



OFFICIAL REPORT
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 9 October 2019

Session 5



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.parliament.scot or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

Wednesday 9 October 2019

CONTENTS

	Col.
PORTFOLIO QUESTION TIME	1
GOVERNMENT BUSINESS AND CONSTITUTIONAL RELATIONS	1
Brexit (New Agreement)	1
No-deal Brexit (Possible Disruptions at NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde)	2
European Union (Future Relationship)	3
Northern Ireland (Impact of Relationship with the European Union)	5
European Union Citizens (Assistance to Stay)	6
No-deal Brexit (Environmental Governance Mechanisms)	7
Veterans (Historic Allegations)	8
CULTURE, TOURISM AND EXTERNAL AFFAIRS	9
Tourism (Inverclyde)	9
Bosnia and Herzegovina (Relations)	10
Brexit (Decline in European Tourists)	11
Brexit (Impact on European Union Tourists)	12
Culture and Heritage (Engagement by Young People from Disadvantaged Backgrounds)	13
Historic Buildings and Landmarks (Dundee)	14
Culture and Tourism (Participation by Disabled People and People with Long-term Health Conditions) ..	15
BUSINESS MOTION	17
<i>Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.</i>	
TRANSPORT (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3	18
BUSINESS MOTIONS	285
<i>Motions moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.</i>	
PARLIAMENTARY BUREAU MOTIONS	288
<i>Motions moved—[Graeme Dey].</i>	
DECISION TIME	289
CHARTER OF RIGHTS FOR PEOPLE WITH DEMENTIA AND THEIR CARERS	290
<i>Motion debated—[Sandra White].</i>	
Sandra White (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)	290
Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Con)	293
Tom Arthur (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)	294
Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)	295
Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)	297
The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey)	299

Scottish Parliament

Wednesday 9 October 2019

[The Deputy Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 13:00]

Portfolio Question Time

Government Business and Constitutional Relations

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Christine Grahame): The first item of business is portfolio questions on Government business and constitutional relations. I remind members that questions 3 and 8 will be grouped together.

Brexit (New Agreement)

1. Annabelle Ewing (Cowdenbeath) (SNP): To ask the Scottish Government what communication it has received from the United Kingdom Government regarding proposals for a new Brexit agreement. (S5O-03635)

The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations (Michael Russell): Although the UK's exit from the European Union was discussed at the meeting of the joint ministerial committee (European Union negotiations) on 12 September in London, we received no correspondence from the UK Government on its proposals for a new Brexit agreement ahead of their announcement by the Prime Minister.

I spoke to the Secretary of State for Exiting the European Union shortly after the proposals' publication, at his request. As has been the case throughout the negotiations, the Scottish Government has not been treated as a trusted partner; indeed, we have had to keep abreast of events through media reports. It is disappointing and frustrating that, yet again, the devolved Administrations have had no meaningful opportunity to influence discussions—a point that I will raise again at tomorrow's meeting of the joint ministerial committee (European Union negotiations), which will be held in Edinburgh.

Annabelle Ewing: I share the cabinet secretary's disappointment.

Yesterday, we heard from number 10 an extraordinary briefing about a telephone conversation with the German Chancellor Angela Merkel, in which the UK Government claimed that what she had said had put the kibosh on its achieving a deal. That claim was widely refuted, and led to an unprecedented intervention by the President of the European Council, who cited a

"blame game" being played by the UK Government. Does the cabinet secretary share my belief that that briefing simply represented Boris Johnson's and the Tories' attempt to shift the blame for the Brexit fiasco to anyone but themselves?

Michael Russell: Yes. I think that there is a general view that whatever is taking place at 10 Downing Street is so outside the norms of behaviour for a Prime Minister—or, indeed, for any civilised Government—that we have to wonder what will come next.

I noticed the question at the end of Donald Tusk's tweet yesterday. We do not know where the Prime Minister is going or where Brexit itself is going, but the damage that it is doing is immense.

Adam Tomkins (Glasgow) (Con): The cabinet secretary mentioned that a meeting of the joint ministerial committee (European Union negotiations) will take place in Edinburgh tomorrow. Does he not welcome that, and the fact that he will, as I understand it, be in the chair? I think that I am correct that it will be the first time that a minister who is not from the UK Government will chair such a meeting. Are those facts not to be welcomed, and do they not offer opportunities for the cabinet secretary to raise with UK Government ministers and officials precisely the sorts of questions that he mentioned?

Michael Russell: I welcome the fact that the JMC(EN) meeting will be held here. I pay tribute to the Welsh Government, which was due to host it. Because of its other commitments, I and my colleagues have stepped in to host the meeting here. I also welcome the fact that, provided that the meeting takes place, I will be the first minister who is not from the UK Government to chair the JMC(EN) since it was commenced at devolution.

However, who is in the chair and where the meeting is held are minor matters in comparison with what its outcomes might be. I will be satisfied tomorrow only if I find that we have made progress on the key issues on the agenda. So far, I am not hopeful that we will, although I remain hopeful that Michael Gove and Stephen Barclay will prove me wrong.

No-deal Brexit (Possible Disruptions at NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde)

2. Johann Lamont (Glasgow) (Lab): To ask the Scottish Government what discussions regarding possible disruptions in the event of a no-deal Brexit it has had with NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. (S5O-03636)

The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations (Michael Russell): My colleague the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport has had regular

discussions with the chairs of all NHS Scotland boards, including NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde, about their preparations for the United Kingdom's exiting the European Union. In addition, officials are in regular contact with the health boards. All such discussions have covered a range of risks and issues, including the potential for disruptions to supplies and the impact that those might have on service delivery.

Johann Lamont: I am sure that the cabinet secretary will agree that we cannot believe a word that Prime Minister Boris Johnson says, especially in relation to his promise that Brexit would bring the national health service an extra £350 million a week. Does the cabinet secretary agree that, in stark contrast to that promise, Brexit uncertainty and the threat of there being no deal have put the NHS and social care under even more pressure? Given the challenges that health boards already face, and with Brexit uncertainty creating staff shortages, the possibility of a lack of medicines and there being less money to invest in the sector, will he outline how the Scottish Government will prioritise our NHS and ensure that health boards get the support that they need in the run-up to the Brexit deadline?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I appreciate that the issue is very important, but I would like to hear shorter supplementaries.

Michael Russell: I agree with Johann Lamont. I point out that the publication yesterday of "Scottish Government Overview of 'No Deal' Preparations", to which the Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills spoke in the chamber, indicates the priority that we have given the matter. Clearly, there are issues to do with the workforce and with medicines and other crucial supplies.

In addition, we must be realistic with people. We will do everything that we can to avoid disruption, but we cannot do everything. Therefore, people should take the position that a no-deal Brexit, or, indeed, any Brexit, will be immensely damaging.

European Union (Future Relationship)

3. Maureen Watt (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP): To ask the Scottish Government, in light of reports that Northern Ireland will be given powers to shape its future relationship with the EU, what representations it has made to the UK Government regarding similar powers being given to Scotland. (S5O-03637)

The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations (Michael Russell): The Scottish Government has long argued for Scotland to have its own arrangements for Brexit, recognising that the vote

in the referendum here was comprehensively against leaving the EU.

As far back as December 2016, we set out in "Scotland's Place in Europe" comprehensive proposals to achieve that, including the powers that should be transferred to this Parliament to enable us to implement our proposals.

The UK Government has not shown the slightest inclination to have serious discussions on what Brexit means for governance in these islands, beyond its instinct to centralise and control. The proposals that the Prime Minister set out this week seem to be designed to fail, as they are demanding that the EU abandon some of its core principles.

The best way to protect our place in Europe and our relationship with the EU is for Scotland to become an independent member in our own right.

Maureen Watt: As the cabinet secretary said, the Scottish Government was the first in these isles to publish a Brexit plan, which the UK Government ignored. The Scottish Government then put forward a compromise position, which the UK Government also ignored. The Tories have ignored the voices of the 62 per cent who voted to remain—

Adam Tomkins (Glasgow) (Con): Question?

Maureen Watt: —and they ignored their trouncing earlier this year in the EU elections.

Adam Tomkins: Question?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Excuse me. I will decide when the question is to come. I do not need you to tell me.

Maureen Watt: Is not it the case that the people of Scotland should have their say on their own future? If the UK Government continues to—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: No—that is long.

Maureen Watt: —ignore the voters, they are the ones who will take the future into their own hands as an independent country—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Naughty, naughty, Ms Watt. That was a long question. I do not want long supplementaries. I know that you will be good, cabinet secretary.

Michael Russell: I am almost too nervous to speak, now. [*Interruption.*] I said, "almost too nervous to speak", just in case Johann Lamont thought that I might be wishing not to.

One of the many tragedies of the Brexit situation is the refusal of the Prime Minister—of any Prime Minister—to listen to what is being said to them by Scotland, Wales, Northern Ireland and, indeed, their own party. That is one of the root causes of

our finding ourselves in this position. It is essential that Scotland's voice be heard on a simple question: does it want to exit the EU with the UK, with all the chaos, or does it want to be a normal independent state in the EU? That is the core question. I know which side I am on.

Northern Ireland (Impact of Relationship with the European Union)

8. **Colin Smyth (South Scotland) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions it has had with the United Kingdom Government regarding the impact on Scotland of Northern Ireland having a different economic relationship with the EU to the rest of the UK. (S5O-03642)

The Cabinet Secretary for Government Business and Constitutional Relations (Michael Russell): I have raised that issue with the United Kingdom Government at meetings of the joint ministerial committee (European Union negotiations) and bilaterally.

We have always made it clear that we support the Good Friday agreement absolutely and in its entirety, and the need to maintain the invisible border on the island of Ireland.

However, it should be noted that as far back as 2016, and completely separate from any discussion about Northern Ireland, the Scottish Government put forward plans to keep Scotland in the single market, but the UK Government rejected them out of hand.

Any form of Brexit will be damaging to Scotland, and it is now clear that the UK Government favours a much more distant long-term relationship with the EU even than that which was envisaged by Theresa May. That will have a very damaging impact on Scotland and the Scottish economy.

Colin Smyth: Whether we end up with the UK Government's latest half-baked proposed deal, or crash out in a devastating no-deal Brexit, there will be a unique impact on the Cairnryan ferry port in south-west Scotland. What support is the Scottish Government providing to best mitigate the impact of that challenge on communities in south-west Scotland?

Michael Russell: I am fully aware that each part of Scotland will have its own questions and difficulties. Today we have released an online tool that will allow any member and anyone in Scotland to look at the impact on their communities. It is interesting to see how varied the impacts will be, although all the impacts will be negative.

Yesterday, the Deputy First Minister said that the unused parts of Stranraer port, in the south-west, will be used for marshalling lorries in the event of there being demand. There are security

issues that will need to be addressed, if there is to be a border in the Irish Sea. A range of other issues need to be addressed for each part of Scotland. We will do that.

However, I stress the point that I made to Johann Lamont: we will work with members and others to do everything we can, but we cannot do everything, in the circumstances.

European Union Citizens (Assistance to Stay)

4. **Jenny Gilruth (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what assistance it is providing to EU citizens to stay in Scotland ahead of 31 October. (S5O-03638)

The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey): The Scottish Government has committed over £1 million to support EU citizens, including £800,000 over three years to Citizens Advice Scotland's EU citizens support service, which provides advice and information.

In April, we launched the stay in Scotland campaign to provide information, advice and practical support on the EU settlement scheme, including £250,000 for community support across Scotland.

Jenny Gilruth: In Fife, less than a third of our 10,000 EU nationals have applied for settled status. Would it not provide much more security and peace of mind for thousands of my constituents if the Tories scrapped the scheme? If they will not scrap it, does the minister agree that voters should have the chance to throw Boris Johnson's party out of number 10 and to decide Scotland's future as an independent member of the European Union?

Graeme Dey: I know that Jenny Gilruth has sought to provide peace of mind for her EU national constituents, as far as that is possible, by holding her own advice event and I commend her for that. I know that a number of members around the chamber have done something similar.

The UK Government should be providing certainty on this issue; it could disapply the requirement for five years' residence and remove pre-settled status altogether. I was struck by the comments of Daniel Hannan, a Conservative member of the European Parliament and a leave supporter. He said:

"I have had constituency cases of EU nationals being denied settled status despite living here for years. This is a breach of the assurances I and other Leavers gave during the referendum."

On the point about Boris Johnson and independence, it will not surprise anyone in the chamber that I concur with the views of Jenny Gilruth.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): What steps is the Scottish Government taking to encourage and support EU citizens in rural Scotland to apply for settled and pre-settled status?

Graeme Dey: Immigration is a reserved matter under the devolution settlement, including the operation of the settlement scheme. However, we are taking a number of steps, including those that I mentioned earlier. I encourage everyone in the chamber to actively promote the stay in Scotland campaign in their constituencies. That campaign was launched by the First Minister in April to raise awareness of the settlement scheme in Scotland. There is a good deal of publicity around that, and there are a number of different elements to the scheme, which covers EU nationals who are based in rural and urban areas. Emma Harper is right to highlight the issue of rural-based folk, because often, as well as being valued friends and neighbours, they are particularly important to those rural local economies.

No-deal Brexit (Environmental Governance Mechanisms)

5. Claudia Beamish (South Scotland) (Lab): To ask the Scottish Government, in the event of a no-deal Brexit, what immediate environmental governance mechanisms it will put in place. (S5O-03639)

The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey): In the Scottish Government consultation paper that was published in the spring, we made it clear that we were considering appropriate interim governance measures should the United Kingdom Government take us out of the European Union without a withdrawal agreement. The Scottish Government is totally opposed to a no-deal outcome because of the severe damage that it will cause. We will, however, do all that we can to protect the natural environment in that eventuality.

Claudia Beamish: A no-deal Brexit would leave our environment at risk in many areas, not least at risk of potential unscrupulous actors. The Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs has committed to interim governance arrangements in a no-deal scenario. Although I strongly believe that there should not be a no deal and I will campaign on a public vote for remain, in this instance will the cabinet secretary confirm that the Scottish Government will publish its interim and long-term proposals for environmental governance quickly if we have the dreadful no deal?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Minister.

Graeme Dey: Indeed—it is minister, not cabinet secretary. However, I appreciate the promotion.

The Scottish Government will make an announcement on interim governance arrangements if and when a no-deal exit appears inevitable. The Cabinet Secretary for Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform will shortly write to the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee, of which Claudia Beamish is a valued member, to update the committee on the issue.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 6 was not lodged.

Veterans (Historic Allegations)

7. Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con): To ask the Scottish Government, in light of his recommendations in the chamber on 4 December 2018, whether the minister for veterans raised with the UK Government members' views regarding historic allegations involving Army veterans from Scotland who served tours in Northern Ireland. (S5O-03641)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not know what is in your copy of the *Business Bulletin*, Mr Mountain, but, in the text that I have, the question says "comments" rather than "recommendations". However, that is a small change.

The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey): I recognise the genuine passion that the member has for the subject. I took the view that the issue should be raised face to face at ministerial level, and I planned to do so with United Kingdom ministers at the intended meeting of the Ministerial Covenant and Veterans Board. However, that meeting was postponed by the UK Government and, for a variety of reasons, including ministerial changes at Westminster, it has still to take place. I also planned to meet the new Minister for Defence People and Veterans, Johnny Mercer, on Monday of this week in Glasgow and to discuss the issue then, but that, too, fell through.

Efforts are still being made to stage an MCVB meeting that accommodates the availability of all participants. I hope to meet Mr Mercer face to face before too long, and the same applies to Ben Wallace, who is the third defence secretary to occupy the post in my 15 months in my role. At whichever of those opportunities arises first, I will pass on the views that Edward Mountain expressed in the debate last year, and I will write to him once that has been done.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Mr Mountain, you looked a bit bewildered earlier. My point was simply that, in my script, the question says:

"in light of his comments in the chamber on 4 December".

There is a difference between comments and recommendations. I do not know whether that was just a slip of the tongue. You looked a bit lost.

Edward Mountain: I will bow to your position on that. I think that you are right. If I misread the question, I apologise.

I thank the minister for his efforts. The issue is vital, as veterans are living in fear of historic allegation inquests being driven by political motives. I therefore urge the minister to continue with the process. I ask him to confirm not only when the meetings have taken place but when they are going to take place, so that I can exert as much pressure as possible to ensure that they happen.

Graeme Dey: I am more than happy to give that undertaking. We all recognise that Mr Mountain has deeply held and genuine views on the issue. That is why I decided that the conversation was best held face to face. I have to say that, when I took the decision, I never imagined that, 10 months on, there would have been no face-to-face opportunity. However, I absolutely give that undertaking and I will keep Mr Mountain apprised of the outcome.

Culture, Tourism and External Affairs

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind members that questions 4 and 8 have been grouped.

Tourism (Inverclyde)

1. Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): To ask the Scottish Government what support it is giving to Inverclyde Council to increase the area's tourism offering. (S5O-03643)

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): Through the Glasgow city deal, we are investing over £7 million in Greenock ocean terminal, which will see an estimated 150,000 passengers disembarking each year, contributing £26 million to the Inverclyde economy. Through VisitScotland, we support the local authority, Tourism Inverclyde and Inverclyde Tourist Group to help steer strategy and tourism activity. We recently awarded Scotland's boat show almost £32,000 to mark the year of coasts and waters, which will greatly enhance one of Scotland's largest marine events. I send my best wishes to the show, which I believe starts on Friday.

Stuart McMillan: I welcome the minister's comments regarding Scotland's boat show, which takes place in Inverkip this weekend.

The minister will be aware that Inverclyde Tourist Group consists of volunteers who direct cruise ship visitors and provide tours. Does the

minister agree that, with the new ocean terminal being built in Greenock, more support must be provided to retain visitors in Inverclyde in order to boost the local economy? Any additional support for the Inverclyde Tourist Group and Tourism Inverclyde would certainly be warmly welcomed.

Ben Macpherson: The Scottish Government shares the industry ambition to see the benefits of sustainable tourism spread across Scotland. The new ocean terminal offers an excellent opportunity for Inverclyde to benefit directly from the growing cruise market, which operates in a highly competitive global market. We are all aware that building or renewing infrastructure does not on its own inevitably lead to a thriving tourist destination, particularly in the case of our many visitors on cruises who disembark and take excursions. It is equally important to ensure the excellence of the overall experience for visitors and host destinations.

The new developments around the ocean terminal and the continued work of local businesses and volunteers will encourage greater numbers of visitors from whatever source to stay and experience what Inverclyde has to offer. I am confident that VisitScotland and other agencies will lend their support to help the sector realise the opportunities that arise around the new ocean terminal and the wider Inverclyde area.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 2 is not lodged.

Bosnia and Herzegovina (Relations)

3. Iain Gray (East Lothian) (Lab): To ask the Scottish Government how it is developing relations with Bosnia and Herzegovina. (S5O-03645)

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): The Scottish Government values Scotland's good relations with our European neighbours and is determined to maintain open and constructive dialogue in the coming months and years. In November 2017, the First Minister and Cabinet Secretary Hyslop met the former ambassador of Bosnia and Herzegovina to the United Kingdom in Edinburgh, and, last year, Ambassador Marinčić attended our St Andrew's day reception at Scotland House in London, where I met her briefly. In August 2016, the First Minister visited Srebrenica to learn at first hand about the genocide and the lives of its survivors.

Iain Gray: The Scottish Government has been very supportive of the charity, Remembering Srebrenica Scotland, including through the visit that the First Minister made to Srebrenica.

Next year will be the 25th anniversary of the genocide in Srebrenica. Will the Scottish Government make contact with Remembering

Srebrenica Scotland, to see what support it can give for events that are planned to commemorate the occasion?

Ben Macpherson: We support Remembering Srebrenica Scotland and allocated funding of £25,000 for 2019-20, through the promoting equality and cohesion fund, to support the charity's work. The charity organises events to mark Srebrenica memorial day and raise public awareness, with the aim of countering discrimination and building stronger community relations. The wider Government and I would welcome correspondence from the charity about its plans for the 25th anniversary. I am sure that, as a country and as a Parliament, we will come together to mark that significant anniversary.

Brexit (Decline in European Tourists)

4. **Stewart Stevenson (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions it has had with the United Kingdom Government regarding the reported decline in the number of European tourists visiting Scotland due to negative perceptions associated with Brexit. (S5O-03646)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Again, I ask members to read what is on the *Business Bulletin*, please.

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): The Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs meets the United Kingdom culture and tourism minister regularly, when that is possible. Most recently, she had meetings in June and August to discuss a number of issues, including the potentially damaging impact of any Brexit on our tourism industry, in Scotland and in the UK as a whole.

Visitors from the European Union are vital for Scotland's tourism industry and wider economy, so we will continue to raise awareness of our serious concerns. Six of our top 10 markets for overseas visitors are in the EU. Those markets accounted for 44 per cent of our overseas overnight visitors and for spending of more than £800 million in Scotland in 2018.

The Scotland is open campaign, which ran in March and early April this year, was an important step in reaching out to key markets in Europe to remind people that Scotland's doors are open. It has been our best-performing marketing activity to date, reaching more than 80 million people—some 27 per cent of the population in key tourism markets.

Stewart Stevenson: Does the minister agree that the bungling Brexit approach of the UK Government is unlikely to create a more favourable impression of the UK and Scotland,

and will limit the opportunity to recover from the £193 million drop in associated spending that has come with this decline?

Ben Macpherson: There is no doubt that continuing Brexit uncertainty poses a threat to Scotland's tourism industry. Figures for the year to March 2019, which the Office for National Statistics published, showed a 3 per cent decrease in European visits to Scotland and a related fall in expenditure, and a recent study that VisitBritain published earlier this year indicated that 44 per cent of European respondents expressed concern about the uncertainty around travel arrangements, due to the on-going negotiations.

Scotland and the Scottish Government did not choose to leave the EU, and we continue to oppose Brexit. However, as a responsible Government we will continue to do everything that we can to prepare and to support Scotland's tourism industry.

Brexit (Impact on European Union Tourists)

8. **Colin Beattie (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP):** With incredible similarity—to ask the Scottish Government what the impact has been on the number of EU tourists coming to Scotland this year of any uncertainty caused by Brexit. (S5O-03650)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That is why the questions were grouped, Mr Beattie.

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): As I indicated in my response to Mr Stevenson, European visitors are essential to the success of Scotland's tourism industry, with EU countries accounting for six of our top 10 overseas markets in 2018. Although overseas visitor numbers have increased in recent years, data for the year to March 2019 suggest that European visitor numbers fell by 3 per cent, compared with the previous year.

It is clear that continuing Brexit uncertainty poses a threat to our vital tourism industry. That is why we will continue to support the industry, to ensure that Scotland offers a warm welcome to and a high-quality experience for all visitors.

Colin Beattie: It is hard to deny that Brexit will result in barriers to those visiting Scotland and all that we have to offer here. How is the Scottish Government mitigating the negative effects of Brexit on tourism, which is one of Scotland's vital industries, and welcoming those who wish to visit?

Ben Macpherson: I mentioned the Scotland is open campaign, and Visit Scotland has produced a guide for EU citizens in six different languages which offers practical advice on travel to Scotland

after Brexit. It will help to ensure that potential travellers are not deterred by uncertainty relating to visas and/or other issues.

In addition, our new tourism strategy, which was developed in partnership with the Scottish Tourism Alliance and other key partners, was recently launched and places meeting visitor expectations at its heart. We will continue to build Scotland's international reputation as a warm and welcoming destination for visitors from across the globe through our Scotland is now campaign.

Culture and Heritage (Engagement by Young People from Disadvantaged Backgrounds)

5. Gordon Lindhurst (Lothian) (Con): To ask the Scottish Government what it is doing to encourage young people from disadvantaged backgrounds to engage with culture and heritage. (S5O-03647)

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): The Scottish Government and Creative Scotland fund and deliver a wide range of programmes that encourage young people from disadvantaged backgrounds to engage with culture and heritage. Examples include our national youth arts strategy, time to shine, and the youth music initiative.

Other examples include our funding for Sistema Scotland, the work with young people from disadvantaged backgrounds by organisations that receive regular funding from Creative Scotland, outreach and engagement work from our national collections, and Historic Environment Scotland's education visits policy.

Gordon Lindhurst: The Scottish Government promised a cultural youth experience fund in its 2016, 2017 and 2018 programmes for government, although it did not, apparently, do so in this year's document. When will that fund be set up?

Ben Macpherson: As the cabinet secretary Fiona Hyslop indicated in the chamber during portfolio questions on 12 September and at the Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Affairs Committee's pre-budget scrutiny meeting on 26 September, we have deferred the introduction of the fund as budget constraints continue.

We continue to work with partners, including Education Scotland and Creative Scotland, to explore the barriers to young people experiencing culture and the actions for tackling those. Officials are carefully considering how best a cultural youth experience fund might enhance existing provision and how to ensure that location is not a barrier to experiencing culture. We intend to introduce the fund once budgets allow.

Historic Buildings and Landmarks (Dundee)

6. Jenny Marra (North East Scotland) (Lab): To ask the Scottish Government what recent discussions it has had with the National Trust for Scotland regarding the preservation of historic buildings and landmarks in Dundee. (S5O-03648)

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): The National Trust for Scotland is a charity that is independent of Government and Scottish ministers. Ministers have not held recent discussions with the trust about historic buildings and landmarks in Dundee.

Jenny Marra: Alongside the great strides that have been taken to develop Dundee's waterfront, we need to make sure that we do not lose sight of our city's history and historic culture.

Dundee's Camperdown house, which was built in 1828 and transferred along with the adjacent park into the city's ownership in 1946, has fallen into disuse over the past few years. Following the recent decision by Dundee City Council to close the adjacent Camperdown golf course, will the minister have discussions with national bodies such as the National Trust for Scotland to protect the house and bring it back into public use?

It is also my understanding that the National Trust has no properties in the Dundee City Council area, which is perhaps the only local authority area without such a property.

Ben Macpherson: Historic Environment Scotland currently provides Dundee Historic Environment Trust with an annual grant of £250,000, which is used for the organisation's running costs and to award grants to benefit the historic environment in Dundee.

Also, as I said, as a non-departmental public body, Historic Environment Scotland operates at arm's length from the Scottish Government. The organisation's priorities for the support that it offers for the presentation of historic buildings such as Camperdown house is an operational matter for it. I encourage Jenny Marra to contact the organisation directly through the chief executive's office. I would be happy to be copied into that correspondence, along with the cabinet secretary, so that we can be kept informed and learn more about the issues that Jenny Marra has raised.

Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con): The minister may or may not be aware of the historically significant Union chain bridge, designed by Samuel Brown, which is in my constituency. It spans the River Tweed and links England and Scotland. What engagement has the minister had with the Friends of the Union Chain Bridge? Will the minister look into

supporting the bridge as it celebrates its bicentenary in 2020?

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Christine Grahame): Just a minute—where was Dundee in that question? I got a wee bit lost. The original question related to

“the preservation of historic buildings and landmarks in Dundee”.

I did not know that the Tweed ran through Dundee, but I learn things every day.

Rachael Hamilton: Presiding Officer, it—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Don't bother answering.

Ben Macpherson: I refer the member to my previous answer about the relationship between Historic Environment Scotland and the Scottish Government, and, in particular, the point about Historic Environment Scotland being an arm's-length body. As I did with Jenny Marra, I encourage her to contact the organisation directly through the chief executive's office and to relay full details of the project that she mentioned.

Culture and Tourism (Participation by Disabled People and People with Long-term Health Conditions)

7. Mark Griffin (Central Scotland) (Lab): To ask the Scottish Government how it supports the participation in cultural and tourism-related activities of disabled people and people with long-term health conditions. (S5O-03649)

The Minister for Europe, Migration and International Development (Ben Macpherson): Inclusion is central to the artistic purpose of all Scottish Government-funded culture bodies, and they all share a desire to communicate with as large and diverse an audience as possible, running a range of associated activities. The public bodies that are responsible for culture and heritage are, of course, also subject to the Equalities Act 2010, and report on progress against objectives frequently.

Inclusive tourism is hugely important for Scotland's offer as a welcoming destination. VisitScotland runs several programmes that advise about and provide support for inclusive practices that benefit the widest possible range of customers and businesses.

Mark Griffin: According to the 2018 household survey, the only category of cultural participation in which the participation rate of people with a minor incapacity was higher than that of people without such an incapacity was library attendance. When we look at the attendance of people with long-term health conditions at museums, galleries and historic places, we can see a big gulf between

them and other people, particularly for those whose disability has a major impact on their daily life.

The minister will know about Historic Scotland's admissions policy, which offers no discounts for disabled people but allows a carer to attend for free. The National Museums of Scotland has the same policy. With the new disability assistance system being built on dignity and respect, will the Government explore extending concessions for those on the new benefits, so that disabled people can enjoy our culture and heritage independently and in their own right?

Ben Macpherson: The Scottish Government knows that actions are important in terms of making a difference when it comes to accessibility and the 2010 act and also with regard to ensuring that we are taking forward the disability delivery plan. We need to know that our actions are making a difference, and, where we see that they are not making a difference, we need to do something about that. We will report on progress in relation to the United Nations' examination of the United Kingdom under the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, which will take place next year, and through the progress reports on the fairer Scotland action plan and the mainstreaming equality policy, both of which are due for publication in 2019.

I note the points that Mr Griffin raises in his question about the application of social security and its relation to the wider questions of the accessibility of cultural activities. The Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs and I—as well as, potentially, the Cabinet Secretary for Social Security and Older People—would welcome any further correspondence that Mr Griffin would like to provide on those points.

Business Motion

13:34

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Christine Grahame): The next item of business is consideration of business motion S5M-19337, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a timetable for stage 3 consideration of the Transport (Scotland) Bill.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Transport (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limits indicated, those time limits being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended (other than a suspension following the first division in the stage being called) or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 4: 1 hour

Groups 5 to 10: 2 hours

Groups 11 to 15: 2 hours 50 minutes

Groups 16 to 19: 3 hours 30 minutes

Groups 20 and 21: 4 hours 15 minutes

Groups 22 to 24: 5 hours 45 minutes

Groups 25 and 26: 6 hours.—[*Graeme Dey*].

Motion agreed to.

Transport (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

13:35

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Christine Grahame): The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Transport (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2—that is, SP Bill 33A—the marshalled list, a corrections slip to the marshalled list, and the groupings of amendments.

The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for five minutes for the first division of the afternoon. The period of voting for the first division will be 30 seconds. Thereafter, I will allow a voting period of 1 minute for the first division after a debate. Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak buttons as soon as possible after I call the group. Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

Before section 1

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): Group 1 is on the national transport strategy. Amendment 38, in the name of the Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity, is grouped with amendments 38A to 38F, 39, 39A, 39B, 40, 40A, 41, 42, 42A, 42B and 132.

The Cabinet Secretary for Transport, Infrastructure and Connectivity (Michael Matheson): Amendment 38 builds on Colin Smyth's proposal at stage 2 for the introduction of a set of underpinning transport principles. It requires the Scottish ministers to produce a national transport strategy that sets out their strategic vision for transport in Scotland. In doing so, they must have regard to the contribution that transport can make to a range of important issues, including the realisation of human rights, social and economic wellbeing, the environment, and health and wellbeing. That demonstrates the importance that the Government places on transport as a key enabler in respect of those matters.

Amendments 39 to 42 set out the consultation, publication and reporting requirements in relation to the strategy. Amendment 132 is a consequential amendment to the long title of the bill.

We are consulting on our draft national transport strategy, which will ensure that protecting our climate and improving lives will be at the heart of future strategic transport planning. The Government will ensure that the requirements that are imposed by amendments 38 to 42 are met

through finalising the strategy post consultation and reporting to Parliament on the final strategy and the consultation process. I urge members to accept the amendments in my name in the group.

Jamie Greene's amendments seek to adjust the content, consultation and reporting requirements of the strategy. We envisage that the national transport strategy will guide us over a 20-year period. I do not support setting timescales or cost estimates at the start of a 20-year strategy. In the strategy, we note the need to be flexible, given the lack of future certainty, and actions will be best developed over the lifetime of the strategy through the monitoring and delivery plans. A more appropriate source to determine future costs to Government for strategic transport interventions will be contained in, among other things, the second strategic transport projects review, which will be published during this parliamentary session. Therefore, I cannot support amendments 38B and 38C. For similar reasons, neither can I support amendments 42A and 42B.

On amendment 38A, developing "measurable policy objectives" for a 20-year strategy would not be analytically robust, given the broad range of factors that may impact on the complex and multifaceted issues that are highlighted in amendment 38. The monitoring framework, which the Government has committed to taking forward, will contain measurable indicators that will demonstrate the progress of the strategy and its contribution to those issues. Therefore, I cannot support that amendment.

I am happy to support amendments 38D and 38E, because I consider that the needs of older people and the importance of education are already implicit in references to social and economic wellbeing. The same is true of economic development and growth, but I am concerned that a specific reference to that as a driver of social and economic wellbeing might be too narrow a focus. The Government takes a more holistic approach to inclusive growth and a broader approach to outcomes through the national performance framework, and therefore cannot support amendment 38F.

Amendments 39A and 39B seek to add further consultees, including Parliament. However, amendment 39 already requires ministers to consult widely, including with the general public. That is sufficiently flexible, and there is no need to specify any particular consultees.

On amendment 39A, establishing Parliament as a consultee would be unusual, as Parliament is, of course, not a stakeholder, but exists to hold the Government to account. Moreover, it is not clear how Parliament could be expected to speak with a single voice for the purposes of any consultation. I agree that the Government must seek to take

account of the views of members of the Scottish Parliament on the draft strategy—in fact, we have already written to all MSPs for that purpose. I will welcome any views that members might have before the consultation on the strategy closes on 23 October.

I propose to make a statement to Parliament when the strategy is laid, of course. Although I see no need for that to be a statutory requirement, I am willing to support amendment 40A, to reaffirm my commitment in that regard.

I urge members to support all the amendments in my name in the group and to support Jamie Greene's amendments 38D, 38E and 40A, but to reject his other amendments in the group.

I move amendment 38.

Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (Con): I thank the cabinet secretary. It is good to get off to a good start by supporting some of my amendments, especially as they were lodged quite late in the day. We had to respond fairly quickly after the Government lodged a large number of amendments on the national transport strategy on the Tuesday evening before the midday deadline the next day. We read through the Government's amendments and they were warmly received by the Conservatives. There is a lot of good stuff in there. In the final hours, we sought to amend what was proposed and tinker with it slightly to see whether we could improve it constructively in any way.

I thank the Government for responding to the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee's concerns about the lack of a transport strategy in the bill. The bill is a transport bill and, although there will certainly be a lot of political back and forward and discourse today, we have to remember that it is, in effect, a bill of many smaller bills and that its purpose is to make improvements to transport in Scotland. The national transport strategy sits at the heart of that.

For the sake of brevity, I will not speak to all the amendments in the group. However, I would like to speak to the ones that the cabinet secretary has asked members to reject.

Amendment 38A says that it is okay to have a vision. I appreciate that the strategy is a long-term one, but I would like to see in it measurable policy objectives that are linked directly to the outcomes. Yesterday, we talked about the national islands plan and stakeholders' feedback that it had lots of warm words and aspiration but lacked substance. We have an opportunity to avoid doing exactly the same with the NTS. The Government should introduce measurable policy objectives, and I would like them to be put in the bill. The key word is "measurable". We and members in future sessions need to be able to look back and see

whether the Government has kept to its outcomes. I appreciate that something so wide ranging will potentially span multiple sessions and Governments, but that should not let any future Government get out of having their performance measured and monitored. Therefore, I ask members to support amendment 38A.

I turn to the other amendments in the group, and specifically amendment 38E. I have asked the cabinet secretary to take into account

“access to further and higher education via public transport”

as a key component of the national transport strategy. We commonly get feedback on how important transport is for people to get to their place of education. We took evidence on that in relation to the south of Scotland enterprise agency, and I am sure that my colleague Liz Smith has taken a lot of evidence on it over the years. Good access to decent public transport is vital for young people who are looking to go to college, university or indeed their place of work, and I would like the Government to put that into the bill.

13:45

I am pleased that the Government supports my amendments 38D and 38E. I thank the cabinet secretary for taking them, and amendment 40A, on board.

Amendment 38F seeks to add to the transport strategy a requirement on “economic development and growth” in relation to some specific metrics, which I think are commonly used ones. Including that would enable us to consider how we can use transport to boost the economy. Ultimately, what is transport? It is about getting people from A to B— from their home to their place of work or study, and vice versa. I do not see why we should not put that into the strategy. It might end up there, but I would like the requirement to be up front in the bill. Again, the objectives that I have specified are measurable ones so that the Government of the day can be held to account.

I turn to a few of my other, smaller amendments. I hope that my amendments that focus on the elderly and the disabled will be well received. I have had some communication with Age Scotland, which has actively contacted members, and I thank it for its support for the amendments. I hope that the Government will reflect on that support outside this building.

I am pleased that the Government is willing to come back to the Parliament and make a statement on the contents of the strategy. In addition to that, however, I hope that we will give it the place that it deserves, as there is a place for proper debate about the contents of the strategy. I know that the cabinet secretary is always willing to

listen to ideas from across the Parliament, and I hope that we will move forward in that positive mood with the rest of the stage 3 consideration of the bill.

I move amendment 38A.

Colin Smyth (South Scotland) (Lab): I welcome Michael Matheson’s amendment 38. As he said, it was lodged in response to a stage 2 amendment in my name that aimed to ensure that we set high-level principles for our transport system in legislation. I am grateful to the cabinet secretary’s officials for liaising with me when determining the wording of the amendment.

Transport has a key role to play in realising human rights, improving health, tackling air pollution and climate change, promoting economic growth and equality and supporting social inclusion. I believe that it is right that we are clear about the relationship between our transport system and our society more broadly, and the aims that are set out in subsection (5) in amendment 38 capture that well.

In particular, I draw attention to the inclusion of fair work, which again responds to a stage 2 amendment in my name. We have seen a race to the bottom in areas such as staff terms and conditions in the privatised, fragmented transport system that we have, and that needs to be addressed. Any company or organisation that receives public money should be required to deliver decent terms and conditions for its workers. I hope that we will see a strengthened fair work framework in the future that will properly include collective bargaining and trade union representation as part of the requirements that are placed on those who receive public money to deliver transport services.

Amendment 38 makes it clear that the principles that are set out in the bill should be delivered through the upcoming national transport strategy. That clear statutory underpinning is useful, and I hope that the new national transport strategy and the policy and budgetary decisions that follow will be consistent with the values and aims that are set out in this welcome amendment.

John Finnie (Highlands and Islands) (Green): The Scottish Green Party will support amendment 38 and Jamie Greene’s amendments 38D and 38E.

The national transport strategy will be fundamental. We will come on to talk about the workplace parking levy and the role that the strategy will play in that, but the strategy is not being proposed simply for the sake of it. It will inform what is done and enable us to be creative, innovative, inclusive and interconnected, and that is to be welcomed.

I concur with Colin Smyth on the inclusion of fair work. The inclusion of the environment and emission reduction targets in subsection (5)(c) in amendment 38 is also important, as is the inclusion of health and wellbeing in subsection (5)(d). This is not just about words.

We will not support Jamie Greene's amendments 38A, 38B or 38C. I consider them to be bureaucratic, and we can scrutinise the things that they mention in any case.

I warmly accept the inclusion of elderly persons. Their demographic is growing and that must be reflected in all our deliberations. The inclusion of access to further and higher education via public transport is very important. The committee heard how that can be turned around; Lothian Buses did so in East Lothian. That was about getting young people involved. There are a lot of positives in some of the amendments.

Mike Rumbles (North East Scotland) (LD): I will focus on two of Jamie Greene's amendments.

On amendment 38A, objectives need to be measurable. Yesterday, we saw the publication of the national islands plan. I am critical of that plan because none of its objectives are SMART—specific, measurable, acceptable, realistic and time-bound. They are aspirational in nature.

The Minister for Energy, Connectivity and the Islands (Paul Wheelhouse): As the member might recall from yesterday's statement, we are developing an implementation strategy that will have SMART objectives. I hope that he will take satisfaction from that.

Mike Rumbles: Yes, but that will be further down the line and it will not take the same legal approach to the islands plan as was in the bill. The situation with the Transport (Scotland) Bill is reminiscent of that. In the Islands (Scotland) Act 2018, we have legislation that requires such objectives to be set and we have found that they are not SMART.

The Government might very well come up with them later on down the line, but an awful lot of work has gone into the national islands plan to produce aspirations. I do not think that we should be producing aspirations. We should be producing specific and measurable objectives, which is why Jamie Greene has lodged amendment 38A and why the Liberal Democrats support it.

I also support amendment 39A, which says that the Scottish Parliament should be a consultee. We already have a good system in which the Scottish Parliament committees can investigate anything that the Government proposes, but would it not be novel to have the Scottish Parliament involved in consulting on the formulation of the national

transport strategy? That is an innovative measure that we certainly support.

The Presiding Officer: The cabinet secretary has indicated that he does not wish to wind up. Jamie Greene, please wind up on amendment 38A and indicate whether you wish to press or withdraw it.

Jamie Greene: I have not much to add. I thank Mr Rumbles for his warm words on what I think are fairly constructive amendments. I note the cabinet secretary's comments and that he has asked members to vote against some of my amendments, but I ask members to reflect on the intent behind them, and on the fact that I hope that they will strengthen the national transport strategy so that we can get it to a good place and the Parliament can be proud of it.

The Presiding Officer: Are you pressing amendment 38A?

Jamie Greene: Yes.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. This is the first vote of the day, so I suspend the meeting for five minutes while we call members to the chamber.

13:53

Meeting suspended.

13:58

On resuming—

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 54, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38A disagreed to.

Amendment 38B moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)

McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

14:00

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 27, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38B disagreed to.

Amendment 38C moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38C be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 26, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38C disagreed to.

Amendments 38D and 38E moved—[Jamie Greene]—and agreed to.

Amendment 38F moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38F be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)

(Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)

Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38F disagreed to.

Amendment 38, as amended, agreed to.

Amendment 39 moved—[Michael Matheson].

Amendment 39A moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 39A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 31, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 39A disagreed to.

Amendment 39B moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 39B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)

McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 31, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 39B disagreed to.

Amendment 39 agreed to.

Amendment 40 moved—[Michael Matheson].

Amendment 40A moved—[Jamie Greene]—and agreed to.

Amendment 40, as amended, agreed to.

Amendment 41 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Amendment 42 moved—[Michael Matheson].

Amendment 42A moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 42A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 31, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 42A disagreed to.

Amendment 42B moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 42B be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)

Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 27, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 42B disagreed to.

Amendment 42 agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Group 2 is on the purpose of low-emission zones. Amendment 135, in the name of Jamie Greene, is grouped with amendments 137, 49, 54 and 55.

Jamie Greene: This is a short group on low-emission zones. It comes back to an issue that we discussed at great length at stages 1 and 2: what is the purpose of a low-emission zone?

At stage 2, there were amendments on this issue. I and the Labour Party presented further detail on what, for the avoidance of doubt, should be in the bill about the purpose of a low-emission zone. In its feedback at stage 2, the Government suggested that what we were proposing was perhaps overly prescriptive, and I accept that. It was perhaps unwise to put into the bill the technical standards and the emissions that low-emission zones should seek to reduce; there are better places to put those stipulations. That said, I still think that is important to push amendment 135 at stage 3, which would put into the bill an overarching message about the purpose of a low-emission zone. The reason for that is the avoidance of doubt among the general public about the purpose of a zone.

Like many others in the chamber, I want low-emission zones to succeed, but they will do so only if the public understand what the purpose and benefits of the zones are and if they have measurable objectives. Amendment 135 clarifies that

“The purpose of a low emission zone ... is to reduce transport-related emissions within and in the vicinity of the zone.”

It is not just the cities that operate a zone that will see a reduction; we also hope to see improvement in areas on the periphery of cities that operate such a zone. I have intentionally taken out any form of prescriptive data on what scientific evidence would define such a reduction. There are other ways that the Government can address that.

Amendment 137 follows on from that and states that the Scottish ministers should set out a report—basically, an updated scientific report—that states what should be included in the emission specification and standards for a low-emission zone. That is my new approach, which has the support of many organisations outside Parliament. Many of us have been speaking to organisations such as Friends of the Earth Scotland, which I thank for their involvement on the issue. I know that they wanted us to push the Government harder to be more specific about what sort of emissions we want to see reduced in Scotland, but I felt that I needed to take some of that out in order to have the best opportunity to have an amendment agreed to at stage 3. I hope that those organisations support the fact that we are debating the matter this afternoon and that the Government will include an overarching objective for low-emission zones.

We will not support amendments 49 and 55, in the name of Colin Smyth. I will let him speak to those and comment later. My understanding is that they introduce an automatic trigger that means that a local authority will have to set up a zone if there is a reduction in air quality, but I do not think that an automatic trigger is the way to do it. Low-emission zones should be set up with the purpose of targeting problematic areas. Automatic triggers will prove onerous to local authorities outside our bigger cities, which do not have the infrastructure to operate such schemes. We know that there can be small zones within local authority areas that have air quality issues; we have often talked about that in Parliament. Colin Smyth’s amendments would require local authorities to set up a low-emission zone to combat such air quality issues, but there are other ways that they could do that. An automatic trigger is not the way to do it, so we will not be able to support Mr Smyth.

I am happy to support amendment 54, in the name of the cabinet secretary.

I move amendment 135.

Colin Smyth: Amendments 49 and 55 will strengthen low-emission zones. When the First Minister declared a climate emergency she said that every policy area must be looked at, but that does not seem to have included the Transport (Scotland) Bill and, in particular, low-emission zones. When taking evidence on the bill, the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee was told that LEZs are the one clear measure in the bill that could make a real difference to emissions. However, despite the fact that this year’s programme for government included a commitment to

“consult on Scotland’s ambition to make the transformative shift to zero or ultra-low emission city centres by 2030”,

the bill as it stands does not allow for the creation of ultra-low-emission zones. City centres and other areas with particularly severe air pollution problems will not be able to go any further than those dealing with more moderate air pollution issues.

If the Government is serious about the commitment in the programme for government, local authorities should have the power to introduce targeted ultra-low-emission zones in the parts of their area with the most severe air pollution. Amendment 55 would allow that, subject to ministerial sign-off. That added layer of scrutiny will ensure that the power is not used inappropriately. Failure to agree to the amendment means that the programme for government commitment is an empty promise.

With regard to amendment 49, the recent review of the cleaner air for Scotland strategy described LEZs as

“a necessary and important commitment in delivering cleaner air”,

particularly with regard to air quality management areas, stating that

“AQMA can and need to be operated more effectively and overall this, with effective LEZ implementation, will lead to necessary further improvements in air quality in the next three to five years”.

Given the clear role for LEZs in air quality management areas, their implementation should not be optional but should be the default position. Amendment 49 would make that the case. However, I have suggested a commonsense provision to give the Scottish ministers the power to waive that requirement, so that if the breach in air pollution was clearly an anomaly or the local authority was able to illustrate how it was otherwise dealing with the issue, it would be exempt.

The two amendments in my name will ensure that the bill reflects the severity and urgency of the climate emergency that we are facing and that the eventual legislation is fit for purpose in the long

run and is flexible enough to meet our changing needs.

14:15

Amendment 135, in the name of Jamie Greene, introduces a clear statutory purpose for LEZs, and is similar to an amendment that I lodged at stage 2. It implements a unanimous recommendation by all members of the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee in our stage 1 report, and I am happy to support that amendment.

Although LEZs can deliver a wide range of social and environmental benefits, we should be clear that, fundamentally, they must deliver a reduction in transport-related emissions. Placing the provisions of amendment 135 in the bill ensures that LEZs must be developed in line with that aim.

I am also happy to support amendment 54, in the name of the cabinet secretary, which reflects the role that LEZs have to play in helping Scotland to meet its climate change targets.

Transport is Scotland's biggest emitter and is responsible for more than a third of all our greenhouse gases. Mechanisms such as LEZs should help to deliver national priorities as well as tackling local issues. Let us strengthen them today to ensure that we achieve that.

Michael Matheson: Amendment 135 would set the purpose of a low-emission zone as the reduction of

"transport-related emissions within and in the vicinity of the zone."

This topic was raised throughout stages 1 and 2. However, the bill already provides a clear mandatory requirement, which is set out in section 9(4): that low-emission zones must help to meet the air quality objectives that are prescribed by the Environment Act 1995. In addition, amendment 54 will add a further mandatory objective for low-emission zones of contributing towards meeting the climate change targets that have been set this year in the Parliament. We will outline the purposes of a low-emission zone and how to set objectives in the forthcoming low-emission zone guidance.

Amendment 135 is therefore not needed. It is unduly narrow in its stated purpose.

Amendment 137 would require the Scottish ministers to prepare and lay a report in the Scottish Parliament no later than five years after the bill has received royal assent outlining any new or existing pollutants that should be considered when setting the emission standards for low-emission zones. Again, that is unnecessarily complex, as these matters are

already dealt with by the existing environmental legislation as well as by the bill as it stands.

Amendment 49 would introduce a requirement on local authorities to implement a low-emission zone in any area that does not meet the air pollution limit values as stated in the Air Quality (Scotland) Regulations 2000. The Scottish Government is committed to introducing low-emission zones in other air quality management areas by 2023 where the national low-emission framework appraisals support that. Those appraisals will be conducted this year for all air quality management areas other than in the four main cities, where low-emission zones are already being prepared. As such, we are already taking steps to ensure that low-emission zones are implemented in air quality management areas where the scientific evidence supports such action.

With the First Minister declaring a climate emergency, amendment 54 brings the crucial issues of climate change and air quality together. Low-emission zones will be required to contribute towards meeting the emissions reduction targets that are set out in part 1 of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009. Those objectives dovetail with the existing mandatory objective of contributing to an improvement in air quality, as prescribed in section 87(1) of the 1995 act. I therefore encourage local authorities to adopt a pragmatic but ambitious approach to the new climate change objective.

Amendment 55 would introduce a power for local authorities to alter their emission standard for their local low-emission zones, such that they could make emission standards more stringent than the forthcoming national standards contained in regulations. The amendment is unhelpful, as it has the clear potential to cause confusion for people driving between zones. It is unnecessary, as the regulation-making power to set the emission standards as a national standard already allows for the possibility of more stringent standards being set over time.

I therefore ask members to support amendment 54, and I ask Jamie Greene and Colin Smyth not to press amendments 135, 137, 49 and 55. If they are pressed, I urge members to reject them.

John Finnie: The Scottish Greens will not support amendment 135.

We believe that the objective that is mentioned in amendment 54, which is in the name of the cabinet secretary, should be self-evident if everything that we are doing in the bill is intended to achieve the aims of the Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009. However, we want not just to hear words but to see actions.

We will also not support amendment 137. Knowledge is an evolving thing, and we would not be looking for a reference in the bill to pick up on that.

We will support Colin Smyth's amendments. Amendment 49 is pragmatic and responsive. With regard to amendment 55, there is clearly a place for addressing difference: we are talking about people's lives. We know that every year tens of thousands of people across the United Kingdom lose their lives because of poor air quality, so there is certainly a place for the ultra-low-emissions standard. It is appropriate that there should be the power to alter that is inherent in Colin Smyth's amendment 55, so we will support it.

Mike Rumbles: I will comment on three amendments, the first of which is amendment 135, in the name of Jamie Greene. The Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee discussed the issue and felt that it is important to make the purpose of a low-emission zone explicit.

"The purpose ... is to reduce transport-related emissions within and in the vicinity of the zone."

That is quite clear, and I do not see what objection anybody could have to it. I must admit that were it not to be set out in the bill, that would make no difference to a zone's operation, but having the purpose set out in the bill would be helpful. Why members might consider not voting for that, I really do not know.

Liberal Democrats will not support amendments 49 and 55, which are in the name of Colin Smyth. Section 4(3) as proposed in amendment 49 is almost contradictory. It says that where such pollutants happen

"a local authority must—

... make a low emission zone scheme",

but subsection (4) says that

"The Scottish Ministers may ... exempt a local authority"

from doing so. To me, that is not at all logical and would add to confusion.

Talking of confusion, if Colin Smyth's amendment 55 were to be agreed to, there would be real confusion across the country. I support the cabinet secretary's comments in that regard. We want to see LEZs being successful; we do not want to see people driving from one city, in which their vehicle's emissions level might be perfectly fine, into another LEZ in which it is not and in which they would be breaking the law. Amendment 55 might be well intentioned, but its drafting is completely wrong.

Scottish Liberal Democrats will not support amendments 49 and 55.

The Presiding Officer: I call Jamie Greene to wind up, and to say whether he wishes to press or withdraw amendment 135.

Jamie Greene: I will comment on members' feedback on the Scottish Conservative amendments. I thank Colin Smyth, of Scottish Labour, and Mike Rumbles, of the Scottish Liberal Democrats, for saying that their parties will support amendment 135, which I appreciate. As they said, it is important that the bill says up front what the purpose of a low-emission zone is.

In his response, the cabinet secretary said that amendment 135's focus is too narrow. I argue that it is purposely narrow because, by default, the point of such a zone is surely to restrict the entry of vehicles that do not meet emissions criteria. The bill's intention is to lower emissions in and around the zone in which it operates. By making that clear and defining what the purpose of such zones is, we are more likely to achieve the buy-in of the general public to support them and to be positive about them, as many members are. Other parts of the low-emission zone provisions might refer to other pieces of legislation, so that, if we were to dig deep enough, that might enable us to find out what they are about.

I have no problem with putting the purpose of low-emission zones on the face of the bill—the effect would be to say, in very simple terms and with no ambiguity, what the purpose of LEZs is.

I appeal to the Scottish Greens to work with Scottish Conservatives on that, given the broad range of support by others—not just political support, but support from organisations with which we have been working for a number of months to try to get something in the bill. Members now have a chance to do that, so I appeal to them to do so.

I sympathise with the cabinet secretary's comments on national standards. It would be very confusing for drivers if different zones were to operate to different technical standards. If a person were to drive from Aberdeen to Dundee and on to Edinburgh in the same vehicle and could enter one LEZ but not another, that would create confusion.

I have other amendments coming up on signage, which would help to inform the public. They will fall nicely together as a package with the amendments that we are debating now. It is a simple proposition: my amendments would enable motorists to understand exactly what they are getting. Unfortunately, in that case, we should not support Colin Smyth's amendments.

However, it is worth noting that cities—including Edinburgh, which might be the first to introduce an LEZ—are already looking at how they could use the legislation, if it passes as it is currently drafted, to operate different geographical zones, which

would allow some vehicles to enter one zone but not another. The legislation has flexibility built in through which to do that; I do not think that differing technical standards is the way to achieve that.

I appeal to members for their support for amendments 135 and 137. I press amendment 135.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 135 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 55, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 135 disagreed to.

Section 1—Restriction on driving within a zone

The Presiding Officer: Group 3 is on exemptions in low-emission zones. Amendment 136, in the name of Jamie Greene, is grouped with amendments 43 and 44.

Jamie Greene: Group 3, which is on low-emission zone exemptions, is a small group. I am happy to support amendments 43 and 44.

As I said earlier, the purpose of a zone is to restrict entry into it. Basically, a motorist will be restricted from entering a zone if their vehicle does not meet the specified emissions standards. However, I think that certain vehicles should be allowed to enter LEZs, if they have to. Amendment 136, which is short and simple, states that vehicles that are being used

“for police purposes ... for ambulance purposes”

or for

“any function of the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service or HM Coastguard”,

should be allowed to enter a zone if they require to do so, and should not be subjected to fines and/or penalties. That seems to be common sense. There is not much more to say than that.

I move amendment 136.

Michael Matheson: I am aware that we have heard a lot of views during stages 1 and 2 on proposed low-emission zone exemptions. Let me be very clear: I absolutely accept that there will have to be exemptions from low-emission zones, and they will be captured in secondary legislation.

At stage 1, we stated that the emergency services and blue badge holders are high in our consideration. At stage 2, a number of amendments proposed exemptions in niche areas: in particular, Richard Lyle lodged an amendment that was agreed to relating to transportation equipment for funfairs. That has resulted in an anomaly in the bill, because the committee did not agree to the related substantive amendment.

In order to rectify the situation, I have agreed with Richard Lyle that an exemption from low-emission zones for showmen’s vehicles will be introduced through secondary legislation. Richard Lyle is content with that approach. As such, I have lodged amendment 43, which will remove section 1(1)(c), which introduced a low-emission zone exemption for funfair vehicles.

14:30

More generally, in respect of amendments 136 and 44, the topic of national exemptions for LEZs needs careful thought and consideration in conjunction with interested parties that have specialist knowledge. My officials are therefore engaging with key stakeholders on proposed regulations on LEZ exemptions. That will include discussions with the Federation of British Historic Vehicle Clubs, and with the emergency services and associated organisations including the Scottish Ambulance Service and Her Majesty’s Coastguard.

I can, however, provide some clarity for Murdo Fraser and Jamie Greene. The specific issue of an exemption for historic vehicles and the emergency services are among the key topics for consideration in development of regulations; I am strongly minded to include such exemptions. It is worth noting that an exemption for historic vehicles has been granted for the English clean-air zone areas, but emergency services have not been exempted from the London ultra-low-emission zone. However, we need to give careful consideration to those matters before drafting the regulations.

I urge members to support my amendment 43 and to reject amendments 136 and 44.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Amendment 44 mirrors amendments that I lodged at stage 2 but did not push to a vote, and with which I sought to exempt historic vehicles from the rules on LEZs. I support LEZs. I declare an interest as the owner of an historic vehicle. I know that I am not alone in that in Parliament. As is the case for many historic vehicle owners, mine does no more than a few hundred miles a year, so it can hardly be classed as a major polluter of the atmosphere.

There are more than 250,000 historic vehicle owners and enthusiasts across the United Kingdom. The vehicles include not just cars but motorcycles, buses, coaches, lorries, vans, military vehicles, tractors and steam engines.

The issue is that without an exemption from LEZs, individuals who live within a designated LEZ would not be able to own or operate an historic vehicle, which would be an unreasonable restriction. Moreover, historic vehicles would not be able to drive through LEZs, which would mean that historic vehicle exhibitions, rallies and events could no longer be held in venues in those areas.

Also, people who are getting married and who want to have a historic car—[*Interruption.*]—or a steam train, as the justice secretary said from a sedentary position—pick them up from their church or their wedding venue would not be able to do that if they were being married within an

LEZ. I am sure that that is a tragedy that members would want to avoid at all costs.

There is a strong case to be made for exempting historic vehicles. I do not believe that they are major contributors to pollution; in fact, in total, historic vehicles represent just 0.2 per cent of total traffic on UK roads and, as the cabinet secretary said, they have already been exempted from the LEZs south of the border.

I lodged amendment 44 essentially as a probing amendment. I am very encouraged by the cabinet secretary's comment that he is "strongly minded" to grant the exemptions in regulations after further discussions with stakeholders. On that basis, I intend not to move amendment 44.

John Finnie: We will not support amendment 136. The organisations that are listed in the amendment should not be granted exemptions. Quite the reverse is true; they should be setting an example. Likewise, Greens will not support Murdo Fraser's amendment 44, although I do not suppose that that will surprise him.

I was gratified to hear the cabinet secretary's words about amendment 43 because I know that it caused some surprise when I lent my support to that exemption. I know that Mr Lyle is not with us today—he is elsewhere—but I did not want to have to call the cabinet secretary a spoilsport. The particular historic vehicles to which the amendment relates have been responsible for a lot of community jollification, so I am glad that that point has been picked up. On that basis, we will support the cabinet secretary's amendment 43.

Jamie Greene: I am surprised that members are not queueing up to tell us about their historic vehicles and steam engines. I think that Murdo Fraser made his points very well and is admirably looking after the huge number of enthusiasts in Scotland. He made some valid points.

I will reflect on the cabinet secretary's comments. I give him the opportunity to say on the record that he will address seriously the question of emergency vehicles in low-emission zones. The discussion on the issue is on-going, and I do not want us to miss an opportunity. I do not see a problem with putting the measure in the bill, but if he thinks that it would be better in regulations, and we can take him at his word on that, I am happy to seek to withdraw amendment 136.

Michael Matheson: As I have stated, we are giving careful consideration to provisions that should be in regulations, and to which services should be included. The matter is better dealt with through regulations, because that will give us greater flexibility to respond to changes in the future. That is the most pragmatic way to deal with the issue. We need to take a careful and considered approach so that we do not create any

unintended difficulties as a result of the decisions that we make in relation to regulations.

Jamie Greene: On that basis, I am happy not to press amendment 136.

Amendment 136, by agreement, withdrawn.

Amendment 43 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Amendment 44 not moved.

The Presiding Officer: Group 4 is called "Ministerial powers and duties: consultation and publication". Amendment 45, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 47, 48, 64, 81 to 83, 85, 90, 92, 93, 109, 111, 119 and 120.

Colin Smyth: All 15 amendments in the group are in my name and aim to improve transparency and accountability under the bill.

The bill will give ministers significant powers to introduce secondary legislation in a range of areas. Generally speaking, those powers are necessary for delivering the aims of the bill, and I am not opposed to their inclusion. However, we should be clear that those decisions should be taken following appropriate consultation. Most of the amendments in the group simply seek to put that commonsense responsibility in the bill.

Amendments 64 and 85 apply to ministerial guidance rather than to regulations, but serve a similar purpose. As the bill stands, local authorities will have a duty to "have regard to ... guidance" that is issued by ministers on LEZs and pavement parking. That is fair, because guidance will help to ensure consistency across the country. However, we should be clear that that action should be taken only after consultation: amendments 64 and 85 clarify that.

Amendment 120 would require ministers to publish any code of practice that they introduce as soon as possible. The bill will give ministers the power to introduce or approve a code of practice on safety measures relating to road works, but it does not make it clear that the code of practice should be published, or how it should be published. The amendment would make it clear that the code must be published, which would remove ambiguity from the bill and improve accountability in relation to the guidance that will be produced under part 5.

I move amendment 45.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 45, 47, 48, 81 to 83, 90, 92, 93, 109, and 111 all seek to require the Scottish ministers to consult

"such persons as they consider appropriate"

before making regulations on low-emission zones, parking and workplace parking. Consultation of stakeholders is vital to the success of any

secondary legislation, and the process is undertaken as a matter of Scottish Government policy. Therefore, I understand the intention behind the amendments.

Amendments 64 and 85 seek to give the Scottish ministers powers to issue guidance on low-emission zones and parking. Again, that is already standard practice: the Scottish ministers have an inherent power to issue guidance. In relation to parking and low-emission zones, the bill requires local authorities to take any such guidance into account. The Scottish ministers will always consult prior to issuing guidance, and consultation of key stakeholders has been ongoing for some time on low-emission zones and parking guidance.

Amendments 119 and 120 would introduce a requirement on the Scottish ministers to consult on any revision or update to the safety code of practice for roads authorities, and to publish that code. Again, the Scottish ministers would, as a matter of routine, consult the industry and roads authorities during preparation of such a code. The existing safety code for undertakers is already published, and the same is intended for any roads authority code.

Although existing measures mean that the intention behind the amendments in the group would be achieved, I have no issue with the requirements being expressed in the bill. I therefore support the amendments.

Colin Smyth: I thank the cabinet secretary for his support for the amendments. They will make small but important changes to protect transparency and accountability, now and in the future, thereby enshrining best practice in law.

Amendment 45 agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: We allowed an hour for the debate on group 4, which is supposed to have finished; we are almost four minutes over time. I used my powers under rule 9.8.4A to allow the debate to continue, so I ask members to note that we are four minutes behind schedule.

Group 5 is technical amendments on low-emission zones. Amendment 46, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 53, 56 and 178.

Michael Matheson: The amendments in this group are designed to help to demarcate the difference between low-emission zone scope and low-emission zone exemptions.

At stage 2, the bill used the terms “vehicle” and “type of vehicle” interchangeably in relation to low-emission zone scope, exemptions, including time-limited exemptions, and grace periods. Unfortunately, that approach might cause confusion.

The amendments in this group seek to address that language issue by ensuring that the bill describes vehicles in terms of, first, their use, secondly, their construction, or, thirdly, a combination of their use and construction, specifically when referring to low-emission zone scope or exemptions. That means that low-emission zone scope and exemptions can be set in a way that accurately describes the vehicles to which the scope of the low-emission zone applies and the vehicles to which the exemptions apply, thereby making clear that low-emission zone scope and low-emission zone exemptions are separate concepts.

The same principle is applied to the creation of grace periods, which are linked to the scope of low-emission zones and, as such, are applicable only to a vehicle’s construction, rather than its use.

I urge members to support amendments 46, 53, 56 and 178.

I move amendment 46.

Amendment 46 agreed to.

Amendment 137 moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 137 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 137 disagreed to.

Section 2—Proving contraventions and issue of a penalty charge notice

Amendment 47 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

Section 3—Enforcement

Amendment 48 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

14:45

The Presiding Officer: Group 6 is on enforcement of low-emission zones. Amendment 138, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 139, 151, 126 and 176.

Colin Smyth: Amendments 138 and 139 relate to the creation, in the bill, of an unclear situation on LEZ enforcement. The bill does not make driving in an LEZ a criminal offence, but it introduces a vague power for ministers to create criminal offences by regulation. I am genuinely concerned about the ambiguity that that creates. If it is the Government's intention to create a criminal offence, that should surely be in the bill. I would therefore be grateful if the cabinet secretary could clarify the intent behind those enabling powers, and what he envisages them being used for.

Likewise, I am keen to know why a decision was not taken to make driving in an LEZ a criminal offence from the outset.

Amendment 126 calls for regulations setting or changing penalty charges related to LEZs to be subject to the affirmative procedure, and my amendment 176 calls for regulations setting out who might be liable for LEZ charges to be subject to the affirmative procedure.

Those are two important details, with significant consequences for drivers, and the decisions made in those regulations must be subject to adequate scrutiny. For that reason, I believe that they should

have to be agreed by Parliament, under the affirmative procedure.

I welcome amendment 151 from Jamie Greene, which calls for regulations on traffic signs to be used in LEZs. The need for consistency in signage was a key issue highlighted to the REC Committee throughout the progress of the bill, and there is widespread agreement that that would be key to raising public awareness and encouraging compliance. I am happy to support amendment 151, which would ensure that that is the case.

I move amendment 138.

The Presiding Officer: I call Jamie Greene to speak to amendment 151 and the other amendments in this group.

Jamie Greene: I will just speak to amendment 151. As was said in the conversation that we had in a previous group on national standards, it is right that we should set a national technical standard for the zones, but it is also really important that we have national signage standards.

Amendment 151 would provide in the bill that ministers will introduce regulations that will ensure that there will not be different traffic signage used in different zones. I lodged the amendment for the reason that Colin Smyth gave—I thank him for his support—which is to ensure that there is consistency across all the zones and that drivers understand the signage and know exactly when they are entering or exiting a zone, and the rules that operate around it. That consistency of message, whether at the side of the road or in road markings, would ensure that no matter which city someone was driving in, they would know exactly when they were in or out of a zone.

Anyone who has driven through London congestion charge areas will know that when the areas were introduced, there was ambiguity about which side of a street was in or out of a zone, and that was an opt-in scheme so people needed to know whether they were going to pay the fee accordingly. The difference here is that people will not know until they get the fine through the post a couple of weeks later.

This is an important, small but useful amendment that will ensure consistency across all low-emission zones as they are introduced across Scotland.

Mike Rumbles: I confirm our support for the amendments on the ground of consistency. I support Colin Smyth's amendments, particularly amendment 138. I agree that the regulations are not the right place to create offences, because, as we know, regulations can only be approved or removed by Parliament—we cannot amend them. The criminal offence really should have been

created in the bill, so we agree with the position that Colin Smyth outlined.

Michael Matheson: This group of amendments addresses the enforcement of low-emission zones.

Amendment 138 seeks to remove the ability of Scottish ministers to create criminal offences for non-payment of the low-emission zone civil penalty charge. Amendment 139 would result in there being no maximum criminal fine for non-payment of low-emission zone penalties. The bill provides for criminal sanctions against non-payment as an important means of ensuring enforcement of the low-emission zone regime. These amendments would undermine the system, as they would remove that enforcement option.

Amendment 151 is unnecessary. The Scottish ministers already have statutory powers to amend the existing Traffic Signs Regulations and General Directions 2016 to prescribe traffic signs for low-emission zones.

Work to design low-emission zone signs at national level is already being progressed by my officials using the powers under the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984.

Amendments 126 and 176 both seek to make the regulation-making powers under sections 1(4)(c) and 2(4)(b) subject to the affirmative procedure. Although I consider the matter to be somewhat finely balanced, I am content to agree that the powers should be subject to the additional parliamentary scrutiny that is afforded by the affirmative procedure. I therefore support amendments 126 and 176, but I ask that Colin Smyth and Jamie Greene do not press the other amendments in this group. If the amendments are pressed, I urge members to reject them.

Colin Smyth: I am a bit disappointed that the cabinet secretary did not really clarify the purpose of the ministerial power to introduce regulations creating criminal offences under this section. I still believe that the approach in the bill creates a degree of ambiguity and confusion, but I do not wish to limit enforcement powers with regard to LEZs by removing that power, so I will seek members' agreement to withdraw amendment 138 and I will not move amendment 139. However, I wish to move amendments 126 and 176, which would make regulations on penalty charges and liabilities subject to the affirmative procedure, as I believe that that would provide a useful additional layer of scrutiny to two key elements of LEZ enforcement.

Amendment 138, by agreement, withdrawn.

Amendment 139 not moved.

Section 4—Power to make or modify a low emission zone scheme

Amendment 49 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 49 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. As this is the first division following a change of group, it will be a one-minute division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)

Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 49 disagreed to.

Section 5—Ministerial approval

The Presiding Officer: Group 7 is concerned with process issues in low-emission zones. Amendment 140, in the name of Jamie Greene, is grouped with amendments 141, 50, 51, 142 to 144, 52 and 63.

Jamie Greene: As amended at stage 2, the bill states that if a scheme is to be created, amended or revoked, ministerial approval is required. My amendments in this group—specifically, amendments 140, 141, 143 and 144—remove the “revoke” element. The reason for that is simple, and concerns something that I raised at stage 2.

It is absolutely fair that Scottish ministers should have a say in the setting up of the zones—they are quite substantial pieces of infrastructure and operations—and it is important that the local authorities that set them up do so following the required due diligence. However, concerns have been raised. If a scheme has been in operation for a number of years and has either met all its objectives or is deemed to be inoperable for any reason, a local authority might choose to close down or revoke a zone and go down a different path in tackling emissions in its area. Indeed, we hope that the zones might be victims of their own success and there will not be a need for them in the future. At the moment, the ability to revoke requires ministerial approval, which means that we could end up with a scenario in which a city such as Dundee or Glasgow would like to cease to operate a zone but is overruled by the Government.

It is important that the local authority that sets up and operates the zone—and is financially responsible for it—should have the right to unilaterally close down the zone, if it deems it appropriate to do so. It is not appropriate for the Government to have the final power to decline the revocation of a zone. The amendments address that.

Another amendment in the group—amendment 142—sets out that there are national rules around the zone. We have talked about signage and national vehicle standards, and the cabinet secretary spoke about regulations around national exemptions. However, the design of the geographic area of a zone, and the days and times of operation, should be left to local authorities. Although it is likely that the zones will be in operation 24/7, that may not be required. There are many reasons—including economic reasons—why a local authority may choose not to operate a zone on a Sunday, for example. I am

not saying that a local authority should do that; this is about giving local authorities the flexibility and freedom to design a zone that works for them.

Local authorities need flexibility on where the zone is—in other words, which streets are in it and which are outside it. Edinburgh has been having a proactive conversation and engaging with the public in that regard already.

As I said, the other aspect on which local authorities need flexibility is the dates and times of a zone’s operation. If a local authority chooses that a zone should operate 24/7, so be it. However, that power should not lie centrally or be centrally decided—again, that should be up to those who create the zone. Although I am happy to hear comments on the amendments, I hope that they are seen as a welcome improvement to the process of operating the zones.

I move amendment 140.

The Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 50 and the other amendments in the group.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 140, 141, 143 and 144 from Jamie Greene are similar to amendments that were lodged at stage 2. They seek to remove reference to revocation from sections 5, 6 and 7 of the bill. As a result, ministers would have no powers to consider proposals to revoke a low-emission zone, statutory consultees would not be consulted on any such revocation, and Scottish ministers and local authorities would have no powers to call for an examination into a proposal to revoke a low-emission zone. Proposals for low-emission zones, including revocation, should always be subject to the scrutiny of ministers and consultees.

Amendments 50 and 51 fulfil a commitment that was made at stage 2 to consider the amendments that Jamie Greene lodged at stage 2. Amendments 50 and 51 hold ministers and local authorities to account in demonstrating that consultation responses have been considered when such a scheme is made and approved.

Amendment 142 from Jamie Greene would have the same effect as another amendment that he lodged at stage 2, and would remove the requirement for ministers to approve proposals in relation to the area and days and hours of operation of a low-emission zone. Amendment 142 should be rejected, because the days and hours of operation are among the most significant elements of a scheme, and ministers should, therefore, approve proposals in that regard.

Amendment 52 offers a significant reworking of section 7 to allow for procedural flexibility in the examination of low-emission zone scheme proposals. It does not dilute the premise of a local

inquiry, but enables an examination to be conducted by an independent reporter by way of written representations, hearings or an inquiry. The new section 7 also gives Scottish ministers a regulation-making power to outline procedural and financial matters in relation to those examinations.

Amendment 63 deals with an anomaly in section 24 that resulted from the committee agreeing to an amendment at stage 2, whereby section 24(1A) allows local authorities to carry out, at their own instance, a review into a low-emission zone, rather than only by direction from Scottish ministers.

I urge members to reject amendments 140 to 144 in Jamie Greene's name, and to accept amendments 50 to 52 and 63 in my name.

Jamie Greene: I appreciate the cabinet secretary's comments. Where there is disagreement or, perhaps, confusion as to the effect of amendments, I am keen to ensure that we do not amend the bill in a way that leads to unintended consequences.

My interpretation of the drafting of my amendments is that they remove Scottish ministers' ability to overrule a decision by a local authority to revoke. My understanding of the cabinet secretary's response is that he would like to retain the power to overrule, but I do not think that he has given a sensible argument for why he would like to retain that power.

15:00

As I have said, it is important that the local authority concerned goes through due process in coming to an arrangement. However, once it has done that, it should be for the local authority, which is, ultimately, financially responsible for operating the scheme, to take the decision to close it down. We could end up in a scenario in which the Government says no to the revocation of a scheme that has perhaps proven to be financially onerous for the local authority, which may have struggled to meet the zone's operational costs. The minister could still say that that does not fit in with the national objectives, so the zone will have to be kept. I do not want local authorities to be in that scenario. That was the premise behind my proposal.

Mike Rumbles: We will support Jamie Greene's amendments. To answer his point—which the minister did not, of course—all ministers want to retain the powers that they have. That is the simple answer to the question why the minister did not agree to what has been proposed. He wants to hold on to the powers that he has. It is very simple.

Jamie Greene: Mr Rumbles has been in this building for a lot longer than I have, and I thank him for his wisdom. I could not agree more.

To be serious, I ask members to support my proposal. We have to strike a balance in the discussion about low-emission zones in respect of what local authorities are given the power to do versus what should be centrally decided. There are elements that should be centrally decided, which we have talked about, but I still think that flexibility is required at the local level. Therefore, I urge members to support amendment 140, which I will press.

I thank the cabinet secretary for amendments 50 and 51, which I am happy to support, following my discussions with him and the legislation team. I thank him for being flexible, taking on board our comments at stage 2 and lodging those amendments. I appreciate that, and we are happy to support amendments 50 and 51.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 140 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 140 disagreed to.

Amendment 141 not moved.

Amendments 50 and 51 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Amendment 142 moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 142 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 28, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 142 disagreed to.

Section 6—Prior consultation

Amendment 143 not moved.

Section 7—Local inquiries

Amendment 144 not moved.

Amendment 52 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 9—Required content of a scheme

Amendments 53 and 54 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

After section 9

Amendment 55 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 55 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)

Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)

McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 55 disagreed to.

Section 10—Grace period

The Presiding Officer: Group 8 is on grace periods in low-emission zones. Amendment 145, in the name of Jamie Greene, is grouped with amendments 146 to 148, 57 to 59, 149 and 150. If amendment 148 is agreed to, it will pre-empt amendments 57 and 58.

Jamie Greene: I know that the group looks long and members are dashing off for coffee, but I will not say very much on the group, so they should not go too far.

Members: Shame.

Jamie Greene: I know—it is a shame. [*Laughter.*] I hope that we will get to a break soon, Presiding Officer. We are making good progress.

When we looked at the proposals in the bill as introduced, we noted that the Government had rightly recognised that there needs to be a grace period. We cannot vote the legislation through and have zones set up the next day, because people would, in effect, be barred from entering the zones. Outside this building, there are people who drive older vehicles and small businesses that have such vehicles. We want to bring them up to the right emission standards to allow those people to drive in our city centres, but we will need some time to do so.

The concept of a grace period is welcome, but throughout stages 2 and 3 we have sought consistently to tinker with the format. When I lodged similar amendments at stage 2, we did not offer the proposals in a table format and the wording was complex to navigate. I hope that the way in which I have presented the proposals in my stage 3 amendments will make it easier to understand them.

In essence, I want to do two things, the first of which is to have three categories of vehicle—buses and coaches; commercial vehicles; and cars, by which I mean everyday household cars—and to give them different grace periods. The second thing is to separate them into the two categories of residents and non-residents. There is a good reason for that. After discussions with many councillors and local authorities, it was clear to me that people who live and operate in a zone and may be captured by it do not have a choice, whereas people who live outside a zone and want to travel into it have more ability to choose to enter it in a certain type of vehicle. If Edinburgh city centre becomes a low-emission zone, someone who lives there and who has the wrong type of vehicle will by default be breaking the law.

We thought that it would be sensible to give people more time, so we propose periods of one, two and three years respectively for those categories in which people are non-residents, and two, three and four years for residents. The range for grace periods would therefore be from one to four years depending on where the vehicle is registered and what type of vehicle it is. That seems to me to be a sensible proposition.

We know that this will be an issue because the indicative proposals from the City of Edinburgh Council show that it has already identified different types of zones that will allow entry to different types of vehicles.

It is sensible for us to do the right thing. We all support the setting up of low-emission zones, but it should be done in a sensible way. A lot of the small businesses that I spoke to are locked into contracts and leases. They cannot get out of those contracts and change their vehicles overnight. The general feedback that I got was that a grace period of three or four years would probably be long enough to allow those businesses to make those spending decisions and change the vehicles that they invest in, be they lease hired, contracted or purchased. That is important feedback.

We do not want to find out that, as a consequence of the legislation, businesses are stuck in vehicle contracts that they cannot get out of in a short period of time, and that they might have onerous charges or penalties to pay as a result.

This is the right thing to do. I am open to hearing members' feedback on whether they agree with the concept that people who live in a zone should be given a little more time. I will take a view on where we sit after the debate.

I move amendment 145.

Colin Smyth: Amendments 57 to 59 aim to encourage the use of shorter grace periods for low-emission zones, while providing local authorities with the flexibility to make decisions that meet their needs.

As it stands, the bill allows grace periods of up to six years, while forcing a mandatory minimum grace period on local authorities. That does not reflect the urgency of the climate crisis that we face in terms of air pollution and climate change, and it does not provide the flexibility that is needed to future proof the legislation.

Six-year grace periods are incompatible with a number of the Government's aims, such as the review of the cleaner air for Scotland strategy, which states:

"The four first round LEZs need to follow legal and policy timetables and be in place and delivering within four years."

That will simply not be possible if any local authority chooses to implement six-year grace periods.

Likewise, the Government's ambitions, from plans to phase out the need for new petrol and diesel cars to the new programme for government aim of zero-emission cities by 2030, will be hindered by the lengthy grace periods in the bill. However, in the interests of flexibility, I have not proposed removing that option entirely. Amendment 59 would simply require ministers to sign off on the use of longer grace periods. That will send a clear message that the maximum grace periods should not be encouraged without removing the option entirely if there was an exceptional reason for such a lengthy period.

Amendments 57 and 58 seek to remove the statutory minimum grace periods to provide flexibility to local authorities and to future proof the bill. While the introduction of an LEZ is a significant change for individuals, and one that requires a fair lead-in period, that will not necessarily always be the case. The legislation needs to be open enough to deal with a range of scenarios now and in the future.

The issue of displacement was raised with the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee. Providing more flexibility on grace periods would, for example, allow the boundaries of the LEZ to be tweaked slightly without the need for a lengthy two-year delay. That is not to say that it should be common practice to go below the suggested minimums and, realistically, many local authorities

are not likely to choose to do that at this point. However, we should trust that common sense will be used in the development of LEZs. Even if local authorities were inclined to use that flexibility inappropriately, ministers will still have sign-off, meaning that an LEZ with unreasonable grace periods would not be allowed, even with these amendments. The amendments are simply about removing something that might act as an unnecessary barrier to a minor change in a boundary at some point down the line.

Amendment 148 and associated amendments seek to replace the range of grace periods with set grace periods, based on vehicle type. Although I prefer the amendments that I have lodged, because they would give local authorities flexibility, Labour will support amendment 148 because it would have the effect of ensuring that LEZs would come into force earlier than the existing provisions in the bill.

John Finnie: We will not support any of the amendments in the group. We are happy with the grace periods. They are clearly an important part of the bill. As in any proposed legislation, transitional arrangements are important. The issue has been addressed and it was the subject of consultation, so we will not support any of the amendments in the group.

Michael Matheson: Grace periods are critical to the operation of low emissions, because they will give all road users time to prepare for the introduction of a low-emission zone. Amendments 145 to 148 seek to place very prescriptive grace periods into the bill. I draw attention to two substantive issues. Amendment 148 does not take account of the full list of vehicle types that are recognised by the Vehicle Certification Agency, which is not acceptable in enforcement terms. The amendments also seek to substantially reduce the maximum grace periods for buses and other commercial vehicles in a way that offers no flexibility for local authorities to set grace periods as they see fit.

15:15

Amendment 57 seeks to remove the minimum period for grace periods for non-residents. Removing the minimum would mean that low-emission zones could, in theory, start immediately, which would give those affected no time to adapt to the changes. The grace periods that are currently set out in the bill form the most appropriate and balanced approach, where we can achieve it in the legislation. They are based on extensive engagement with stakeholders, including local authorities.

Amendment 59 would impose a requirement to seek the approval of Scottish ministers around

grace periods, which is not necessary because ministers must already approve a low-emission zone scheme under section 5 of the bill.

I have some sympathy with the intent of amendment 58, which seeks to remove minimum grace periods for residents. Local authorities will still have flexibility to set those periods up to two years beyond the grace period that is set for non-residents, so I can support that amendment.

Amendments 149 and 150, which were lodged by Jamie Greene, are concerned with removing section 11 in its entirety. That would, in effect, result in the removal from the bill of substantive necessary grace period provisions, covering situations including those in which two or more local authorities wished to act jointly when making or amending a low-emission zone, or in which newly adopted roads were included in an existing low-emission zone.

Therefore, although I can support amendment 58, I ask Jamie Greene and Colin Smyth not to press their other amendments in the group. If the amendments are pressed, I urge members to reject them.

Jamie Greene: One thing that is still unclear—perhaps the cabinet secretary can clarify it—is whether the power to set grace periods will be defined zone by zone by local authorities, or whether there will be a national minimum or maximum for grace periods. My amendments seek to bring clarity on that point.

Michael Matheson: There is a minimum and a maximum, and also a provision that will allow local authorities to set grace periods that reflect local circumstances.

Jamie Greene: Right—so there would be a national range, but flexibility at a local level. If a local authority's proposal for a grace period did not meet the national exemption, would it not be able to introduce it? I still think that that is unclear. For example, does the cabinet secretary envisage a situation in which an Edinburgh resident may have one year but a Glasgow resident may have three years? Might we see such an outcome?

Michael Matheson: We covered that point at stage 2. As Jamie Greene is aware, there is a minimum and a maximum. In seeking approval from Scottish ministers, a local authority would have to set out what the grace period would be. If the period exceeded what was set out in the legislation, clearly it would not be approved by ministers, but if a lower period was sought, the local authority would have to explain to ministers the purpose of having a timeframe that was lower than the maximum.

Jamie Greene: I appreciate the cabinet secretary's response on those points. I will not

seek to progress my proposal on the grace period in the structure that was presented in my amendments, but I will add my support to amendment 58, in the name of Colin Smyth, which the Government has indicated that it will support. I seek leave to withdraw amendment 145 and I will not move my other amendments in the group.

Amendment 145, by agreement, withdrawn.

Amendment 56 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Amendments 146 to 148 and 57 not moved.

Amendment 58 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 59 not moved.

Amendment 149 not moved.

Section 11—Grace periods: further provision

Amendment 150 not moved.

Section 12—Time-limited exemptions

Amendment 178 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

After section 16

Amendment 151 moved—[Jamie Greene].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 151 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 54, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 151 disagreed to.

After section 17

The Presiding Officer: For members' information, we will take a 10-minute break in about 15 minutes' time, after group 10.

Group 9 is on information sharing. Amendment 60, in the name of Michael Matheson, is grouped with amendment 84.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 60 and 84 enable the sharing of information between the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency and a "responsible body" such as a local authority or its "enforcement agent" in a way that allows the successful enforcement of LEZs and parking schemes, while complying with data-sharing legislation. The data principally centres around the details of the registered keeper of the vehicle, which is central to the operation of enforcement regimes.

That approach to data sharing will work in instances in which the LEZ and back office parking enforcement regimes are run by the Scottish Government, a group of local authorities or a contractor. Where information is disclosed to an enforcement agent, they can use or further disclose it only

"as is necessary for or in connection with the enforcement"

of the LEZ and parking schemes. I urge members to agree to amendments 60 and 84.

I move amendment 60.

Amendment 60 agreed to.

Section 19—Ministers' grant-making powers

The Presiding Officer: Group 10 is on financial provisions regarding low-emission zones. Amendment 61, in the name of Michael Matheson, is grouped with amendments 62, 152 and 153.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 61 and 62 make it clear that grants to individual persons, for example, might be subject to conditions, including a repayment. That is necessary to address a situation in which a grant is provided to make alterations to a vehicle to reduce its emissions—such as the retrofit of a vehicle to achieve a Euro 6 diesel standard—but the alterations are subsequently proven not to work in the real world and not to reduce emissions sufficiently.

Amendment 152 is unnecessary. Local authorities are not obliged to accept

"an offer of a grant or a loan"

from the Scottish Government. In practice, we already provide funding to local authorities to help them meet their low-emission zone scheme design and implementation costs. If, due to unforeseen issues, additional funding is needed, my officials will work in a collaborative manner with local authorities to address those funding requests.

Amendment 153 is similar to an amendment that Brian Whittle lodged at stage 2 and that was not agreed. As I did at stage 2, I believe that that approach is too prescriptive. However, the focusing of penalty moneys on issues such as active travel can be delivered if a local authority frames an objective of their low-emission zone scheme around such an issue. That point will be made clear in low-emission zone guidance.

In moving amendment 61, I ask members to support amendment 62 and to reject the other amendments in the group.

I move amendment 61.

The Presiding Officer: I call Jamie Greene to speak to amendment 152 and the other amendments in the group.

Jamie Greene: First, I accept the cabinet secretary's comments that amendment 152 is unnecessary. If he is confident that local authorities have the right of refusal, I am happy not to move it.

However, I will speak to amendments 61 and 62, in the name of the cabinet secretary, on a technical matter that comes from a discussion that we had at stage 2. At that point, by ensuring that the local authorities and ministers would mutually agree the conditions of the terms of such a grant, we strengthened the bill. That wording is in section 19(2) and it is helpful to see it in the bill. However, with amendment 61, the cabinet secretary seeks

to roll back on that agreement, by saying that the conditions for repayment will be only

“as the Scottish Ministers determine”.

At stage 2, I sought to ensure that local authorities had some involvement in setting the conditions of repayment, that they would not be subject purely to the conditions laid on them and that it would be a mutual decision. For that reason, I cannot support amendments 61 or 62.

The Presiding Officer: I call Brian Whittle to speak to amendment 153 and the other amendments in the group.

Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con): Amendment 153 looks at surplus moneys that arise from penalty charges within an LEZ. In developing low-emission zones, the Transport (Scotland) Bill reduces options for travel within an LEZ. Amendment 153 ensures that investment in green, alternative modes of transport, such as “active travel”, “public transport infrastructure” and “park and ride facilities”, is intrinsic to the penalty charge. If we remove transport options, it is important that we encourage alternatives. If we leave the action at removing modes of transport within an LEZ, we are leaving a job half done. There is not much in the bill that encourages active travel. Amendment 153 would encourage different modes of transport within the zones.

Michael Matheson: Brian Whittle will be aware that local authorities will look at their transport strategies and, if in the process of establishing low-emission zones they wish to make specific objectives around active travel, which it is within their scope to do, the moneys that are raised through the LEZ scheme can be used for those purposes. Should local authorities choose to do that, there are powers in the legislation to allow it to happen.

Brian Whittle: Does the cabinet secretary recognise that, if we do not allocate the money to active travel, the danger is that the money that the schemes raise will go into a black hole and could be used for anything in local authorities’ budgets?

Michael Matheson: Brian Whittle should recognise that the money that is raised from low-emission zone fines is for the purpose of local transport provision. Therefore, if the authority makes active travel a specific provision when it sets up the low-emission zone, the money is committed for that purpose. That is how the schemes have been designed and the legislation ensures that the provision is applied, if it is one of the objectives that a local authority sets.

15:30

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 61 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 91, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 61 agreed to.

Amendment 62 moved—[Michael Matheson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 62 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)

McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 91, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 62 agreed to.

Amendment 152 not moved.

Section 21—Application of penalty charges

Amendment 153 moved—[Brian Whittle].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 153 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)

Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 153 disagreed to.

Section 24—Direction to carry out a review

Amendment 63 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 26—Guidance

Amendment 64 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes group 10. We are slightly ahead of schedule and exactly

one third of the way through the plan. We will have a 10-minute suspension to allow members to take a break.

15:34

Meeting suspended.

15:47

On resuming—

Section 28—Provision of local services by local authorities

The Presiding Officer: Group 11 is on the provision of bus services by local transport authorities. Amendment 65, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 66, 128, 130 and 131.

Michael Matheson: Following stage 2, I have listened very carefully to what the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, the Association of Transport Co-ordinating Officers, the Competition and Markets Authority, the Confederation of Passenger Transport and local authorities have said about the bill's provisions in this area.

Amendments 65 and 66 address the two stage 2 amendments that were concerned with municipal bus operations and would ensure that there is clarity in the new powers. The amendments recognise what Colin Smyth was also seeking to achieve at stage 2. They empower all local transport authorities in Scotland to provide services

“for the carriage of passengers by road using vehicles that require a PSV operator's licence”

and to operate services in the commercial bus market where they consider that that will

“contribute to the implementation of their relevant general policies.”

That wide power enables a local transport authority to choose the most appropriate option for their circumstances. LTAs will continue to have proper regard to all other obligations on them, such as those regarding competition and state aid rules.

Over the coming months, my officials will continue to engage with local transport authorities, the Competition and Markets Authority, bus operators and others in developing appropriate guidance.

Amendments 128, 130 and 131 are consequential amendments.

I move amendment 65 and urge members to support the other amendments in group 11.

Colin Smyth: I am delighted that the Government has accepted Labour's long-standing goal to lift the ban on councils running bus services, without restrictions such as limiting services to areas where there is an unmet need, as was previously specified in the bill, or requiring local authorities to set up an arm's-length company.

Across Scotland, bus passenger numbers are falling, vital routes are disappearing and fares are rising. We desperately need to change. We need to empower our local authorities to run bus services for the benefit of their communities and break up the private monopolies that too often dominate the bus market.

Public transport should be a public service, where profits are invested in improving services and keeping fares down, not boosting shareholders' dividends. To see the benefits of municipal ownership, we simply have to look outside the windows of this Parliament at Lothian Buses, which runs one of the most popular bus networks in the country and last year returned £7.7 million to the public purse.

Although the arm's-length approach that has been taken in Lothian has been successful, a one-size-fits-all approach such as the one put forward by the Government at stage 2 would not work for all communities. Setting up a municipal bus company comes with significant risk and costs and it is unrealistic for a council that is simply seeking to run a small number of services. It is critical that local authorities have flexibility and can run services directly where needed, allowing them to build up capacity and expertise over time.

My stage 2 amendment delivered that, as do the amendments lodged today by the Government, which reflect and respect the decision taken by the committee at stage 2. I am therefore happy to support the Government amendments. I am grateful to the cabinet secretary's officials for discussing the wording of the amendments with me and with others, including COSLA, before they were lodged.

Jamie Greene: I appreciate the work that the Government, the cabinet secretary and his team have done on this issue. The committee looked at the issue in its stage 1 report, in which we identified that the bill did not go far enough in empowering local authorities to have the flexibility to run bus services where they saw the need.

The issue stemmed from the fact that local authorities would be able only to run services that were classified as meeting an unmet need. By default, those have tended to be the services that commercial operators have pulled out of or do not operate because they are not commercially viable. Asking local authorities only to operate services in

that environment is untenable. There was very little appetite to do that among the local authorities that we wrote to; in their responses, few of them had either the resource—financial or otherwise—or the appetite to run such services.

That issue was reflected at stage 2, when we amended the bill. I supported some of Colin Smyth's amendments, but after stage 2, part 2 of the bill was a bit of a mess and it needed to be tidied up. Over the summer, I met a number of Scotland's major bus operators and some of the smaller ones, and I extended the conversation to local authorities as well, so that we could find a compromise that works, that delivers on the requests of the committee and that takes into account some of the fair points that Colin Smyth raised about local authorities wanting to do their best for people in their area. We have to balance that with ensuring that we do not produce legislation that will inadvertently create issues for local authorities.

If a local authority wants to run a bus service, it should do so through the mechanism that the Government proposed; ideally, it should be through an arm's-length company. That would keep clear blue water between the bit of the council that operates the service and the bit that tenders and issues licences to operate services. However, we know that we need to do something to improve bus patronage, which is still decreasing in Scotland.

I hope that local authorities will consider these amendments to be positive and I hope that any local authority that is considering operating a service will think carefully about the implications and give the decision the gravitas that it requires, because it is not easy, cheap or simple to do so. However, if it chooses to do so, it will have our support. I am happy to support all the Government's amendments on bus franchising.

Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Lab): I am pleased to support amendment 65 and the other amendments in this group, which will give local authorities the power to operate municipal bus services, which my colleague Colin Smyth argued for during the committee stage.

Too often, it seems that the communities that we represent are being held hostage to the whims of the private profit motive. People in Hamilton experienced that recently when First Glasgow announced that it would be withdrawing the X1 bus service between Hamilton and Glasgow.

It is a popular service that is relied on by lots of local people, including hundreds of students and workers who travel into the city. The potential loss of that service, especially for people who need it at peak times, would have had a really disruptive impact on my constituents' daily lives—in some

cases, more than doubling the time and cost of commuting.

Despite the popularity of the service, the initial reason that was given was that the route was not profitable enough. However, our public services should be there to serve the interests of the people and not to fill the pockets of stakeholders in private companies.

We need more power and control over our bus services. In that example, the X1 has received a temporary reprieve following immense public pressure, with a petition lodged by Hamilton resident Rebecca Creechan reaching more than 4,700 signatures so far, but the operator has stated that that is on a use it or lose it basis, and the future of the service is not guaranteed beyond December. The amendments in the group would ensure that local authorities such as South Lanarkshire Council have the potential to step in and provide bus services when private firms withdraw and would take us towards a public transport system that serves the interests of the many and not the few.

John Finnie: I thank the cabinet secretary. He said that he listened to the debate at stage 2, and I know that he did so intently. Importantly, he also listened to COSLA, which is the representative body of local authorities and which has said that it wants the powers in the amendments. Colleagues have talked about the current provision in the bill referring to unmet need. That relates to a situation where there is no money in providing a service. We know from the demographics of people who use buses that they are the people who have many needs to be met, not least to get from A to B.

I am delighted that the Scottish Government is on board and I fully support the amendments in the group, although they are hardly revolutionary. The Scottish Greens ran a better buses campaign and heard from people the length and breadth of the country about the challenges that exist, which have fuelled the patronage decline. We need to reverse that. No one is suggesting that that will happen overnight, but it is important that local authorities take the opportunities, not least because the situation with Lothian Buses has always been anomalous. As I said in relation to an earlier amendment, we saw the turnaround that took place in East Lothian when Lothian Buses moved in, got young people on board and got them into the habit of using public transport.

We would like an extension of free public transport. It is important that there is a co-ordinated approach, as we discussed earlier in talking about transport strategy. It is a real boon that our local authorities will now be in a position to provide services, so we will support the amendments.

Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab): I welcome the cabinet secretary's amendments in the group, as they put into effect Colin Smyth's stage 2 initiative, which is good. The amendments are potentially transformational and need to be acted on urgently.

Scottish Labour strongly supports the principle of bus company ownership by local authorities. It would enable local authorities to be proactive and to ensure that communities get the bus services that they need so that people of all ages have access to employment, schools, further and higher education, health facilities, shops and community and leisure facilities—everything that we need in our daily lives. An expansion of not-for-profit bus services means that investment will benefit our communities directly.

The bus pass for the over-60s, which I introduced, was crucial in giving access to bus services for older people and gave those with cars the option of leaving their car at home when going to work or about their business. However, as Colin Smyth said, far too many people simply do not have any bus services to use or the services are too expensive. That is why we urgently need municipal bus company ownership.

The model in Scotland is Lothian Buses, which is an award-winning company that provides an affordable service, with a network right across the city and links across the region. The profits are reinvested locally.

John Mason (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP): Will the member give way?

Sarah Boyack: No—I need to be fast.

There are already calls for municipal bus companies in Glasgow and Aberdeen. I understand that in Aberdeen, the city council has noted an interest in the sale of First Bus and already owns 20 hydrogen buses that are operated either by First Aberdeen or Stagecoach. We should have municipal bus companies across Scotland, where our local authorities want to implement them, and not just in towns and cities but in rural communities.

We need to go beyond the principle. We need skills and knowledge and the sharing of expertise so that all our councils can use such services. I hope that the transport secretary will back up the power with proactive support for our hard-pressed local authorities, not just through advice from Transport Scotland but with start-up resources so that councils can use the powers to establish or buy bus companies and invest in the accessible low-emission buses that will be vital for success.

Mike Rumbles: The Liberal Democrats certainly support all the cabinet secretary's amendments in the group. Across the chamber, every party wants to halt and reverse the long-term decline in the

use of buses. It is extremely important that we empower local authorities to do so through the amendments.

Yesterday in this chamber, I was critical of the cabinet secretary on another aspect of his work; today I praise him for his work on buses. It is rare that, after the Government has introduced a bill, a minister—after a change of minister—listens to the arguments at stage 1 and in the stage 1 report, supports amendments at stage 2 and then lodges amendments at stage 3 that complete the change.

The cabinet secretary has done that, and the effect is to move us away from empowering local authorities to take on only unprofitable routes to properly empowering them to establish bus services. I say well done to the minister. I am glad that the First Minister is listening to this, because I hope that the cabinet secretary's approach is a trend that she will encourage in all her ministers.

16:00

John Mason: I wanted to make a quick point by way of intervention, but I will make a speech instead, if that is acceptable, Presiding Officer.

I point out, especially to Labour members, that when I was a member of the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee we heard evidence from Lothian Buses that the company's being in public ownership or not made no difference to its services and their popularity.

There are many factors in bus decline, particularly in the west of Scotland and the greater Glasgow area.

John Finnie: The member also heard about the spectacular failure of bus services in East Lothian and how the situation was recovered by the public service—that is, Lothian Buses.

John Mason: I am happy to accept that. My more general point is that the decline in bus use, particularly in the west of Scotland, is not easily explained and will not easily be sorted. One factor is that in the west we have a much wider network of local railways, which the Edinburgh area does not have, which means that bus services in Edinburgh cater for a wider range of people and journeys.

The reality is that the public—including many of my constituents who do not have cars—aspire to have cars and not use buses. There is a wider issue here, and although I am broadly supportive of public ownership and regulation, I do not think that there is a simple answer that explains the decline of bus usage.

Michael Matheson: I am pleased that my amendments were able to achieve cross-party support in the Parliament this afternoon. That is to

be welcomed. They help to address an issue that we and Colin Smyth sought to address at stage 2, by providing greater clarity, which will be important in empowering local authorities.

I am grateful for members' comments on the issues. Some members raised specific issues. Monica Lennon referred to the X1 service in Hamilton; my colleague Christina McKelvie, who is the constituency member, has been very much involved in pursuing the issue on behalf of her constituents. Efforts have succeeded in securing an extension to the service until the end of this year, so that people can try to see whether it can continue in the long term.

Monica Lennon was correct to say that the bill will empower local authorities to consider the option of delivering commercial services in their areas. I encourage all members to support the move to empower local authorities to take forward services in their areas.

Amendment 65 agreed to.

Section 28A—Local transport authority bus companies

Amendment 66 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 29—Bus services improvement partnerships

The Presiding Officer: Group 12 is on bus services: consideration of needs of certain persons. Amendment 67, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 68 to 71.

Colin Smyth: The amendments in this group, which are all in my name, seek to ensure that bus services improvement plans and franchises respond to the needs of people who are living in poverty and people with relevant protected characteristics. It is important that bus services improvement partnerships deliver for all passengers, and these amendments will ensure that inclusion is at the heart of plans.

Transport has an important role to play in the lives of people who are living in poverty and people with protected characteristics. Good public transport can provide essential access to a range of opportunities and services. Equally, poor or inaccessible public transport can contribute to poverty and worsen its effects.

The amendments in this group will ensure that that is a key consideration as plans are developed. Such consideration could inform a range of aspects of plans. The most obvious example is the affordability of fares. Consideration might also impact on decisions about routes, for example, to ensure that services run through deprived areas in our communities, which are often overlooked.

The Poverty and Inequality Commission recently produced a report that highlighted the significant role of transport in addressing poverty and inequality, and made clear that the status quo is not working. It stated:

“It is clear to the Commission that action is needed on transport in order to help unlock people from poverty.”

The Government’s draft national transport strategy sets “promoting equality” as one of its key strategic priorities. These amendments are a small but practical way to put those words into action in order to develop a fairer rights-based transport system.

I move amendment 67.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 67 to 70, in the name of Colin Smyth, seek to impose additional requirements as to the content, notification of, and consultation on bus services improvement partnership plans and schemes.

The amendments are similar to several that were lodged at stage 2, which focused on ensuring that account is taken of the needs and views of those on low incomes and those who find it difficult to use or afford local services because they have one or more of the protected characteristics that are set out in section 149(7) of the Equality Act 2010. Those amendments were voted on at stage 2 and opposed by the committee at the end of the voting process. The concerns that I raised then remain.

Local authorities must already comply with the public sector equality duty and are required to assess the impact of applying a proposed new or revised policy or practice against the needs that are mentioned in section 149(1) of the Equality Act 2010. That includes when setting local transport policies and developing bus services improvement partnership policies and proposals.

Further, there are substantial safeguards in place throughout the bus services improvement partnership process to ensure that local transport authorities consult those who are likely to be affected by a proposed partnership and give suitable notice to all persons in the area. The process can include the particular groups that have been identified and, coupled with the equality duty, the effect is that those groups will be included in bus services improvement partnership development and that their needs will be considered.

In a similar vein, amendment 71 seeks to require a local transport authority, when carrying out its duty to consult on a proposed franchising framework organisations that are representative of “users of local services”, to specifically consult organisations representing persons on a low income or, again, persons whose ability to use

local services is likely to be affected due to characteristics that are protected in the Equality Act 2010. As I have said, local authorities must comply with the public sector equality duty. The existing duty in the franchising provisions of the bill to consult organisations that represent “users of local services” does not need to be expanded to achieve the aims of amendment 71.

There is also an additional level of scrutiny in the franchising process, which involves the decision of an independent panel that will actively consider not only the consultation and action taken on the process but any other representations that are made to it about the proposed franchising framework.

The very robust processes for both bus services improvement partnerships and franchising, along with the public sector equality duty, mean that the amendments in the group are simply unnecessary and merely complicate the provisions for no practical gain.

I therefore urge members to reject them.

The Presiding Officer: I ask Colin Smyth to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 67.

Colin Smyth: I do not share the cabinet secretary’s view that those responsibilities would create problems in the development of BSIPs and franchises, or his opinion that they are unnecessary. They do not undermine or distract from existing responsibilities. They simply add important aims on tackling inequality that are entirely consistent with the principles for our transport system that we agreed to add to the bill at the start of today’s debate.

I am sure that members across the chamber want local transport authorities to take an inclusive approach to the development of BSIPs and franchises. My amendments would make that a clear responsibility. Ensuring that BSIPs and franchises work for people living in poverty and people with protected characteristics is fundamental to their success. However, all too often, theirs are the voices that are not heard and are excluded when it comes to public transport, despite the current equality duty, which the cabinet secretary thinks is sufficient.

The amendments will also ensure best practice across the country and will lead to a far more effective and inclusive approach to our transport system.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 67 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a one-minute division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)

Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 29, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 67 disagreed to.

Amendment 68 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 68 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)

Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 68 disagreed to.

Amendment 69 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 69 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 29, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 69 disagreed to.

Amendment 70 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 70 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)

Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 70 disagreed to.

Amendment 71 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 71 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)

Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 29, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 71 disagreed to.

After section 34

16:15

The Presiding Officer: Group 13 is on grants to bus service operators and accessibility conditions. Amendment 154, in the name of Colin Smyth, is the only amendment in the group.

Colin Smyth: Amendment 154 will strengthen accessibility standards on buses by requiring operators that receive bus service operator grants to provide information in accessible formats on request, and to ensure that bus drivers receive disability awareness training at least every two years. Those two issues have been highlighted as key barriers that prevent people with disabilities from being able to access public transport.

The Poverty and Inequality Commission's recent report on transport shone a light on the challenges that face disabled people on public transport. It stated that

“while disabled people can be eligible for free concessionary bus travel, this is only useful to them if they can access services”

and specifically highlighted the lack of accessible information about journeys.

The need for accessible information about services—such as timetables—should go without saying. The need for staff to be well trained in disability awareness is, likewise, clear. However, as things stand, provision of information in accessible formats varies from operator to operator and, overall, is severely lacking.

Existing provisions around staff training are also inadequate, with training being required only at the start of a driver’s career, and with no requirement for regular updates. That creates the risk that details of the training will be forgotten over time, particularly details in respect of scenarios that drivers do not encounter daily.

There is also the risk of best practice and legal requirements changing over time, which means that drivers who have not received any training since the start of their careers will not be kept up to date. Amendment 154 seeks to address those two challenges as far as possible within the Scottish Parliament’s current powers.

I move amendment 154.

John Finnie: I clearly support Colin Smyth. To be perfectly honest, I am angered that we need amendment 154 in the first place, because the issue is so fundamental. Colin Smyth talked about accessibility. If we are to increase patronage, it is vital that we make use of buses as easy as possible. I know from both the better buses campaign and from constituency casework that driver training is an issue. I hope that members across the chamber will support the amendment.

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Con): I thank Colin Smyth for lodging amendment 154, which is important. We need to debate it, and I will be interested to hear what the cabinet secretary has to say. My colleague, Jamie Greene, lodged a similar amendment at stage 2—as did I—on accessibility.

However, there is a bit of vagueness in amendment 154, and a lack of clarity about how it would work in practice. Colin Smyth is absolutely right that we need to make bus information as accessible as possible.

As members are going out tonight, if those of them who use public transport or walk look at the bus timetable at the bus stop outside our Parliament—if it is still light—they will see how small the writing is saying what time the next bus will come. Lothian Buses reduced the size of the writing even this year. For a person with any form

of visual impairment, it is almost impossible to read.

There is a duty on bus companies to consider how that information is made available. Clearly, technology is moving, which is good news. However, people who have visual impairments can struggle with using mobile phones and other technology.

Although I am very sympathetic to amendment 154 and hope that what it suggests will happen, Conservatives cannot support it as it is drafted.

Michael Matheson: I appreciate what Colin Smyth is trying to achieve with amendment 154. Measures to improve bus driver disability awareness training and accessible information are important. However, I have serious concerns that the amendment, which seeks, in essence, to require bus operators to take measures to improve accessibility for disabled passengers, relates to the reserved matter of equal opportunities and is outwith the legislative competence of the Scottish Parliament. In any case, European Union law already requires that local service operators ensure that their drivers receive disability awareness training.

Regulation of equal opportunities is a reserved matter. The Department for Transport plans to publish best-practice guidance that will be applicable across the UK on provision of disability awareness training in the bus sector. That guidance is being informed by the experience of disabled passengers, bus operators and training providers. The Department for Transport’s inclusive transport strategy commits to developing a disability equality and awareness training package that is to be made available to transport operators by the summer of 2020.

Much is already being done in Scotland through the bus stakeholder group, which I chair, and Transport Scotland’s annual accessibility delivery plan for 2019-20, which has a workstream that is dedicated to bus accessibility. We continue to work closely with the Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland and bus operators to ensure on-going improvements in bus accessibility. I assure members that I will consider whether there are, within our existing competence, further measures that we can take through guidance on accessibility.

The Bus Services Act 2017 made amendments to the Equality Act 2010 to provide powers in relation to accessible information. The Scottish Government formally responded to the DFT’s consultation on its proposals for future accessible information regulations. We expect that that will result in improvements in provision of accessible information.

Amendment 154 relates to a reserved matter and is not necessary, so I urge members to vote against it.

Colin Smyth: Anyone who says that amendment 154 is unnecessary is simply not listening to Scotland's disabled people. I and, I am sure, many members have heard first-hand about the problems and barriers that are put in the way of disabled people as a result of lack of information or poor disability awareness training.

Although the right to accessible information is covered by the Equality Act 2010, the reality is that that is simply not being delivered. New legislation is under way to improve on-board journey information, but nothing is being done to improve access to the information that customers need in advance of a journey. Why should members have easy access to a bus timetable in a format that they can read but a blind person cannot?

Mike Rumbles: I thank Colin Smyth for taking an intervention. I realise that he is winding up and that I cannot contribute to the debate without making an intervention.

I was surprised by what the cabinet secretary said about the matter being reserved. Training is not a reserved matter. If there was some dubiety about that, the Presiding Officer would not have selected amendment 154 because it would not have been admissible. I am sure that the Presiding Officer will correct me if I am wrong. Does Colin Smyth agree with me?

The Presiding Officer: I say to be helpful that I do not rule on the competence of amendments; I rule on their admissibility only.

Colin Smyth: Mike Rumbles has made a very important point. The cabinet secretary implied that the proposal is somehow outwith our powers. I have been very careful to avoid lodging amendments that are outwith the Scottish Parliament's competence. The Scotland Act 1998 states that the Scottish Parliament cannot promote equal opportunities through regulation or prohibition, but it allows us to encourage promotion of equal opportunities. That is exactly what amendment 154 would do by linking the new requirements to bus service operator grants. I am very clear that that is within the Parliament's competence.

Existing equalities legislation is a floor, not a ceiling, for our ambition to have a more equal Scotland. Amendment 154 gives us an opportunity to take another, albeit small, step towards far greater equality in Scotland.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 154 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 34, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 154 disagreed to.

After section 37

The Presiding Officer: Group 14 is on ticketing arrangements. Amendment 155, in the name of Jamie Greene, is grouped with amendments 72 to 74 and 129.

Jamie Greene: At stage 2, we had a wide-ranging discussion about smart ticketing and the

intention behind part 3 of the bill. It is not a huge part, but it is important. There is a genuine, cross-party desire to improve and to make better use of smart ticketing technology, and the reason for that is simply to encourage take-up of public transport. We feel that there are barriers to access and many reasons why people will not move from their cars to buses. Other than price and reliability, one of the main reasons that has come up is confusion about pricing and the ability to pay.

The REC Committee looked at the subject during the bill's passage and I have chosen to bring back one specific issue, which is contactless payment. As we know, the use of contactless payment is on the up on most forms of transport. I think that the majority of sensible operators are introducing it anyway because, by default, it increases patronage, makes it easier for people to pay and, therefore, increases revenues into the services. That is happening anyway, but it is still not happening in many other places, and we believe that the bill can go further and be more ambitious if the Government takes the lead on that.

My amendment 155 says:

"The Scottish Ministers must ... make provision requiring that contactless payment options are available as soon as reasonably practicable throughout Scotland".

There is no immediate mandate and we are not suggesting any recourse against operators that do not introduce it with immediate effect, but it is important that the Government shows some leadership on the issue, and the way for it to do that is to make regulations and bring to Parliament a proposal that says, "This is our plan and our strategy for rolling out contactless payment on all forms of transport right across the country." The Government can do that in a reasonable way and we reworded the amendment for that reason. It would allow the Government some flexibility as to how and when it did that, but I would absolutely like to see it happen, and I hope that members will support me.

The other amendments in the group, which the cabinet secretary has lodged, are largely technical and we are happy to support them.

I move amendment 155.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 72 and the other amendments in the group.

Michael Matheson: Jamie Greene's amendment 155 would oblige the Scottish ministers to make regulations

"requiring that contactless payment options are available as soon as reasonably practicable throughout Scotland for payment for entitlement to travel."

Mr Greene lodged the same amendment at stage 2, as he said. I said at stage 2 that the amendment seemed unnecessary, and I remain of that view. Contactless payment technology is already rolling out at a considerable pace. ScotRail, all major bus operators and a number of other modes already accept contactless payment at stations and on board.

In the short time since stage 2, we have seen further growth, with Lothian Buses extending contactless payment to all its buses, and 29 smaller operators have determined commercial demand and return on investment to take advantage of our £1.1 million smart pay grant fund, meaning that more than 80 per cent of buses in Scotland now accept contactless payment.

16:30

Additionally, it should be noted that regulations made under amendment 155 could not require railway service operators to provide contactless options. Such provision would fall outwith the Scottish ministers' devolved competence on the basis that it relates to the regulation of passenger railway services, which is a reserved matter.

For those reasons, I ask Jamie Greene to withdraw amendment 155. If it is pressed, I urge members to reject it.

Amendments 72 and 73 make minor clarifying amendments to the list of persons with whom ministers must consult before making a ticketing scheme.

Amendment 74 clarifies that the ticketing provisions in the Transport (Scotland) Act 2001, as amended by the bill, will continue to apply to Edinburgh tram services. It also allows for the provisions to apply to any new tramway services that might be proposed in future.

Amendment 129 makes a minor formatting change to the 2001 act.

Stewart Stevenson (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP): I support what Jamie Greene is trying to do, but the implementation of amendment 155 would fall short of what we require in a number of respects.

In his comments, Jamie Greene referred to all forms of transport. Let me give an example of a genuine difficulty with that. On a visit to Barra, I rented a cycle for my visit to Vatersay from a little shed at the back of someone's house. It was a little business renting out bicycles and it was being run by students at the high school on Barra.

The phrase "all forms of transport" would catch that small business. I do not think that the school students should be denied the opportunity to run a cash business renting out a form of transport.

Similarly, by not defining the transport involved, amendment 155 would catch air travel, taxis, and so on, not just the hire of bicycles on Barra.

There are also a couple of issues that ought to give us modest concern. In many parts of Scotland, contactless payment will need the customer to be able to get a mobile phone signal. It might come as news to some—not Jamie Greene, I am sure—that there is not yet a mobile phone signal everywhere. At home, we have no mobile phone signal. Pockets like that will probably remain, so the amendment discriminates against rural areas.

Also, the requirement for contactless payment methods might increase the pressure to restrict the ways in which people can pay. I do not, but many of my generation want to continue to use cash, so we would like there to be a requirement for transport operators also to take cash for those who want to use it.

Although I admire the ambition of the amendment and support the philosophical view behind it, I cannot find myself supporting it in the form in which it is presented.

Jamie Greene: I thank Stewart Stevenson for his input but it is worth pointing out that I am not saying that contactless is the only option; it is an additional method of payment, and I think that it would be welcome. Amendment 155 does not say to Bob's Bikes in Barra that he would need to use contactless as the only method to receive payment.

The amendment refers to the Transport (Scotland) Act 2001 and I am pretty sure that bicycle rental is not covered by that anyway.

In my opening, I might have referred to all forms of transport but the amendment does not cover that. The amendment says that I would like the Government to lay regulations to ensure that the roll-out of contactless increases. As the minister said, it is happening organically, which is great news, and I congratulate those who are using it, but we want to see it rolled out everywhere.

In much of Scotland, many forms of transport are not just cash only, but exact change only. That is still a barrier to people who are used to using a bank card or mobile phone to pay for access to a service elsewhere in the country. This amendment is helpful. It does not force everyone to use contactless payments or to accept only contactless payment; rather, it asks the Government to take the lead and come forward with a plan on how to roll it out as far as reasonably possible. For that reason, I will press amendment 155.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 155 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 69, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 155 disagreed to.

Section 38—Ticketing schemes

Amendments 72 and 73 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

After section 40

Amendment 74 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 41A—Travel concession schemes: application to community transport

The Presiding Officer: Group 15 is on community transport services. Amendment 75, in the name of the cabinet secretary, is grouped with amendments 76 and 121 to 125.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 75, 76 and 125 in this group clarify the use of the term “community transport services” that is used in sections 41A and 68B of the bill.

In section 41A, which creates a one-time reporting requirement for the Scottish ministers, amendments 75 and 76 remove the term and make it clear that any additional transport services that come within the ambit of the report are those which ministers consider appropriate.

In section 68B of the bill, which places a duty on health boards discharging certain functions, amendment 125 provides that the prescription of any other transport services for the purposes of those functions is to be done by regulations.

Amendments 121 to 124 remove references to “health and social care partnership” from sections 68A and 68B. That term has no meaning in the legal framework around health boards and is therefore unnecessary.

All the amendments in this group seek only to provide clarity and effectiveness to amendments that were accepted at stage 2; they do not alter the effect or intention of the amended sections and I urge members to accept my amendments in this group.

I move amendment 75.

Amendment 75 agreed to.

Amendment 76 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 47—Exceptions to parking prohibitions

The Presiding Officer: Group 16 is on parking prohibitions: applications and exemptions. Amendment 77, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 78 to 80, 22 and 133.

Colin Smyth: It is important that the proposed ban on pavement parking works as effectively as possible. Significant concerns have been raised about the potential unintended consequences of the exceptions for deliveries and collections. Amendments 77 and 79 would remove the

exceptions from the bill and require ministers to replace them with secondary legislation.

My intention is not to remove the exceptions entirely, as I appreciate that they serve a purpose. However, given the serious concerns that have been raised about the current wording of the provision, it is not appropriate to have it in the bill. Putting the exceptions in secondary legislation would allow for additional consultation to ensure that the wording works, and would ensure that it can be easily amended if it acts as a loophole, as many people fear that it will.

My aim is simply to avoid a situation in which primary legislation is required if the Government wants to make what would be a minor change to this section of the bill.

Amendment 78, in the name of Michael Matheson, will remove a requirement in one of the exceptions to leave pavements unobstructed. The addition of a requirement to leave a space of at least 1.5m at all times was a key improvement to the bill at stage 2 and I do not support undoing that. It is fundamentally important that the ban puts an end to cars obstructing pavements, and protecting the requirement to leave a space of 1.5m in the case of all exceptions is key to that.

I am sympathetic to amendment 80, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, which looks to introduce an exception for community transport services. However, I am not clear on the circumstances in which the exception would apply, and it does not include a requirement to leave a space of 1.5m to avoid obstructing the pavement, as other exceptions in the bill currently do.

I move amendment 77.

Michael Matheson: Section 47(6) sets out the exceptions that relate to vehicles that are parked in the course of business. Amendment 77 seeks to remove that subsection from the bill, and amendment 79 seeks to replace it at the end of section 47 with a regulation-making power.

Amendments 77 and 79 are very similar to those sought by Mr Smyth at stage 2. However, with amendment 79, Mr Smyth seeks to introduce a new subsection that would enable regulations to be made that would impose

“such other conditions as the Scottish Ministers consider necessary”.

As no procedure has been cited for the regulations, they would attract the negative parliamentary procedure. In effect, that would mean that the aspects of section 47 that attracted the most debate at stage 2 would be re-enacted with amendments in subordinate legislation with minimal parliamentary scrutiny.

Given the importance of the parking prohibitions and the recognised need to keep the operation of the exceptions as narrow as possible, the Scottish Government considers it preferable to rely instead on the powers in section 47(11) to modify the exceptions in future. As they are required to be made through the affirmative procedure, that would ensure greater opportunity for parliamentary scrutiny of the exceptions.

The purpose of amendment 78 is simply to clarify that if a driver is parked wholly in an existing parking bay on a pavement, they cannot be penalised for being in breach of the 1.5m restriction.

Amendment 80, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, seeks to add a further exception to allow a community bus service or

“other similar community transport service”

to double park when collecting or dropping off a passenger.

Unfortunately, the amendment has much the same drafting problems as it did at stage 2. The phrase

“other similar community transport service”

is a particularly vague term, which might lead to ambiguity about which vehicles it applies to.

I recognise that there might be circumstances in which exceptions should be made to parking prohibitions for certain road users, but it is vital that we properly and clearly define those groups to avoid weakening the prohibitions. That is one of the reasons why we took the regulation-making power in section 47(11) to which I referred.

I am happy to commit to consider introducing regulations that address the issue—following detailed consultation with community bus services and other providers—to ensure that we properly capture the services that need to be exempted.

Amendment 22, in the name of Graham Simpson, seeks to require that the regulations that are made under section 44(1) are made by affirmative rather than negative procedure.

The regulations will contain procedures for the making of exemption orders by local authorities. They are procedural and technical in nature and, as such, the Government considers that the negative procedure provides an appropriate level of parliamentary scrutiny.

However, I recognise the importance of the exemption orders process to the overall effectiveness of the pavement parking prohibition and would therefore be content for the regulations to undergo the more detailed scrutiny that the affirmative procedure affords.

Amendment 133, in my name, simply changes the long title of the bill to reflect the addition of the prohibition of parking at dropped footways at stage 2.

I urge members to support amendments 78, 22 and 133 and to reject amendments 77, 79 and 80.

16:45

Rachael Hamilton (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con): For those who cannot access private transport, community transport providers are vital in order to attend health appointments, see friends and engage with their community. In the words of the Community Transport Association, they are a “lifeline” for more than 100,000 Scots. I heard what the cabinet secretary said; therefore, I will not move my amendment 80. I am happy for him to scrutinise the matter through regulations instead.

With regard to the other amendments, we do not support amendments 77 and 79, in the name of Colin Smyth. We believe that they would replace current provisions in the bill with something worse and hinder the day-to-day operations of many businesses.

I am happy to support amendments 78 and 133, in the name of the cabinet secretary. We are also happy to support amendment 22, in the name of my colleague, Graham Simpson, because it would improve scrutiny of pavement parking orders.

Graham Simpson (Central Scotland) (Con): As the cabinet secretary outlined, amendment 22 deals with the procedure that ministers would use for laying regulations on the way that councils should go about making areas exempt from pavement parking provisions subject to the affirmative procedure. If we ban parking on pavements, which I believe will be the outcome today, there could be issues in areas where roads are not wide. Councils will come under pressure to exempt some areas. They will have to operate under the regulations that are laid by the Scottish Government, so it is vital that Parliament can see those regulations, scrutinise them and accept or reject them. That is why the affirmative procedure is most appropriate. I am glad to have the cabinet secretary's support.

Sandra White (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP): I am over the moon that we have come to this part of the bill. People want to get on with the job, so I will speak to the amendments.

With regard to amendment 77, I understand where Colin Smyth is coming from. I had a chat with Colin and Living Streets Scotland with regard to secondary legislation. However, I cannot support the amendment. Colin Smyth said that it could take time. We have waited long enough for

the rules and regulations on pavement parking to come in. Leaving out the whole of section 47(6) is a big mistake, and I could not support that. I cannot support amendment 79, because it would drag the process out for too long. Those amendments would mean that the restriction on pavement parking, in order that people who are disabled are able to get along the pavement, would be lost. I fear that we would not get that back.

I support amendment 78, because of everything that the cabinet secretary said. I am pleased that amendment 80 will not be moved. We will look at that issue again, because there is a lot of sympathy for amendment 80. I will support amendment 133; I hope that everyone will support it. It sums up everything that has gone through the bill. I thank members and everyone who has contributed. I am happy to support amendment 22, in the name of Graham Simpson. He is right that we will probably need to look further afield when local councils get the responsibilities.

Mike Rumbles: At stage 2, I lodged five amendments on the issue of leaving a 1.5m gap as a compromise between the positions of the people who wanted a complete ban on pavement parking and the people who realised that businesses need to function and that a complete ban would cause real difficulties. I was particularly taken by the evidence that we heard at stage 1 from non-commercial organisations such as Living Streets and others concerned with disability access. They said that, if the 1.5m gap was there and not obstructed, it was a reasonable compromise between those two arguments. I am, therefore, disappointed that Colin Smyth has lodged his amendment.

John Mason: As Mike Rumbles knows, I was on the committee when we put forward the idea of a 1.5m gap, which I thought was a compromise. However, when I wrote to the 32 local authorities, I got very little support for the idea because they felt that it would be impractical.

Mike Rumbles: That is a fair point. However, I listened to the organisations that gave evidence to the committee at stage 1—as, I am sure, did John Mason—and I understood them to be satisfied with the 1.5m gap as a compromise. Therefore, as I say, I am disappointed that Colin Smyth has decided that he wants to take out section 47(6) altogether and give the power to ministers to impose regulations. I am pleased that the minister said that he does not want to do that. The amendments that I lodged at stage 2 were made in consultation with the minister. I may be getting him into trouble with my praise for his approachability on the subject, but we got together and worked out that compromise. I thought that

the committee was happy with that, so I am disappointed that the issue has come back.

I will also comment on the fact that one of my stage 2 amendments will be taken out by the minister's amendment 78. He is correct and I support him on that. It was a technical amendment and I think that we went too far, because the section refers to a parking place. I hope that the other four of my previous amendments will remain in the bill, because I remind everybody that the 1.5m gap is a compromise. There were people who wanted a complete ban, and I understand where they were coming from because there is nothing more irritating for disabled people or mums or dads with prams than having to move on to the road, given the danger that that poses. The compromise ensures that there is a 1.5m gap, and that, surely, is the right thing.

Jamie Greene: I want to bring some other points to the conversation, which has been largely technical. This is the only opportunity that we have to talk about pavement parking and double parking, and I have some observations that are important to make for people outside the debate who are wondering what effect the legislation will have on them.

I am positive about tackling pavement parking and double parking; it is good that we have cross-party support on them and that the bill is tackling them. However, the past few weeks are testament to the fact that it is important that we pass bills that make sense and that can be implemented in a logical and practical way.

I want to point out a couple of things that people are still unsure about, or have reservations about. I do not know whether the minister will be able to address them after we have passed the bill, through regulations or other secondary legislation, but we need to take them into account.

First, we all have streets in our areas on which the local authority actively encourages pavement parking for the simple reason that it keeps cars off the road and allows carriageways to be passable. The big question, if we legislate to ban that practice, is where those cars will go. Displacement has cropped up throughout the debate and we have not found a solution for it. If cars are moved from the pavement on to the road and the road becomes impassable, those people will have to park elsewhere.

The Presiding Officer: Mr Greene, I do not want to stop you, but we are speaking specifically to the amendments in group 16. Your remarks are important, but they should have been made at stage 2. If you have remarks that are pertinent to the amendments in the group, please continue.

Jamie Greene: Thank you, Presiding Officer: I will bring my remarks back to the amendments in

group 16. They concern instances in which we would create exemptions. The key is to allow local authorities to decide which streets can be exempt from the legislation.

On waiting times, which Colin Smyth's amendments address, we still have to allow for delivery of goods and services and we have to let taxis and other vehicles go about their normal business, but do so in the spirit that the bill is trying to achieve. We are all very sympathetic to what it is trying to achieve, but none of the amendments in the group addresses how local authorities will tackle the matter of displacing cars from pavements on to the roads. That is something that we need to be aware of when we go back to our constituencies.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Greene. Those were important points, and I did not want to cut you off. I was just making sure that we stick to the amendments.

Colin Smyth: The potential problems that will be created by the deliveries exemption to the pavement parking ban have been raised over and over again since the bill was introduced. Given the importance of a workable and effective ban on pavement parking, it would be irresponsible simply to bury our heads in the sand and to keep ignoring the warnings. If the current provision in the bill is fine, as the cabinet secretary and others argue, it would work just as well in secondary legislation as it would in primary legislation. Amendment 77 would not change the provision. There seems to be confusion among some members about that.

If the exemption creates problems in practice, regulations can easily be changed to deal with that. That will not be the case if the provision remains in primary legislation. Therefore, nothing would be lost by moving the exemption from the bill into secondary legislation. Sandra White said that that would cause delays, but it would not. It is a change from primary legislation to secondary legislation, but the provision would remain.

Mike Rumbles: The point that I was trying to make is that it is surely our job to interrogate the proposed legislation, and it is for us to be able to amend the bill. If the provision were to be transferred to regulations at a future date, the provision would be delayed. We cannot amend regulations as they come in—we must just accept them or reject them. Hard work has been done on the matter. It would be remiss of us to take the provision out of the bill. We are doing our job.

Colin Smyth: At stage 1 of the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee's deliberations on the bill, Mike Rumbles argued completely the opposite position—that the provision should be moved from primary to secondary legislation. It is fine to say that if it does not work we can change the law, but

changing primary legislation is a very lengthy and complex process, whereas changing secondary legislation is not.

Mike Rumbles: Will the member take another intervention?

Colin Smyth: I do not have time.

Mike Rumbles: You said things that are not true.

Members: Oh!

Colin Smyth: Presiding Officer, the only thing that I can do is refer Mike Rumbles to the stage 1 report, which was unanimously agreed by all members of the committee.

Nothing in the provision would be lost by moving the exemption from the bill to secondary legislation. That would act as a safeguard to ensure that the exemption did not act as a loophole or undermine the ban. I hope that members will support what is, frankly, a commonsense amendment.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 77 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)

Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)

Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 29, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 77 disagreed to.

17:00

Amendment 78 moved—[Michael Matheson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 78 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)

Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and
 Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)
 (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse)
 (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)
 (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 89, Against 30, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 78 agreed to.

Amendment 79 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 79 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)

Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)

Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 29, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 79 disagreed to.

Amendment 80 not moved.

Colin Smyth: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. During the debate on group 16, Mike Rumbles got to his feet and in effect accused me of misleading Parliament over a recommendation that was made by the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee at stage 1 of the bill. That recommendation, which was unanimously agreed by members of the committee, said:

“The Committee believes that the exemption in the bill to allow 20 minutes for loading and unloading of deliveries may have the unintended consequence of creating a national exemption for pavement parking by commercial vehicles. However, more fundamentally, it is concerned that the 20 minute time limit is an arbitrary one and, on that basis, it questions the appropriateness of including this provision in legislation ... The Committee therefore calls on the Scottish Government to bring forward an amendment at Stage 2 to remove the 20 minute exemption for deliveries and loading from the Bill. It considers that a more appropriate and workable mechanism for managing commercial delivery and loading arrangements should be developed and included in guidance.”

As that recommendation was supported by all members of the committee, it was inappropriate for one of them to accuse me of misleading Parliament when I made that point in the course of the debate.

The Presiding Officer: I am sure that members will be grateful for the clarification. [*Interruption.*]

Before I deal with the point of order, I point out that there are clearly disputes between members on matters of opinion, which are matters for them. I advise members that we are currently falling behind schedule. Such matters are simply ones on which members disagree; they are not the same as voting matters. I therefore encourage members—

Mike Rumbles rose—

The Presiding Officer: I will take a point of order from Mr Rumbles.

Mike Rumbles: On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

I cannot let that go by. For more than 20 years, I have argued that the chamber is the place where we discuss legislation—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order, please. Let us hear Mr Rumbles.

Mike Rumbles: Since I was first elected here more than 20 years ago, I have consistently argued that the chamber is the place to discuss legislation. That is us doing our job. What I objected to was Colin Smyth's standing up and saying that I had previously argued for the provision to be moved from primary to secondary legislation. He knows that not to be true, but he still said it. It was wrong of him to do so. I have made my point; I hope that Colin Smyth will withdraw what he said.

The Presiding Officer: I reiterate that such matters are not points of order for the chair to rule on; they are simply matters of opinion or points of dispute between members. Both members have made their points very clearly. I suggest that we now move on to the next group of amendments.

After section 47B

The Presiding Officer: Group 17 is on caravan parking prohibition. Amendment 156, in the name of Jeremy Balfour, is the only amendment in the group.

Jeremy Balfour: We move to perhaps the key amendment of the afternoon. So that there is no misunderstanding, I state that I am a great fan of caravans—I was caravanning at Easter.

Amendment 156 falls under part 4, which covers "Exceptions to parking prohibitions". It would add a new section, which is designed to ensure that caravans cannot be parked on a public road

"unless the owner of the caravan has received written permission from the local authority."

That may seem to be a slightly technical issue, but I am aware that caravans being parked on public roads is becoming a big issue, particularly in the Lothians, although I have received representations from other parts of Scotland, too.

Amendment 156 would bring an end to the practice of caravans being parked for long periods—I am talking about months or even years—in residential neighbourhoods, quite often some distance away from the caravan owner's house. Those caravans are blocking valuable parking spaces for local residents and reducing visibility and safety for pedestrians and road users.

Amendment 156 would give the necessary authority to local councils and the police to remove those caravans from our streets. I have spoken to councillors in Edinburgh, Midlothian and other parts of Scotland, and they fully support that move.

John Finnie: I may have missed it, but has the member produced an equality impact assessment for his proposal, particularly in relation to the disproportionate impact that it would have on the Gypsy Traveller community?

Jeremy Balfour: The member raises a really interesting point. My proposal would have no impact at all on Gypsy Travellers, because they do not park on roads but in appropriate places.

In areas such as Edinburgh's Portobello beach, caravans have been parked up for several months, which has caused residents major problems. Under current legislation, the council and the police are powerless to move the caravans on. Many caravan users use the loophole in the law to park their caravans for free, rather than using the caravan sites and compounds that are designated and readily available for the safe long-term storage of caravans.

Amendment 156 would ensure that caravans are stored in the correct facilities away from carriageways, which would improve access and safety for local road users and communities. I urge members to accept my amendment.

I move amendment 156.

John Finnie: It is apparent that the member has not done an equality impact assessment. If he had done, he would have had due regard to my earlier point about the disproportionate impact on the Gypsy Traveller community.

The member's focus seems to be entirely urban, but the Parliament must play its part in addressing the long-standing discrimination against that group of individuals who move about—theirs is a mobile lifestyle. I fail to understand how some of the language that he has used is at all helpful. I urge members not to support the amendment.

Michael Matheson: Jeremy Balfour's amendment 156 seeks to introduce a national ban on parking caravans, including motorhomes, on a road adjacent to a footway.

I am unclear about the reasoning behind the proposed national ban, but the practical effect would be that no one would be allowed to park their caravan or motorhome on the road outside their house, nor would they be able to park on a street and pop into a local shop to buy something, without having local authority permission to do so. I assume that it is not Mr Balfour's intention for his amendment to be so extremely far-reaching.

Jeremy Balfour: What is the difference between my proposal and a person having to get a permit in order to park their car outside their house? Surely those are very similar things.

Michael Matheson: Someone who was heading off for the weekend with their caravan and who chose to pull over and stop at a shop for the purpose of buying something would find that they were not permitted to do so, purely because there happened to be a footway beside the road, without the permission of a local authority. Frankly, that is somewhat ridiculous.

If the amendment is trying to deal with people residing in caravans that are parked on streets, that issue is already addressed in legislation. Additionally, the police have extensive powers regarding obstruction, if it is considered that a caravan is parked in such a way as to cause an obstruction. Local authorities also have the power to introduce a traffic regulation order if an issue arises in a specific area.

In addition, amendment 156 is technically deficient in that the regulation-making power in subsection (4), although on the face of it extremely broad, would not permit subordinate legislation to be introduced that would enable effective enforcement; an express power to create an offence or to introduce a civil penalty would be needed. The prohibition is also not tied to the existing enforcement mechanisms in the bill for the other parking prohibitions.

Finally, and importantly, this issue was not raised in evidence at stage 1 or at any point during the passage of the bill. Introducing such a sweeping and flawed prohibition at this late stage in the process is not a good way to go about making law. I therefore urge members to reject amendment 156.

Jeremy Balfour: In light of the cabinet secretary's remarks about the technicalities, I seek leave to withdraw amendment 156.

Amendment 156, by agreement, withdrawn.

Section 48—Imposition of penalty charges

Amendment 81 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 81 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 31, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 81 agreed to.

Amendment 82 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 82 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)

Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 31, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 82 agreed to.

Section 49—Enforcement of parking prohibitions

Amendment 83 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 83 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)

Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 87, Against 31, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 83 agreed to.

Section 51—Removal of motor vehicles parked contrary to parking prohibitions

17:15

The Presiding Officer: Group 18 is on the requirement to consult before making regulations on the removal, moving and disposal of vehicles. Amendment 157, in the name of Graham Simpson, on behalf of the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, is grouped with amendments 158 and 159.

Graham Simpson: Amendments 157 to 159 are in my name, but I lodged them on behalf of the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee. As members know, one of the committee's primary functions is to ensure that delegated powers in bills are appropriate. Like the rest of the

Parliament, we want to ensure that the legislation that is on the statute book is fit for purpose. Sections 51(1), 52(1) and 53(1) create regulation-making powers, using the negative procedure, about the removal, moving and potential disposal of motor vehicles when they are parked on a pavement or adjacent to a dropped footway or are double parked.

At stage 1, the Government said that the use of secondary legislation will allow proposals to be developed and consulted on, but there is no express requirement to consult in sections 51 to 53. Although the committee looks at each power on its merits, the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 has similar regulation-making powers in which the Scottish ministers are required to consult such representative organisations as they think fit. The committee noted that powers to remove, move and dispose of vehicles engaged the right that is guaranteed under article 1 of protocol 1 of the European convention on human rights to peaceful enjoyment of property.

At stage 1, the committee asked the Government whether it would be more appropriate for a requirement to consult representative organisations to be set out in the bill. The Government said that it is a matter of standard practice when promoting any transport-related secondary legislation to consult a wide range of representative bodies. During the cabinet secretary's evidence to the committee, he added that he was "very open" to the committee's views and was "happy" to give further consideration to having a requirement to consult on the bill to

"put the matter beyond doubt."—[*Official Report, Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 23 October 2018; c 15.*]

However, no such amendments were lodged at stage 2 and, after a further request from the committee last week, the Scottish Government confirmed that it did not plan to lodge any such amendments at stage 3.

Although the committee has no reason to doubt the Scottish Government's commitment to consult on the regulations, we need to ensure that the legislation is fit for purpose for the Government of the day and any future Government. I lodged amendments 157 to 159 on behalf of the committee to reflect that aim.

I move amendment 157.

Jamie Greene: I thank the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee for its input on the bill. We wait to hear the Government's position, so all I will say is that I hope that the Government will reflect on the issue. It is unprecedented and unusual for a committee to intervene in such a way with amendments of this nature. I hope that

members on the Government benches will support the committee.

Michael Matheson: Amendments 157 to 159 seek to introduce a requirement that, prior to making regulations under sections 51(1), 52(1) and 53(1), the Scottish ministers consult

“such persons or organisations as appear to them to be representative of drivers and other road users, and ... such other persons as they consider appropriate.”

As pointed out in discussions with the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee when the matter was raised at stage 1, it is the Scottish Government’s practice to undertake consultations when bringing forward any new legislation. Consultations are held with a wide range of representative bodies, including, where appropriate, organisations that are representative of drivers, and the process for making the regulations under these sections will be no different.

Although the Scottish Government does not consider there to be a need for a requirement in the bill to consult certain bodies, we recognise that putting a requirement in the bill puts the matter beyond doubt. I am therefore willing to accept the amendments as written.

Amendment 157 agreed to.

Section 52—Moving motor vehicles parked contrary to parking prohibitions

Amendment 158 moved—[Graham Simpson]—and agreed to.

Section 53—Disposal of removed motor vehicles

Amendment 159 moved—[Graham Simpson]—and agreed to.

After section 54

Amendment 84 moved—[Michael Matheson]—and agreed to.

Section 57—Ministerial guidance

Amendment 85 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 85 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 75, Against 29, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 85 agreed to.

After section 58

The Presiding Officer: We move to group 19. We have just passed the agreed time limit, so, under rule 9.8.4A, I will allow the debate to continue, but I will limit it to members who have a right to speak on the amendments in the group—

Claudia Beamish (South Scotland) (Lab): Oh, no.

The Presiding Officer: May I have an indication of how many members want to speak on the amendments in this group?

Cabinet secretary and Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans, I see that quite a few members want to speak on the matter. We missed the cut-off by seconds—by one minute, in fact—and standing orders suggest that if that happens members can contribute only if they intervene on members who have amendments in the group. The alternative is that one of you moves, and I accept, a motion without notice to move the timeline by—let us say—up to 10 minutes, which will have the effect of knocking out every timeline, including decision time, by 10 minutes. We would put such a motion to a vote, of course. Cabinet secretary, are you minded to take that approach?

Michael Matheson: I am keen to accommodate members who want to speak, and I will be happy

for them to make interventions during my speech, if that enables them to make their points.

The Presiding Officer: Rather than move the timeline.

Michael Matheson: Rather than move the timeline.

The Presiding Officer: Very well. In that case, I suggest to members who want to speak in the debate on group 19, which will be limited, that you need to make an intervention on one of the members who is due to speak—Colin Smyth, Jamie Greene or the cabinet secretary. Indeed, if a member wishes to contribute to the debate, I urge them to intervene on Colin Smyth. Is that clear?

Group 19 is on other parking restrictions. Amendment 160, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendment 161.

Colin Smyth: Thank you, Presiding Officer. I will do my best to look for all members who wish to—

Mark Ruskell (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green): Will the member give way? [*Laughter.*]

Colin Smyth: I am happy to take intervention number 1.

Mark Ruskell: I thank Colin Smyth for giving way and I thank him for lodging amendment 160, which is similar to an amendment that I lodged at stage 2.

It is hugely important that we ensure that cycle lanes are safe and that we remove the danger of parked cars from cycle lanes. I know, from going out cycling with my children, that parked cars are a major hazard, which force cyclists to move around them, often into the door space of parked vehicles and even into a line of traffic coming in the opposite direction. It is important that we get a ban in place and I thank Colin Smyth for lodging amendment 160.

Colin Smyth: As Mark Ruskell said, amendment 160 aims to address an anomaly in parking enforcement in relation to cycle lanes. The law was changed to allow mandatory cycle lanes to be introduced without a traffic regulation order, in order to simplify the process and encourage local authorities to do that. However, as the law stands, only the police can enforce the ban on parking in cycle lanes that are introduced in that manner. That is a significant problem, given that the majority of councils in Scotland have now decriminalised parking enforcement. Currently, the only way to enforce the ban on parking in mandatory cycle lanes is for councils to go through the costly and time-consuming TRO process for each cycle lane in their area. That means that

although parking in cycling lanes is already banned, the ban is often, in effect, unenforceable.

Amendment 160 addresses that by adding an overarching ban on parking in mandatory cycle lanes to the Traffic Signs Amendment (Scotland) Regulations and General Directions 2018.

Claudia Beamish: Will the member take an intervention?

Sarah Boyack: Will the member take an intervention? [*Laughter.*]

Colin Smyth: I am happy to take an intervention.

Claudia Beamish: I strongly support this amendment from my colleague and friend Colin Smyth on the prohibition of parking in cycle lanes. For a long time, there has been regular discussion of cyclists' concerns about the issue in the cross-party group on cycling, walking and buses.

As an urban cyclist, I feel strongly that there are significant dangers to cyclists in having to regularly pull in and out of cycle lanes due to parked vehicles. There should be equal rights for road users, and this is a further opportunity to recognise that the car is no longer king. I ask members to please support Colin Smyth's amendment.

Colin Smyth: Amendment 160 will mean that all mandatory cycle lanes will be covered by the ban, so councils with decriminalised parking enforcement will have a legal basis on which to enforce it without the need for TROs. What is the point of procedures that rightly made it easier for councils to introduce mandatory cycle lanes without TROs, if we then make them impossible to enforce? My amendment removes that anomaly.

It is no secret that current cycling rates are just not good enough and fall well short of the Government's target.

Sarah Boyack: Many constituents have written to me on this matter. As we know from surveys, there is a particular issue for many women, for whom the perception of danger on our roads is one of the things that puts them off cycling. The situation is good for neither cyclists nor drivers, because cyclists have to divert from a lane that is marked for cycling on to the main road. A wider safety issue needs to be addressed.

I very much hope that we get this amendment through today.

Colin Smyth: I thank Sarah Boyack for that important intervention.

If the Government is serious about increasing cycling rates and making cycling safer, as Sarah Boyack alluded to, we should not accept barriers being put in the way of increasing the number of mandatory cycle lanes.

Amendment 161, in the name of Jamie Greene, also looks to address a problem created by the move to decriminalise parking enforcement, which relates to parking outside schools. I believe that his amendment, which requires consultation, is a reasonable way of looking into that issue. I am therefore happy to support it.

I move amendment 160.

Jamie Greene: I will restrict my comments to amendment 161 and thereby discourage people from intervening to talk about cycle lanes.

There is a wider point about asking the Government to look at the issues that amendments in this group seek to address. We have had a lot of correspondence on both those issues, which are important ones to consider.

We talked about them at stage 2, when I had a specific problem with the way that we enforce parking outside schools, and the fact that some local authority areas are decriminalised parking zones and others are not. The evidence is not just anecdotal; we have seen situations outside schools in which police officers enforce some rules and traffic wardens enforce others. We also know that many local authorities have a shortage of traffic wardens, who cannot be in all places outside schools during peak periods at the beginning and end of the day.

We all agree that we need to ensure that parking outside schools is done considerately and in a way that does not pose a safety risk. At the moment there are clearly issues, or at least a misunderstanding of the regulations. When we spoke about the issue at stage 2, the minister said that he would send a communiqué to local authorities on this matter. I do not think that that is enough.

Like Colin Smyth, what I want is a proper consultation with schools and local authorities. I want to hear their views and opinions on the matter. I would like the Government to ask for those opinions, take that information away and then come back and propose a way forward. That could include some of the provisions on how we address issues around cycling, too. There is still, clearly, an issue around enforcement in relation to people who park in cycle lanes and around the way people park outside schools. The sensible thing to do would be to take my approach, which is to ask the Government to consult and then come back to Parliament with a plan. I hope that members will support that.

17:30

Michael Matheson: Amendment 160, in the name of Colin Smyth, seeks to make parking in a mandatory cycle lane a criminal offence,

enforceable by the police. There are technical difficulties with the amendment that could make it difficult to enforce but, even if those were resolved, the Scottish Government would strongly oppose the amendment for several reasons.

First, the creation of a new criminal offence is at odds with the Scottish Government policy of decriminalising parking offences. The amendment seeks to create a new offence, enforceable by the police only, which is directly in contradiction with the focus on decriminalising parking enforcement.

Secondly, there are mandatory cycle lanes where loading is required at certain times of the day for access to shops and so on. A blanket prohibition on parking without exceptions for waiting or loading could have a severe impact on the operation of businesses along that route.

Thirdly, there would be nothing to stop a local authority introducing a mandatory cycle lane on any residential street without any form of consultation with the residents. Indeed, it could be seen by local authorities as a way of introducing parking restrictions without any need for a TRO.

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green): Will the member take an intervention?

Michael Matheson: I will give way to Mr Harvie, if he will smile.

Patrick Harvie: I am grateful to the member for giving way.

If the member is asking the chamber to accept that amendment 160 is simply the wrong way of achieving the aim, why has he not come forward with what he regards as the right way of achieving what is a clearly needed change in the way in which our cycle lanes are managed? This is a problem that people deal with every day throughout Scotland.

Michael Matheson: I am grateful for the fact that Mr Harvie smiled, and I assure him that I am about to set out how I will seek to address the issue.

As I pointed out at stage 2 when Mr Smyth attempted to address parking on cycle tracks, there is legislation in place to enable local authorities to regulate parking in cycle lanes, either by making the stretch of road a cycle track or by making a TRO to restrict parking. Creating even more legislation without considering the implications for all would not be helpful. However, I would like to undertake to include mandatory cycle lanes within the review of the TRO process that I have previously committed to and which will be undertaken in order to find a way to address these issues more effectively and do so through proper consultation.

Amendment 161, in the name of Jamie Greene, requires the Scottish ministers to hold a consultation with each local authority and each school in Scotland. I am afraid that the provision is vague about the scope or timescale of the consultation and does not suggest any particular matters that should be considered other than that of parking in the vicinity of a school.

Mr Greene put forward amendments in this area at stage 2, and I made a commitment to write to all local authorities that have DPE to remind them what powers they have and what they can do to enforce parking at or near schools. Policy officials also met Mr Greene after stage 2 and pointed out that many of the issues that he is looking to resolve are indeed already within the powers of local authorities. I therefore intend to pursue the issue with local authorities, to highlight and clarify the powers that they already have and to make them aware of the steps that have been taken in places such as Edinburgh and Glasgow under the current powers.

Given those two commitments, I urge members to reject amendments 160 and 161.

Colin Smyth: Amendment 160, in my name, aims to fix a problem that is causing significant problems for cyclists. It has been highlighted to the Government time and again, but the Government has failed to take action on it. Local government budgets are under huge pressure at the moment, and it is simply unfair to expect local authorities to undertake a full TRO process on every mandatory cycle lane in their area just to be able to enforce something that is already banned, given that recent regulations told councils that they did not need TROs when they set up those mandatory cycle lanes.

Not agreeing to my amendment will mean that councils will simply reduce the overall number of mandatory cycle lanes that they introduce. Is that what we want to see? Although I welcome the Government's commitment to review the TRO process, it is no reason to kick the issue into the long grass, especially when we have no idea when that might happen and what the eventual outcome will mean in this context. We have an opportunity to address the anomaly, and we should take it.

I have to say that I provided the wording of the amendment to the cabinet secretary's office and gave him an opportunity to suggest changes to it or raise any specific issues before I lodged it. However, he failed to take the opportunity to do that.

Parking in cycle lanes is a major hazard for cyclists. If the existing ban on parking in cycle lanes cannot be enforced, it is utterly meaningless. Given the clear and urgent need to increase the rates of cycling in Scotland, we should be doing all

that we can to ensure that it is a safe and practical option for people to use, not making it more difficult.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 160 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)

Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 34, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 160 disagreed to.

Amendment 161 not moved.

The Presiding Officer: Before we turn to group 20, which is the beginning of the debate on the workplace parking levy, I am minded to have a short suspension of seven and a half minutes. We will resume at 17:45.

17:37

Meeting suspended.

17:50

On resuming—

Section 58A—Workplace parking licensing schemes

The Presiding Officer: Group 20 is on workplace parking levy: process. Amendment 86, in the name of Jamie Halcro Johnston, is grouped with amendments 89, 162 to 165, 91, 110 and 127.

Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con): I know that there will be lots of discussions about the workplace parking levy, but I will focus on amendment 86, which is about the islands.

Amendment 86 is a fairly straightforward amendment, which will require that, if a local authority introduces a workplace parking levy scheme that extends to an island community, an island communities impact assessment will be conducted. That will give local authorities clear directions and a consistent island approach. At the moment, such impact assessments must be conducted only when a policy, strategy or service is, in the local authority's opinion, likely to have an effect on an island community that is significantly different from its effect on other communities.

Amendment 86 will ensure that the requirement for impact assessments is applied uniformly and will uphold the spirit of the Islands (Scotland) Act 2018. That will be particularly important in those council areas that contain island and mainland communities, where there is a greater risk of specific island needs being ignored.

There are many cases where island transport needs differ from those on the mainland. As Strathclyde Partnership for Transport stated,

"As is well established, Scotland is a country of contrasts and the 'one size fits all' approach is rarely fit for purpose in tackling transport issues. Therefore, while WPL may be considered appropriate in some places (e.g. large urban areas), it will likely not be an option for others (e.g. remote rural areas / islands)."

The managing director of Loganair, which provides lifeline air links to many of our island communities, has called the proposed levy "impractical and unreasonable" for its staff. Their situation is most pronounced at island airports,

where out-of-hours public transport links are often non-existent.

Although amendment 86 will not prevent a workplace parking levy from being introduced in an island community, it will ensure that due consideration is given to local circumstances and that problems such as poor public transport links can be fully taken into account. There are already burdens on workers in the islands. Transport from island to island already imposes an additional cost on commuters. Further additional costs might create more barriers to attracting people to live and work in our islands. Recruitment is a considerable issue for many businesses in the islands, including Highlands and Islands Airports Ltd.

John Finnie: I am listening intently to what the member is saying, but does he not trust the three island local authorities or, indeed, the mainland authorities that have islands to take all those factors on board when determining whether to introduce such a scheme in the first place?

Jamie Halcro Johnston: We are making sure that they have to do that, which is entirely reasonable.

Amendment 86 will ensure that island needs are actively reflected in any policy changes in this area.

The Scottish Conservatives will also support amendment 89, in the name of Colin Smyth, which requires an additional level of approval for workplace parking levy schemes. My colleagues Dean Lockhart and Michelle Ballantyne will speak to amendments 162 and 163, and 164 and 165, respectively.

I will also address the Government's amendments. Amendment 91 provides for a reporter to examine proposals to make, amend or revoke a workplace parking licensing scheme. That is not a particularly helpful approach and it builds up the administrative structure around the levy. We will oppose the amendment.

I move amendment 86.

Colin Smyth: Amendment 89 would require ministers to approve workplace parking levy schemes before they can be brought in. That would provide an additional layer of oversight to the process. Having two layers of scrutiny is generally considered good practice, which I presume is why ministers have that and other powers in relation to the creation of low-emission zones. I have difficulty in understanding why the bill introduces Government sign-off for low-emission zones but the Government does not want sign-off for a workplace parking levy. It seems that the Scottish Government simply wants

to wash its hands of an unpopular policy, pass the buck and duck its responsibility.

I am happy to support the rest of the amendments in the group, in particular those that call for more comprehensive analysis by local authorities of the impact of the levy on communities.

Dean Lockhart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Amendments 162 and 163 seek to ensure that adequate assessments are undertaken before a workplace levy can be introduced.

Amendment 162 requires a local authority to carry out an assessment of the impact that the levy may have on small and medium-sized enterprises in its area. In its submission to the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee, the Federation of Small Businesses in Scotland highlighted the need for local authorities to carry out proper consultation and impact assessments before the introduction of individual schemes. It said:

“We believe this section ... needs to place more detailed requirements upon local authorities in relation to a specific business impact assessment, including a small business assessment.”

The amendment would place on a statutory footing a requirement to assess the likely impact on SMEs. That could easily be done through consultation with small business representative groups or directly with small businesses in the local area.

Amendment 163 takes the principle of an impact assessment one step further by also requiring an assessment of the potential impact on employment levels in the local authority area. The assessment would evaluate whether the introduction of a workplace parking levy could lead to a decline in employment in the local authority area, which is a potential outcome if workers cannot afford to pay the levy and there are insufficient public transport links. If the workplace parking levy were shown to have a detrimental impact on employment levels or the business of small firms, the consequences for the community and the local economy could be far reaching and long lasting.

Local authorities should therefore be required to undertake those assessments and consider the findings before making a decision on whether to proceed with an individual scheme. I urge members to support small businesses in their constituencies and to support those amendments.

Michelle Ballantyne (South Scotland) (Con): Sadly, it is well documented that the job market is more difficult for people with disabilities. Research shows that disabled applicants have to apply for 60 per cent more jobs on average than their counterparts, and a disabled person in Scotland is

still twice as likely to be unemployed and actively seeking work as a non-disabled person.

The charity Scope estimates that having a disability costs a person an average of £583 per month. Furthermore, many disabilities mean that public transport may be far more stressful, or even impossible, for many people who would otherwise drive to work. Amendment 164 asks that local authorities specifically set out the impact that the workplace parking levy would have on disabled people who have either “physical or mental impairment”. It is important, because a focus on those people, rather than looking at persons “likely to be affected”, would require the local authority to assess what transport for disabled people is available in the area and how the levy would affect them.

Amendment 165 looks at low-pay and low-income households and again asks for a specific assessment of how the levy would affect those households. A Scottish Government report earlier this year identified that, of the working age population living in relative poverty, 59 per cent live in working households. The report says that the two main drivers of in-work poverty are low pay and low intensity, which covers many of the jobs that are offered by local authorities such as janitorial and administration staff and apprentices. It is entirely appropriate that any local authority wishing to implement a parking levy should check how the measures would impact on such groups. I urge the chamber to support those amendments.

Michael Matheson: Amendment 91, in my name, builds on John Finnie’s stage 2 amendment that gave the Scottish ministers and local authorities the power to cause a local inquiry to be held into a proposed workplace parking licensing scheme. On reflection, I am concerned that that approach might be too restrictive.

18:00

Therefore, amendment 91 provides flexibility, allowing for the examination of representations to be tailored and proportionate to the needs and circumstances of individual proposals. It will do so by allowing the Scottish ministers and local authorities to appoint a reporter who will decide whether to consider representations in writing, at a hearing, at a public inquiry or in some other way. The Scottish ministers will have the power to deal with the procedural aspects of those examinations. That is consistent with amendment 52, in my name, on low-emission zones, which was already debated. Amendment 91 retains the key principles of John Finnie’s stage 2 amendment, while making for a more responsive and flexible approach.

Amendment 110 allows the Scottish ministers to specify in regulations the manner in which local

authority accounts in relation to workplace parking licensing schemes must be published, bringing that into line with section 22 on low-emission zones.

Amendment 127 changes from negative to affirmative the parliamentary procedure for regulations under section 58B(5), which can vary the circumstances in which a workplace parking place is provided. That is in line with the view of the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee.

I ask members to support my amendments in the group.

Amendment 86, in the name of Jamie Halcro Johnston, is unnecessary. Local authorities proposing a workplace parking licensing scheme will have to prepare and publish an assessment of the impacts of the proposal, and an island communities impact assessment is already required to be carried out in appropriate circumstances under the Islands (Scotland) Act 2018.

Amendment 89, in the name of Colin Smyth, revisits an argument from stage 2, as it would require that the Scottish ministers sign off on each proposed scheme. The workplace parking licensing scheme is built on principles of localism and is underpinned by consultation and impact assessment requirements. As a result, I cannot support amendment 89.

Amendments 162 to 165 seek to extend the mandatory coverage of impact assessments in respect of a number of named groups. Given that there is an existing requirement to assess the likely effects on persons who might have to pay charges, those amendments are unnecessary.

I urge the other members with amendments in the group not to move them.

Alexander Burnett (Aberdeenshire West) (Con): I speak in support of Dean Lockhart's amendments regarding the car park tax, which will penalise rural communities that do not have the luxury of good public transport. Legislating for a workplace parking levy without first addressing poor public transport in Scotland—crucially, in the north-east—risks undermining income and job opportunities for my constituents and people in the wider region.

There is a risk that a tax imposed by Aberdeen City Council would impact directly on those who have no option but to work in the city and live in Aberdeenshire. That inequity is compounded by the fact that the revenue from the tax would not benefit those who paid it, and that those who set it would not be electorally accountable to those who paid it. The injustice of taxation without

representation goes against the principles of our democracy.

Our rural communities should not be penalised by the car park tax, so I urge members to support amendments 162 and 163.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: I will be brief, as I think that we will discuss the issue a little bit more. At the moment, whether an island communities impact assessment should be done is a matter for the local authority's opinion, so amendment 86 would give some reassurance to those living in the islands that the impact of a workplace parking levy on communities will be fully assessed by councils before any decisions are made.

I hope that members will support amendment 86.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 86 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinrossshire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 54, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 86 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Group 21 is on the workplace parking levy. Amendment 1, in the name of Neil Bibby, is grouped with amendments 2 to 21 and 134. I call Neil Bibby to move amendment 1 and to speak to all the amendments in the group.

Neil Bibby (West Scotland) (Lab): The purpose of my amendments is to remove provisions for a workplace parking levy from the Transport (Scotland) Bill. Members should be in no doubt that the levy is a regressive tax on workers that will hit the lowest paid hardest. It is not consequence free, it is not a solution to climate change and, far from incentivising modal shift, it penalises those for whom modal shift is not an option. It is not an option, because, for many working people, public transport in Scotland is not good enough.

John Finnie: Will the member take an intervention?

Neil Bibby: I would like to make some progress first.

Nottingham is the only place in the UK to have introduced the levy. In written evidence to this Parliament, the public sector union Unison said that, in Nottingham, its members found that

“increases to the workplace parking levy were widely passed on, had hit members hard and were not applied in a fair way.”

The Scottish Trades Union Congress says:

“The levy is also a flat tax which takes no account of affordability or fairness and therefore has a disproportionately negative impact on those with the lowest incomes.”

The Associated Society of Locomotive Engineers and Firemen—ASLEF—the train drivers’ union, whose members provide the services that make modal shift possible, says that it is an “outrageous” tax on

“people for turning up to work”.

As has been mentioned, Loganair, Scotland's only airline, has raised its concerns about it. The Scottish Wholesale Association says:

"Early and late shift patterns are not covered by public transport timetables. Staff starting at 5am have no alternative but to drive to work."

John Finnie: Will the member take an intervention at that point?

Neil Bibby: I will take the intervention if Mr Finnie can explain why he believes that working people in his region should have to pay to go to their work, when his motoring expenses are covered by the taxpayer.

John Finnie: I did not catch the member's last point. I was intervening on him. If he repeats the point, I am happy—

The Presiding Officer: Mr Finnie, please ask your question.

John Finnie: If there are all those downsides to the workplace car parking levy, would Mr Bibby explain why Labour-controlled Nottingham City Council introduced it and why it was in the manifestos of Edinburgh and Glasgow city Labour parties?

Neil Bibby: John Finnie did not take up my point about his motoring expenses. He has claimed £1,700 from the taxpayer.

The workplace parking levy in Nottingham was not introduced in isolation. The council invested in public transport before it introduced that levy. There is no guarantee that the Scottish National Party will use the levy to invest in transport.

No economic impact analysis has been conducted, and nothing that the Government has said convinces me that it has seriously considered the unintended consequences of the tax. Do not take my word for it—listen to the Educational Institute of Scotland. It believes that the levy poses a risk to "recruitment and retention" in the teaching profession. It is not the only profession that is worried. The Scottish Association of Social Work believes that it is wrong to place

"a charge on social workers to park at work, after using their cars to carry out essential work—much of this in emergency situations".

If the purpose of this go-to-work tax is to secure modal shift away from cars towards public transport, viable public transport options must be available to commuters. However, the reality for Scotland's commuters is that we have a joke of a rail service, and since the Scottish National Party came to power the number of bus passenger journeys has plummeted by 100 million and one fifth of all bus routes have been stripped out of the bus network. Public transport is broken under this Government and it needs to be fundamentally

transformed before we consider the workplace parking levy.

What about the views of the people? When Survation polled the Scottish public on attitudes to the workplace parking levy, it found that the people of Scotland opposed it. The Scottish Government has been unable to demonstrate any public support for the policy and, if we are talking about manifestos, the SNP Government made no reference at all to a workplace parking levy in its manifesto for the last election to this Parliament.

The SNP is not listening. It is not listening to the trade unions, the business community or the people of Scotland. The proposal has served no purpose other than to give the Scottish Green Party a reason to vote for an SNP budget, which has slashed core funding for the very councils that the Government says the levy is supposed to support. We cannot agree to the proposal for a workplace parking levy; we believe that it should be rejected and erased from the Transport (Scotland) Bill.

I move amendment 1.

Michael Matheson: I was disappointed that, on the very day that we debated the Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Bill, Neil Bibby lodged an amendment to remove the provisions on workplace parking from the Transport (Scotland) Bill. I am conscious that there is some confusion and concern within the Labour Party about the position that it has taken on the issue.

We know that Labour-controlled Nottingham City Council was the first to introduce a workplace parking levy in England. We also now know that Labour-controlled Birmingham City Council is consulting on introducing a levy and that Labour-controlled Oxford City Council is discussing the introduction of such a levy. It is not just me who is uncomfortable with the matter. I am conscious that members of Labour's shadow cabinet are uncomfortable with the issue, as we know from Claudia Beamish, who stated that she was "uncomfortable" with the position that her party holds. There are people in the Labour Party who believe that it is the right type of approach to take. For example, Edinburgh council's Labour leader, Cammy Day, said:

"This is not about taxing people, it's about saying we need to discourage the use of petrol and diesel cars coming into the city, it's about encouraging people to use bikes and public transport."

The one thing that is consistent is Labour's inconsistency on workplace parking levies.

Neil Bibby: Will the member take an intervention?

Michael Matheson: Mr Bibby is no doubt about to explain the Labour Party's hypocrisy on the issue.

Neil Bibby: I do not know whether the minister has realised that we are not in Birmingham, Oxford or Nottingham, but in Scotland. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order, please.

Neil Bibby: If the minister is so concerned about showing leadership on climate change and about modal shift, will he lead by example and be modally shifting himself out of his ministerial car to get to work every day?

Michael Matheson: I cannot vouch for Neil Bibby's ability on geography, but the last time that I checked we were in Edinburgh. I can also say that the workplace parking levy was in the Labour Party's manifesto for the council elections here. And the last time that I checked, Glasgow was also in Scotland.

The amendments that John Finnie introduced at stage 2 bring in a modest discretionary power for local authorities to introduce such a scheme. It is a power, not a duty. There is a high degree of local decision making in how a scheme is set up, with local authorities having wide powers to shape a scheme to meet local needs. There are detailed requirements to carry out impact assessments and to consult widely. Funds raised can be used only on activities to promote the objectives of local transport strategies and to meet the costs of those schemes. There is not one single solution to the climate emergency that we face. There needs to be a range of tools in the boxes of policy makers in order to address the issue.

18:15

Just two weeks ago, individuals, even some on the Labour benches, were lecturing us about the Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Bill, telling us that we must take bold, urgent action to tackle climate change. Well, let us see what Labour members mean by that today, and let us see whether they are prepared to take some of the bold, urgent action that is necessary. As ever when it comes to the Labour Party, it is just empty rhetoric, with no commitment to deliver on it. I urge members to oppose Neil Bibby's amendments.

The final amendment in the group, amendment 134 in my name, is a minor technical amendment to the long title of the bill to reflect that it now includes a provision on workplace parking licensing schemes. I urge members to support that amendment.

Mike Rumbles: I congratulate Neil Bibby on being fleet of foot and much quicker than me in

getting his amendments accepted at the chamber desk. I was right behind him, and I am in absolute agreement that his amendments should be agreed to, to remove the 20 sections concerned from the bill.

We have improved the bill today, and we did so at stage 2, with councils being able to run their own bus companies—and not just on unprofitable routes—and by banning pavement parking. I will remember the member's bill of my colleague Ross Finnie, and here we are. I am really pleased that we have supported all those measures.

John Finnie: Will the member take an intervention?

Mike Rumbles: Let me get moving first.

In our view from the Liberal Democrat benches, the 20 sections on workplace parking are being introduced contrary to the evidence that has been produced at the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee.

We have heard that Nottingham is the only place where that measure has been taken. All the local authorities throughout England have had the power for years. It might come as a surprise to the cabinet secretary that Birmingham is consulting on the measure, but it should not be a surprise to members of the committee, as we have known that Birmingham and other authorities have been consulting on it for a very long time—but they have still not moved forward with it.

John Finnie: Will the member take an intervention now?

Mike Rumbles: Just let me make some progress.

It is not just that Nottingham is the only place that has taken the measure. Why is it the only place that has done it? The evidence that we received was quite clear: that the administration in Nottingham has invested massively in public transport, because it was interested in behavioural change. Of the 20 sections of the bill that we are discussing, none is about behavioural change.

John Finnie: I am grateful to Mr Rumbles for taking an intervention.

Why, therefore, does the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities want the measure?

Mike Rumbles: It is funny that the member asks why COSLA would like the money. In our view, COSLA has been starved of funds by the Scottish Government through the budget that Mr Finnie supported. Mr Finnie should know the answer to his question very well.

I will return to the facts about Nottingham. That authority has invested a huge amount, and it has achieved behavioural change. However—and this

may come as a surprise to members—it has not reduced congestion and has not reduced the problems that vehicles have been causing in Nottingham. Has that come as a surprise? There is silence in the chamber—apart from—

John Mason: Will the member give way?

Mike Rumbles: Yes, of course I will.

John Mason: Would the member not accept that the evidence at committee was that the increase in congestion was less in Nottingham than elsewhere?

Mike Rumbles: I will accept—and I was just about to come on to this before Mr Mason's intervention—that the witnesses told us that it was impossible to measure the comparisons. They did not know. What they could measure was whether congestion had decreased or increased, and they measured the increase. The measure has not succeeded in its aim of reducing congestion.

Members need to be aware of the other advice that was given to the committee, if they are not aware of it already. The clear advice to us was that, for environmental reasons, whatever we do, we should not impose LEZs and the workplace parking levy at the same time. That was clear evidence from the witnesses from Nottingham. I am surprised that we are now going with both of them, against the advice of the people who gave us evidence.

The bill should be all about engaging behavioural change, which those 20 sections will not create. In the debate on previous amendments I was taken by the contribution of Alexander Burnett, who represents the same area that I do. I was very impressed by what he had to say. *[Interruption.]* I have just heard the cry, "I bet you are." To that, I say that I was impressed—I will give praise where it is due. Mr Burnett represents the people of Aberdeenshire West; I represent the same people, but at regional level. He made the point that if Aberdeen City Council were to adopt the workplace parking levy—under whichever administration that might be—it would hit hard the very many people who travel into the city. Despite the best efforts of Aberdeenshire Council, we in the region recognise that the public transport infrastructure to achieve behavioural change is not there—so what will happen? People's behaviour will not change; all that the levy will do is raise funds for Aberdeen City Council, which it needs because, as we all know, it is the local authority that is worst supported by central funding in this country. Therefore it is quite obvious that it might be tempted to go down the route of adopting the levy. However, that would hit the people whom I represent—

Mark McDonald (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind): Will Mr Rumbles advise what the council leaders

had to say about their intentions on the workplace parking levy when Aberdeen City Council and Aberdeenshire Council set their budgets recently?

Mike Rumbles: I would be surprised if all our councils in Aberdeenshire had not asked for more arrows for their quivers, because that is what COSLA also does. *[Interruption.]* I am sorry to say so again, but I reiterate that in the chamber our job is to ensure that we pass laws that are right for the entire country. That is what I am trying to do on behalf of the Liberal Democrats.

As I have said, there is real irony around those 20 sections. As we all know—and as Neil Bibby said—the only reason that those 20 new sections are in the bill is the budget deal that the Scottish Greens made with the Scottish National Party. I congratulate the Greens, who have six members in the Scottish Parliament—

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work (Derek Mackay): They do a better job than you.

Mike Rumbles: The Cabinet Secretary for Finance, Economy and Fair Work has just said, from a sedentary position, that the Greens do a better job than the Scottish Liberal Democrats. I point out that we engaged, while SNP members were not interested because they had the Greens' votes.

I give credit where it is due, but I also criticise where it is due. I give credit to the Greens for achieving the deal. However, I find it amazing, because the SNP Administration did not have to do it—that is what surprises me. I am absolutely certain that the Greens would have abstained, so the SNP Government has landed itself with a hugely unpopular form of taxation—it has to be the worst of all in the popularity stakes.

Alison Johnstone (Lothian) (Green): I am truly interested to learn what the Liberal Democrat member will do about the climate emergency—or is his party's current stance simply all about wooing the Conservatives?

Mike Rumbles: As far as I remember, Scottish Liberal Democrats voted for the bill, whereas the Greens did not. *[Interruption.]* We will live with that one.

Presiding Officer, I know that time is short, so I will bring my remarks to a close. As I have said, it is rather ironic that the smart SNP Government has landed itself—

Derek Mackay: Thank you.

Mike Rumbles: I must point out to some members that in saying "smart" I was being ironic. The smart SNP Government and the First Minister have landed themselves with something that they did not need to do and that will not achieve

behavioural change. I believe in achieving such change, but I also believe in doing it in the right way.

Jackie Baillie (Dumbarton) (Lab): I support amendments 1 to 21, in the name of Neil Bibby.

As is the case with any proposed legislation, we need to fully think through the consequences of our actions. In this case, who will bear the cost of the workplace parking levy? It will undoubtedly be either employers or employees. Based on the charge that was levied by Nottingham City Council, the charge here is likely to be of the order of £400 per year for each space. If the charge is borne by employees, we can safely assume that those at senior management level are likely to have that cost rolled into their remuneration package, but the bulk of the workforce—those who are perhaps less well paid—could face that additional £400 cost if they want to park at work. That, quite simply, is a tax on employment.

John Mason: Will the member give way?

Jackie Baillie: In a second.

If the cost is borne by the employer, depending on the volume of spaces available that could mean thousands of pounds of extra costs. I made a freedom of information request to the Government and all its agencies. Between them, they have 37,082 parking spaces; I confess that I have not counted them all personally. Of that number, 10,764 are exclusively for staff, but the remaining spaces could also be used by staff. If we take the smallest possible figure, the lowest possible cost to the Government and its agencies would be £5 million a year. That is the minimum amount that would not be spent on a range of public services, including on transport.

The cost could be significant for employees and employers. The money that local government would gain is not hypothecated to transport; it could be used to shore up other services.

I would find the levy to be much more acceptable if public transport was halfway decent. I could then say to people in my area that the tax is a good thing and that they could get public transport instead, and I would encourage that modal shift. However, in my area the bus service has been stripped away and the train service is so bad—there are delays, cancellations, stop-skipping and short-form trains—that people have shifted back to their cars.

John Mason: Does the member at least accept that in Glasgow and Edinburgh's city centres, where congestion is a problem, the public transport is very good and it is not the ordinary workers who get a parking place but the top people?

Jackie Baillie: I think that John Mason needs to get out more, because I can tell him that the people in my constituency who require to commute do not use the train or bus services, because they are unreliable and they make them late for work; those people get into trouble at work as a consequence.

I highlight to SNP members that local government is cash strapped. The SNP Government, since it came to power, has stripped away £1.5 billion from local government. No wonder local government will grab every opportunity to raise income in order to protect services.

What about people who live in rural areas where public transport is not good? What about shift workers, when public transport simply does not run at night time? I want us to make progress on climate change. I want there to be improvements in public transport, but we need to make those improvements first before imposing a workplace parking levy, which is a flat-rate regressive tax that will hit workers hard. If the Government was honest about it, the levy has more to do with a backroom budget deal with the Greens than it has to do with high principle.

Murdo Fraser: I speak in support of Neil Bibby's amendments 1 to 21, all of which seek to remove references to the workplace parking levy.

The car parking tax emerged from the budget deal between the SNP and the Greens. Although it looks like a Green provision, it now appears that the idea was first put on the table by the SNP's finance secretary. The simple fact is that the car parking tax is a bad idea, because it is a regressive tax, which will likely cost up to £500 a year and will hit the lowest-paid workers the hardest.

The measure simply has not been thought through. There was no economic analysis of the new tax, and there was no consultation with any businesses, other organisations or stakeholders before it was proposed. We have very little detail about how the tax would work in practice—the Federation of Small Businesses has described that as "alarming".

Nottingham City Council introduced a car parking tax at a cost of £400 a year. It is, of course, up to employers whether they pass on the tax to employees. If they do, the charge is likely to be subject to VAT, lifting it up to nearly £500. Councillor Adam McVey, the SNP leader of the City of Edinburgh Council, has already said that he hopes that businesses would pass on that cost to staff. He hopes that that would be the case. Other SNP councils, including Glasgow and Dundee, have expressed interest in implementing it.

The tax would hit the poorest hardest. It is a regressive tax, which would be payable at a flat rate. For those on low wages, whether they are night-shift security workers or those who work in retail, it would represent a substantial hit to their pockets. Those are individuals who, perhaps because of shift patterns, might not have a safe, reliable and affordable public transport alternative, so they have no option but to use their cars; they cannot use a bus or a train to get to work. Those are the very people whom the SNP is planning to hit in their pockets.

18:30

We have heard from the SNP that this is about localism—that it is about giving a new power to local authorities. Who could object to that? However, that argument is fatally undermined by the fact that the scope of the tax has already been restricted by the Scottish Government, because it has deliberately removed NHS workers from that scope—NHS workers, but not workers in other sectors or indeed workers in other parts of the public services or low-paid workers in the private sector.

Councils have not been given discretion to set up the tax as they see fit; their hands have been tied by the Scottish Government. This is nothing to do with localism. We are left with a tax from which NHS workers might be exempt, but which schoolteachers will pay, or for that matter teaching assistants, school support staff and those working in school catering, along with emergency services workers, the police, and those in low-paid private sector jobs, whether in retail, the care sector or in hospitality; they will all be asked to pay.

Every SNP member who votes against these amendments is voting to penalise those people. Anything that they say in the future about social justice or about helping the low paid will ring hollow if they vote against these amendments.

Colin Smyth: I support amendments 1 to 21, which would remove the workplace parking levy from the bill entirely. The workplace parking levy is unpopular; it is regressive; and it was added to the bill only because of a budget deal, which shows that it is more about raising revenue than about reducing emissions. It is a desperate attempt to put a sticking plaster over the gaping wound in local council budgets that has been caused by the Government's cuts.

If the SNP really believes its own rhetoric on the levy—if it really thinks that this is such a good idea—why did it not include the measure in its transport bill in the first place? Did Humza Yousaf, Michael Matheson's predecessor, simply forget to include the measure? Why, when the bill was debated at stage 1, did the SNP MSPs label the

measure as unfair when now, suddenly, they have done a U-turn and are backing it? The SNP should be honest—this was all about votes for its budget and ordinary workers will pay the price for that deal.

We need to tackle transport-related emissions and encourage a modal shift towards greener modes of transport, but the workplace parking levy will not achieve that. Low-emission zones will prevent polluting vehicles from being used in those zones, but a workplace parking levy will simply allow those who can afford it to continue to use those vehicles.

Not one person—not one—who gave evidence on the levy to the REC Committee believed that it would be as effective as LEZs in tackling air pollution and reducing emissions. The levy is regressive; it creates a situation in which a company's chief executive is likely to pay the same as the company cleaner. It is simply unfair. Many of my constituents travel for work from rural areas with poor transport links to cities; under this scheme, they will pay hundreds of pounds to their neighbouring councils, such as Glasgow and Edinburgh, but not a single penny will be spent on improving public transport in the council area where they live. That is why Labour members will stand up for our constituents and vote to remove this unworkable, unwanted, unfair tax on ordinary workers.

Mark McDonald: I have listened carefully to the debate on the issue and I admit to being slightly confused by the arguments that are being deployed. On the one hand, we are told that this is a regressive tax that will hit workers; on the other hand, we are told that councils will not implement the measure because councils in England have not implemented it. On the one hand, we are told that councils are desperate for this power—a point that Mr Rumbles made—and on the other hand, we are told that they will not use it if they are given it.

This is not about whether the workplace parking levy will be introduced in every council area in Scotland; it is about whether every council area in Scotland should have the opportunity and ability to introduce that levy, should it tally with their local circumstances.

I asked Mr Rumbles directly about the positions of Aberdeenshire Council and Aberdeen City Council on this issue when they set their budgets. He obviously did not know, because he said that councils would want to have the power and would want to use it in order to plug the holes in their budgets. He said that Aberdeen City Council would be desperate for the power on the basis that it is one of the lowest-funded authorities in Scotland. However, at the budget meeting, the council leader Douglas Lumsden said that, in his

view, the parking levy was a non-starter. Therefore, at a local level, Aberdeen City Council is taking a decision not to introduce the workplace parking levy.

Mr Rumbles says that all councils will want to introduce a levy to plug holes in their budgets, but that is not borne out in what councils are saying, so that is not a legitimate argument.

Mike Rumbles: Mr McDonald is talking about current council administrations, but we are putting down legislation and laying the law of the land for the future. Any administration, particularly one in the city of Aberdeen, could well be tempted to use the power. As we have heard, many of my constituents in Aberdeenshire would be hit hard by that. Mr McDonald's constituents in the centre of Aberdeen might not necessarily be hit, but my constituents who live in Aberdeenshire would be affected. That is my point.

Mark McDonald: My constituents do not live in the centre of Aberdeen; they live in the suburbs of Aberdeen, and many of them have to travel to work in the centre of Aberdeen and in Aberdeenshire.

It is interesting that Mr Rumbles says that future administrations might decide to introduce a levy. I do not believe that we should give powers only when we agree with what the people who get the powers will do with them. I do not believe that, because an administration may change colour in the future, we should not give the powers in case that future administration takes a decision that we do not like. That is not how democracy or the principle of devolution or empowerment should work, but it is telling that that appears to be how the Liberal Democrats view the principle of empowerment. The Liberal Democrats think that councils can have powers only if they are used in the manner that we agree with, or if councils are of a political persuasion that means that we would agree with the method with which they would use those powers.

Mike Rumbles: Will the member take another intervention?

Mark McDonald: I have taken one intervention from Mr Rumbles, which is probably enough.

Members have spoken about how unpopular the measures are. In considering how to vote on amendments, I am often guided by correspondence from my constituents and what they ask me to do. In relation to the workplace parking levy, which is supposedly the least popular piece of legislation or taxation ever introduced, the amount of correspondence that I have received asking me to vote specifically on the amendments has totalled zero—I have had no letters, emails or phone calls to my office. The idea that the issue is somehow the talk of the steamie is simply not

borne out in the correspondence that my constituents have sent to me in relation to how I vote today.

I will vote to empower local councils to take decisions that meet their local circumstances. I will reject the amendments in the name of Neil Bibby in order to ensure that the provisions on the levy remain part of the bill.

Neil Bibby: Too often, politics seems to exist in a bubble, isolated and out of touch with the real concerns of working people. On days like this, we can see why. The idea that there is a public transport system in place in Scotland that meets the needs of Scotland's workers is laughable, and the idea that the levy will not disadvantage workers on modest incomes is an absurdity. For those who experience transport poverty and who put themselves into debt to own a car because public transport is not good enough, the levy will make it more expensive to get to work.

Members such as John Mason have said that opposition to the levy is elitist. He should tell that to the workers at Tennent's in Duke Street and other workplaces in Glasgow. If he goes to the council schemes in his city or in my region, he will find plenty of cars—sometimes they are owned by people who choose to commute by car, but often they are owned by people who have no choice but to commute by car. If people have to drive to work to support their family, car ownership is not a choice; it is a necessity. They are not the elite. They are the working people and sometimes the working poor of this country and they are being ignored by SNP and Green politicians who collectively claimed £300,000 in public money to cover their motoring expenses in the first two years of this session of Parliament alone. Those people are being ignored by Michael Matheson, who claimed £2,000 in motoring expenses in 2018-19. They are being ignored by ministers who do not use public transport and who have and will continue to have the luxury of being chauffeur-driven to their work.

A number of amendments have been lodged that would create exemptions to the levy, but the proposal is beyond mitigation. It would be better to remove the levy entirely and shift our focus to measures that we know will work. This debate is not the test of the Parliament's will to act on climate change, and the Greens know it, as does everybody else. The test of our will to act is whether we embrace a green new deal, a green industrial revolution and a low-carbon future. Nor is the debate a test of whether the Parliament will fund councils fairly, and the SNP knows that. That will be tested at budget time, when the Parliament can reverse the cuts to Scotland's councils that have been imposed by the SNP Government and the Green Party.

The workplace parking levy proposal is nothing more than a political fix to pass a budget. It is a fix that will hit low-paid workers, and Scottish Labour cannot support it. We believe in making it cheaper and easier to get to work—that was in the manifesto that we stood on. We reject this regressive tax on Scotland's workers. On behalf of Scottish Labour, I press amendment 1.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 1 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Crawford, Bruce (Stirling) (SNP)
 Cunningham, Roseanna (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 54, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 1 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Members might have noticed that we are past the agreed time limit for the debate on this group to finish. For your information, we are running exactly 25 minutes behind schedule. I ask the business managers to consult my colleagues on the business team about how we might want to handle the rest of this evening's business. I used my powers under rule 9.8.4A to allow the debate on group 21 to continue.

Section 58B—Workplace parking places

The Presiding Officer: Group 22 is called "Workplace parking levy: application and exemptions". Amendment 87, in the name of Mike Rumbles, is grouped with amendments 88, 30, 23 to 27, 31 to 35, 94 to 99, 166, 167, 100 to 108, 168, 169, 36, 170, 28, 29 and 37.

Mike Rumbles: It is quite obvious that the workplace parking levy will remain in the bill, as a result of the vote on amendment 1. I thought that that might be the case, so I lodged amendments 87 and 88, the purpose of which is to take business customers out of the workplace parking levy.

I want to do that for several reasons. First, we must go back to the purpose of the bill, which is, as I understand it, to promote behaviour change. We were told that the levy would not apply to customers of businesses. However, section 58B says:

"For the purposes of this Part, a workplace parking place is provided at any premises at any time if a parking place provided at the premises is at that time occupied by a motor vehicle used ... by a worker, agent, supplier, business customer or business visitor of a relevant person".

Later in section 58B, "business customer" is defined. The section says that

"business customer", in relation to a relevant person, means a client or customer".

Regardless of what we heard in committee, the bill says that the workplace parking levy will apply to customers. Any business that provides a parking place that is subject to that local authority tax will have to pay for customers who turn up. That will not change behaviour; it will just give the business added costs.

Mark McDonald: Will the member take an intervention?

Mike Rumbles: I will in a moment.

There is another issue, which I want to explain, for wholesalers and businesses that attend other businesses, such as suppliers. I assume that hitting such businesses with the tax is inadvertent. If it is not, it is clear that the purpose of the workplace parking levy is to raise funds rather than to promote behaviour change, although we are told that it is about behaviour change. Suppliers will be hit by the tax if they have to deliver goods to other businesses—but they cannot do that in any other way; they cannot change that behaviour.

When we look at the matter that way, we see that the purpose of the bill cannot be behaviour change. It has to be something else, so what is it? It is about raising funds.

18:45

I urge members to think about that whether they believe that the workplace parking levy is right or wrong. Rather than adding costs to businesses that are supplying customers, I am trying to make an adjustment that would put that right. We have spotted a problem. Business suppliers and customers approached me to lodge amendment 87. I was happy to do so because this is a real issue and I am trying to make the bill better.

I move amendment 87.

Annie Wells (Glasgow) (Con): I will keep my remarks short in order to try to get some time back. I will speak to amendments 30 to 33, 36 and 37.

Amendments 31 to 33 seek to add to the places of work that should be exempt from the car park tax. I have chosen to focus on establishments that are responsible for provision of social care. Amendment 31 would exempt establishments that provide adult social care, amendment 32 would exempt those that provide adult health care and amendment 33 would exempt residential care establishments.

We must bear it in mind that Scotland has an ageing population and a growing requirement to provide adult social care. Therefore, we should not be putting up barriers that would hinder that provision.

In February of this year, Trisha Hall, who was then national director of the Scottish Association of Social Work, wrote to Derek Mackay and said:

"Public transport may be limited or simply non-existent, and there are many instances where we have to transport people who need or use our services. It is important that we are able to park outside our various workplaces and have immediate access to cars."

Amendments 30, 36 and 37 are technical amendments.

I urge members to vote for my amendments.

The Presiding Officer: I call Liz Smith to speak to amendment 23 and other amendments in the group.

Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Amendment 23 is designed to exempt any and all car park spaces at Scottish educational institutions from the workplace parking levy. As defined within the schedules of the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002, that would include primary and secondary schools, and further and higher education institutions.

The reasons for such exemptions are very clear—£500 a year of a teacher's or lecturer's salary, or of that of a support member of staff, is a not inconsiderable sum for the many staff who do not live close to the school, college or university in which they work. As members well know, teachers' and lecturers' hours are often irregular and frequently involve working unsocial hours, and many teachers need to have a flexible commute and they need the facility to carry large bags, files and teaching resources, which is not always possible on public transport.

We have seen the very strong reaction to the proposals from the education sector, which is why I urge Parliament to support amendment 23.

The Presiding Officer: I call Liam Kerr to speak to amendment 24 and the other amendments in the group.

Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con): Amendments 24 to 27 seek to apply exemptions to the car park tax for our police officers, fire and rescue workers, criminal justice social workers and prison officers. The amendments are about protecting the people who protect us, and ensuring that we do not hit prison, police and fire officers with an extra tax of hundreds of pounds.

In July the Scottish Police Federation wrote to the cabinet secretary stating that the car park tax could risk the safety of police officers because it could force officers, who often start early and finish late, often in remote locations, into using public transport along fixed routes at fixed times, and it could increase the chances of their homes being targeted. They might also have to travel to work in uniform.

John Finnie: Will the member take an intervention?

Liam Kerr: I will not, as we are 20 minutes behind time.

I raised an issue concerning Peterhead prison yesterday in committee. It sits on a cliff at the top of Peterhead on a fairly lonely street which has

lights and traffic. On the other side of the road there is a large expanse of unlit grass that is separated from the first house by a tall hedge. Street lights are some distance apart, and the southbound bus stop, from where the last Aberdeen bus leaves at quarter to ten, did not have a shelter the last time I waited at it.

That is not the sort of exposed and risky situation towards which we should be pushing our prison officers—especially in the context of the significant increases in assaults by prisoners against staff that Audit Scotland warned us about, and especially given that 80 per cent of the vacancies in the entire Scottish Prison Service are at Peterhead. Good luck changing that statistic by imposing a further tax.

Just to be clear, when I asked the chief executive of the SPS yesterday who would pay the charge, he said that the extra £1 million that is required to fund the service's 2,411 spaces could not come from its budget, which Audit Scotland has reminded us has been slashed by 12.5 per cent in the past year.

Gillian Martin (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP): Peterhead prison is in Aberdeenshire. Did Aberdeenshire Council vote to take on the car parking levy?

Liam Kerr: We are talking about the car park tax in the bill, so how could Aberdeenshire council have voted on it already? The member knows full well Aberdeenshire Council's position on the matter.

The important point that people are trying to distract us from—I say to Gillian Martin that it bears restating—is that the extra £1 million that is required to fund the SPS's 2,411 spaces could not come from a budget that Audit Scotland reminded us has been slashed by 12.5 per cent in the past year. Yesterday, the chief executive spoke about that; I will paraphrase his words, because the *Official Report* of the meeting is not yet online. He said that additional funds would have to come in from Government, or the SPS would have to find the resources elsewhere. To my mind, that means the employees.

John Finnie: Mr Kerr will recall that the chief executive also expressed concern about the additional employer pension contributions, and the fact that that will contribute to officers working on the front line until they are 68 years of age, because of something that has been imposed by Mr Kerr's party's UK Government.

Liam Kerr: There is nothing like staying relevant in a debate—and that was nothing like staying relevant in a debate.

I cannot believe that this Parliament, which has agreed to remove national health service workers

from the scope of the car park tax, could think that our brave officers are in some way less deserving. These are people who put their health and wellbeing—and often that of their families—on the line every day, for each and every one of us. When they watch this at home, who will they see standing with them, and who will they see deserting them?

In closing, I will repeat the words of Calum Steele, of the Scottish Police Federation. He said:

“It is difficult to comprehend how any politician could support a proposal that increases risks to the safety and security of police officers. The reality of the threat against police officers is real and ought not to be ignored in such a cavalier manner.”

He also said:

“Who could have imagined the Scottish Parliament would have chosen the increasing of risk of harm to police officers and the public alike would be how it chose to commemorate its 20th anniversary?”

Who, indeed, Presiding Officer? Who, indeed?

The Presiding Officer: I call Graham Simpson to speak to amendment 34 and other amendments in the group.

Graham Simpson: I will speak to amendments 28, 29, 34, 35 and 94.

Amendment 28 would exempt shift workers and night workers from paying a levy. Amendment 34 would exempt any workplace with shift workers and night workers. I will give members an example of why that is the right thing to do.

I used to work for *The Scottish Sun*—*[Interruption.]* Somebody has to. I always worked at night—*[Interruption.]* I worked way later than we will be working tonight—I promise members that. Sometimes, I worked into the wee small hours.

When I first started there, in 1990, we were based in Kinning Park in Glasgow, and we could park in the street outside for free. Anyone who was at work during the day could get the underground or the bus, but people who worked late at night could not do that. The company decided to move into the city centre, with a new printing press off the M8; I will mention that later. The journalists were to work on Queen Street in Glasgow city centre. It is not possible to park there for long, and certainly not for a full shift. As our hours were, to say the least, antisocial, we kicked up a bit of a stink through our union. I was, later, the slightly militant rep of that union. We argued that making night workers go into the city centre was putting us at risk—*[Interruption.]* I am sorry that members are not interested, but what I am saying applies not just to journalists, but to any people who work at night—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Could we please keep the background chatter down?

Graham Simpson: Thank you, Presiding Officer.

We said, and the company eventually accepted, that it should provide us with car parking because public transport, during the hours that we were working, was not an option. They paid for spaces in a private car park for those who needed their cars for their jobs and those who worked unsocial hours. It did not—as John Mason thinks—apply only to the top people. I believe that the option no longer applies for new staff at *The Scottish Sun*, which is a shame.

If you do not live in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee or Aberdeen, public transport is not available after certain times. Being expected not to use a car puts some workers—particularly lone females—at risk, which is an argument that we made strongly.

I mentioned the printing press that is off the M8 at Newhouse, as is the food company, Brakes. It told me:

“As a major employer in Newhouse, based in an out of town location and with a 24 hour operation, Brakes believe the proposal for a Workplace Parking Levy would have a negative impact on our employees and people who work under similar circumstances.”

John Mason: Does Graham Simpson accept that it is largely in city centres that there is a problem, and that city centre councils have said that they will consider the levy, and most others have said that they will not?

Graham Simpson: I definitely do not accept that. The company that I am describing is not based in the city centre. Its employees work unsocial hours and do not have access to public transport, so the levy would have a major effect on its employees.

Brakes also said:

“The lack of public transport infrastructure outside of major conurbations and the ability to provide suitable, safe and regular alternatives to fit with shift patterns to our site (and many like ours) leaves people no option but to drive to work, and imposing a further tax on them would be, in our view, unfair and punitive. We would strongly recommend an exemption for people who work shifts at out of town locations where the public transport infrastructure is inadequate.”

We can look elsewhere; examples do not have to be from my region. Sutherland Brothers, which is based at the airport industrial estate at Wick—which is in Gail Ross’s constituency—told me:

“Being a local, community, family-run wholesaler, operating on low margins and in a highly-competitive wholesale industry, the thought of yet another ‘tax or levy’ on our business, or to our employees, is one that neither we, nor they, can afford. Operating within an industrial estate and with poor public transport, our staff have no alternative but to use their car to commute to work.”

They have no alternative. That is the case

“Even more so where staff commute from areas outside of Wick and travelling in the early hours of the morning or late evenings to get to and from work.”

There is a theme. Both firms make the same point—that it is wrong to impose a tax on companies that are nowhere near transport hubs, be they bus stops or train stations, and that it is wrong to penalise companies whose staff work hours that preclude them from using public transport in any case. Amendments 29 and 35 would cover that point by exempting workplaces that are not near bus stops or train stations—which is a lot of workplaces. If the intention behind the levy is to get people out of their cars, what is done needs to be balanced and fair. For some people, using public transport is not an option, so I urge members to support my amendments.

Amendment 94, which is also in my name, would exempt from the levy any place that is primarily for the use of local authority employees. On reflection, I think that that would go too far, so I will not press it.

The Presiding Officer: I call Donald Cameron to speak to amendment 95 and the other amendments in the group.

Donald Cameron (Highlands and Islands) (Con): I will speak to amendments 95, 96 and 97. The three amendments are self-explanatory and seek exemptions for three specific sectors: air ambulance and rescue service workers, health charity workers and those who work in veterinary services.

I will deal briefly with each in turn.

19:00

Our air ambulance service men and women provide an invaluable service across Scotland, especially in more remote and rural areas, and they often work in extremely dangerous conditions and put their lives at risk. Likewise, those who work in health charities and veterinary services are valuable, hard-working members of society who carry out important work and often possess unique and vital skills.

The purpose behind the amendments is to protect people who work in those sectors. They should not be at risk of a car park tax at their workplace. The Scottish Government has already accepted that workers in the NHS should be exempt. Given that two of the amendments deal directly or indirectly with those who work in the health services, I urge members, for the sake of consistency, to support my amendments.

The Presiding Officer: I appreciate the brevity.

Jeremy Balfour: My amendment 98 seeks to address an omission in the section of the bill on national exemptions. The bill, as amended at stage 2, rightly allows for an exemption for NHS premises, but the issue of independent hospitals remains unresolved. My amendment would add a further provision to exempt premises that are used for employees who work in independent healthcare services.

The key principle is that all healthcare providers should not be burdened, deterred or put in a weaker place simply because of where they work. Whatever our view of independent hospitals is, that is not the issue that is before us. Many independent hospitals provide specialist services and care, and NHS patients can be referred to independent healthcare providers for further care and treatment.

It is worth noting that it is not just consultants and doctors who are employed in those places; nurses, administration staff, cleaners and other low-paid professionals work in them, too, and they should be exempt from paying the tax. They should be able to carry out their roles without financial penalties being imposed on them. I will therefore press my amendment 98.

I will touch on amendment 105. I remind members that I am in receipt of the personal independence payment, although I do not drive a car and do not have a licence.

I urge members to look at amendment 105 afresh and to agree to it. Last year, Jamie Hepburn produced a paper on people with disabilities who are trying to get into employment. My colleague Michelle Ballantyne has already pointed out the large discrepancy in Scotland in respect of the number of disabled people who are trying to get into employment. I welcome what the Scottish Government is doing to try to bring that number down, and I am sure that it has all-party support. Those who, like me, are on PIP or the disability living allowance want to work although they receive that benefit. We hear a lot from the Scottish Government about how it wants to deal with people on benefits with dignity and respect. Voting against amendment 105 would not be treating disabled people with dignity or respect. I urge the Government to think again on that amendment. The Government is penalising those who are disabled and want to go to work.

The Government will tell me that the money will be paid by an employer rather than an employee. Can members imagine an interview situation in which two people go for a job, one of whom has a disability and needs to use a car to get to work and the other does not? Who will be employed? What cost will be saved? The tax will hold disabled people back. It is a tax on disabled people, it is unfair, and I urge members to vote against it.

Colin Smyth: The amendments in the group look to exempt a number of people and groups from the tax. There are strong arguments to be made for each of the exemptions. Ultimately, that illustrates how unfair the workplace parking levy is. Every exemption that is suggested—from the exemption for police officers who need to travel to work by car for safety reasons to those for train drivers who need to take their car to drive the first train of the day and shift workers who have no access to public transport late at night—reveals the flaws in the policy.

My amendment 99 looks to exempt those who drive ultra-low-emission vehicles from paying the levy. Given that the purpose of the scheme is supposed to be to reduce emissions, it beggars belief that those who drive ultra-low-emission vehicles should be subject to paying the levy. That is not only an issue of fairness; in practical terms, exempting ultra-low-emission vehicles would provide a financial incentive to buy them. This really is a test of just how serious the Government is about encouraging that.

My amendment 100 looks to exempt low earners from paying the levy. This is a fundamental issue of fairness. It is a basic principle of fair taxation that the worst-off should not shoulder an unfair burden. As the bill stands, those who can least afford it will pay a higher proportion of their income than the well-off. What is proposed is a fundamentally regressive scheme that will hit the poorest the hardest. If the SNP is determined to force this tax through, the least that we can do is to set an earnings threshold to protect those on the lowest incomes.

Maurice Corry (West Scotland) (Con): In a similar vein to my colleagues, I speak to my amendments 166 and 169 with the intention of exempting certain key groups from the impact that the workplace parking tax would have. Amendment 166 would serve to exempt from the charge those who are employed by the Royal National Lifeboat Institution, while amendment 169 would allow serving members of the armed forces to be similarly exempted.

Amendment 166 centres on the RNLI, which provides crucial maritime rescue and education services in Scotland. RNLI workers operate 24/7 and are prepared to respond to emergencies at any time of the day. That requires them to work irregular and unsocial hours. A workplace parking tax could encourage RNLI members to rely exclusively on public transport, and it would undermine their ability to fulfil their role as efficiently and effectively as possible. The RNLI is a charity and its members should be free from the financial strain of the workplace parking tax.

Amendment 169 centres on serving armed forces personnel. These men and women place

others before themselves in often challenging and dangerous circumstances. To mark their contribution to our safety, serving armed forces personnel should surely be exempt from the parking charge.

With regard to the military bases and other areas of military employment across Scotland, public transport links are not always regular or direct, and in such instances personnel often have to rely on travelling by car in order to fulfil their duty. A workplace parking charge would seem to be an unfair burden in those cases.

Given the nature of their work, members of the RNLI and the armed forces would clearly benefit from exemptions being in place. I urge the Parliament to support my amendments 166 and 169.

The Presiding Officer: I call Jamie Greene to speak to amendment 167 and the other amendments in the group.

Jamie Greene: Thank you, Presiding Officer. I have not had an opportunity to speak on the car park tax yet, and I would like to make some points on it. I thank my colleagues on the seats behind me and across the chamber, who have made some interesting and valid points. I noticed that, while they were speaking to their amendments, there was an awful lot of chitter-chatter going on and a lot of disinterest from the centre of the chamber, and do you know what? I think that that is absolutely shameful, because everything that has been said today is important. We have heard valid arguments from people who are trying to protect people in our country who will be affected by the legislation that the Government wants to pass, and members would do well to listen to some of those arguments.

However, if they do not want to listen to us—and they are perfectly within their rights not to do so—they should listen to others. They should listen to people outside this place—the Scottish Retail Consortium, the FSB, teaching unions, the Scottish Police Federation, motoring organisations and even the Scottish Association of Social Work, which wrote a letter to the Government. I have that letter, which pleaded with the Scottish Government not to support a workplace parking levy. The British Medical Association, Scottish prisons—there are so many organisations, many of which we would not normally support in terms of their message, but which have got the message out there that this is a regressive tax on hard-working public service workers and it should be opposed every step of the way.

Derek Mackay: Will the member take an intervention?

Jamie Greene: I will take an intervention if Mr Mackay will tell the people of Scotland why he wants to tax them for turning up at work.

Derek Mackay: Can the Conservatives not reflect for a moment—and can Jamie Greene answer this question—that all those business representative organisations and others are really concerned about something right now that will affect jobs, employment and the economy, and that is Brexit? Why are we to be deaf to the impact of Brexit, which will impact on our constituents far more than any Conservative scaremongering over an environmental measure?

Jamie Greene: There you have it, Presiding Officer. That is the answer to everything. It is now Brexit's fault that the Scottish Government is introducing a tax on people in Scotland. It is always someone else's fault. When is Mr Mackay going to take responsibility for the actions of his Government? His back-door, dodgy deal with the Greens is the reason why we are having this debate in the first place.

If the WPL is so important to Mr Mackay, where was it at stage 1? It was not even in the bill. It appeared at stage 2.

The committee that was looking at the bill did not have a proper opportunity to take evidence on it. We did not hear from witnesses. They are now coming out of the woodwork after they heard about the policy. We should have done this at stage 1; that is how the Parliament makes good law.

The only parties that support the levy are the Greens and the SNP. Let us sum everything up by considering what John Mason had to say about the tax in the Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee. Let us listen to the words of the SNP and hear what its members think the levy is really all about. John Mason said:

“the levy does not affect poorer people; it affects richer people. It is a tax on the elite.”—[*Official Report, Rural Economy and Connectivity Committee*, 19 June 2019; c 31.]

Mr Mason, if you think the elite are teachers, social care workers, firefighters, RNLI volunteers and people on shift work, what planet are you living on? It is not the same one that we are on.

Not a single amendment came from the Greens and the SNP.

John Mason: Will the member give way?

Jamie Greene: If you want to explain those words, I am happy to give you that opportunity. You are the gift that keeps on giving in this debate.

John Mason: I thank Mr Greene for his kind words.

Mr Greene knows perfectly well that we took evidence that the problems with congestion are in the city centres, where there are few schools, and few social workers and train drivers have parking spaces. In the city centres, including in this building, it is the richer people who have the parking spaces. They are the ones who are being targeted.

Jamie Greene: Your front bench even looks embarrassed at those comments. They are shocking. No wonder you were reported in every national newspaper the day after you said that. It is unbelievable that that is your view of the world. It is unbelievable that you think that the only people who get a parking space are somehow the rich or the elite in the upper echelons. That is a shocking attitude to have towards Scotland's workforce.

John Mason's words demonstrate that any shred of credibility that the SNP had on standing up for social justice in Parliament will go right out of the door when it votes for this to go through. Ditch the tax and ditch it now.

The Presiding Officer: I appreciate that it is getting late and tempers are getting a bit frayed. However, I encourage members not to use the word “you” when speaking about other members.

Michelle Ballantyne: The Department for Work and Pensions and Social Security Scotland have implemented a variety of short-term payments to help people in times of need. The effectiveness of those measures could be seriously undermined by the introduction of a workplace parking levy.

In the first three months of this year, the average crisis grant payment from the Scottish welfare fund was £87. Those applying for the grant do so because they are in urgent need of funding, yet if they are charged for parking under the proposals, those people are far more likely to have to apply for more grants.

The Cabinet Secretary for Social Security and Older People (Shirley-Anne Somerville): Does the member agree that the main reason why people apply to the Scottish welfare fund is that their benefits are not paid in time, and one of the main reasons why we have in-work poverty is because workers' benefits are not sufficient? Perhaps we could tackle that at source rather than attacking a workplace parking levy.

Michelle Ballantyne: What I find really sad about that is, if the cabinet secretary thinks that there is an issue, how will compounding it help? That is the issue.

SNP members are sitting here tonight, intending to vote for something that will be applied to the very people whom you talk about needing to help all the time. We have to look at whether the levy

should have exemptions. You have already decided that NHS staff should have an exemption. I said at stage 2, and I will repeat it today, that I do not understand how you can say that everybody who works for the NHS, including consultants on very large salaries, should be exempt but that those who are in receipt of benefits and trying to improve their lives and get out of poverty through work should have to pay a levy for going to work. That is not fair, however you look at it.

You have voted today that there will be a workplace parking levy, and we are trying to say to you—and I think you should listen—that some people should be exempt. You think the NHS should have an exemption—

The Presiding Officer: Ms Ballantyne, just stop for one second. I appreciate that the member is not trying to be personal, but the term “you” does not apply to any member in this chamber. The only time “you” applies is when members are addressing the chair—it does not apply to other members or parties.

19:15

Michelle Ballantyne: The collective members who represent the SNP and the Greens believe that people who are on benefits and low pay should have to pay to go to work. We are suggesting today that you vote for amendments that would exempt those people, and that you collectively vote—

Members: “You!”

Michelle Ballantyne: I am obviously going to have to practise this—along with everybody in the chamber.

We are suggesting that members on the SNP and Green benches collectively vote to exempt people from those arrangements. [*Interruption.*] I know that you all think that this is terribly funny and you are really enjoying it, but I can tell you that there are a lot of people out there who are not going to find this at all funny.

In the debate on an earlier amendment, I spoke about the impact on people who have disabilities, and my colleague Jeremy Balfour spoke powerfully about that impact. The message that you are going to send today is, “We know it’s tough to get to work when you are disabled, but that is not the issue. We need to get our budget through with the Greens so we’re keeping to our agreement and we’re going to make you pay for that deal.” That is not fair.

Many members on the SNP benches have been incredibly vocal in their opposition to universal credit. The Minister for Children and Young People said that she believes universal credit shows a complete “lack of empathy”; the Cabinet Secretary

for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs described it as “dreadful” and the convener of the Social Security Committee argued that it “punishes” people. I believe that universal credit ensures that those who rejoin the workforce on a part-time basis are not left in difficulties. People can gradually build up their work, and it provides a clear route to help people out of poverty. In those early stages when someone is trying to get back into the workforce and improve their chances, being slapped with a fine for parking at work is not going to help. Amendment 102 would protect UC claimants from the punitive damage that the workplace parking levy would inflict.

I will conclude, because everyone needs to have their say. If Maree Todd is sincere in her empathy, if Fiona Hyslop really is filled with dread and if Bob Doris genuinely does not want to see claimants punished, I ask you to support our amendments, because that is the right thing to do for people who are trying to do the best for themselves and their families.

Sandra White (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Will you make a ruling or give me advice? Michelle Ballantyne never once in the past five minutes spoke to the amendment. She spoke about social security and benefits. I am asking you to rule that she did not speak to the amendment.

The Presiding Officer: I know the point that Ms White makes, but I did feel that Ms Ballantyne spoke to the subject in hand and certainly to the purpose of the amendment.

Pauline McNeill (Glasgow) (Lab): The fact remains that this policy allows a levy to be passed on to workers. If the levy is to be in the bill, that is why we need exemptions. In Nottingham, eight out of 10 employers pass on the levy to the workforce.

The intention of the policy is clear—it is to stop people driving to work. That is the central tenet of the policy, yet what is interesting this afternoon is that not one SNP member will rise to their feet to argue the substance of the policy—not one of them. Linda Fabiani is on record as saying:

“The workplace parking charge is in fact an extra tax on business.”—[*Official Report*, 14 September 2000; c 314.]

There are many others.

The intention is to avoid saying what they are embarrassed about. The people of Scotland will not be happy when they know that the SNP has put this power in a bill and that SNP members support it. The SNP might win the vote tonight, but it will not win the argument on the car parking tax.

I do not know what land John Mason is living in, but it will be decades before we raise the serious levels of cash that are needed to make public transport a choice for many people. I would have

more respect for the SNP if it gave us crossrail, new trams or even a rail link to Glasgow airport. It is a joke that SNP members come to the chamber and say that ordinary working people will have to take the bus or the train—there is no logic in that. According to the *Evening Times*, 88 per cent of people in Glasgow are against the tax. It is clear that there is no popular support for it among ordinary people.

On a serious note, over the summer, I did some work on the issue and spoke to many companies in the west of Scotland. They said that if they paid the charge, it would affect their margins and, for that reason, they would have to pass it on to workers. Notably, a company in Glasgow city centre—John Mason does not seem to realise this, although it might be in his constituency—has three apprentices who would lose their jobs if the company has to pay the charge. Such are the sums of money that companies will have to pay—one will have to pay £68,000.

If SNP members do not care about that, do they care that the policy will impact more on lone parents and women than on anybody else? Helen Martin of the STUC gave evidence at stage 2 and said that the workplace parking tax is a policy that is completely out of touch. Without a shadow of a doubt, it will be low-paid workers who pay the price.

I would have more respect for the policy if the money was to be ring fenced. I tried to intervene on the minister earlier. He said that the money would have to be used for strategies, but not for actual public transport.

Michael Matheson: Will Pauline McNeill give way?

Pauline McNeill: No. The minister did not take an intervention from me when he had the chance.

There is a contradiction with the exemptions—I will let the minister in if he wants to answer this point. Why would there be a—*[Interruption.]* This is a serious point, Mr Matheson. Why is the principle of exemptions in the bill for some workers—I support the exemption for NHS workers—if the minister is not willing to extend it to those mentioned by other members who have risen to their feet? The truth is that the minister wants to wash his hands of the policy; he is not really interested in making the case for it.

I believe that SNP members are embarrassed about the policy, despite their rhetoric. If they vote tonight to put it in the bill, I ask that they at least consider voting for amendments that will mean that people who earn less than the living wage will not have to pay a car parking tax, and that lone parents—or anybody with childcare responsibilities—who need to drop off their kids

before they go to their work will not be affected by such a policy.

Does the SNP really believe in its anti-poverty policies? Let us not forget that the Child Poverty (Scotland) Act 2017, which was supported by members of this Government, has a provision that recognises that lone parents are among the poorest, yet SNP members are going to vote against my amendment that tries to exempt lone parents. Shame on them for doing that!

I have rarely felt as angry as the way that I feel about this Scottish Government policy. If the SNP really cares about its policies, it needs to be serious about public transport improvements and anti-poverty policies. At the very least, if we are stuck with this policy, the SNP needs to put some exemptions in. The people of Scotland will thank it for that, at least.

Michael Matheson: A large number of amendments in this group seek to add further national exemptions to workplace parking licensing schemes. In the available time, I cannot deal with each of those individually, but I want to comment on the general approach.

Some of the proposed exemptions apply to particular premises, some to vehicles and others to people who are in particular circumstances. Local authorities have a wide range of powers to apply local exemptions to premises, persons or motor vehicles. They can vary the charges that are payable under the scheme to different days, different times of day, different parts of the licensing area, different people and different premises. Licensing schemes will be shaped by local needs and local transport objectives, and locally appropriate exemptions will be a key part of that.

Jeremy Balfour: Will Michael Matheson take an intervention?

Michael Matheson: I want to make progress.

Setting substantial and wide-ranging national exemptions, as some members propose today, risks undermining local authorities' ability to develop and implement effective schemes to meet local needs. However, I suspect that that is the intention of some members.

Tonight, Conservative Party members have sought to portray that discretionary power for local authorities as iniquitous and have suggested that it is outrageous that authorities should have such a power. If it is such an appalling and unworthy power for local authorities, why has the Conservative Government in London allowed it to remain on the statute books for local authorities in England and Wales? Is it okay for councils in England and Wales to have the discretionary powers to consider those matters but not for us to

allow Scottish local authorities to have them? The Tories are never keen to give powers to Scotland. I suspect that that is just another example of that attitude from the Conservative Party.

The levy is intended to deal with parking spaces that are used by individuals who are visiting premises to carry out their business. I turn to Mike Rumbles' amendments 87 and 88, which seek to remove parking spaces used by business customers from the definition of liable parking spaces. As I stated, that provision is intended to deal with parking spaces that are used by individuals who visit premises to carry out their business, and not, for example, people who park at a supermarket. It is a charge on the parking space, so the occupier of the premises where it is provided is liable, not the business customer. Therefore, it is not clear why we would want to exempt a parking space at a business that is used by people to carry out business.

Amendments 28, 29 and 37 seek to prevent ministers from specifying that under the licensing scheme, certain people are to be liable for charges. Those amendments seem to proceed on the assumption that people who use workplace parking might be liable for the charge under the scheme. However, it is only providers of workplace parking who are liable for charges. The bill makes no provision for recovery of the charges by the provider.

For the reasons that I have outlined, I urge members to reject all the amendments in the group.

Mike Rumbles: The debate on this group of amendments, which deal with exemptions to the workplace parking levy, has been heated. That is because there are genuine concerns that, when, in a moment, we vote on them, the amendments will not be accepted. The issues that have been raised are not being properly weighed on their merits to improve the bill.

My amendments 87 and 88 are really one amendment. If we do not accept that amendment, it will add costs to businesses. Those businesses will have to pass the costs on to customers. As I said, I have submitted only one amendment, with another consequential to that. The bill is supposed to be about behavioural change. If members do not accept amendments 87 and 88, it is not about behavioural change; it is about adding costs.

Andy Wightman: Will the member take an intervention?

Mike Rumbles: In a moment.

When Liam Kerr spoke to his amendment, Gillian Martin made the point that the current Aberdeenshire Council administration would not impose the workplace parking levy. Of course it

would not. Like Mark McDonald earlier, Ms Martin fails to understand that we are supposed to be making the law of the land for the future and for future administrations. I am being unkind, because I do not think for one minute that Gillian Martin and Mark McDonald do not understand that. I am sure that they know it perfectly well.

Finally, on the points that the minister made just now, I am disappointed with his response to amendments 87 and 88. He said:

"It is a charge on the ... space."

I agree with him; that is the point of the amendments. He is absolutely right, but he is drawing the wrong conclusion. That is my point. The charge is on the space in the business, so what is the business going to do? There is no behavioural change there. The suppliers to that business will still have to bring in their goods; they are not going to change their behaviour. Are the customers going to change their behaviour? They will if the prices go up as a result of the provision, so we will damage our retailers as well. It is just not logical. If the whole point is behavioural change, amendments 87 and 88 need to be accepted.

19:30

The Presiding Officer: Before we move to the votes, because there will be a series of 57 votes, I highlight that we are running late by approximately half an hour. Therefore, under rule 9.8.5A, I am minded to accept a motion without notice to extend the time limit for the debate on groups 22 to 24 by 30 minutes. That means that all subsequent time limits will be extended and, as a consequence, I will delay decision time.

Motion moved,

That, under Rule 9.8.5A, the time limit be moved by 30 minutes.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motion agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: For the information of people in the gallery, because I know that there is a big reception for Dementia Scotland and others, that means that decision time will be moved back by half an hour. The debate on the bill will not finish until at least half past 8, which means that members' business will not finish until later. You might wish to pass that information on to others.

I will move to the votes. The first question is, that amendment 87 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)

Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caitness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 87 disagreed to.

Amendment 88 not moved.

Amendment 2 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 2 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 2 disagreed to.

Section 58C—Power to make and modify schemes

Amendment 89 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 89 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)

Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)

Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 89 disagreed to.

Amendment 3 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 3 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)

Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 3 disagreed to.

Section 58D—Prior consultation and impact assessment

Amendment 162 moved—[Dean Lockhart].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 162 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)

Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)

McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 162 disagreed to.

Amendment 163 moved—[Dean Lockhart].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 163 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)

Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 163 disagreed to.

Amendment 164 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 164 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 164 disagreed to.

Amendment 165 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 165 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)

Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 165 disagreed to.

Amendment 4 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 4 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 4 disagreed to.

Section 58E—Scottish ministers' power to regulate process

Amendment 90 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 5 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 5 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 5 disagreed to.

Section 58F—Local inquiries

Amendment 91 moved—[Michael Matheson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 91 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 82, Against 31, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 91 agreed to.

Amendment 6 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 6 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)

Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)

Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 6 disagreed to.

Section 58G—Licence applications and processes

Amendment 92 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 92 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 106, Against 7, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 92 agreed to.

Amendment 7 moved—[Neil Bibby].

19:45

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 7 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 7 disagreed to.

Section 58H—Content of licences

Amendment 8 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 8 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)

Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse)

(SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 8 disagreed to.

Section 58I—Exemptions etc

Amendment 93 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

Amendment 9 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 9 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 9 disagreed to.

Section 58J—National exemptions

Amendment 30 moved—[Annie Wells].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 30 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)

Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)

Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 30 disagreed to.

Amendment 23 moved—[Liz Smith].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 23 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 23 disagreed to.

Amendment 24 moved—[Liam Kerr].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 24 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 24 disagreed to.

Amendment 25 moved—[Liam Kerr].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 25 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)

Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)

Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 25 disagreed to.

Amendment 26 moved—[Liam Kerr].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 26 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 26 disagreed to.

Amendment 27 moved—[Liam Kerr].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 27 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)

Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)

Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 27 disagreed to.

Amendment 31 moved—[Annie Wells].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 31 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 31 disagreed to.

Amendment 32 moved—[Annie Wells].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 32 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)

Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)

(SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 32 disagreed to.

Amendment 33 moved—[Annie Wells].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 33 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)

Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 33 disagreed to.

Amendment 34 moved—[Graham Simpson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 34 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)

Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 34 disagreed to.

Amendment 35 moved—[Graham Simpson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 35 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 35 disagreed to.

Amendment 94 not moved.

Amendment 95 moved—[Donald Cameron].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 95 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)

Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 95 disagreed to.

Amendment 96 moved—[Donald Cameron].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 96 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)

McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 51, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 96 disagreed to.

Amendment 97 moved—[Donald Cameron].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 97 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

20:00

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 58, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 97 disagreed to.

Amendment 98 moved—[Jeremy Balfour].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 98 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 98 disagreed to.

Amendment 99 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 99 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 99 disagreed to.

Amendment 166 moved—[Maurice Corry].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 166 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)

Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 166 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: I call amendment 167, in the name of Jamie Greene.

Jamie Greene: Members will be delighted to hear that I do not intend to move amendment 167. [Applause.]

Amendment 167 not moved.

Amendment 100 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 100 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 20, Against 90, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 100 disagreed to.

Amendment 101 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 101 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)

Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 101 disagreed to.

Amendment 102 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 102 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 102 disagreed to.

Amendment 103 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 103 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)

Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)

Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 103 disagreed to.

Amendment 104 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 104 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)

Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 104 disagreed to.

Amendment 105 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 105 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)

Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 105 disagreed to.

Amendment 106 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 106 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 106 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Colleagues, I am going to call a short suspension. Despite moving decision time, we have run out of procedural time—or, rather, we have run into a procedural impasse.

I ask all the business managers to come down to the well of the chamber for a discussion, and I ask members not to go too far from the chamber,

as we might need to have a vote before quarter past eight.

20:09

Meeting suspended.

20:24

On resuming—

The Presiding Officer: Colleagues, we have discussed the situation with the business managers and have reluctantly agreed that there is too much business to get through this evening. Members are clearly flagging and other business is waiting, including members' business.

Members: Some members are flagging!

The Presiding Officer: Yes, thank you.

After the discussion with the business managers, with members' agreement, we have agreed to finish the rest of the voting in the group. I think that there are roughly 12 votes left. We will then go to decision time, and there are a number of votes to be taken at decision time. We will then go to members' business, as members have been waiting for that.

We will then have to take the four remaining groups of amendments tomorrow. We will come back with a revised business timetabling motion at 11:40 tomorrow, to allow for the debates and voting on the remaining four groups to happen tomorrow. That will probably have a knock-on effect on decision time tomorrow evening. We hope to be able to trim either the debate or some other items of business tomorrow so that decision time does not have to be moved by a whole hour. There will be a timetable to vote on at 11:40 tomorrow.

To summarise, we will finish the group that we are dealing with now. We will then move to decision time. There will be a revised business programme for members to vote on at 11:40 tomorrow. That will probably mean that there will be a change to decision time tomorrow evening. Are we agreed with that way of proceeding?

Members indicated agreement.

Alex Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

The founding principle of this Parliament when it was formed was that it would be a family-friendly Parliament. The way in which this debate has been organised by the bureau has been anything but family friendly. That is not to mention the great disservice that has been done to Sandra White, her members' business debate, all the people who are here for it, and the cross-party groups.

We are about to go into the final 18 months of the parliamentary session. As those of us who have been around a wee while know, the next 18 months will be full of stage 3s, which will take up a lot of time. I therefore ask the bureau to reflect on what has happened this week and tonight, to make sure that it does not happen again, and that we return to the founding principle of being a family and public-friendly Parliament.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the member for the point of order. He might be interested to know that we have had exactly that discussion in the bureau. We are particularly aware of the fact that this is a family-friendly Parliament. All your business managers are totally committed to the idea of a family-friendly Parliament, and every time that we have had to move decision time, they have debated that. We had a very fraught debate about moving decision time this evening.

Along with Sandra White, I am the sponsor of tonight's event on dementia in Scotland, so I am aware of the effect that this is having on tonight's events, including the other events that are taking place.

Mr Neil is quite right. The Parliament and the business managers are debating this very subject. We are extremely conscious that business is piling up and that there will be a lot of stage 3s in exactly this situation as we go through the next few months. The point is not lost on any of the business managers.

Neil Findlay (Lothian) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: Hang on a second, Mr Findlay.

The subject is on our agenda for the next meeting. It has been on the agenda previously, and we will return to it. I assure Mr Neil that the very sentiment that he has expressed is shared by all the business managers.

Neil Findlay: Presiding Officer, I hear what you are saying. However, you will recall that, when I was business manager for the Labour group, I raised these issues consistently. Every time that I did so, I was outvoted on the bureau. That is the problem.

The Presiding Officer: Mr Findlay raised these matters, and he is not the only business manager to have done so. Normally business managers are not outvoted; we reach a consensual agreement, having noted the points that business managers have made.

This issue is not new. It has been on-going since the Parliament started. We are getting better at dealing with it, but it still comes up as a tricky issue every time that we have a contentious stage 3. The points are well made and noted, and I am

sure that all the business managers will take them on board.

I suggest that we move on and try to get business done, so that we do not keep people waiting any longer.

Amendment 107 is in the name of Pauline McNeill, but I ask Elaine Smith to move it.

Amendment 107 moved—[Elaine Smith].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 107 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)

Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 107 disagreed to.

20:30

Amendment 108 moved—[Elaine Smith].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 108 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)

Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 108 disagreed to.

Amendment 168 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 168 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and
 Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse)
 (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)
 (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 168 disagreed to.

Amendment 169 moved—[Maurice Corry].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 169 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)

Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)
 (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)
 (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and
 Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 169 disagreed to.

Amendment 36 not moved.

Amendment 170 moved—[Michelle Ballantyne].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 170 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)

Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 170 disagreed to.

Amendment 10 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 10 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)

McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 10 disagreed to.

Section 58K—Charges

Amendment 109 moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 109 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)

White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 109, Against 3, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 109 agreed to.

Amendment 28 moved—[Graham Simpson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 28 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 28 disagreed to.

Amendment 29 moved—[Graham Simpson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 29 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 29 disagreed to.

Amendment 37 not moved.

Amendment 11 moved—[Neil Bibby].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 11 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Ballantyne, Michelle (South Scotland) (Con)
 Beamish, Claudia (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Bowman, Bill (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Peter (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Corry, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Davidson, Ruth (Edinburgh Central) (Con)
 Fee, Mary (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Findlay, Neil (Lothian) (Lab)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Iain (East Lothian) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Harris, Alison (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kelly, James (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lamont, Johann (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lindhurst, Gordon (Lothian) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Macdonald, Lewis (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Marra, Jenny (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Mason, Tom (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mitchell, Margaret (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Rumbles, Mike (North East Scotland) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Elaine (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, David (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Tomkins, Adam (Glasgow) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Campbell, Aileen (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Denham, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)

Fabiani, Linda (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Finnie, John (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Freeman, Jeane (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnstone, Alison (Lothian) (Green)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Angus (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Derek (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAlpine, Joan (South Scotland) (SNP)
 McDonald, Mark (Aberdeen Donside) (Ind)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Neil, Alex (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Paterson, Gil (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Gail (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Michael (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Stewart (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Watt, Maureen (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Wheelhouse, Paul (South Scotland) (SNP)
 White, Sandra (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Wightman, Andy (Lothian) (Green)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 50, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 11 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: We will end consideration of amendments there, for this evening. Consideration of amendments to four sections, and the stage 3 debate, will take place tomorrow.

Business Motions

20:38

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): The next item of business is consideration of business motion S5M-19314, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a revised business programme.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business—

Tuesday 29 October 2019

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Ministerial Statement: Promoting the Safe and Appropriate use of Fireworks in Scotland

followed by Scottish Government Debate: Improving Disability Assistance in Scotland

followed by Committee Announcements

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 30 October 2019

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Health and Sport; Communities and Local Government

followed by Culture, Tourism, Europe and External Affairs Committee Debate: Glasgow School of Art Fire

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Thursday 31 October 2019

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

followed by Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Social Security and Older People

followed by Ministerial Statement: The Scottish Greenhouse Gas Emissions Annual Target Report for 2017

followed by Scottish Government Debate: Forestry

Centenary

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

Tuesday 5 November 2019

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

followed by Stage 1 Debate: UEFA European Championship (Scotland) Bill

followed by Committee Announcements

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Wednesday 6 November 2019

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Finance, Economy and Fair Work; Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform

followed by Scottish Government Business

followed by Business Motions

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

Thursday 7 November 2019

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

followed by Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Rural Economy

followed by Stage 1 Debate: Referendums (Scotland) Bill

followed by Financial Resolution: Referendums (Scotland) Bill

followed by Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

(b) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 28 October 2019, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motion agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: The next item is consideration of business motions S5M-19315, on the timetable for the stage 1 debate on the Non-Domestic Rates (Scotland) Bill, S5M-19316, on

the stage 2 timetable for a bill, and S5M-19317, on the stage 1 timetable for a bill.

Motions moved,

That the Parliament agrees, for the purposes of its consideration of the Non-Domestic Rates (Scotland) Bill, under Rule 9.6.3A of the Standing Orders, that the Parliament shall consider the general principles of the Bill on the fourth sitting day after publication of the lead committee report.

That the Parliament agrees that consideration of the Scottish National Investment Bank Bill at stage 2 be completed by 29 November 2019.

That the Parliament agrees that consideration of the Scottish Elections (Reform) Bill at stage 1 be completed by 7 February 2020.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motions agreed to.

Parliamentary Bureau Motions

20:39

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): The next item is consideration of five Parliamentary Bureau motions. I ask Graeme Dey to move S5M-19318, on the office of the clerk, S5M-19319, on the designation of a lead committee, and S5M-19320, S5M-19321 and S5M-19322, on approval of Scottish statutory instruments.

Motions moved,

That the Parliament agrees that the Office of the Clerk be closed on Friday 27, Monday 30 and Tuesday 31 December 2019.

That the Parliament agrees that the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee be designated as the lead committee in consideration of the Animals and Wildlife (Penalties, Protections and Powers) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1.

That the Parliament agrees that the Environmental Protection Act 1990 Amendment (Scotland) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

That the Parliament agrees that the Provision of Early Learning and Childcare (Specified Children) (Scotland) Amendment Order 2019 [draft] be approved.

That the Parliament agrees that the Tenancy Deposit Schemes (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Decision Time

20:39

The Presiding Officer (Ken Macintosh): We move to decision time. I propose putting a single question on the five motions, S5M-19318 to S5M-19322. If any member objects, they should say so now. No member has objected.

The question is, that motions S5M-19318 to S5M-19322, in the name of Graeme Dey, be agreed to.

Motions agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the Office of the Clerk be closed on Friday 27, Monday 30 and Tuesday 31 December 2019.

That the Parliament agrees that the Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee be designated as the lead committee in consideration of the Animals and Wildlife (Penalties, Protections and Powers) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1.

That the Parliament agrees that the Environmental Protection Act 1990 Amendment (Scotland) Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

That the Parliament agrees that the Provision of Early Learning and Childcare (Specified Children) (Scotland) Amendment Order 2019 [draft] be approved.

That the Parliament agrees that the Tenancy Deposit Schemes (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2019 [draft] be approved.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes decision time. I thank members for their forbearance and I apologise to all those who have been inconvenienced, including members of the public who are in the Parliament.

20:40

Meeting suspended.

20:42

On resuming—

Charter of Rights for People with Dementia and their Carers

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Linda Fabiani): The final item of business this evening is a members' business debate on motion S5M-18709, in the name of Sandra White, on the 10th anniversary of the charter of rights for people with dementia and their carers. The debate will be concluded without any question being put.

Motion debated,

That the Parliament notes that October 2019 is the 10th anniversary of the Charter of Rights for People with Dementia and their Carers, which was signed by all political parties in the Parliament; further notes that the Charter introduced a human rights-based approach to health and social care based on the UN PANEL principles; acknowledges that, for the first time in Scotland, the PANEL approach allowed people with dementia and their carers to participate in decisions, have accountability in their care and be empowered to access their rights without stigma; considers that the Charter has ensured that public and private bodies, voluntary organisations and individuals are held responsible for the care and treatment of people with dementia and accountable for the respect, protection and fulfilment of human rights; commends the importance of the Charter in underpinning three national dementia strategies and resulting initiatives working to improve people's lives; applauds the ALLIANCE, Alzheimer Scotland and the University of the West of Scotland for ensuring that the voice of lived experience sets the agenda for the next 10 years; values the efforts made by organisations across Scotland, especially the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman, to use the Charter as a tool for empowerment, raising awareness of rights and improving quality of services; congratulates the Scottish Dementia Working Group, National Dementia Carers Action Network and Dementia Carer Voices for their awareness raising campaigns on the need for person-centred care; recognises that, while much progress has been made over the last 10 years, by 2031 it is projected that there will be approximately between 102,000 to 114,000 people with dementia in Scotland, and therefore welcomes discussions to date to make the Parliament more open, inclusive and dementia-friendly, and believes that dementia is one of the key issues now and in the future for people in Glasgow Kelvin and across Scotland.

20:42

Sandra White (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP): I very much welcome the opportunity to host this members' business debate on the 10th anniversary of the charter of rights for people with dementia and their carers in Scotland.

I will update members on what has happened. We had 40 members of a dementia choir here, who were going to sing, but unfortunately they could not wait for such a long time and have had to leave. I apologise to them and to members.

I see a number of people coming into the gallery now, including Irene Oldfather and Mary Scanlon, which is fantastic. I can now say the bit of my speech in which I acknowledge the people in the gallery who have championed the charter. I also thank members from across Parliament who have signed the motion and supported the debate. I think that Professor Miller and some other people have been here for quite a while, so I thank them very much for their patience in bearing with us. I am sure that Irene Oldfather, Mary Scanlon and others who have been elected members understand that Parliament can be unpredictable. I thank them all for staying on.

The Health and Social Care Alliance Scotland, Alzheimer Scotland and the University of the West of Scotland mark October 2019 as the 10th anniversary of the signing of the charter of rights for people with dementia. There is an event later tonight in the Scottish Parliament, and it will be a great honour for me to speak then, too.

The charter of rights was an initiative of the cross-party group on Alzheimer's and dementia, which was set up and convened by Irene Oldfather when she was a member of the Scottish Parliament. She had had experience of dementia in her family, and the charter was a response to the fact that, at the time, people with dementia and their rights seemed to be invisible. I thank Irene and others for taking up the issue and for championing people with dementia with such dedication and commitment.

In 2009, it was recognised that people who are living with dementia are entitled to enjoy the same human rights as everyone else. Nevertheless, at that time, people with dementia were still being denied their rights because of social and cultural barriers, including lack of understanding in the population about dementia, and lack of staff training on how to respect and protect the human rights of people who are living with dementia.

The charter adopted the United Nations-endorsed PANEL principles: participation, accountability, non-discrimination and equality, empowerment and legality. The approach focuses on people's right to participate in decisions that affect their human rights; accountability of the people who are responsible for respecting, protecting and fulfilling those rights; non-discrimination and equality; empowering people to know their rights and how to claim them; and legality in all decisions, through an explicit link with human rights legal standards in all processes and outcomes. The aim is to uphold the human rights of people living with dementia in the community and in care facilities.

The charter and its rights-based approach have been fundamental in shaping the development of dementia policy and practice since its publication

in 2009. The approach has driven commitments to provide high quality post-diagnostic support, to enhance education and training for health and social care professionals, and to improve care in acute hospitals, all of which are important.

The charter has brought to the fore the voices of people who have lived experience of dementia, or of caring for people with dementia, through the Scottish dementia working group and the national dementia carers action network. All national strategies have been developed in partnership with people with dementia, their carers and a range of organisations and professionals in health and social care.

It is estimated that 90,000 people in Scotland are living with dementia. With our increasing population of older people, that number will continue to grow. Dementia is a difficult condition for the people who live with it and for their families and carers.

I draw members' attention to the Health and Social Care Alliance's dementia carer voices project lead, Tommy Whitelaw, who is also in the gallery. Tommy has been at the forefront of awareness-raising campaigns in Scotland. His mother was diagnosed with vascular dementia and he cared for her for five years until, sadly, she passed away, in 2012. Tommy has continued to use his history to raise much-needed awareness of the charter. The dementia carer voices project has reached more than 170,000 national health service staff, care home staff and students, has secured more than 24,000 pledges from people, and has visited more than 900 locations—I think everyone in Scotland has met Tommy and heard his story. I congratulate him and thank him very much. *[Applause.]*

There is no doubt that Scotland has made much progress since 2009. As a result of the charter of rights, we have in place some of the most progressive dementia policies in the world. We should be proud of that. Since the charter was established, improving dementia care has been a priority of the Government, and it remains a priority.

Progress has been forged through hard work. Effective contributions at every level from practitioners and policy makers have been pivotal in moving us on. The Scottish Government should be recognised for working constructively to make progress: it has introduced three dementia strategies, with a fourth to come.

There has been great progress since a motion on dementia was debated in 2009, but there is always more to be done. For example, I thank the *Evening Times* and *The Herald* for their campaign to highlight the need for free healthcare for people who have advanced dementia. It is a very real

issue that affects people who are very vulnerable. Whether the condition is assessed as being a matter for social care or healthcare is a huge question that the Government is considering at the moment. We know that care can be very expensive—it can be out of the reach of many people and their families. I ask the minister to address the issue when he sums up the debate, and to consider the issue with the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Sport.

20:49

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Con): I thank Sandra White for securing this evening's debate. I welcome the people in the gallery, and I apologise for the late running—although it is great to have everyone here.

As Sandra White has pointed out, about 90,000 people in Scotland are diagnosed with dementia, and the figure will be higher if we take those who have not yet been diagnosed. We have an ageing population, and the condition is likely to affect more people, as time goes on.

I was not here 10 years ago, but as I have read about the subject it has become clear to me that the charter has become a landmark in dementia and in how our treatment of dementia has progressed over the past 10 years. It introduced an approach to health and social care that is based on human rights. That is fundamentally important. It has helped to shape dementia policy in the Scottish Government and the Scottish Parliament and, I hope, within our political parties, as we try to work out how to help people with the condition. The charter has brought the issue of dementia carers to the forefront—it is a condition that affects individuals, but it affects their wider families, as well.

In my speech, I wish to look ahead. Where can we go now and in the next 10 years? I have three quick points to make. First—as Sandra White pointed out in her excellent speech—we have started to see people with dementia and their families as equal members of our community. There is still some social stigma attached to talking about dementia within the family, and some communities still hide it away and do not want to acknowledge it. We have to get to a place where families, individuals and communities can talk about it openly, and where we feel that people with dementia and their families are part of the community. I know that we all want that.

Secondly, we must ensure that people with dementia and their families have active voices and can participate in decision making on the policies not only of the Scottish Government but of local authorities, communities and Parliament. It is

important that we have ambassadors pushing us politicians regarding the decisions that we make.

Thirdly, drawing from my constituents and the people whom I talk with, including my family, I think that we still need to ask whether the workforce is getting the appropriate training to deal with people with dementia. When I talk about the workforce, I use the widest definition—medical intervention, social care or help that is given in nursing homes and other such places. We have to prioritise, so that those who work with families and the people with dementia have the appropriate training. It goes beyond that: training needs to cover people in pharmacies and in various social settings, who need to understand that the language that they use and how they communicate and explain things must be appropriate.

We have come a long way in 10 years, for which we can take collective credit. There is still progress to be made, however, so I hope that the people in the gallery and others can keep pushing us, as politicians, to make the appropriate changes that will make easier the lives of people with dementia and those of their families.

20:54

Tom Arthur (Renfrewshire South) (SNP): I thank my colleague Sandra White for securing the debate, and I join Sandra White and Jeremy Balfour in welcoming our guests to the gallery. I, too, extend my apologies for the fact that we are beginning the debate only now, well past the witching hour for the Parliament.

I intend to make only a few remarks. I thank all those who were involved at the inception of the charter of rights, all those who have worked to deliver on it over the past 10 years and those who are committed to building on it.

I want to centre my remarks on the issue of participation. It is clearly important to have a high-level strategy, but ultimately what matters is the delivery of that strategy and how it changes the circumstances of those on whom such strategies are designed to have an impact. It is about what happens on the ground.

I have witnessed at first hand in my constituency some of the excellent work that has been undertaken to improve the wellbeing of, and opportunities for, those with dementia and those who care for people with dementia. I highlight two groups: dementia friendly Johnstone and dementia friendly Lochwinnoch. Both are relatively new, but they are already blazing a trail across Renfrewshire to improve the lives of people with dementia and their carers.

Earlier today I spoke with Karen McShane, who set up dementia friendly Johnstone. The group is pushing ahead, engaging with Scottish Opera and Scottish Ballet to offer day trips for people with dementia and their carers. The Lochwinnoch group, which has been established for about two years, is also making a profound difference. There are regular tea dances, where I am regularly shown up for not being able to do the slosh. The group also engages in a lot of activities that empower people with dementia and their carers.

Another aspect concerns those with dementia, and those who care for them, who are in employment. My understanding is that around 18 per cent of people under the age of 65 with dementia in the UK continue to work after diagnosis, and 93 per cent of working carers in the UK report that looking after someone with dementia has affected their capacity to work. As a result, I have tried, during my time in Parliament, to be a champion for the Carer Positive initiative, which is a Scottish Government-backed scheme delivered by Carers Scotland. It seeks to recognise and support those employers who have workplace practices that recognise the unique challenges that those who combine working with caring responsibilities face. I have tried to encourage as many employers as possible across my constituency of Renfrewshire South to become Carer Positive employers.

Once again, I urge members on all sides of the chamber to become, if they are not already, Carer Positive employers. I also ask members to engage with businesses and organisations across their constituencies and regions to encourage them to become Carer Positive employers. Let us look forward to the next 10 years of making the charter a reality for people.

20:57

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): I, too, congratulate Sandra White on bringing to the chamber this debate on such an important subject. I welcome former colleagues and campaigners to the public gallery.

The incidence of dementia will increase, because people are living longer and therefore more people are susceptible to developing the condition. That said, proportionally, the number of old people who are developing dementia is falling. Living longer is a good thing—we use life expectancy levels to demonstrate the economic and social wellbeing of our society and to measure our country's progress against that of others. However, dementia care is treated differently from care for those with other health conditions. Care is seldom provided by the NHS, which means that patients often pay for their care in the care sector.

No one is suggesting that care should be delivered in hospital, but there is a disparity between conditions with regard to which aspects of their care a person must pay for. Most people who have dementia want to live and die at home, but that cannot happen without high-quality home care services being available to them. I have constituents who have been moved huge distances from home to enable them to access diagnosis and specialist services. That takes them away from what is familiar, which is really bad for someone with dementia. It also increases the strain on the family, forcing them to leave home for days just to be able to visit, not to mention the associated costs.

When it comes to treatment in our health service, there seems to be a hierarchy of conditions. If someone can be cured, no expense is spared; if they cannot, their experience is altogether different. While the NHS has had its funding protected to a greater extent, local authorities, on which dementia care falls, have faced severe cuts that impact on services.

I have spoken to care workers who specialise in dementia. They believe that, with the right interventions from care workers and the use of modern technology, they can keep people at home, and safe, for much longer. With one client, they used a recording of her daughter's voice telling her mother not to go out when the front door was open at night. Where family are present, they need support too. Unpaid family carers have told me that they are unable to get a night's sleep because their loved one does not settle. They cannot leave them alone, so they have no time to themselves. In turn, they can become ill, which means that two people, rather than just one person, will need intervention. The right support can keep people at home longer, and that will provide them with a better quality of life.

Those who provide paid care for people with advanced disease need to know the person's history. That was once described to me as a shoogly bookcase. The bottom bookshelf has the person's values and early memories and, as they live, they begin to fill the higher bookshelves with their memories and experience. If they develop dementia, it is as if someone is starting to shake the shoogly bookcase. The first books to fall are the ones at the top—the most recently added new and short-term memories. As time goes on, more memories will be lost, the bookcase will shake more, and the contents of the lower shelves will be lost. At that point, a person will regress back to their early values and memories. The knowledge of a person's history helps carers to identify their needs and values at that stage of the condition.

That was explained to me in a story about a woman who was in care and became very

distressed and aggressive when she took part in activities in communal areas of the home. She was happy and placid in her own room, but she got very upset when she mixed socially. It transpired that she was of a generation in which a woman who went out properly dressed would always wear a hat. The home got her a hat, and she then thoroughly enjoyed social activities because she felt that she was properly dressed for the occasion. With regard to her knowledge and values, that was where she was.

That sounds simple, and in some ways it is, but that cannot be done unless people know the person who is being cared for and the care is patient centred. We need to find ways of providing such care so that someone's welfare does not depend on their condition or—worse still—their wealth. A caring society must be able to provide care from the cradle to the grave, regardless of the condition.

21:02

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): I congratulate Sandra White on securing this debate and those in the gallery who have stayed this long.

I note what Jeremy Balfour said about 90,000 people suffering from dementia. However, I want to talk about only one case.

Unfortunately, as we get older, we sometimes see our friends succumbing to dementia. It is a dreadful, slow killer of personality. The first time that I noticed that a friend of mine was behaving slightly differently was when we were listening to jazz. She was semi-detached from it and smiled at all the wrong places. I thought that she was perhaps slightly deaf.

The second time that I noticed that she was behaving slightly differently was when I was having brunch in her house and they tried to make me talk politics against my will. She served up her home-made soup and forgot the cutlery. I did not really think much of that at the time but, gradually, other things happened. One day, when we were on the bus, she turned to me and said, "Christine, I've forgotten where you live."

Dementia ate away at her a bit at a time. The blessing for her was that she was not distressed or aggressive; rather, she became childlike. When she did not remember where I lived, I simply said, "That's okay. I'll take you to it. That's all right." I just took it as it was.

She used to be a wonderful watercolour painter. I have some of her watercolours in my house. One Christmas, a few months before she died, she came to my house, and I said to her, "These are

your paintings." She said, "Are they?" and just smiled.

There was a funny side to it. All her life, she drank only wine. When I offered her husband, who was also a good friend of mine, a whisky, she said, "I'll take one of those, too." It was a great big whisky. Obviously, she had forgotten that she was only a wine drinker. However, that was the only light bit of it.

I did not see the bit when her good husband contained her behaviour in the bungalow and in the back garden, where they used to play tennis on a big lawn that they kept for that purpose. Her husband managed to cover up her behaviour and support her right up until the week before she died. She had to be put in a care home only then, and he found that very difficult.

The other tragedy for that friend of mine was that her mother suffered from dementia, too. Years before, she had said to me, "Christine, I hope what happened to my mother never happens to me." I said, "Och, that'll never happen to you," but there it was. That is one story of one man and one woman and how dementia affected her.

The condition makes some people very aggressive. Recently, I went to a meeting in Midlothian of carers and their partners or husbands or wives who suffer from dementia. I met a woman there who I have known for a long time and who had been involved with me in a political campaign. She did not have the same politics as me, but the campaign was to save a community centre. I did not notice the dementia that was eating away at her at the time—her husband had to tell me that she was suffering. She said to me, "I've got dementia, Christine." She became more and more aggressive as she picked up all the cups and saucers and piled them up while tidying everything up. I could see the aggression building up in her. Her personality had changed in a different way.

In that group, those with dementia were assessed while they were there but, after half an hour, the carers went into a room together, and I sat in with them. Nobody said much, but one woman began to talk about her husband and what she had to do, but she could not continue. Later, I got an email about it, which I will not share with members, because I do not like doing that kind of thing. However, I later saw that woman escorting her husband into the car like a child and taking his hand and I realised that, 24 hours a day, seven days a week, 52 weeks a year, she never has a moment to herself, apart from that little bit of respite.

It is absolutely right that we talk about the numbers, but we really must address the variance in how the condition attacks people. When

someone has nobody to care for them, I do not know how they manage, but we really must support the carers who do that work day in and day out, and often discreetly.

21:07

The Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans (Graeme Dey): I thank the members who remained behind to make their speeches, and particularly Christine Grahame for that moving contribution. I congratulate Sandra White on lodging the motion and on her commitment to the agenda over the past 10 years. As others have done, I acknowledge the patience that those in the public gallery showed in waiting for the debate to take place.

Members have made a number of important points. To pick up on Tom Arthur's point about the Carer Positive initiative, I encourage members to follow his advice on that. I have certainly done what he suggests. I also encourage members to consider a dementia awareness course for them and their staff, which is something else that I did last year. It was certainly eye-opening and helpful for the way in which my office deals with the case load that comes to us relating to dementia. Let us be honest—it is an increasing case load.

More recently, as veterans minister, I visited the Erskine care home in Edinburgh, which is an absolutely wonderful facility that has a particular focus on dementia. In the course of that visit, I was asked to try on the dementia suit. The officials were a bit concerned about the minister doing that, as officials tend to be, but I wanted to try it to see what it was like. That was even more eye-opening. The sheer physical and mental effort to concentrate for a few moments simply to pour a cup of tea or take the top off a jelly carton was exhausting. That really brought home the debilitating nature of dementia and the strain that it must place on people suffering from it, particularly when they are older.

To return to the broad themes of the debate, the development and signing of the charter represent a great coming together of all the parties in the chamber—it has been a cross-party and external stakeholder effort—in recognition of the importance of the agenda and of not only improving care but ensuring the wider social inclusion and civic participation of people with dementia and, we must stress, their carers. In the past 10 years, we have been privileged to benefit from the experience, passion and expertise of people with lived experience of dementia—those with the illness and those who look after them. The Scottish dementia working group is a long-established organisation that has sought tirelessly to bring the experiences of its members, all of whom have dementia, to the development of

national policy to effect changes in the design and delivery of services and support. However far we have come, we owe a lot to that contribution.

The national dementia carers action network and the dementia carer voices project have brought the experiences of carers to the forefront. In more recent years, they have been joined by the TIDE—together in dementia everyday—carers network and DEEP, the dementia engagement and empowerment project. I thank all those groups for their dedication and for giving their time to improve the lives of people with dementia. Without them, we could not develop truly meaningful action on dementia. Although we still have some way to go, there is no doubt that we have made progress.

A wide and growing range of organisations have been influential in supporting and challenging Government and the health boards, and now the integration joint boards, to make improvements in dementia care in accordance with the charter. The list includes Alzheimer Scotland, the Health and Social Care Alliance Scotland, the University of the West of Scotland and a range of academic research, charity and statutory bodies. I also highlight those organisations that are at the forefront of delivering innovation in dementia support, including the award-winning Kirrie Connections in my constituency, which really delivers on the ethos of living well with dementia.

In developing Scotland's first national dementia strategy, we engaged with stakeholders on the human rights principles that are, as they should be, at the core of the charter. That strategy was produced in 2010, and the following year, when we produced the first "Standards of Care for Dementia in Scotland", the charter rights were again crucial in underpinning all the key standards in that document.

The dementia standards still apply. They set out the entitlements for individuals, including the right to a diagnosis; the right to be treated with dignity and respect; the right to access all possible support services that are available; and the right to retain as independent a life as possible as part of the wider community. Kirrie Connections does good work in that respect—as do organisations like it—because it is at the heart of the community. People are not isolated because of their dementia—instead, they are part of the society of that town.

The standards also include the right of people with dementia to have carers who are well supported to carry out their caring role. The human rights principles that are set out in the dementia charter and in the dementia standards have informed all our policy initiatives, including the two national health and social care workforce programmes, our national dementia post-diagnostic service and our work on acute and

specialist NHS dementia care. They have also helped to inform the inspection of services, such as the major Care Inspectorate report, “My life, my care home: The experiences of people living with dementia in care homes in Scotland”, and the work of institutions such as the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman.

Key to all those developments has been an embedding of principles that mean that people with dementia and their carers are central to, and active participants in, decisions that are made on care, treatment and support. That is how it should be. We recognise that dementia is, and will remain, one of our foremost challenges. It is well understood that more people are living longer, and that positive development means that more people will live long enough to develop Alzheimer’s disease.

Our big-ticket policies on dementia—the integration of health and social care, the Carers (Scotland) Act 2016 and now the social care reform programme—are designed to help to address that demographic shift. If we have not got it right all the time—which of course we have not—the intent and the drive are still there to make this happen.

We welcomed the Alzheimer Scotland report, “Delivering Fair Dementia Care For People With Advanced Dementia” earlier this year. To respond to Sandra White’s question, I say on behalf of the cabinet secretary that she is considering the report’s recommendations as part of the social care reform programme. We continue to work with all partners to support the implementation of “Scotland’s National Dementia Strategy 2017-2020”. That includes a commitment to improve referrals to enter dementia post-diagnostic support, as we recognise that the service has not yet reached enough people. We have also extended free personal care, which currently benefits more than 77,000 older and disabled people in Scotland, to those under 65.

The dementia charter of rights has also influenced the suite of carers’ rights that we have established under the 2016 act, including the right of each carer to have a personalised plan to identify what is important to them. As we all know, carers have the right to be listened to in assessing the needs of the cared-for person and in planning for when the person who is looked after comes home from hospital. We still have some way to go in delivering on that, but we are on the right track. Carers have the right to information about support, including through a carer information and advice service in every area. All those rights are summarised in the carers charter.

Earlier this year, we announced a review of mental health legislation in Scotland to improve the rights of, and the protections for, persons—

including those with dementia—who may be subject to the existing provisions of mental health, incapacity or adult support and protection legislation, and to remove barriers to those who are caring for the health and welfare of those individuals. The review is focusing on how the views of people with lived experience can be part of the decision-making process.

Last year, we consulted on a number of changes to the Adults with Incapacity (Scotland) Act 2000, including changes to power of attorney and guardianship orders. We will incorporate ideas for the reform of the law on adult incapacity, including those that come from the review of learning disability and autism, into the findings of the mental health review in order to form an overarching review of mental health and incapacity law.

To build on all our partnership work on dementia, the programme for government says that we will consult on a fourth national dementia strategy next year. It is important that everyone with a locus in this area feeds into that process. As a Government, our commitment to this agenda is strong, as is the commitment of this Parliament, as we have heard tonight. That commitment is shared by every member in the chamber, as has been abundantly clear in this short and very late debate—again, I apologise for the lateness of the debate. I thank members for their contributions, and I thank those in the gallery for their contributions and for their presence here tonight.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes the debate. I thank everyone involved, including our guests in the gallery.

Meeting closed at 21:15.

This is the final edition of the *Official Report* for this meeting. It is part of the Scottish Parliament *Official Report* archive and has been sent for legal deposit.

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers
is available here:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000

Textphone: 0800 092 7100

Email: sp.info@parliament.scot



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba