

Cross-Party Group on Music

26 September, 2023, 6pm

Minute

Present

MSPs

Michelle Thomson (Convenor), Claire Baker, Clare Adamson

Invited guests

Lori Anderson (Culture Counts)

Non-MSP Group Members

Paul MacAlinden (Glasgow Barons), Carol Main (Live Music Now Scotland), Morag Macdonald (Creative Scotland), Trish Strain (EIS), John Wallace (MEPG), Ailsa Macintosh (BBC), Alan Morrison (Creative Scotland), Robert Kilpatrick (SMIA), Oliver Melling (Music Venues Trust), Kenneth Taylor (St Mary's Music School), Alison Reeves (Making Music), Adam Behr (Newcastle University), James Cunningham (HITS), Mae Murray (MEPG), Dominic Parker (BBC SSO), Matt Brennan (University of Glasgow), Jenna Main (ABRSM), Diljeet Bhachu (MU), Raymond Black (Craft Management), Gordon Munro (RCS), Jen O'Brien (Music Broth), Iona Fyfe (MU), David Francis (Traditional Music Forum)

In attendance: Laura Murtagh

Apologies

Lisa Whytock (Active), Donald MacLeod (Hold Fast), Alan Midwinter (Forget Me Notes), Louise Stanners Pow (MU), Gill Maxwell (Scottish Music Centre), Andrew Cruickshank (MU)

1. Matters Arising

Claire Baker asked for a response in Parliament to some concerns over Barnett Consequentials from DCMS's Creative Vision which purportedly would make available £77m for the creative industries. The matter has gone to a supplementary hearing at Westminster with the Treasury and DCMS in disagreement over whether new money is being made available. CB has asked SPICE (the Parliament's Information Service) if it can help to clarify. CB also asked whether funds made available to Arts Council England for

investment in Supporting Grass Roots Venues would also be available for the same purpose in Scotland. The Minister, Christina McKelvie's indicated that this would not be the case.

2. Culture Funding

Lori Anderson, Director of Culture Counts, outlined the pre-Budget scrutiny process being carried out by CEEAC, the Culture Committee, which last year reported on what it described as 'a perfect storm' for culture. This year they were seeking answers for three questions: Where is the sector now; how can the Scottish Government innovate in this area; how can the revised Culture Strategy contribute? Brexit, increases in the cost of living, and post-Covid recovery are making the landscape difficult to negotiate. Attendances have not fully recovered, and the 120 Regularly Funded Organisations have been on standstill since 2018. The government's Constitution, Europe, External Affairs and Culture budget is £347m out of a total budget of £59.7bn, 0.58% (the actual spend on culture is less), one of the lowest in Europe in percentage terms (28th out of 34). The initial call for notes of interest for the next round of Creative Scotland multi-year funding resulted in roughly 500 responses to the value of £113m when the amount available is £33m, not discounting demand from other funding strands. Funding for the National Companies has been flat since 2016, and Local Authorities have suffered a real terms reduction on 40% in the same period.

There are concerns about the viability of some organisations, particularly those with no more slack to cut without compromising current services, when diversification of income streams has not been sufficient and reserves are depleted. Resources do not match ambition.

CEEAC has set a baseline target of 1% of overall budget, i.e. £597m. 1% remains the goal but the current allocation needs to rise by 30% to offset inflation. Multi-year settlements are meant to provide stability and growth, but on current figures it will be for fewer people. Ways to make more money available for culture might include what the Committee called a 'whole systems' approach (cross-portfolio), the Transient Visitor Levy (aka 'tourist tax'), and 1% from the budget of infrastructure projects.

Paul MacAlinden: Do we know how much is spent on the constitution and on external affairs?

LA: £35m

Ray Black: We don't see much wage inflation in the culture sector. There is a shortage of technical staff, HR and IT departments can't pay competitive salaries.

Michelle Thomson: One of the challenges is the macro-economic environment of the UK. We are undergoing the slowest recovery since 2008. Scotland has demographic challenges, and low productivity. Multi-year funding is a hostage to fortune when SG itself doesn't get multi-year funding. As a group we need to think about doing things differently: back to cross-portfolio, whole system working, seeing other people and organisations as allies not competitors for resources. The recent 'Culture in Communities' report from CEEAC suggests that investment

knocks on to cross-portfolio work. There are a couple of potentially useful interventions – a Round Table on whole system working, and a members' debate.

Morag Macdonald: Are there specific areas where links might be made?

MT: The Autumn Statement on November 22, and the Scottish Budget on December 14.

PMacA: There is a place in this cross-portfolio area for working with link workers in NHS surgeries. Is there a data pool which would provide metrics on social return on investment for grassroots cultural activity? (See Appendix 1)

Clare Adamson: It is challenging to get the data.

MT: It is complex, because you're not necessarily comparing like with like. GP surgeries are private businesses and all different.

James Cunningham: That has been the experience in Renfrewshire – problems in compiling robust data on social prescribing.

Action Points: MT to look at Round Table and Members' Debate

3. Low Emission Zones

Donald MacLeod (tabled): With the return of the students most operators in the Night Time Industries Association are optimistic that footfall and takings will improve on the past 12 months. This however is not the case in Glasgow where the implementation of Low Emission Zone has stalled any recovery, eroded consumer confidence, and harmed an already fragile economy. Some recent survey findings from the SHG (Scottish Hospitality Group) makes for very worrying reading (see Appendix 2)

Gavin Stephenson vice-chair of NTIA says the impact of LEZ has been devastating and he points out that Glasgow's night time economy businesses have shrunk by 9% compared to 2% in Edinburgh, and that Glasgow's business closure rate is running at 400% more than Edinburgh's.

In a recent Herald column (see Appendix 2), Stuart Patrick CEO Glasgow Chamber Of Commerce pointed out that Glasgow is still 10% pre-pandemic in terms of footfall and highlighted his concerns about LEZ and indeed the possibility of GCC introducing a congestion charge, a move which would prove ruinous for many businesses, both during the day and at night. Everyone I've spoken to from the various hospitality sectors and trade bodies, is astonished and very angry that GCC could even contemplate such a punitive measure at such a time, especially on the back of LEZ and at a time when the public transport network is still in such a parlous state, and footfall, especially midweek, has fallen off the end of the abyss. I was particularly taken though by a comment from a

well know Scottish promoter who said, “Then West Dunbartonshire could do the same for Glasgow folk going to Loch Lomond, East Renfrew could put a toll on the M8 motorway exit, Braehead too for all those pesky Weegies getting IKEA benefits! Tax on their hot dogs an pickled herring!”

The road to recovery for the city’s beleaguered night time economy, hospitality and live music sector is littered with pot holes and it increasingly looks set to be a long arduous trek. Further bad news was received this week when it was reported that in 2024 Glasgow’s taxi numbers could drop by as much as 600 taxis due to LEZ , all very depressing stuff as this will prove to be a further hammer blow to visitor numbers and in turn the Night Time Economy which already suffers due to a lack of public transport.

MT: How much of the impact has been the effects of Covid still working their way through?

Oliver Melling: There has been a 15.7% shrinkage in venues across the UK between 2022 and 2023. Artists are struggling with what seems to be punitive measures when playing small venues in particular. There is a need for the exemptions to be widened.

MT: We should encourage Glasgow-based members to contact their councillors.

4. Music Education

John Wallace and Mae Murray: MEPG was involved in the collective words and music event that opened the Edinburgh International Festival, a collaboration that saw 354 performers on stage, exemplifying the theme of ‘societal cohesion to societal diversity’. The plan is to make this kind of event a feature of future festivals.

The Scottish Young Musician competition will involve all 32 local authorities this time round. The competition has expanded with schools running their own competitions.

The ‘We Make Music Companion’ shows how music education in Scotland is flourishing. It is being continually updated. The WMM kitemark is being used now by five local authorities, while there are now 14 WMM instrument libraries across Scotland, with a side-effect that some libraries are now becoming de facto music venues.

MT: What steps can people around the table take to help create frameworks for engaging people?

Trish Strain: Free tuition in schools needs to be looked at again.

JW: We know that £12m went to councils in addition to music tuition budgets. Four or five councils are not using that money properly. The matter has been raised with ADES and CoSLA.

JC: We need to start looking at the impact of the spend.

MT: The Verity House Agreement has created new protocols for central and local government, which should result in some changes and more flexibility.

DONM: 13 December at the Scottish Parliament with music and refreshments.

Appendix 1

From Paul MacAlinden

The following reports and case studies evidence the role of arts in healing. Unsurprisingly, music and the arts play a role in this.

From Glasgow City NHS Community Link Workers Annual Report:

"She said that she and Gordon had attended the Alzheimer Scotland 'Come and Sing' group together and had made some new friends."

"He was keen to try new things and the CLW introduced him to a local art project."

"The vast majority of patients (81%) identified mental health and wellbeing issues which they wished to address"

1st source: Melih Caner Inancli

Health Improvement Senior

South Locality Health Improvement Team

Glasgow City Health and Social Care Partnership

Pollok Health Centre

21 Cowglen Rd

Glasgow, G53 6EQ

Email: melihcaner.inancli@ggc.scot.nhs.uk

Mobile: 07811 066027

There have been a number of evaluations re impact of CLW programme and there are also a number of tools used to measure impact including WEMWEBS, experience surveys etc. Link here to summary report re learning from CLW

programmes (UK): [20191014-clw-summary-final-v12.pdf \(ihub.scot\)](#) and link here to Glasgow City HSCP 2022/23 CLW Annual Report

[v2 FINAL draft - Glasgow City CLW Annual Report 22 23.pdf \(hscp.scot\)](#)

My colleague, Melanie McIntosh (melanie.mcintosh@ggc.scot.nhs.uk), is overseeing the implementation of the programme in Glasgow and happy to answer any follow up questions 😊

Kindly,

Melih

Second Source: Phil Donnelly phil.donnelly@alliance-scotland.org.uk

Each quarter we report to the HSCP on things like referrals and engagement, numbers of individuals seen, appointments carried out, re-referrals, waiting times, appointments per person, outcomes of wellbeing and satisfaction surveys, ABIs undertaken as well as provide case studies and report on locality-specific challenges and gaps. Every interaction with each individual referred is captured by the CLPs, but I don't know if the report is shared more widely than the health board.

For nationwide impact it might be worth approaching the Scottish Social Prescribing Network or Scottish Community Link Worker Network.

Appendix 2

From Donald MacLeod:

The recent survey findings from the SHG (Scottish Hospitality Group) makes for very worrying reading:

Glasgow based members across 120 sites

Our latest survey to our Glasgow members showed the following results:

67% said that footfall has dropped after 7pm

63% blamed LEZ and poor transport for the fall in footfall

80% said that poor transport is a major concern for staff members getting to and from work in the city

58% said that LEZ and poor transport was having a major issue on their ability to recruit, with prospective employees choosing to take employment outside the city

47% say trading is worse than pre-pandemic and 29% saying it is roughly the same

64% Disagreed strongly with the Susan Aitken report that footfall in the evenings and weekend is 20% ahead of pre-pandemic

<https://www.insider.co.uk/news/devastating-impact-lez-glasgows-night-30651750>

https://www.heraldscotland.com/business_hq/23784536.glasgow-congestion-charge-hard-swallow/

<https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2023/09/22/snp-lez-will-force-half-of-glasgow-cabs-off-road/>