in the name of Edward Mountain, has already been debated with amendment 41. I call Edward

Mountain to say whether he wishes to move or not move the amendment.

**Edward Mountain:** Sorry—give me two seconds, Presiding Officer. Yes, I will move it. Sorry, but, on amendment 40, we have—

**The Presiding Officer:** This is amendment 48.

**Edward Mountain:** Amendment 48?

**The Presiding Officer:** Yes.

**Edward Mountain:** Sorry, Presiding Officer. I decided not to move that amendment, because I had assurances from the cabinet secretary.

*Amendment 48 not moved.*

### **Section 17—Publication of information about support**

*Amendment 49 moved—[Richard Leonard].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 49 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

**The Minister for Public Health and Women's Health (Jenni Minto):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I apologise, but my phone did not connect. I would have voted yes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Minto. We will ensure that that is recorded.

**Gillian Martin:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I had exactly the same issue. I would have voted yes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Martin. We will ensure that that is recorded, too.

### **For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)

Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

## Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 86, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 49 agreed to.*

## After section 18

*Amendment 12 moved—[Mairi Gougeon]—and agreed to.*

## Section 26—Code of practice on sustainable and regenerative agriculture

**The Presiding Officer:** We move on to group 8, on a code of practice on sustainable and regenerative agriculture. Amendment 50, in the name of Edward Mountain, is the only amendment in the group.

**Edward Mountain:** Amendment 50 is a simple amendment to get to the bottom of what “sustainable and regenerative agriculture” means. It was driven home to me this morning at the Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee, when we heard a call for that term, which is being used in relation to land reform, to be explained. I have been farming for 40 years, and I think I know what is sustainable and regenerative, but I do not know what it is in law, so I am calling on the Government to set that out within a year of section 26 coming into force, so as to explain it to humble people like me.

I move amendment 50.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I have quite a simple response to a simple amendment. I am content that the code should be published in a timely manner, so that our farmers and crofters can use it to best



effect in undertaking their activities in a manner that is sustainable and regenerative. Amendment 50 provides that certainty of publication within a set timeframe, and I urge members to support it.

**Edward Mountain:** I have nothing to add to the words of the cabinet secretary, which are incredibly wise in this situation.

*Amendment 50 agreed to.*

### **Section 27—Continuing professional development**

**The Presiding Officer:** We move to group 9, on continuing professional development. Amendment 3, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, is grouped with amendments 13, 4, 51, 52 and 14.

**Beatrice Wishart:** Amendment 3, in my name, would ensure that peer-to-peer learning is a form of continuous professional development covered by the bill. The importance of this type of learning in the agriculture sector was highlighted on several occasions to the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, including at our fact-finding farm visits. I believe that there would be merit in clearly laying out in the bill that that kind of learning is supported. I thank Edward Mountain for his support of amendment 3, and I acknowledge his similar amendment at stage 2.

Amendment 4, also in my name, creates provision for continuous professional development to be fair and proportionate by considering the number of employees, the scale of agricultural activity and the geographical location of the farm, croft or land. The intention behind the amendment is to ensure that CPD is accessible to all farmers and crofters, regardless of the size and location of their farm or croft. I would appreciate any assurance that the cabinet secretary can provide that the Scottish Government will be ensuring that that is in the design of CPD.

Amendment 52 requires Scottish ministers to “consult such persons as they consider appropriate”

before making CPD regulations. CPD must be co-designed with farmers and crofters to ensure that it is effective in achieving its aims. Amendment 52 would ensure that there is a statutory requirement for farmers, crofters and land managers to have their views on continuous professional development considered by Scottish ministers before they make relevant regulations.

I move amendment 3.

**Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP):** Amendment 13 would insert a new paragraph into section 27(3), adding new matter to that list:

“circumstances in which a person who would otherwise be required to undertake particular, or a particular amount of, CPD activities does not have to do so”.

The amendment provides that there may be particular circumstances in which persons who are required to undertake compulsory CPD are justifiably not able to for various reasons such as illness or other reasonable circumstances. I ask Parliament to support amendment 13.

17:45

**Rachael Hamilton:** Amendment 51 is a replica of my stage 2 amendment, which fell in error—I will not clype on anyone about the circumstances. CPD should be inclusive and attainable. Amendment 51 specifies that CPD must be affordable and accessible for those receiving the training. That ensures that CPD requirements do not create an excessive financial burden for them.

Turning to the other amendments in the group that I wish to address, I highlight my strong support for amendment 3 in the name of Beatrice Wishart, which is also supported by my colleague Edward Mountain, and which acknowledges the value of peer-to-peer learning. I recently attended the National Sheep Association’s Scotsheep event at Aikengall farm near Dunbar, where I spoke to the mental health support charity Farmstrong Scotland, which was strongly of the opinion that farmers are much more comfortable when speaking with like-minded peers. Amendment 3 is one of the most significant amendments to the bill.

**Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP):** I am pleased to speak to amendment 14 in my name. It has quite a few subsections. I highlight that the National Farmers Union Scotland supports the amendment.

I have a particular interest in the parts of the bill that relate to continuing professional development. I was a clinical nurse educator in my previous role with NHS Dumfries and Galloway and I was embedded in education and CPD for 30 years as a registered nurse. During those 30 years, I witnessed and experienced the value of on-going education and CPD.

I am also acutely aware of the value of CPD for agriculture, having visited Scotland’s Rural College in Dumfries and Galloway on a number of occasions as well as Scotland’s Rural College Edinburgh campus. I have met the SRUC team on many occasions and I have heard from the exceptional experts who provide education for our current and future farmers about how education, research and CPD are crucial for agricultural, forestry and rural skills development and enhancement.

I thank everyone who assisted me in lodging amendment 14 in order to make it clear in the bill that continuing professional development activities need to be made available in a range of formats,

including peer-to-peer CPD, which committees and colleagues highlighted at stage 2.

Peer-to-peer learning is the term used in Beatrice Wishart's amendment 3, which I tend to agree with. My amendment helps to demonstrate that there is no requirement for farmers, crofters, land managers and other agricultural producers to attend off-farm education or education away from their business for their CPD. With CPD, a person who is working in agricultural production could obtain knowledge or improve their knowledge about the best techniques, innovations and skills in a range of ways that meet their individual needs. That could mean peer support as well as completing online learning. That is similar to how healthcare staff achieve much of their required continuing professional development—and it works. NFU Scotland has highlighted that CPD could be obtained by engaging with professional organisations, and an example that it used was the Soil Association.

Amendment 14 inserts a new section after section 27, requiring ministers to monitor the impact of the CPD schemes that are made under section 27 and to report on their impact and effectiveness, with particular regard to the findings of that monitoring and the matters set out in proposed new subsection 2. Those matters reflect particular points that were raised at stage 2 that relate to range, format and type of access, and ensure that ministers are required to monitor how future CPD schemes deliver against those issues, which means that CPD can be delivered optimally.

Proposed new subsection 5 would require ministers to lay any such reports before the Scottish Parliament and to publish them.

Proposed subsections 3 and 4 respectively would give ministers discretion around the manner and period or periods for monitoring, and over the number and frequency of reports.

Proposed subsection 6 includes a new enabling power and would allow ministers to modify by regulation the matters that are set out in subsection 2, subject to the affirmative procedure under subsection 7.

Taken together, proposed subsections 3, 4 and 6 would give ministers an appropriate degree of flexibility to ensure that the monitoring and reporting was undertaken as effectively as possible in respect of future CPD schemes.

Amendment 14 would ensure that the focus of such monitoring and reporting would remain relevant and could be tailored to ensure that its delivery was as effective as possible. I hope that the Government and members support amendment 14.

**Edward Mountain:** I rise to speak in support of Beatrice Wishart's excellent amendment 3, which I recognise from the amendment that I lodged at stage 2—unfortunately, it did not get through. The reason why I was keen for peer-to-peer learning is that that is where farmers come into their own. Not only do they learn from farmers in their locality what is going on but they learn some of the tricks that they have to get around the problems that are encountered. For example, they can feed cows more iodine in their mineral licks to enable easier calving, which is something that you learn from experience on the ground. That was certainly brought out by the groups that were run by the Scottish Agricultural College, such as the suckler cow groups across Moray, for example, which I found particularly useful.

There is another reason why peer-to-peer learning is so important. It allows you to see your neighbour at very busy times, when they might be struggling with some of the problems that they are having to face. For example, unless you have actually done it, no one knows what it is like to have a tricky calving or lambing, where you lose a substantial number of calves or lambs, despite all your hard work. Therefore, having a period to reflect on that with your peers in a peer-to-peer learning group is incredibly important. Not only does it teach you things but it gives you a chance to assess your neighbour's mental health, if they are struggling, which does happen.

I like Beatrice Wishart's amendments 4 and 52 about co-design and the number of employees. Obviously, Rachael Hamilton's amendment 51 about making sure that CPD is affordable is absolutely critical. Monitoring such schemes is really important, especially if peer-to-peer learning is funded not only by the private sector but by the Government. The Government will want to ensure that its money is well spent.

I hope that members will agree to Beatrice Wishart's amendment 3 on peer-to-peer learning, which I whole-heartedly support, having raised the issue in the first place.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I note at the outset that Scottish ministers recognise the importance of peer-to-peer learning, for all the reasons that have been set out by Beatrice Wishart and, as Edward Mountain said, because of its value to farmers and crofters. I encourage the Parliament to support amendment 3.

Amendment 14 will introduce a monitoring and evaluation requirement covering important matters relating to accessibility, appropriateness and proportionality. Those matters reflect issues that were raised in amendments that were lodged at stage 2, and I agree that they are key. The flexibility that is built into the amendment on the manner and period of monitoring, the number and

frequency of reports to be prepared, the timescales for the monitoring to take place and the matters that it must focus on will allow monitoring and evaluation to be tailored to ensure that its delivery can be as effective as possible over time and to ensure that ministers share their assessment of the effectiveness of the CPD schemes that they have developed and implemented. I ask the Parliament to support the amendment.

On amendment 4, in the name of Beatrice Wishart, we fully intend to create a CPD regime that supports and empowers the individual to perform at their best without being unfair or unduly burdensome. Although I agree with the intent of the amendment, which is absolutely right, I believe that amendments 14 and 52, in the names of Emma Harper and Beatrice Wishart respectively, would more effectively address the issues that amendment 4 appears to be concerned with. Those amendments would allow the issues to be considered from the outset in future CPD design and would ensure that the impact and effectiveness in the areas of accessibility, appropriateness and proportionality are kept under review and adjusted as required.

As Rachael Hamilton has already outlined, amendment 51 is the same as an amendment that was lodged at stage 2. Although I absolutely agree that CPD needs to be accessible, including in its cost to users, that matter is addressed by amendment 14 on “Monitoring and evaluation of continuing professional development”, which would require monitoring and reporting on the costs that are associated with CPD activities, among other matters. Additionally, amendment 52 would introduce a statutory duty to consult on regulations that would consider those matters.

I must also emphasise that the drafting of amendment 51 is significantly problematic. Like amendment 4, amendment 51 would create a legal duty on ministers every single time that they used the power under section 27(1) to

“ensure that CPD activities are affordable and accessible for those receiving”

those activities. To begin with, the terms “affordable” and “accessible” are undefined, unclear and subjective and it is not clear how it would be reasonably or practically possible to comply with that. Furthermore, ministers will need to be able to use the power to make regulations on CPD that would not remotely touch on or in any way impact the affordability or accessibility of those CPD activities. For example, that might include any regulations that we might make about the certification of CPD providers; CPD recording, monitoring and enforcement; information processing or even minor technical and amending regulations.

The duty in amendment 51 would apply to every use of section 27(1), so where regulations would concern those matters but would not relate to CPD activities, it would not be possible for ministers to comply with the duty, thereby rendering it impossible to use the power. It goes without saying that that would cause major problems in establishing and managing future CPD regimes. In fairness, I do not think that is what Rachael Hamilton intended.

It should also be noted that ministers will separately have the power to provide financial support for accessing, developing and providing CPD under part 4 and under paragraph 8(1)(a) of schedule 1. Matters of affordability and accessibility would also be considered, where appropriate, as part and parcel of a business and regulatory impact assessment or of any other impact assessment linked to the introduction secondary legislation.

For all those reasons, I ask Rachael Hamilton not to press her amendment.

Amendment 13 recognises that there may be particular circumstances in which persons who are required to undertake CPD are justifiably not able to do so because of illness or other reasonable circumstances, so I ask Parliament to support that amendment.

Amendment 52 introduces a consultation requirement when using the section 27(1) CPD enabling power. Ministers have already informed stakeholders that they will co-design the CPD regime with them and, as I have already outlined, informal consultations have already taken place, with more planned for later this year and a formal consultation planned for next year. Nevertheless, I appreciate that amendment 52 will provide assurance that stakeholders’ views about the development of the regime will be sought and, accordingly, I ask Parliament to support amendment 52.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Beatrice Wishart to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 3.

**Beatrice Wishart:** I thank the cabinet secretary for her views on my amendments and am satisfied with her explanation that CPD will be designed in such a way as to ensure that it is accessible to farmers and crofters, regardless of the size or location of their farm or croft. I therefore will not move amendment 4 when we reach that point.

For the reasons that I and others have already stated, I believe that it is important to specify peer-to-peer learning in the bill, so I press amendment 3.

*Amendment 3 agreed to.*

*Amendment 13 moved—[Alasdair Allan]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 4 not moved.*

*Amendment 51 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 51 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Robison. We will ensure that that is recorded.

**Shirley-Anne Somerville:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I also could not connect. I would have voted no.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Somerville. We will ensure that that is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 48, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 51 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 52 moved—[Beatrice Wishart]—and agreed to.*

#### After section 27

*Amendment 14 moved—[Emma Harper]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 53 not moved.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we move on to group 10, I will suspend the meeting for a five-minute break. The division bell will ring when we are about to resume.

18:01

*Meeting suspended.*

18:09

*On resuming—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur):** We resume with group 10, which is on labour market intelligence. Amendment 54, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendment 55.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I will be brief, as we still have a little way to go. The commission for the land-based learning review was established to provide advice on how to attract more people into land-based and aquaculture sectors by improving learning pathways, but little progress seems to have been made. Perhaps the cabinet secretary could expand on that.

Amendment 54 seeks to support the challenges that the commission faced when carrying out the review. The average age of farmers is 59, so a succession plan for the future of the sector is essential. Amendment 54 relates to the collection of data for the purposes of aiding Skills Development Scotland in addressing skills demands in rural areas. I thank the cabinet secretary for providing comments on that ahead of stage 3, in which she noted potential competence issues with the amendment.

However, I have a solution: as an alternative, I have lodged amendment 55, which requires the Scottish ministers to review the agricultural labour market intelligence periodically. I believe that

amendment 55 satisfies the concerns that the cabinet secretary raised regarding an overlap with reserved matters. I sought advice from the Law Society of Scotland, which had no issues with either of the amendments or comments to make.

I move amendment 54.

**Mairi Gougeon:** Amendments 54 and 55 seek to address a gap that has been identified in labour market intelligence data in the agriculture sector. As Rachael Hamilton outlined, that was also highlighted in the recommendations by the commission for the land-based learning review, which we are currently working to address. As we outlined in our response to that review, we have committed to producing and publishing an implementation plan to consider how we would take forward those recommendations.

Although I appreciate the intent behind the amendments, I do not believe that the changes are necessary. The Agriculture (Retained EU Law and Data) (Scotland) Act 2020 already makes provision, as far as it is within devolved competence to do so, for the collection and processing of data relating to agricultural activity. We also already review and publish what data we have on agricultural labour market intelligence. For example, the 2020 act provides the legal basis for the sector completing the June agricultural census, which already includes questions on workforce numbers. That data is then published as part of our official statistics.

Given that the objectives of the amendments are already being addressed and have a suitable existing statutory basis, I ask Rachael Hamilton not to press amendments 54 and 55.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Rachael Hamilton to wind up and press or withdraw amendment 54.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I thank the cabinet secretary for explaining why she is not inclined to support my amendments, but I cannot see what there is not to like about achieving a robust platform to fill the gaps for future land-based jobs, based on environment, food security and other areas where there are skill shortages. We need to fill specific gaps in order to future proof agriculture. I will therefore press amendment 54, because I think that it fits nicely into the context of the bill.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 54 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)

Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 46, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 54 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 55 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

18:15

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 55 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)

Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)

Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 46, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 55 disagreed to.*

### After section 28

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 11 is on food security statements. Amendment 5, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is the only amendment in the group. I call Rachael Hamilton to move and speak to amendment 5.

**Rachael Hamilton:** Thank you, cabinet secretary—[*Laughter.*] Oh—thank you, Presiding Officer. Was that a promotion? I am not quite sure.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Don’t ask a question you don’t know the answer to—[*Laughter.*]

**Rachael Hamilton:** That is the first rule of politics, Presiding Officer.

Amendment 5 requires the Government to lay a statement on food security before the Parliament at least every three years. That will ensure that food security remains a priority concern for the Scottish Government—and for the country—and that Scotland-specific food security issues are

identified in a transparent manner and brought to the attention of the chamber.

This is a very topical issue. The UK Government has just released the new UK food security index, which gives that transparency. We also need that transparency in Scotland.

I move amendment 5.

**Ariane Burgess:** The Scottish Greens have some concerns about Rachael Hamilton's amendment 5. On one hand, requiring the Scottish Government to produce food security statements could be useful in highlighting the need for more food production in Scotland and more climate resilience. However, as Scottish Environment LINK pointed out, the term "food security" is often used to argue against using land for tree planting and nature restoration. The truth is that we need both. True food security or food sovereignty is most likely to be achieved through a mosaic of diverse food production, interspersed with planting and nature-rich habitats. Many argue that that type of land sharing approach is best for tackling the climate and nature emergencies as well.

In any case, we are concerned that the amendment is a little one sided. We could have supported it if the requirement were to produce more holistic food and environmental security statements. I am interested to hear the cabinet secretary's thoughts on this amendment.

**Mairi Gougeon:** As Rachael Hamilton has outlined, food security is a hugely important issue, and I appreciate the cross-party interest in this. As well as amendment 5, which is being considered today, a number of food security-related amendments were debated at stage 2. As a result, I believe that the bill has already been enhanced with the inclusion of amendment 47, from Emma Harper, which was accepted at stage 2. It makes a clear link between food security and rural support plans. On one hand, it demonstrates our commitment to food security and, on the other, it recognises that agricultural policy alone cannot deliver food security, which is a food system and a society-wide topic.

Following the stage 2 debate, I am glad to have discussed the issue of food security with Beatrice Wishart and Rachael Hamilton, who both moved amendments in that regard. I thank them both for working with me on this really important matter. I am pleased that a compromise has been found with Rachael Hamilton's amendment 5, which is proportionate and effective and provides useful information but is not a duplication of the pre-existing reporting requirements that I mentioned previously.

I am therefore happy to support amendment 5 and I encourage other members to support it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I invite Rachael Hamilton to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 5.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I thank the cabinet secretary and the Scottish Government for the support. I do not agree with Ariane Burgess's comments on the need to be more holistic. We all know that humans cannot eat trees. I am pleased that the Government has supported amendment 5.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 5 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)



Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 103, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 5 agreed to.*

*Amendment 56 moved—[Richard Leonard].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 56 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

**Clare Haughey:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies—I was unable to connect to the platform. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I will make sure that that vote is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 56 disagreed to.*

### Schedule 1—Purposes of support

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Group 12 is on purposes of support. Amendment 57, in the name of Rhoda Grant, is grouped with amendments 15, 58, 1, 59, 60, 6, 61, 7, 62-65, 16, 66 to 70, 17, 71 and 72.

**Rhoda Grant:** I will move amendment 57 and speak to amendments 1, 6, 7 and others in the group.

Amendment 57 would amend a change that was made at stage 2 that allows support to be given for plants that are grown for energy and other non-food purposes. My amendment seeks to qualify that by ensuring that non-food purposes are a by-product of food production rather than the sole purpose of growing the crop. [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Excuse me, Ms Grant.

A few too many conversations are happening in the chamber. If members need to have conversations, I invite them to step out of the chamber to do so.

Ms Grant, please continue.

**Rhoda Grant:** Thank you, Presiding Officer.

In a truly circular economy, we should recycle all waste. One way of doing that is through production of energy from farm waste. It can be expensive to invest in the technology to do that; therefore, support for it should be available. However, there are real concerns about farmland, which should be used for food production, being used to replace our dependence on oil and gas. With the price of oil and gas rising way beyond that of food, it might become attractive for farmers to choose to take on non-food production on arable farmland. We should not use public money to encourage action that could lead to food shortages.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I have a simple question about a new approach that some farmers are considering using—agroecology. That would happen on land that is suitable for food production, but it might also include riparian or other tree planting. Would that be affected by Ms Grant's amendment?

**Rhoda Grant:** No, it would not, because the bill already allows for that. Amendment 57 is about production of fuel on arable land.

Amendments 6 and 7 attempt to take a similar approach on forestry. I am grateful to the cabinet secretary for her assistance with the amendments.

Grants for forestry are available elsewhere, but the growth of carbon trading is leading to forestry being planted on arable land and other land that should be used for food production. We need to ensure that no public money encourages that process. My amendments 6 and 7 seek to do that.

Amendment 1 would simply add production of herbs to the list of activities that can be supported by the rural support plan.

I have concerns about the cabinet secretary's amendment 15, which will remove the word "edible" from the description of "horticulture". I seek her reassurance that that will not create a loophole for energy production to become the primary purpose of farming within a rural support plan.

Although I am supportive of the aims of amendment 59, I do not believe that regulation of assistance to buy land should lie within the bill. It should lie within the land fund, which recently had its budget cut by the Government of which Ariane Burgess's party was so recently a member.

On amendment 70, I again seek reassurance that agricultural funding will not be used to pay large estates to manage their deer numbers. They should do so at their own expense. Frankly, if we are now at the stage at which lairds need to be paid to manage their deer numbers, we should examine our poaching laws rather than protecting deer for the elite.

I move amendment 57.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 15 and other amendments in the group.

**Mairi Gougeon:** There are a number of amendments in the group, which I will try to get through as quickly as I can.

First, I turn to my amendments 17 and 15. On amendment 17, I think that we understand the important role that our land managers have to play in reducing flood impacts across Scotland. Paragraph 15 of schedule 1 makes reference to "flood prevention schemes". Having considered that wording further, I propose to look beyond such schemes and to consider how flood resilience might be improved through a range of actions, at a range of scales and through a range of delivery partners. I hope that members will agree with that approach.

On amendment 15, as Rhoda Grant has highlighted, Scotland's horticulture sector provides us with high-quality fresh fruit and vegetables, but horticulture does not cover only "edible" items. The bill should not rule out the possibility of support in the future for other sectors within that. Following further consideration of Ariane Burgess's amendment 201 from stage 2, I am concerned that

referring to "edible" horticulture would be overly restrictive and might mistakenly give the impression that we are ruling out the possibility of support for other sectors in the future. That is why I lodged amendment 15, which would remove the word "edible".

I turn to the other amendments in the group. On amendment 57, I am happy to provide reassurance that there is no impact on food production because a limited amount of land is used for energy crops and there are no current proposals to incentivise growing such crops. However, recognition of them as crops under an amendment that was agreed to at stage 2 allows for flexibility and can remove barriers to farm businesses that choose to pursue opportunities in that area. As such, I will not support amendment 57, and I encourage members not to support it.

18:30

On amendment 58, I understand that Ariane Burgess wishes to clarify that the reference to "deer and game farming", which was included at stage 2, applies to farming only and not to rearing of birds for sporting activity. However, schedule 1 does not exist to set the rules of, or the criteria for, hypothetical future supports. That detail would be a job for Scottish statutory instruments, use of which would ensure full scrutiny by the Parliament and its committees. Also, there are no plans to provide support for rearing of birds for shooting. I therefore encourage members not to support amendment 58.

On amendment 59, I want more people in Scotland to have a greater say in and to get more benefit from how our land is owned, used, tenanted and managed. Through sections 4 and 6 and part 2 of schedule 1, the bill already allows the Scottish ministers to provide support to small to medium-scale farmers, crofters and growers to carry out agricultural activities and produce food.

In addition, a range of other measures and opportunities are already being made available. Those include the provisions in the Land Reform (Scotland) Bill, which will provide increased opportunities for wider land use and is being considered by our colleagues in the Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee.

We also have on-going support available to new entrants through the Scottish Land Matching Service and the farming opportunities for new entrants group. As part of my consideration of what is needed for the future, I have asked my officials to see what else can be done to enable more letting of land for generations to come. Also, earlier this month we launched the crofting consultation, which invites views on enabling

crofters to use their crofting assets as security for loans.

Therefore, although I welcome the intention of amendment 59, given that the bill already enables the intent behind the amendment to be met and given the range of other activities that are already in motion, I ask Parliament not to support the amendment, because I think that there are better mechanisms in place to achieve the aim.

The concept of edible forest gardens, which amendment 61 seeks to promote, is really positive. However, the growing and harvesting of fruit and nut trees are horticultural rather than silvicultural activities, and support for horticulture is already included in part 2 of schedule 1. Furthermore, the bill does not exclude any of the types of trees to which the amendment relates, so the issue of where they are supported would be a matter for the design of future support schemes. For those reasons, I consider amendment 61 to be unnecessary.

Amendment 63 would create a trigger for an environmental impact assessment to be carried out where a project is 50 hectares or more. That would make a great number of forestry projects more expensive and unreasonably bureaucratic. As I mentioned at stage 2, all new planting schemes in Scotland that exceed the EIA regulatory thresholds are already the subject of a screening assessment. Hundreds of projects are screened under the regulations each year, but most schemes are well designed and mitigate risk to the environment before being submitted, so they do not require an EIA. I am therefore content that the current approach to EIAs is appropriate and proportionate.

Furthermore, amendment 63 would apply only to grant-funded woodland, which would result in a two-tier system that would adversely affect farmers and crofters. I do not need to reiterate why disadvantaging Scottish farmers and other land managers against privately funded woodland investment is a bad thing.

On amendment 64, schedule 1 already makes provision for assisting crofters both as individuals and when they are acting jointly with others, as they would do in an active grazing committee. The Government is committed to crofting law reform in the current parliamentary session in order to make crofting regulation less onerous for active crofters and the Crofting Commission. That reform will introduce some immediate positive outcomes for crofters and their communities, will enable the commission to regulate more effectively and will encourage more active common grazings. Because of that, I ask Ariane Burgess not to move amendment 64.

I turn to amendment 66. As I said in talking about amendment 19, which was similar, I very much value the culture and traditions of farming and crofting, which are important and are worth preserving. The bill's aim is to support them now and into the future, although I note that that will not be to the exclusion of improved practices. However, as I said in relation to amendment 19, it is not clear what the references to culture and traditions actually means, so I ask Parliament not to support amendment 66.

On amendment 67, ministers recognise the need for, and importance of, education and training on local food production and business management. However, that support is already covered in schedule 1. Furthermore, amendment 67 refers only to assistance in respect of a narrow range of areas and at a single level of educational attainment. It ignores other levels, including higher national diplomas and postgraduate qualifications in subject areas that are related to rural industry. That is why I ask Parliament not to support amendment 67.

On amendment 68, I absolutely agree that it is important to educate young people on agriculture and food. That is why we have provided funding in the current financial year to the Royal Highland Education Trust to continue its really excellent programme of farm visits for school pupils and its provision of educational resources for teachers. We also continue to fund the Education Scotland administered "Food for thought" education fund, which provides small grants to educational establishments for the purposes of projects that are related to food education.

However, the meaning of amendment 68 is not clear. Neither "Curriculum for Excellence" nor "students linked to" it are defined, so it is unclear who could be supported. Furthermore, curriculum for excellence is not referred to or defined elsewhere in Scots education law, nor is it employed in all schools. Local authorities and schools design and deliver curriculum for excellence; it is they, not the Scottish Government, who have the statutory duty to deliver education.

If the concern is about funding in the context of education, ministers already have wide powers under the Standards in Scotland Schools etc Act 2000 to

"make grants to persons who ... undertake, or engage in, activities relating to school education ... or propose to",

and they can provide grants under the Educational Development, Research and Services (Scotland) Grant Regulations 1999. That is why I ask Parliament not to support amendment 68.

On amendment 69, I agree that soil health and quality are of vital importance for our farmers and the wider environment, but that is why the bill

already enables us to provide support for all the purposes that are set out. Paragraph 13 of schedule 1 will enable us to provide support related to

“the physical, chemical and biological condition of the soil”, and paragraph 15 of that schedule will enable us to provide support related to protecting and improving soil as a vital living system. Of course, healthy soils provide key ecosystem services. I therefore ask Rachael Hamilton not to move her amendment 69.

Although I sympathise with the aims of amendment 72, I believe that the desired outcome is better supported by Tim Eagle’s amendment 71, which seeks to address the issue in more general terms and will offer us more flexibility of support. As such, I ask that amendment 72 be not moved. I thank Tim Eagle for lodging amendment 71 and for working with me to ensure that farmers, crofters and land managers may access support through the agricultural support framework, as outlined in his amendment 71.

Amendment 1, which seeks to add “herbs” to schedule 1, is similar to an amendment that Rhoda Grant lodged at stage 2. I am happy to support it.

I thank Rachael Hamilton for lodging her amendment 60. I appreciate the cross-party support in the area that it covers. The Scottish Government is always supportive of innovation that has a positive impact and is in line with our policy ambitions, especially in the agricultural sector.

On Rhoda Grant’s amendments 6 and 7, the Scottish Government agrees—as, I am sure, all members do—that we do not want large areas of prime arable land that are suitable for producing a wide range of edible crops to be planted with woodlands. Amendments 6 and 7 will allow the creation of exceptions to where woodland may be planted. Setting that out in secondary legislation will give us an opportunity to fully consider the issue and ensure that we undertake the appropriate consultation before we make regulations.

Ariane Burgess’s amendment 62 draws further attention to the duty on Scottish ministers to have regard to sustainable forest management and, in particular, to support new woodlands. I am sure that we all want all new woodlands in Scotland to be of the highest quality, to be sustainable and to add value in as many ways as possible.

On Brian Whittle’s amendment 16, the definition that is proposed is broad and covers the wide range of types of bodies that can act as anchor organisations. I fully recognise the important role that anchor organisations play in our rural and

island communities; I therefore support including reference to them in the bill.

I am also happy to support amendment 65, I agree with Ariane Burgess that the venison sector is very important for ensuring that wild and farmed venison can be utilised.

Finally, on amendment 70, the Scottish Government has been clear about its commitment to increased deer management, including its commitment in our recent climate change action policy package to develop a national scheme that incentivises increased deer management and investment in the venison supply chain. I am therefore happy to support amendment 70.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Ariane Burgess to speak to amendment 58 and other amendments in the group.

**Ariane Burgess:** My amendment 58 seeks to clarify the intention of an amendment that Tim Eagle secured at stage 2. His amendment added deer and game farming to the list of agricultural activities that may be supported. I understand that Mr Eagle’s intention was that that should apply to game farming and not to sporting activity. My amendment 58 seeks to clarify that support may be provided for raising game birds for food, but not for rearing pheasants to be shot for sport. I have already made the point that the Scottish Greens do not believe that public funds should be subsidising blood sports.

**Finlay Carson:** Will the member take an intervention?

**Ariane Burgess:** I have a lot to get through, so I will keep going.

My amendment 59 would add something crucial to the purposes of support—support for small to medium-scale farmers, including new entrants, to buy land for food production. Our food producers are being priced out of buying land, which is partly due to investors buying land for carbon offsetting. It is crucial that we keep enough land in the service of food production to maintain resilience in the face of global climate impact.

Recent research from the James Hutton Institute shows that agricultural production and the numbers of tenants are already declining. That accelerates depopulation and weakens rural communities. Until recently, there were start-up grants for young farmers and new entrants, which included up to £70,000 to be allocated to support land purchases. The Land Reform (Scotland) Bill will bring a land and communities commissioner. Perhaps they will want to consider the best way to reduce the barrier of high land prices for new farmers. There may be other solutions needed alongside that, such as a surcharge on land and

buildings transaction tax for large landholdings, as recommended by the Scottish Land Commission.

The important thing is that we consider that now, as the issue is becoming urgent. Farmers are retiring and not enough new entrants are taking their place. It was good to hear the cabinet secretary's comments on the matter, and I am interested to learn that she is looking into the possibility of finding ways to make more land available.

My amendment 61 adds another activity to the purposes for support—the restocking of commercial trees with trees that produce edible fruits, nuts and leaves. I have met land managers who want to do that, but there is currently no support available. It is not just about creating an orchard. Support should be available to plant a mixture of trees. Support for more innovative integration of forestry and agriculture is necessary to address biodiversity loss and climate change while preserving food production in Scotland. We certainly can produce food from trees.

Amendment 62 ensures that all support that is provided for forestry under part 3 of schedule 1 to the bill must align with statutory duties in the Forestry and Land Management (Scotland) Act 2018, including the duty on ministers to promote sustainable forestry management.

Amendment 63 would take that further and require all large forestry projects of more than 50 hectares to conduct an environmental impact assessment as a condition of receiving public funding. We all know that tree planting can help to fight climate change, but commercial conifer plantations can also cause significant damage to the environment. The James Hutton Institute says that more carbon may be released by disturbing soils during planting than can be absorbed by trees over decades. Spruce plantations can self-seed in areas where they damage restored peatland, native woodlands and high nature value grasslands.

Since Scottish Forestry was established, it has required only one full environmental impact assessment to be carried out by private forestry firms. We need to rebalance the burdens and benefits in forestry between the private and public sectors. Large schemes are delivered by large multinational companies that can afford to pay for an EIA. In a typical year, only 30 per cent of forestry schemes were over 50 hectares, but they accounted for almost three quarters of the land used for planting. That means that placing an environmental impact assessment requirement on schemes that are more than 50 hectares would ensure that the majority of land that is managed for forestry is managed responsibly while affecting only a minority of schemes. The Community Woodlands Association assured me that

community woodland projects are not large enough to be affected.

In other sectors, it would be most unusual for major schemes to happen without EIAs. Forestry has been an anomaly for decades, but given the negative impacts that it can have, it is time for the sector to bear more responsibility. I am aware of work that is under way to improve the guidance around the screening and scoping process, but it is conducted behind the scenes. Formal EIAs, using existing legal mechanisms, would improve transparency, restore public trust in forestry and—crucially—minimise environmental damage. That will be increasingly important as more of our land is used for forestry and more public funds are used to support it.

Amendment 64 would support common grazing committees to meet the conditionality of new payment schemes. Some grazing committees manage huge areas of land and include up to 80 individual shareholders. There is significant additional cost and effort involved in coming to agreement about how to manage land and whether to apply for new schemes, but the benefits could be substantial if grazing committees sign up for support under tier 2 or other new schemes that incentivise climate and nature measures. The Greens would like to see additional support for those committees to adopt new practices as part of a just transition.

My amendment 70 would ensure that the rural payment framework can support deer management to tackle the climate emergency—

**Finlay Carson:** Will the member take an intervention?

**Ariane Burgess:** Yes.

18:45

**Finlay Carson:** I am pleased that the member has taken an intervention, because she appears to be making good progress. Can I take her back to amendment 58 and ask her what her understanding is of what happens to game birds once they have been shot as part of a sporting activity and whether they enter the food chain?

**Ariane Burgess:** I am much further on in my comments at the moment, so I have moved on. Where was I? My amendment 70 would ensure that the rural payment framework can—

**Finlay Carson:** Yes or no?

**Ariane Burgess:** I still have quite a lot to get through.

My amendment 70 would ensure that the rural payment framework can support deer management. To tackle the climate emergency, we need to address grazing pressures from all

herbivores. Of course, deer can impact on farming as well as forestry. Bringing at least some funding for deer management under the rural payment umbrella will make it easier for farmers and other land managers to address overgrazing from deer and livestock together.

My amendment 65 would ensure that the rural payment framework can support the establishment of venison supply chains and infrastructure such as deer larders. Given that deer culling is necessary to rebalance ecosystems and allow trees to grow, we should not be wasting their meat when it is very nutritious, sustainable and in abundant supply. Supporting venison supply chains and shared larders is an excellent way to strengthen rural communities and local food production.

Taken together, the amendments will provide another option for farmers to diversify through deer management and venison production. The Common Ground Forum has found that farmers would like to do that if the right incentives were in place.

My final amendment 67 would add degree and graduate-level courses in local food production and management to the list of activities that can be supported under the bill. I heard the cabinet secretary's comments on that, but support could be directed through the Scottish Funding Council for an initial period, just as the gastronomy course at Queen Margaret University was recently funded to meet an industry need.

There is an industry need for skilled new entrants in local food production, but there is currently no degree-level course available in Scotland. The course could be made available at multiple locations, such as the University of Highlands and Islands and elsewhere, and it could cover horticultural science, business skills for running a market garden or glass houses, and product development and promotion.

I encourage members to vote for the Scottish Green amendments in the group to ensure that support is available for more people to carry out activities in rural communities in ways that benefit all of us and our shared planet.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I am grateful to be able speak to my amendments in the group and some of the others.

Schedule 1 sets out the purposes of support. Amendment 60 creates an additional purpose for support to encourage agricultural and scientific innovation. Farmers and crofters should be supported to take up technologies that can promote sustainable and efficient farming and food production. I thank the Scottish Government and the cabinet secretary for indicating that they will support amendment 60.

Amendment 66 creates an additional purpose of support to preserve and maintain the traditions and cultural roles of farmers and crofters. I made my argument quite powerfully and succinctly at the beginning of the proceedings, so I will not repeat what I had to say.

Amendment 69 expands on an existing purpose to provide support to promote, protect or improve soil health through the effective management of soil. I lodged a similar amendment at stage 2 that was not supported, but I believe that soil management and soil health are integral to the future of the planet and our environment.

Amendment 72 assists persons who have suffered significant damage by geese. That issue was recently discussed by the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, and I acknowledge that it is covered by my colleague Tim Eagle's amendment 71, which provides support for farmers and producers who have sustained loss and damage as a result of the reintroduction of a native species, plant or animal.

On a positive note, I support amendments 64 and 65, in the name of Ariane Burgess. I thought that we were all rubbing along quite nicely today, but Ms Burgess's unfortunate vendetta against shooting interests continues through amendment 58. The value of game shooting, enabled by Scotland's game farms, is brought to bear in the value of country sports. We heard that strongly at the SLE moorland conference at the Cardney Estate last week, and the British Association for Shooting and Conservation has just published a report that states that the sector provides £340 million to the Scottish economy in gross value added and supports 15,000 direct and indirect jobs. I believe that Ariane Burgess and the Green Party support a reversal of the depopulation that is happening in Scotland, but clearly not in that sector.

Those figures demonstrate the value of the sector to Scotland's rural economy, so it is astonishing to see Ms Burgess fighting to exempt game farmers just because she does not agree with the premise of game shooting. The reality is that the Scottish Greens' view on shooting and wild foods is inherently contradictory. On the one hand, they support the killing of deer—so much so that they want to see heavily pregnant females shot and youngsters left orphaned without their mothers—but, on the other hand, they oppose the shooting of game birds, despite the fact that peer-reviewed science has shown that the land management associated with game bird shooting delivers demonstrable environmental benefits. The Greens' position is utterly bizarre.

**Lorna Slater (Lothian) (Green):** Will the member take an intervention?

**Rachael Hamilton:** I will take the intervention if the member can explain why hinds are being shot while they are heavily pregnant.

**Lorna Slater:** I am rising to correct the record. The proposed changes to deer legislation are not about orphaning baby deer. That is absolutely not the case and is completely incorrect; that is not the intention at all. Deer welfare is an absolute priority with all changes.

Rachael Hamilton is not recognising that the number of deer in Scotland has doubled twice in the past 50 years. That is unsustainable. Managing deer is a key part of managing biodiversity, which is a consistent thread for the Scottish Greens.

**Rachael Hamilton:** I really enjoyed that lecture from Lorna Slater. *[Interruption.]* SNP members, who are the friends of the Greens through the unofficial Bute house agreement, should consider the animal welfare prospects and the unintended consequences, such as deer being shot while heavily pregnant. *[Interruption.]*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Let us hear the member whose microphone is on.

**Rachael Hamilton:** As I said, the Scottish Greens' policy is utterly bizarre, but it is, of course, totally consistent with their general apathy towards rural interests. Contradictory ideology is driving such policy making, and that is what Ms Burgess is trying to achieve through her prejudiced and ill-thought-through amendment. I urge members to vote against amendment 58.

**Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con):** I will speak only to amendment 16, which relates to the identification of rural anchor institutions in the provisions on development strategies for rural areas, so that the bill ties in with future community wealth building legislation.

Current research on anchor institutions in rural areas is limited, but it is clear that anchor institutions in rural areas are not the same as those in urban areas. Large public sector bodies—a typical model for an anchor institution—tend to be located in urban areas, and my amendment could help rural communities to identify economically viable businesses and enterprises in an area that could serve the same function as traditionally defined anchor institutions, such as farming co-operative markets and processing facilities. That is why I suggest that the phrasing in the bill refers to

“a body, or network of bodies”.

**Finlay Carson:** Amendment 68 would result in projects relating to

“educational activities and learning opportunities for students linked to the Curriculum for Excellence”

being eligible for funding. I cannot quite understand the cabinet secretary's position, because she will know that the purpose of curriculum for excellence is to help children and young people to become

“successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors.”

That is laid out quite clearly. It is one of the Scottish Government's flagship policies, so I cannot quite understand why we cannot link policies in the bill to well-known legislation elsewhere.

Developing the capabilities and attributes of the four capacities is embedded right across learning. There are eight curriculum areas in curriculum for excellence, and literacy, numeracy and health and wellbeing are recognised as being particularly important. I will highlight two of the curriculum areas that are of significance to the bill.

Learning in health and wellbeing ensures that children and young people develop the knowledge, understanding and skills that they need now and in the future. Technology involves the application of knowledge and skills to extend human capabilities and to help to satisfy human needs and wants, and it has a profound effect on modern society. Learning in technologies enables children and young people to be informed, skilled, thoughtful, adaptive and enterprising citizens. The technologies curriculum areas include the study of digital literacy; textile technology; technological developments in society and business; craft, design, engineering and graphics; computing science; and, most important in this case, food technology.

It is important that such activity is led not solely by classroom teachers but in conjunction with those who are involved in and have experience of the agriculture and food sectors. One organisation that excels in providing learning and experience opportunities is the Royal Highland Education Trust, as we have already heard. It aims to provide the opportunity for every child in Scotland to learn about food, farming and the countryside, and to create a wider understanding of the environmental, economic and social realities of rural Scotland.

**Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab):** Is it not right that, with young people's involvement, particularly at the real level on farms, which involves seeing how they work, all the really difficult lessons about seasonality, years and the passage of time become much easier to understand, and they better understand their place in the environment?

**Finlay Carson:** Absolutely. I appreciate that intervention, which really set things out well.



There is a significant allocation of public money to the agriculture and rural sector. In every generation, we have fewer and fewer links to farming and rural life, which is critical. The significance of agriculture and food production must be part of the curriculum.

I urge members to support my amendment.

**Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests. I am an active farmer.

Amendment 71 is similar to an amendment that was lodged and debated at stage 2. I thank the cabinet secretary and her team for working with me on the new amendment.

The amendment would enable assistance to be given to farmers and others who have sustained loss or damage as a consequence of the reintroduction of a native species of plant or animal or of the activity of a species of conservation value. It aims to take seriously the lessons learned from previous reintroductions and activity of native species.

This is not about focusing on the negatives; it is about focusing on the positives of important species while recognising the need for assistance for those who work the land, where that is needed. Although I recognise that support schemes are already in place, I believe that including both provisions in the bill would send a strong message of support to Scottish farmers and landowners moving forward.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Rhoda Grant to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 57.

**Rhoda Grant:** I have nothing to add other than that I seek to withdraw amendment 57 given the reassurance provided by the cabinet secretary that arable land would not be used for energy production.

*Amendment 57, by agreement, withdrawn.*

*Amendment 15 moved—[Mairi Gougeon].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 15 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

19:00

The vote is closed.

**Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con):** On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. Apologies—my app froze, but I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Hoy. I will ensure that that vote is recorded.

**Bill Kidd:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app seems to have frozen as well. I vote yes, please.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I can advise you that your vote has been recorded, Mr Kidd.

**Michael Marra:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies, but I think my app froze. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Marra. I will ensure that that is recorded.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 105, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 15 agreed to.*

*Amendment 58 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 58 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 58 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 1 moved—[Rhoda Grant]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 59 not moved.*

*Amendment 60 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 6 moved—[Rhoda Grant]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 61 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 61 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

**Against**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)

Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 27, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 61 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 7 moved—[Rhoda Grant]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 62 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 63 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 63 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**Clare Haughey:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies—I could not connect to the platform. I would have voted no.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Haughey. I will make sure that the vote is recorded.

#### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

#### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and  
 Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by  
 Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)  
 (SNP)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caitness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)  
 (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 63 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 64 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 64 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

**Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green):** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. For some reason, my app did not work. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Ms Chapman. I will ensure that your vote is recorded.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)  
 (Con)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)

Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 56, Against 58, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 64 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 65 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We are in the home straight. The adrenaline is going and it is affecting my hearing, so please speak up.

*Amendment 16 moved—[Brian Whittle]—and agreed to.*

*Amendment 66 not moved.*

*Amendment 67 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 67 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)

Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 26, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 67 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 68 moved—[Finlay Carson].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 68 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

**For**

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 47, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 68 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 69 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 69 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

19:15

**Michael Marra:** On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Mr Marra. I will make sure that that vote is recorded.

### For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)



Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

### Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 45, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 69 disagreed to.*

*Amendment 70 moved—[Ariane Burgess].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 70 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

### Against

Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 85, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 70 agreed to.*

*Amendment 17 moved—[Mairi Gougeon].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 17 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)

Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

### Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 87, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 17 agreed to.*

*Amendment 71 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is, that amendment 71 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

**Members:** No.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There will be a division.

### For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

#### Against

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 108, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

*Amendment 71 agreed to.*

*Amendment 72 not moved.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That ends consideration of amendments.

Members will be aware that, at this point in the proceedings, the Presiding Officer is required under standing orders to decide whether, in her view, any provision of a bill relates to a protected subject matter—that is, whether it modifies the electoral system and franchise for Scottish parliamentary elections. In the Presiding Officer’s view, no provision of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill relates to a protected subject matter. Therefore, the bill does not require a supermajority to be passed at stage 3.

Before we move to the debate, I call Mairi Gougeon to signify Crown consent to the bill.

**Mairi Gougeon:** For the purposes of rule 9.11 of standing orders, I advise the Parliament that His Majesty, having been informed of the purport of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill, has consented to place his prerogative and interests, in so far as they are affected by the bill, at the disposal of the Parliament for the purposes of the bill.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Given that Parliament agreed earlier to extend the time given to consideration of amendments, I advise members that I will now use my discretion to move decision time to 8.22.

There will be a brief pause before we move to the debate.

## Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill

### The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is a debate on motion S6M-13663, in the name of Mairi Gougeon, on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill at stage 3. I invite members who wish to speak in the debate to press their request-to-speak buttons.

19:23

**The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands (Mairi Gougeon):** I am delighted to open this stage 3 debate on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill.

I begin by thanking the convener and all members of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee. Their work and scrutiny throughout stages 1 and 2, along with their support for taking a framework approach, has made for a really effective piece of legislation. I also thank the other members who may not sit on that committee but who have also engaged constructively as the bill has progressed. I also extend my particular thanks and gratitude to the members of the bill team for their hard work and support, their expertise and their tireless efforts on the bill.

Last, but certainly not least, I express probably the most thanks to those from across Scotland who responded to the bill consultation, including the almost 600 members of the public who attended events online or in person, the almost 400 people who sent written responses and the dozens who gave evidence to the committee. I thank the many stakeholders including NFU Scotland, Scottish Environment LINK, the Scottish Crofting Federation, Scottish Land & Estates and many others who have also engaged with us directly. I thank all who have worked to get the bill into the strongest position that it can possibly be in.

The bill and the secondary legislation and framework of agricultural support that will stem from it affect us all. The bill is the foundation of how we will support food production, tackle the challenges of climate change and work to restore nature. Ultimately, we need the legislation and the support that flows from it to enable our farmers and crofters, and the wider rural communities of which they are an integral part, to thrive. The core intent of the bill is to provide for a support model that enables our farmers and crofters to grow more of our food more sustainably, to farm and croft with nature and to assist in efforts to meet our nation's climate change outcomes.

The powers of the bill are about realising our vision for agriculture—a positive vision of our

nation being recognised as a global leader in sustainable and regenerative farming, and one in which our producers play the essential role of contributing to our food security, driving our rural economy and ensuring that our world-renowned food and drink industries continue to thrive. It is pertinent that we hold this debate and have debated amendments to the bill at stage 3 in the week in which many of us, I am sure, will visit the Royal Highland Show, which is our country's biggest showcase of all things food, farming and rural.

As I have previously said in the chamber, Scotland has a proud and long-standing heritage as a farming nation, and agriculture is the cornerstone of our rural economy. The introduction of the bill last September was an important step on our journey of transformation, as we transition to a new way of supporting farming into the future. The closing of stage 3 is another milestone, but by no means is it near the end of that journey. Our route map sets out broadly how we will continue to progress and the rural support plan, which has been a matter of valuable discussion both in and outwith the committee, will soon take up that mantle. I will continue to work with our farmers, crofters, land managers and stakeholder organisations as we continue that vital work and look to deliver on our ambitions.

During the stage 1 debate, I welcomed the committee's agreement that a framework bill is appropriate to establishing a long-term basis for future support schemes. The bill has to enable the multiyear transformation in support for farming and rural communities that I have spoken about. That will be a complex process and will include a transition over time from the complex and extensive assimilated law scheme rules. However, it is right that, as a Government, we take the necessary time to develop the detail of our future policy with the people who are most affected by it. That is vital in order to deliver on our commitment of no cliff edges for our farmers and crofters.

That is why I also welcome the committee's recognition that a framework bill will enable the support measures to be co-developed and delivered over the long term, as needed, and to provide the necessary flexibility and adaptivity. Over recent years, events have continued to show us that we need that flexibility in order to be effective in our response to any and all future geopolitical, economic, climate and nature challenges. That flexibility is also central to enabling our unwavering commitment to co-developing and co-designing the details of future support schemes.

I have been clear about my intention to be transparent with stakeholders and the Parliament. Over the past years, I have worked closely with

the sector and rural partners to develop the proposals that we brought forward in the bill, as well as what we have introduced through our route map. Throughout the bill's passage through the Parliament, I have continued to work with stakeholders and across parties to try to reach consensus and co-develop the contents of the bill.

In that spirit, I very much welcomed the willingness of members across parties to engage constructively on amendments. I am grateful to those members for meeting me to have those discussions, and I am delighted that we could reach a consensus on many of the important areas that were raised during stage 2. Together, through that collaboration, we have agreed a number of helpful clarifications and additions to the bill—for example, with Ariane Burgess, to include examples of eligibility for area-based schemes and clarifications to the rural support plan, including a list of outcomes additions that further show the breadth of future co-development. Through the Government's discussions with Labour, Richard Leonard lodged an amendment on information about recipients of support—a transparency that, I am sure, will be welcomed by all. I also welcome the collaborative work with Rhoda Grant on amendments that will help to ensure that, through regulations, we indeed have the right tree in the right place.

I have worked with Beatrice Wishart to agree an amendment on a requirement for consultation before making regulations on continuing professional development. I am also pleased that, with Edward Mountain, we reached an agreement on amendments on the right of appeal, and that discussions with Rachael Hamilton led to an amendment on, among other areas, the preparation of a statement on food security in Scotland. Due to discussions with back benchers of my own party, we now have further amendments on CPD, including a comprehensive amendment on monitoring and evaluation.

All of that has served to make the legislation stronger and fit for the future.

The Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill provides Scotland with a flexible future framework that will support farmers and crofters to adapt to new opportunities and new challenges. I am absolutely clear in our commitment to support farmers and crofters to produce more of our food more sustainably, while continuing to acknowledge the need for change, and to ensure that agriculture continues to play its part in cutting emissions, mitigating climate change and restoring and enhancing nature and biodiversity, while continuing to produce food.

I am really fortunate in this job in that I get to travel the country, meeting farmers and crofters across Scotland who are already undertaking this

work and some really important activities. They are all trying to produce food to feed our nation while reducing their impact on the climate and enhancing biodiversity.

As we transition to the future—

**The Presiding Officer:** You must conclude, cabinet secretary.

**Mairi Gougeon:** —I reiterate my commitments that we will communicate clearly and that we will ensure that there is a just transition and no cliff edges in support. We will continue to develop the details of future policy with those most affected by it—with our farmers and crofters.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill be passed.

19:30

**Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con):** I am pleased to be able to open the debate on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill at stage 3 on behalf of the Scottish Conservatives.

I start by thanking the bill team and the committee clerks, who have supported us throughout the bill's passage, and the relevant stakeholder groups who have provided insights and briefings. I will not list them all but I send them my thanks.

I also thank the cabinet secretary for meeting me and colleagues ahead of stages 2 and 3 to discuss amendments to the bill. Our views on the passage of the bill will be very different. I believe that the bill presented an opportunity for the Scottish Government to deliver a brand new shiny support scheme that was centred around Scottish farmers and food producers. It was an opportunity to build a scheme that was co-designed with farmers and rural communities, could provide much-needed clarity and detail on future support schemes and could transform the future of Scotland's food production by putting food security at its heart.

However, the SNP has failed to take full advantage of the opportunity to create a bespoke plan that is specific to Scotland's farmers and food producers. Farmers, crofters and rural communities have waited a very long time—six years, in fact—to see the bill itself and the important detail that will support it. I take myself back to the angry scenes outside Holyrood when farmers protested about the lack of detail from the Government on their future. We are now nearly nine months on from the introduction of the bill, and we still do not have meaningful clarity on how farmers and food producers will be supported.

As the cabinet secretary has stated repeatedly in the chamber and in committee, the rural support plan will contain the key details of the support schemes. In the stage 3 proceedings earlier this afternoon, the cabinet secretary stated, regarding the publication of the rural support plan:

“That is as much information as we can provide at this stage”.

However, last week, in a written answer to me, the cabinet secretary confirmed that the rural support plan will be published before Parliament breaks for recess next Thursday.

I wonder what significant developments or events are expected between now and next Thursday that may cause a delay in the publication of the rural support plan. If the plan had been shared ahead of today’s debate, we could have spent valuable time discussing and scrutinising the detail and plans that will affect farmers the most. However, we spent time debating ridiculous ideological amendments from the Green Party about farm connections and its obsession with grouse shooting. Today is just another day on which the SNP has failed to give farmers and food producers the detail that they need. Sadly, today is another day that they remain uncertain about their future, uncertain about what investments they can afford to make and uncertain about how they can continue to put food on plates up and down Scotland.

Perhaps the Royal Highland Show will be a revelation and there will be a big announcement on detail on Thursday when the First Minister goes to the Quality Meat Scotland breakfast, but we will have to wait and see.

With regard to the measures in the bill, the Law Society notes that, without certainty and clarity,

“it is difficult to fully understand and assess their likely impacts, particularly on those operating in the sector”—

as I have said—further highlighting

“the need for flexibility to be appropriately balanced against ensuring there is clarity in the law”.

As we stand here today, with the bill as amended, the Government has failed to get the balance right. The Scottish Conservatives lodged several sensible amendments at stages 2 and 3 to improve the bill and to ensure that it can be delivered with Scottish farmers and food producers at its heart. Although I am pleased and very grateful that the Scottish Government supported a small number of our amendments and that those were successful, more could have been done to improve the bill. The Scottish Conservatives will continue to scrutinise how the Scottish Government delivers for farmers.

The Scottish Conservatives will be delighted to support the bill at stage 3, because it is a

mechanism to allow farmers to be supported. We will continue to support Scottish agriculture but, at the same time, we will ensure that the SNP is held to account and that it listens to rural Scotland. We will continue to call for the immediate publication of a rural support plan that is meaningfully co-designed with key stakeholders—we have been promised that. We will continue to call for a commitment to multi-annual ring-fenced funding to provide long-term security and certainty to farmers and food producers. We will continue to call for an understanding of when the Scottish Government will return the rest of the £46 million to the rural affairs portfolio. We will continue to scrutinise the SNP to ensure that the secondary legislation delivers for rural and farming communities.

Farming communities are so important to Scotland’s rural and local economies, and we will always support them.

19:36

**Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab):**

I, too, thank all those who helped with the bill: those who gave written and in-person evidence, the Parliament’s legislation team, the clerks to the committee and other parliamentary staff, all of whom helped during the process. I also thank the parliamentary staff who are working late tonight to allow us to conclude our deliberations, because they cannot get home until we go home.

The bill is essential to allow our primary food producers to access Government support. Our food system does not work well. Primary producers are too far from their end customers and often do not receive a fair return for their work. The bill has recognised fair work practices and, I hope, allows scope for local production and procurement. However, that is all dependent on the rural support plan, which is a critical component of the bill. The bill simply allows for a plan to be produced and funded. How our farmers and crofters produce food, reach net zero and feed our nation is totally dependent on the rural support plan, and we have not seen even the vaguest draft.

We urged the cabinet secretary to produce a draft before stage 3 to allow the committee to gauge whether the bill provided the correct foundations for the plan. We are still waiting, and I wonder whether we will again be left waiting until the last possible moment to see it.

**Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries)**

**(Con):** Does the member agree that it is completely disrespectful to the Parliament, and to the committee that Rhoda Grant and I serve on, that, despite the time that the bill has been in the creation, the rural support plan, which is a key

feature of it, will be published after the stage 3 proceedings have finished?

**Rhoda Grant:** Yes, I agree. I fear that the Government hates scrutiny and believes that it knows best. The simple fact is that scrutiny provides better legislation and governance. If the Government can answer the concerns and reassure people, and if it can reassess its plans in the face of new information, we all win. Not only do we all win but, much more importantly, we provide good governance to the people whom we serve. We should all hold that ambition.

Much depends on the legislation being successful. We need food security. The war in Ukraine has shown us that we are globally interdependent and that we need to be more self-sufficient. That global interdependence also challenges our net zero goal. Food miles add to our carbon footprint, and we have no way of gauging whether the food that we import is net zero. We know, for example, that meat that is produced elsewhere is intensively farmed and produces greenhouse gases, with the result that protein from meat is often frowned upon. However, we can produce meat from grass-fed cattle that locks in carbon and is net zero.

Why do we import meat that undermines our ability to produce something much more nutritious, which is much better for the planet? It makes no sense. We also know that smaller producers underpin our rural communities, which addresses depopulation, yet we reward larger producers, many of whom would be profitable without support, to a much greater extent. It makes no sense.

On the one hand, we look to land reform to change the land ownership pattern in Scotland, but on the other, we actively encourage large land holdings by paying them a greater amount per hectare than we pay to those who provide the greatest community benefit. Again, that is senseless. We need the reality to meet the rhetoric.

I urge the cabinet secretary to share a draft of the rural support plan immediately. She also needs to share drafts of the many pieces of guidance and secondary legislation that flow from the bill as soon as possible. She must allow it to be scrutinised, and she must listen to what those who depend on it say.

There can be no cliff edge. This must be the start of a process that lays the foundation for agricultural support in the future, and that vision must be clearly presented. That way, we underpin our agriculture sector by supporting it to provide food security while meeting our net zero and societal goals.

19:41

**Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green):** I thank everyone who has been working so hard to bring the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill to fruition to enable the next steps in the agricultural reform route map to sustainable and regenerative agriculture.

I thank the members from other parties with whom I had constructive conversations, and the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee and its clerks, and I offer a big thank you to the cabinet secretary and the Scottish Government bill team for the many discussions about amendments and the best ways of achieving our shared aims. A huge thank you also goes to the stakeholders who have been working for years to influence the bill, including organisations and individuals across the spectrum of farming, forestry, land management, conservation, nature restoration and workers' rights, and to the Scottish Parliament's legislation team, which helped to transform ideas into amendments.

I give a special mention to the farmers and crofters whom I spoke to in Parliament, during committee visits and in my region, and to the organisations that I worked closely with and that inspired or helped me to draft my amendments—the Landworkers Alliance, Nourish Scotland, Jo Hunt at Knockfarrel croft, the Scottish Crofting Federation, Scottish Environment LINK and its many members, including, notably, the RSPB and Trees for Life, the Association of Deer Management Groups, the Worker Support Centre Scotland and the Royal Society of Edinburgh.

Those organisations have put so much effort in because they know how crucial the bill is. It creates the framework that will shape the on-the-ground efforts to minimise climate change and restore nature, and it will support more people to live in thriving rural communities, working in good green jobs, including, first and foremost, food production.

Each party has made important contributions to the bill, such as Elena Whitham's addition of an animal welfare objective, Brian Whittle's inclusion of a connection to the good food nation efforts and Colin Smyth's influence on the Scottish Government, which agreed to consult NatureScot and other bodies when designing rural payment schemes.

After many in-depth conversations, I was delighted to secure Government support for several Scottish Green amendments, which will bring us closer to achieving the bill's objective. The bill now includes suggested outcomes that the rural support plan should aim to achieve. Those include reduced emissions, reduced pesticides, increased organic farming and improved water



quality. That complements the changes that were secured at stage 2, which means that support can be provided for protecting and improving biological soil health, which is essential for continuing to produce food and maintaining functioning living ecosystems.

I have been championing small producers, including market gardeners, whose small plots mean that they have not been eligible for support, despite the huge contributions that they make to local food supply, rural jobs, carbon sequestration and nature. My amendments that will provide new routes to support could be a game changer for those key workers and attract new entrants to local food production. I will follow progress closely and, if necessary, will periodically remind the Scottish Government to use those new powers.

**Finlay Carson:** Will the member take an intervention?

**Ariane Burgess:** I will keep going.

Many stakeholders felt that the bill did not give enough consideration to forestry, so I was glad to secure a few improvements in that space. The bill now specifies that ministers must consider their duty to promote sustainable forestry management, and it will also enable support to be provided for agroforestry that brings benefits to farms and farm animals, and for nature-based businesses and nature restoration. A tall barrier to nature restoration is unsustainably high deer numbers, so I am pleased to have added to the bill support for deer management—which is very challenging but vital work—and for infrastructure to ensure that the venison will make it on to local plates and not go to waste.

All together, I am proud of the improvements that the Scottish Greens and other parties have made to the bill, and I urge members to vote it into law.

19:45

**Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD):** I am pleased to speak for the Scottish Liberal Democrats at stage 3 of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill, which is a significant piece of legislation that is needed to support those who produce food in Scotland. A lot of work has gone into getting us to the final stage of the bill and, as others have done, I extend my thanks to the bill team, the convener and members of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, and the team at the Scottish Parliament information centre for their support throughout the committee scrutiny. My thanks also go to all the organisations that provided briefings and everyone who gave evidence to the committee, and I thank the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform

and Islands for her constructive engagement during our consideration of the bill.

We have known since the United Kingdom left the European Union that Scotland would need a new support system for agriculture to replace the common agricultural policy, and I am disappointed that it has taken so many years to get to this point. The uncertainty has caused anxiety for farmers, crofters, land managers and people across the supply chain and associated professions, from auctioneers to vets. Recent years have been challenging for the sector. Brexit has had impacts on growers' ability to find agricultural workers, while global political instability and rising costs have also created considerable challenges.

By their very nature, farming and crofting require long-term planning and investment, which is why farmers and crofters need certainty for years ahead. Many have just been treading water and have been unable to commit to long-term plans as they have waited to see the terms of the new agriculture bill and rural support plan. The wait has also impacted new entrants to farming and, as I highlighted at stage 1, it has negatively impacted on the mental health of some in the sector.

Scotland can rightly be proud of its food and drink sector. Consumer confidence in what we grow is vital and, following our exit from the EU, it is important that Scotland maintains high animal welfare standards.

There has been much discussion about the inclusion of a multi-annual financial framework in the rural support plan. The cabinet secretary argued that it is not possible to commit to including such a framework, as the Scottish Government does not have certainty over future budgets. However, I am disappointed that, this afternoon, my amendment that sought an indicative financial framework over multiple years was not supported by the Government.

As part of our scrutiny process, the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee undertook farm visits, which were extremely useful, as they enabled us to gain a better understanding of the variety of needs across the sector. Our fact-finding visits, including to McGregor Farms in Coldstream and the Scotland's Rural College hill and mountain research centre at Crianlarich, were particularly helpful for learning about innovation in farming practices and the importance of sharing knowledge via peer-to-peer learning.

Farmers and crofters live by the seasons and they are very aware of the impacts of climate change and biodiversity loss. Many already innovate and make changes to increase resilience in the face of challenges such as increasing severe weather events, and that good practice should be fostered, nurtured and encouraged.

The sector in Scotland is diverse, ranging from small-scale producers to large farms. Across that cross-section of producer types, support is required from the Scottish Government to enable them to produce food for the nation. Co-design of support schemes is vital to avoid a one-size-fits-all approach. Support schemes must recognise the diversity of the agriculture sector and must work for all farms and crofts. New entrants need to be supported and encouraged for the future success of the sector.

Farming and crofting across Scotland and the wider supply chain contribute enormously to our rural economy and rural communities. Scotland can be proud of its agriculture sector and all that it produces.

**The Presiding Officer:** We move to the open debate.

19:49

**Elena Whitham (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP):** The importance of the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill cannot be overstated, and my thanks, too, go to everyone who has got us to this stage. The bill will provide the much-needed framework—the scaffolding, in fact—for the measures that the Scottish ministers will use to develop the critical support that farming and rural communities need in order to adapt to new opportunities and challenges and to prosper in an ever-changing world.

The bill will be the platform for measures that are focused on the Scottish Government's key outcomes of high-quality food production, climate mitigation and adaptation, nature restoration and wider rural development. We need to ensure our food security; protect our environment and enhance biodiversity; and support and empower our rural communities to thrive.

The vision for agriculture outlines the goal of transforming how the Government will

“support farming and food production in Scotland to become a global leader in sustainable and regenerative agriculture.”

It puts farmers, crofters and land managers at its core, and values their efforts to help feed the nation and steward our countryside. The Scottish Government understands that the sector needs flexibility, now and into the future, to best respond to the pressures and challenges that we will continue to face. NFU Scotland has told us that being nimble and flexible is key.

As we move forward, the bill will allow for the provision of adaptive support to farmers, crofters and land managers in the near-term, medium-term and long-term future. As the Scottish Government continues to co-develop the measures for the four-

tier support framework, it remains committed to supporting active farming and food production with direct payments now, and it will take a phased approach to integrating new conditionality. There must be no cliff edges in either support or conditionality.

It is important to reflect on the fact that the bill was informed by the insights of five farmer-led groups that reported to us. Those invaluable groups made contributions on the suckler beef, dairy, pig, arable and hill, upland and crofting sectors and demonstrated a shared commitment to, and appetite for, change across the industry.

During consideration of the bill, many expressed the view that there needed to be much more detail in the text of the bill. Although I understand why some felt that way, it is not practical to lay out detailed schemes in primary legislation, as that would remove the opportunity to create flexibility to respond to unforeseen future issues. That is why the framework bill is the right way forward. Secondary legislation will lay out detailed schemes that will sit within the framework of primary legislation but will be best able to respond to change. It is also important that we ensure that there is space for the relevant committee to scrutinise future iterations in a way that is effective for all. I agree that it is imperative that we see the rural support plan as soon as possible.

One of the first sessions that I attended as a new member of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee was when we hosted 37 land managers and community representatives from across Scotland to help to inform our consideration of the bill. I found the session to be highly informative, and I came away contemplating how we create space for, and provide support to, our smaller producers, and how we ensure that the voices of rural communities are amplified and those communities are supported to thrive. I would be keen to hear from the cabinet secretary on both those issues when she sums up.

Finally, it is important that we reflect on the reason that the bill was needed in the first place, which is Brexit—a change that this country did not vote for, and which has been quite disastrous for our rural communities. While Scotland was in the European Union, we enjoyed the benefit of a seven-year multi-annual framework that reflected the uniqueness of our agricultural landscape, with Scotland receiving nearly £1 billion in funding annually to support farming, food production, woodland creation, environmental protection and wider rural priorities. Since Brexit, Scotland's funding has been allocated annually, with no certainty beyond next year, and scant dialogue from UK ministers, despite the best efforts of our cabinet secretary. Perhaps an incoming Government can have better dialogue with us.

In addition, we must recognise the threats that the United Kingdom Internal Market Act 2020 places on our agriculture sector, and the difficulties that it creates with regard to our ability to tailor agricultural payments to the specific needs of Scottish farmers, crofters and land managers in the future. I do not think that we can underestimate that.

This framework bill is needed, and I urge the Parliament to support it today.

19:53

**Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries)**

**(Con):** The Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill has been a long time coming, particularly given that the UK vote was almost exactly eight years ago and it is more than three years since the UK Government passed the Internal Market Act 2020, in November of that year.

We are told that the new framework bill will be used by the Scottish Government to deliver its vision for agriculture, but I am not alone—far from it—when I say that there has been insufficient progress in providing detail to farmers and growers across Scotland of what that vision will look like in practice.

The Rural Affairs and Islands Committee handled stages 1 and 2, and I thank the committee clerks and all the witnesses who took part. We undertook a significant piece of pre-legislative scrutiny work, holding evidence sessions and gaining a broad understanding of Scottish agriculture and future challenge and opportunities. Throughout witness sessions and visits, we heard concerns from across the sector about the timing of the bill and, more importantly, about the lack of information on the direction of future agricultural support.

Sadly, the passing of the bill will not relieve any fears around that challenge. Stakeholders also demanded that any future agriculture and rural support must be developed in full consultation with them. Although the cabinet secretary has reiterated the Government's intention to co-design the agricultural support system with stakeholders, the bill has fallen short of providing adequate rules for statutory consultation. Index-linking budgets would be a true measure of co-design at grassroots level, but what we have from this SNP Government is the ill-thought-out calving index condition, which is just one example of co-design not working.

New qualifying conditions will be introduced to the Scottish suckler beef support scheme, which is a hugely important payment system for some people, as it accounts for 33 per cent of their income, but farmers and representative groups are

asking for the scheme to be paused. The Institute of Auctioneers and Appraisers in Scotland has described the new conditionality measures as “counterintuitive”, and the National Beef Association has said that introducing the conditions

“halfway through the qualifying period is just foolish.”

I hope that that is not an example of the co-design that the cabinet secretary has been portraying as the gold standard in policy making.

A framework bill can deliver policy that is flexible and adaptable. Nevertheless, the Law Society of Scotland has highlighted

“the need for flexibility to be appropriately balanced against ensuring there is clarity in the law, appropriate levels of parliamentary scrutiny underpinning legislative and policy developments, and meaningful stakeholder consultation.”

Without greater detail as to how the subsequent proposals will operate in practice, it is difficult to fully understand and assess their likely impacts, particularly on people operating in the sector. As a former NFUS president said to me, the Scottish Government's bill says, in effect, “Give us the power to do whatever we want, when we want, with whatever budget we want, on policy priorities as yet undecided or at least unpublished.”

The publication of the draft rural support plan could have been the saving grace in addressing some of the uncertainty, but, despite calls for it to be published before stage 3 to allow discussion and initial scrutiny, those calls have been ignored by the Government. All that we have had are amendments that provide more information and the commitment to effective consultation with those who will be affected by plans during the preparation, or any subsequent reviews, of plans. Although that is welcome, it falls well short of what the industry and stakeholders were looking for.

The bill could have been so much more. It was the opportunity for Scotland to move away from the CAP and develop a plan and strategy through a bespoke piece of legislation that was capable of delivering a future farming industry, addressing Scotland's unique challenges and opportunities and ensuring that the industry was sustainable, profitable and capable of delivering the food security, climate change, biodiversity and rural repopulation outcomes that we all want to see.

I am disappointed by the lack of ambition that has been shown by this Government and some of our farming representative organisations, whose closeness to the Government and unquestioning acceptance of the bill are regrettable. I sincerely hope that the lack of vision does not derail what our hugely innovative farmers have already achieved in the past few years without what is often misguided interference from the Government.

**The Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity (Jim Fairlie):** Will Finlay Carson give way?

**The Presiding Officer:** Mr Carson has concluded. I call Richard Leonard, who is the final speaker in the open debate.

19:58

**Richard Leonard (Central Scotland) (Lab):** I draw members' attention to my voluntary entry in the register of members' interests.

As I set out in the stage 1 debate, the stated intentions of the bill are ones that we broadly welcome, but the test will be whether those intentions are fulfilled. That is why I, for one, welcome the Government's willingness to improve the transparency, monitoring and evaluation of the distribution of farm payments and other financial instruments.

Pete Ritchie of Nourish Scotland told me just this week that the very latest figures show that the top 10 per cent of recipients of basic payments swallow up 43.7 per cent of the total budget—that is over a quarter of a billion pounds going to the top 10 per cent—and we have the largest concentration of land ownership in the whole of western Europe. So, if, in a year or two's time, the biggest and wealthiest landowners are still the biggest recipients of farm support payments, in my view we will have failed.

We also need to turn back the tide of corporate greenwashing, to turn back the tide of corporate and capital wealth tax avoidance, and to turn back the tide of city spivs and speculators dominating the reforestation of Scotland. There is no meaningful regulation of the market. The cabinet secretary tells us that

"Scottish Forestry does not restrict funding to companies based on their wider business interests."

Well, it should. This is public money. There is a racket going on here, and it is a racket that we can stop.

We need to end a system in which too much public money is going into the private pockets of Scotland's already wealthy corporations and estate owners. What a contrast all of that is to the plight of the people who work on our farms—those 67,000 farm labourers in Scotland and those 6,000 to 7,000 migrant seasonal workers, who are, in my view, the most exploited workers in Scotland. They are treated as the lowest of the low.

The landowners tell us that fair work principles should not apply to those seasonal workers, because they are covered by the Scottish Agricultural Wages Board, but their hourly rate is just £11.44. That is well below the living wage. Add to that the fact that they have a deduction from that, in many cases, for accommodation that

is often below a tolerable standard and that, we have learned through the passage of the bill, is not inspected at all.

There is a huge inequality and a great injustice here, which should challenge not just our sense of fairness but our sense of morality. I am disappointed by the Government's unimaginative, uninspired inaction on this in Parliament today. Let me finish with the words of John Steinbeck, who warned in "The Grapes of Wrath" that

"the line between hunger and anger is a thin line."

He wrote that

"in the eyes of the hungry there is a growing wrath. In the souls of the people the grapes of wrath are filling and growing heavy, growing heavy for the vintage."

The current unequal, unjust rigged order is not working. It is driving a movement for change—for radical change—that is pro-people, pro-worker, pro-environment and pro-nature, and that is what we must deliver. That is our democratic, social and moral duty—to act to deliver that real and radical change.

**The Presiding Officer:** We move to winding-up speeches.

20:02

**Ariane Burgess:** I am honoured to have been part of the process of shaping the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill. I thank the cabinet secretary and my MSP colleagues for their contributions to the debate. I once again thank the numerous farmers, crofters and other stakeholders who worked hard to make the bill as strong as possible, so that it can help to shape agriculture and rural land use and support rural communities.

A key theme that has emerged through working on the bill is justice. Climate justice requires significant changes in agriculture and land management, which in turn require changes to rural support and incentives.

**Finlay Carson:** Will the member give way?

**Ariane Burgess:** I am sorry, but I am not going to take any interventions.

Social justice indicates that the agriculture budget should be redistributed to support more people, particularly those who run small-scale farms and crofts. Social justice also demands the right to food, which has implications for farming, food processing, policy and payments. Ecological justice and animal rights point us to using public funds for public good, not for subsidising blood sports on grouse moors.

To advance each of those forms of justice, a just transition is needed to support people to change practices where necessary, start new activities

where desired and make a good living from work that benefits people and the planet in the community where they want to live. That is an extremely tall order, and it will not be achieved by the bill alone, but the bill is a key piece of the puzzle, which is why it is so important.

In my opening contribution, I spoke about the improvements that various members made to the bill, and there is much to be proud of, but there are many areas where more progress must be made. Beyond the passage of the bill, it is imperative that we continue to push for improvements that will advance those aspects of justice through rural land management and how it is supported.

I lodged amendments that aimed to help new and young farmers to buy land in the face of sky-high land prices, to give local communities a voice in relation to large-scale non-native tree planting, to redistribute a portion of farm support so that there is more for small farms and crofts and for climate and nature, to curb public subsidies for driven grouse moors, to ensure that rural payments help to promote land reform and land access principles, and to encourage employers of seasonal farm workers to provide fair work in a safe environment. The cabinet secretary has assured me that work is under way to advance many of those aims, which did not require inclusion in this piece of primary legislation. I appreciate the intentions of the Scottish Government. The Scottish Greens will follow those aspects closely, and I look forward to seeing them develop.

The Scottish Greens are clear, as are many stakeholders, that significant changes are needed in agriculture and land use in order to address the climate and nature crises. That will happen in a socially just way only if there are significant changes to the support and incentives that are provided through the rural budget.

The Scottish Government has said repeatedly that it will transform the way in which farming and food production are supported. We have not yet seen evidence of that transformation, but we are confident that the bill creates the powers and establishes the framework that will enable the necessary change, which we trust will become clear as work continues along the agricultural reform route map. That will be absolutely crucial to supporting farmers, crofters, growers, foresters and other members of rural communities to adapt and thrive through regenerative land management, food production and related businesses. The bill is a significant milestone on that track. The Greens strongly support it and we urge other members to do the same.

20:06

**Colin Smyth (South Scotland) (Lab):** It is eight years since the vote to leave the EU, and it is four years since the Parliament passed the Agriculture (Retained EU Law and Data) (Scotland) Act 2020. Even after this long-overdue bill is passed today, too much of the future of farming will still be on hold: we are “treading water”, as Beatrice Wishart said.

There is no draft rural support plan, there are still no measurable targets and there is still no better distribution of support. I know that we cannot dot every single i and cross every single t of a rural support scheme in primary legislation. We need flexibility to ensure that some changes can be made when needed without revisiting the primary legislation. However, the bill should have set out a clearer strategic direction and a real purpose, and it should have had more ambition for future support.

The bill should have better recognised the facts: that our current agricultural support system is not working; that too many farmers and crofters cannot make ends meet; that conflict and war are, more than ever, putting our food security at risk; that despite more than 80 per cent of Scotland’s land being used for agriculture, we have rising food poverty; that past practice has too often damaged biodiversity; and that innovative, regenerative and nature-friendly practices are still undersupported.

We cannot continue with business as usual. Properly supporting our farmers and crofters is key to producing the food that we eat, but changing how we provide that support is key to restoring nature, to tackling climate change and to supporting sustainable rural communities.

There have been some welcome changes to the bill since it was published. During stage 1, I and charities including OneKind highlighted the failure of the bill to include a commitment in its objectives to improving animal welfare. I am pleased that that was amended at stage 2. High-quality food production is delivered through high animal welfare standards. It is right that that is reflected in the objectives of the bill, and it should be reflected in the support that we provide to farmers and crofters.

At stage 2, I lodged amendments on proper engagement in development of the rural support plan, so I am pleased that the cabinet secretary listened to the arguments and lodged amendments on that at stage 3.

The bill could and should have been better, however, and I have to say that part of the responsibility for the fact that it is not better rests with the Scottish Greens. At stage 2, amendment after amendment that I moved, supported by

Scotland's environmental groups, was voted down, often by just one vote. That one vote was the Scottish Greens voting against improvements to our environment.

We now turn our attention to implementation of the bill. Rhoda Grant was right to emphasise the importance of the proposed rural support plan, which is, arguably, even more important than the bill itself. Several members highlighted the failure of the Government to bring forward a meaningful draft plan by stage 3. As Rhoda Grant said, the Government hates scrutiny: ministers believe that they know best.

Rhoda Grant and Richard Leonard were also right to highlight the failure to set out in the bill a clear commitment to a more distributive approach to farm payments. As Rhoda Grant said:

"We also know that smaller producers underpin our rural communities, which addresses depopulation, yet we reward larger producers, many of whom would be profitable without support, to a much greater extent."

I was struck by the figures that Richard Leonard highlighted from Nourish Scotland that show that the top 10 per cent of recipients of basic payments swallowed up 43.7 per cent of the total budget—more than a quarter of a billion pounds. Too much support goes to too few and too many are excluded from that support. The bill was a missed opportunity to address that.

The bill will be passed today. However, much work still needs to be done to ensure that food production is at the heart of our rural support scheme and that that is done in a fair and sustainable way. If that does not happen, the Government will continue to fail to deliver for Scotland's farmers and crofters and it will continue to fail to deliver for Scotland's environment.

20:10

**Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con):** I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests: I am a partner in a farming business and I am in receipt of farming payments. I am a member of NFU Scotland, Scottish Land & Estates and the Royal Highland and Agricultural Society of Scotland—I am looking forward to the show this week. I am a substitute member of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee and was involved only slightly in the scrutiny of the bill, and I am a member of the Finance and Public Administration Committee.

We should have reached this point some time ago and the matter should have been sorted out a long time ago. As others have mentioned, the United Kingdom Government's Agriculture Bill was passed more than three and a half years ago. Throughout the legislative process, stakeholders

have warned about delays with progressing the bill and of the impact of those delays.

I feel a sense of *déjà vu* while speaking today, because I spoke in the stage 1 debate and although the political side of Scotland has changed—the "Faustian pact", as Fergus Ewing called it, of the Bute house agreement is over—many of the concerns that we had then remain today.

MSPs, committees and stakeholders have raised concerns about this framework bill because of its serious lack of detail. Obviously, more details will be filled in through secondary legislation. Of course, we still have no rural support plan, which Professor Thomson of Scotland's Rural College said

"needs to be front and centre",

while Douglas Bell of the Scottish Tenant Farmers Association said:

"The earlier that can come, the better. There is a real frustration among agricultural stakeholders just now about working in a vacuum."—[*Official Report, Rural Affairs and Islands Committee*, 31 January 2024; c 11, 12-13.

A Government that has produced reams and reams of independence papers that no one reads has not been able to produce a rural support plan that farmers need. Despite that, ministers have ignored calls for it to be published. Has the cabinet secretary signed off the rural support plan? I am happy to take an intervention from the cabinet secretary if she would like to clarify whether she has signed off the rural support plan.

**Mairi Gougeon:** I do not make points or interventions at the beck and call of members.

**Jamie Halcro Johnston:** Well, that is a shame, because I think that the plan is vital. As my colleague Fin Carson said during the debate, it will be extraordinarily disrespectful if the rural support plan that we have been denied being able to see and scrutinise is, perhaps for political reasons, published in the next few days.

That lack of detail and uncertainty for farmers has impacted on investment and long-term decision making not just on them but on the supply chain. That is why I welcomed and was happy to support Beatrice Wishart's amendment calling for indicative multiyear funding. I am disappointed, if not surprised, that the SNP did not support that.

I turn to other amendments. The Scottish Conservatives promised to lodge amendments to improve the bill. I congratulate my colleagues Tim Eagle, Edward Mountain and Brian Whittle on their successful amendments. I also thank Rachael Hamilton and Finlay Carson, who have engaged very positively throughout the bill process. Rachael Hamilton's amendments tried to ensure better scrutiny by Parliament and its committees of

the rural support plan, and recognised the need to preserve the traditions of farmers and crofters. That was never evident in some of the amendments that were lodged by Ariane Burgess.

The Scottish Conservatives support the bill because of the need for more certainty for farmers. Farmers are being asked to trust the SNP—to trust a Government that has cut rural budgets, that has syphoned off peer-review funding, that has let down rural Scotland time and again and that has often thought that it knows best, rather than listening to those who farm and manage Scotland's land. However, many people in our rural communities and in the agricultural sector do not trust the SNP.

When the rural support plan is delivered and secondary legislation is introduced, the Scottish Conservatives will do all that we can to ensure that it will meet the needs of our farming sector and our rural communities.

20:15

**Mairi Gougeon:** I have to start by saying to Jamie Halcro Johnston that people have even less faith in his disastrous party, and we will soon see evidence of that in the upcoming election.

**Jamie Halcro Johnston:** Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

**Mairi Gougeon:** No, thank you.

I wanted to start in a positive way, given the debate that we have had and the amendments that we have considered. I thank my parliamentary colleagues for their contributions to the debate and for all their contributions and discussions on amendments. I admit that we have had a few tetchy points, but I am glad that we have, largely, been able to discuss the bill in quite a constructive way.

There were, of course, various amendments that we were not able to accept and various areas that we were not able to agree on, but there were many areas of consensus. I know that all of us across the chamber share the vision of a thriving agriculture sector, with our farmers and crofters continuing to produce food in a way that works for the climate and for nature and playing their critical role in thriving rural and island communities. I believe that the bill that we are due to pass sets a firm foundation that will enable us to deliver that.

I turn to some of the points that have been made in the debate. There is so much to cover, so I will try to get through as much as I can. I will pick up on some of the points that Richard Leonard made. First, I thank him for raising the cultural tone of the debate through his literary references, but he also raised hugely important points. I know that he might not be content with my response to

him today but, as I outlined, the issues that he raised are hugely complex and do not rest solely in my portfolio, so it is not just up to me or within my powers to fix them—they cut across Government portfolios. I hope that he will take up my offer of a meeting with me and the Minister for Housing so that we can at least try to make some progress on the important issues that he has raised.

I know that the rural support plan is of great interest to members, many of whom have spoken about it tonight. At stage 2, I spoke about the content, scrutiny and role of the rural support plan. As I highlighted to the committee, I recognise that there is a lot of interest in the area, which was reflected in the many stage 2 amendments relating to how the bill's provisions could be strengthened. I believe that it was crucial that we considered those amendments not in isolation but as a coherent whole to ensure that the plan could be drafted and delivered and could function. I reiterate that I believe that the amendments were lodged in good faith to make the bill more effective.

**Finlay Carson:** Can you confirm whether you have signed off the draft rural support plan?

**The Presiding Officer:** Speak through the chair.

**Mairi Gougeon:** The convener of the committee might be surprised to know that the committee was sent a copy of the draft rural support plan on 7 June, which has been published on the committee's web page. I take serious issue with the completely unfounded comments and accusations that have been thrown at me tonight. If the member cared to do a quick Google search, he would find it for himself.

As I said, I believe that it was crucial that we considered the amendments not in isolation but as a coherent whole. Ultimately, that will ensure that the plan is as strong as possible and is able to function now, during the period of transition, and well into the future. We will co-develop the policies and schemes with farmers, crofters and wider stakeholders. That is why I committed to engaging collaboratively with members of all parties prior to stage 3 and to lodging amendments that would reflect that. Generally, I am pleased that, together, we have been able to deliver on that commitment. We have passed a series of robust amendments covering the rural support plan and our approach to monitoring and evaluation.

Many other issues were raised when amendments were discussed earlier. Certain things were asked for but, although I agreed with the basis of the amendments, I was unable to support them. One such issue was, undoubtedly, the asks from members across the chamber for

the Government to commit to multiyear financial frameworks.

Funding and the lack of certainty about future budgets have been raised many times. As members are well aware, Brexit means that we no longer have any assurance on long-term funding. We have no certainty that we will have any funding even beyond next year. That is why I welcomed the committee's backing for the Scottish Government's long-standing call for certainty from the UK Government on future funding. Rural Scotland cannot suffer a loss of financial support as a result of Brexit and the decisions that have been made by a disastrous UK Government.

The Scottish Government expects the UK Government to meet its public commitment and engage in collective and meaningful discussion about the future allocation of rural support. I have to raise the complete disrespect that has been shown to not only the Scottish Government but devolved Administrations across the UK. They have been completely ignored by the latest Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. There has been not one response to a piece of correspondence, and he has refused to turn up to meetings in which he would have to engage with the relevant members. That situation cannot continue. I am sure that voters will have their say when it comes to 4 July.

The Scottish Government has, of course, been clear and consistent in our position that we expect full replacement of EU funds to ensure that there is no detriment to Scotland's finances, and we expect the UK Government to fully respect the devolution settlement in any future arrangement. Despite the uncertainty, I have been clear to the sector and in Parliament that there will be no cliff edges in support, as the Scottish Government has committed to maintaining direct payments beyond 2026 and supporting our nation's producers through a just transition. Over the past few years, I have listened to all the feedback that we have had from members of all committees, stakeholders and—this is important—our farmers and crofters. They are the people who work the land, produce our food and work for the climate and nature. It is vital that we continue that work with them as we develop our future policy, and that is exactly what I intend to do.

Passing the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill in Parliament will be a significant milestone in reforming our agricultural and wider rural support systems, and it takes us another step further on that journey. I am therefore happy to commend the bill to Parliament.

**The Presiding Officer:** That concludes the debate on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill at stage 3.

## Parliamentary Bureau Motions

20:22

### **The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

The next item of business is consideration of three Parliamentary Bureau motions. I ask Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, to move motions S6M-13693 and S6M-13694, on committee membership, and motion S6M-13695, on substitution on committees.

### *Motions moved,*

That the Parliament agrees that—

George Adam be appointed as a member of the Constitution, Europe, External Affairs and Culture Committee;

Ben Macpherson be appointed as a member of the Criminal Justice Committee;

Michelle Thomson be appointed to replace Colin Beattie as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee;

Willie Coffey be appointed to replace Evelyn Tweed as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee;

George Adam be appointed to replace Ruth Maguire as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

John Mason be appointed to replace Ben Macpherson as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

Evelyn Tweed be appointed to replace Michelle Thomson as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

Joe FitzPatrick be appointed as a member of the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee;

Emma Roddick be appointed to replace Stephanie Callaghan as a member of the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee;

Fulton MacGregor be appointed to replace Willie Coffey as a member of the Public Audit Committee;

Colin Beattie be appointed to replace Alasdair Allan as a member of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee;

Kevin Stewart be appointed to replace John Mason as a member of the Social Justice and Social Security Committee;

Ruth Maguire be appointed as a member of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee; and

Joe FitzPatrick be appointed to replace Jackie Dunbar as a member of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee.

That the Parliament agrees that Lorna Slater be appointed to replace Maggie Chapman as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee.

That the Parliament agrees that Maggie Chapman be appointed to replace Ariane Burgess as the Scottish Green Party substitute on the Economy and Fair Work Committee.—[*Jamie Hepburn*]



**The Presiding Officer:** The question on the motions will be put at decision time.

## Decision Time

20:22

**The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):**

There are two questions to be put as a result of today's business. The first question is, that motion S6M-13663, in the name of Mairi Gougeon, on the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill at stage 3, be agreed to. As this is a motion to pass the bill at stage 3, the question must be decided by division. As members have been voting throughout the afternoon, I will allow a moment for them to refresh the voting app.

Members should cast their votes now.

**For**

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)  
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)  
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)  
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)  
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)  
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)  
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)  
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)  
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)  
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)  
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)  
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)  
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)  
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)  
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Lab)  
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)  
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)  
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)  
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)  
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)  
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)  
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)  
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)  
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)  
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)  
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)  
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)  
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)  
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)  
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)  
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)  
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)  
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)  
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)  
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)  
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)  
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)  
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)  
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)  
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)  
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)  
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)  
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Jamie Hepburn]  
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)  
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)  
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)  
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)  
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)  
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)  
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)  
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)  
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)  
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)  
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)  
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)  
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)  
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)  
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)  
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)  
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)  
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)  
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)  
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)  
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)  
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)  
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)  
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)  
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)  
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)  
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)  
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)  
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)  
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)  
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)  
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)  
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)  
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)  
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)  
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)  
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)  
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)  
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)  
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)  
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)  
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Richard Leonard]  
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)  
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)  
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)  
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)  
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)  
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)  
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

**The Presiding Officer:** The result of the division is: For 115, Against 0, Abstentions 0.

*Motion agreed to,*

That the Parliament agrees that the Agriculture and Rural Communities (Scotland) Bill be passed.

**The Presiding Officer:** If no member objects, I propose to ask a single question on three Parliamentary Bureau motions. The final question is, that motions S6M-13693 and S6M-13694, on committee membership, and motion S6M-13695, on substitution on committees, in the name of Jamie Hepburn, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, be agreed to.

*Motions agreed to,*

That the Parliament agrees that—

George Adam be appointed as a member of the Constitution, Europe, External Affairs and Culture Committee;

Ben Macpherson be appointed as a member of the Criminal Justice Committee;

Michelle Thomson be appointed to replace Colin Beattie as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee;

Willie Coffey be appointed to replace Evelyn Tweed as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee;

George Adam be appointed to replace Ruth Maguire as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

John Mason be appointed to replace Ben Macpherson as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

Evelyn Tweed be appointed to replace Michelle Thomson as a member of the Education, Children and Young People Committee;

Joe FitzPatrick be appointed as a member of the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee;

Emma Roddick be appointed to replace Stephanie Callaghan as a member of the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee;

Fulton MacGregor be appointed to replace Willie Coffey as a member of the Public Audit Committee;

Colin Beattie be appointed to replace Alasdair Allan as a member of the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee;

Kevin Stewart be appointed to replace John Mason as a member of the Social Justice and Social Security Committee;

Ruth Maguire be appointed as a member of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee; and

Joe FitzPatrick be appointed to replace Jackie Dunbar as a member of the Standards, Procedures and Public Appointments Committee.

That the Parliament agrees that Lorna Slater be appointed to replace Maggie Chapman as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee.

That the Parliament agrees that Maggie Chapman be appointed to replace Ariane Burgess as the Scottish Green Party substitute on the Economy and Fair Work Committee.

**The Presiding Officer:** That concludes decision time.

*Meeting closed at 20:25.*



This is a draft *Official Report* and is subject to correction between publication and archiving, which will take place no later than 35 working days after the date of the meeting. The most up-to-date version is available here:  
[www.parliament.scot/chamber-and-committees/what-was-said-and-official-reports/official-reports](http://www.parliament.scot/chamber-and-committees/what-was-said-and-official-reports/official-reports)

Members and other meeting participants who wish to suggest corrections to their contributions should contact the Official Report.

Official Report  
Room T2.20  
Scottish Parliament  
Edinburgh  
EH99 1SP

Email: [official.report@parliament.scot](mailto:official.report@parliament.scot)  
Telephone: 0131 348 5447  
Fax: 0131 348 5423

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

**Tuesday 16 July 2024**

---

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

---

All documents are available on the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot)

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers is available here:

[www.parliament.scot/documents](http://www.parliament.scot/documents)

---

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000  
Textphone: 0800 092 7100  
Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)

---

