



# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 4, No. 40, Session 6

Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 29 October 2024

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

**1. Time for Reflection:** Jim Wallace, Rt Hon Lord Wallace of Tankerness KC, led Time for Reflection.

**2. Revision to Business Programme:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (Jamie Hepburn), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-15071— That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 29 October 2024

after

*followed by* Topical Questions (if selected)

insert

*followed by* Ministerial Statement: Legal Advice Relating to Scottish Information Commissioner Decision

delete

5.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

5.30 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 30 October 2024—

delete

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Deputy First Minister Responsibilities, Economy and Gaelic; Finance and Local Government

and insert

2.00 pm Motion of Condolence

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Deputy First Minister Responsibilities, Economy and Gaelic; Finance and Local Government

delete

5.10 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

and insert

5.55 pm Decision Time

(c) Thursday 31 October 2024—

delete

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Net Zero and Energy, and Transport

and insert

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Net Zero and Energy, and Transport

*followed by* Ministerial Statement: Housing (Scotland) Bill

after

*followed by* Finance and Public Administration Committee Debate: Scotland's Commissioner Landscape

insert

*followed by* Legislative Consent Motion: Passenger Railway Services (Public Ownership) Bill

The motion was agreed to.

**3. Topical Questions:** Questions were answered by a Cabinet Secretary and a Minister.

**4. Ministerial Statement:** The First Minister (John Swinney) made a statement and answered questions on Legal Advice Relating to Scottish Information Commissioner Decision.

**5. Fiscal Sustainability:** The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison) moved S6M-15048—That the Parliament recognises that continued and further action is needed to address the sustainability of Scotland's public finances; supports the creation of a five-year Fiscal Sustainable Delivery Plan, to be delivered alongside the forthcoming Medium-Term Financial Strategy; believes

that tackling the social, economic and environmental challenges that Scotland faces is only possible through the delivery of sustainable funding for public services; supports the exploration of all avenues to deliver fiscal sustainability to ensure delivery of the core missions of tackling child poverty and the climate emergency, and agrees that the UK Government's revision of fiscal rules means that it should immediately grant the Scottish Government increased capital, alongside additional borrowing and investment powers, to allow for greater investment to renew and enhance public infrastructure and deliver projects that support the transition to net zero.

Craig Hoy moved amendment S6M-15048.2—

As an amendment to motion S6M-15048 in the name of Shona Robison (Fiscal Sustainability), leave out from “recognises” to end and insert “realises that a significant change of approach is needed to deliver sustainability in Scotland's public finances; recognises that sustained strong economic growth is essential to this; is deeply concerned that the Scottish National Party administration has failed to deliver the growth- and business-friendly policies needed to realise sustained economic growth; notes with alarm the absence of reform and the growing inefficiency of government and its agencies, and the impact that this has on fiscal sustainability; reiterates the need to prioritise productivity and government efficiency, and to keep social security costs and public sector pay under close review; stresses the importance of proper investment and infrastructure development, and calls on the Scottish Government to use its fiscal discretion to ensure that this investment is not jeopardised for any reason.”

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 29, Against 83 (including 2 proxy votes), Abstentions 4).

Daniel Johnson moved amendment S6M-15048.1—

As an amendment to motion S6M-15048 in the name of Shona Robison (Fiscal Sustainability), leave out from “, and agrees” to end and insert “; notes the Scottish Fiscal Commission's Fiscal Sustainability Report and the specific challenges that Scotland will face in the next 50 years, including those posed by an ageing population, and required health spending forecast to increase from 35% to 50% of devolved spending, and calls on the Scottish Government to set out an approach to deal with the long-term fiscal challenges presented by demographic, climate and technological change.”

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 21, Against 95 (including 2 proxy votes), Abstentions 0).

The motion was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 66 (including 2 proxy votes), Against 45, Abstentions 4).

**6. Decision Time:** The Parliament took a decision on item 5 as noted above.

**7. Recognising the Dangers of Artificial Intelligence (AI):** The Parliament debated S6M-13331 in the name of Emma Roddick—That the Parliament recognises what it sees as the fast evolution and potential of artificial intelligence (AI); understands that there have been many warnings from those most closely familiar with AI capabilities who say that the regulation of and limits on AI’s use is required to ensure safety; notes reports that Professor Geoffrey Hinton, known as the “godfather of AI”, has warned of the need for greater social security investment when AI is entrusted with roles currently carried out by salaried humans, and the need to consider the implications and threat to humanity of AI being given military roles and resources; further notes with concern the conclusions of researchers who report that AI is already acting independently in unexpected ways; acknowledges, for example, that a recent study from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) demonstrated AI models beginning to exhibit deception, apparently becoming aware of and adapting to safety assessments of its operation by deceiving assessors and operating differently while under observation, and notes the belief that, in order to effectively regulate the operation of and reach of AI, including in the Highlands and Islands region, policymakers have a duty to seek to understand how it works, what the dangers are, and how to protect society and vulnerable individuals from harm.

The meeting closed at 6.36 pm.

**David McGill**  
Clerk of the Parliament  
29 October 2024

**Appendix**  
**(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)**

**Committee Reports**

The following report was published on 14 October 2024—

Health, Social Care and Sport Committee, 14th Report, 2024 (Session 6):  
Pre-Budget Scrutiny 2025-26 (SP Paper 663)

The following report was published on 21 October 2024—

Criminal Justice Committee, 8th Report, 2024 (Session 6): The Coronavirus  
(Recovery and Reform) (Scotland) Act 2022 (Extension of Temporary Justice  
Measures) Regulations 2024 [draft] (SP Paper 662)

The following report was published on 22 October 2024—

Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee, 13th Report, 2024 (Session 6):  
Report on the Vehicle Emissions Trading Schemes (Amendment) Order 2024  
(draft) (SP Paper 665)

The following report was published on 25 October 2024—

Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee, 14th Report, 2024 (Session 6):  
Report on Environmental Standards Scotland's Investigation into Climate  
Change Delivery (SP Paper 666)

The following report was published on 28 October 2024—

Rural Affairs and Islands Committee, 10th Report, 2024 (Session 6):  
Subordinate legislation considered by the Rural Affairs and Islands Committee  
on 9 October 2024 (SP Paper 667)

The following reports were published on 29 October 2024—

Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, 61st Report, 2024 (Session  
6): Subordinate Legislation considered by the Delegated Powers and Law  
Reform Committee on 29th October 2024 (SP Paper 670)

Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee, 15th Report, 2024 (Session 6):  
Net Zero, Energy and Transport Committee report on the Local Services  
Franchises (Traffic Commissioner Notices and Panels) (Scotland) Regulations  
2024 (SP Paper 671)

**Subordinate Legislation**

**Affirmative Instruments**

The following instrument was re-laid before the Parliament on 22 October 2024 and is subject to the affirmative procedure—

Greenhouse Gas Emissions Trading Scheme (Amendment) (No. 2) Order 2024 [draft]

laid under paragraph 11 of schedule 3 of the Climate Change Act 2008

The following instruments were laid before the Parliament on 28 October 2024 and are subject to the affirmative procedure—

Rural Support (Improvement) (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 [draft]

laid under section 2(3) of the Agriculture (Retained EU Law and Data) (Scotland) Act 2020

Scotland Act 1998 (Transfer of Functions to the Scottish Ministers etc.) Order 2025 [draft]

laid under paragraphs 1 and 2 of Schedule 7 to the Scotland Act 1998

### **Negative Instruments**

The following instrument was laid before the Parliament on 15 October 2024 and is subject to the negative procedure—

Registration of Births, Deaths and Marriages (Scotland) Act 1965 (Prohibition on Disposal of a Body without Authorisation) Amendment Regulations 2024 (SSI 2024/281)

laid under section 27A(7) of the Registration of Births, Deaths and Marriages (Scotland) Act 1965

### **Other Documents**

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 15 October 2024 and is not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Scottish Fiscal Commission Annual Report and Accounts for the year ending 31 March 2024 (SFC/2024/6)** laid under section 12(1) of the Scottish Fiscal Commission Act 2016

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 16 October 2024 and is not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Consumer Scotland Annual Report and Accounts 2023-2024 (CS/2024/02)** laid under Section 22 (5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 18 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**National Galleries of Scotland, Trustees' Annual Report and Financial Statements, For the year ended 31 March 2024 (SG/2024/255)** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

**National Library of Scotland, Annual Report and Financial Statements, For the year ended 31st March 2024 (SG/2024/256)** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

**National Museums Scotland, Annual Report and Accounts, For the year ended 31 March 2024 (SG/2024/254)** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

**Statement Scottish Canals: Fees of Chair and Board Members (SG/2024/262)** laid under paragraph 8 of Schedule 1 to the Transport Act 1962 as amended by Part II of Schedule 2 to the Scotland Act 1998 (Cross-Border Public Authorities) (Adaptation of Functions etc) (No2) Order 2000

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 21 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Appointments to Scottish Land Commission: Statement to Scottish Parliament under section 11(4) of the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2016 – October 2024 (SG/2024/265)** laid under section 11(4) of the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2016

**Historic Environment Scotland Annual Report and Financial Statements 2023-24 (SG/2024/155)** laid under Section 14(3) of Schedule 1 of the Historic Environment Scotland Act 2014

**Industrial Development Act 1982 - Annual Report by The Secretary of State for Business and Trade, the First Minister of Scotland, and the Welsh Ministers, For the year ended 31 March 2024 (SG/2024/185)** laid under Section 15 of the Industrial Development Act 1982

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 23 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Health and Care Professions Council Annual Report and Accounts 2023-24 SG/2024/241** laid under Articles 44(2) and 46(7) of the Health Professions Order 2001

**Health and Care Professions Council Fitness to Practise Annual Report 2023-24 (SG/2024/248)** laid under Article 44(1) of the Health Professions Order 2001

**HMICS Custody Inspection report – Argyll and West Dunbartonshire (HMICS/2024/08)** laid under section 79(3) of the Police and Fire Reform (Scotland) Act 2012

**Scottish Sentencing Council Annual Report 2023-24 (SG/2024/263)** laid under section 13(5) of the Criminal Justice and Licensing (Scotland) Act 2010

**Scottish Public Services Ombudsman: Compendium of Case Reports for October 2024 (SPSO/2024/10)** laid under Sections 15(1) and 15(1A) of the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman Act 2002

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 24 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Engineering Construction Industry Training Board (ECITB) Report of the trustees and accounts for the year ended 31 December 2023 (SG/2024/27)** laid under Section 88 of the Scotland Act 1998

**Scottish Animal Welfare Commission, Annual report of SAWC activity 2023-2024 (SG/2024/253)** laid under Scottish Animal Welfare Commission Regulations 2020

**Scottish Public Services Ombudsman: Annual Report 2023-24 (SPSO/2024/AR)** laid under sections 17(1) and (3) of the Scottish Public Services Ombudsman Act 2002

**Scottish Public Services Ombudsman Annual Report and Financial Statements 2023-24: SG/2024/270** laid under section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 25 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland, Annual Report and Accounts 2023-24, Year Ended 31 March 2024 (SG/2024/252)** laid under Section 10 (3) of the Commissioner for Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2003

**Disclosure Scotland Annual Report and Accounts (SG/2024/247)** laid under sections 20(6) and 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

The following documents were laid before the Parliament on 28 October 2024 and are not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Children's Hearings Scotland Impact Report 2023-2024 (SG/2024/245)** laid under paragraph 21 of schedule 3 of the Children's Hearings (Scotland) Act 2011

**Children's Hearings Scotland - Annual Report and Accounts 2023-24 (SG/2024/244)** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

**Forestry and Land Scotland Annual Report and Accounts 2023-24 (SG/2024/41)** laid under Section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000



**Scottish Human Rights Commission, Annual Report and Financial Statements,  
For the year ended 31 March 2024 (SG/2024/268)** laid under Section 22 (5) of the  
Public Finance and Accountability (Scotland) Act 2000

The following document was laid before the Parliament on 29 October 2024 and is  
not subject to parliamentary procedure—

**Ethical Standards Commissioner Annual Report and Accounts 2023/24  
(SG/2024/267)** laid under section 22(5) of the Public Finance and Accountability  
(Scotland) Act 2000

---

---

Published by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

---

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.parliament.scot/documents](http://www.parliament.scot/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000 or 0800 092 7500

Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)

Live chat on [parliament.scot](http://parliament.scot)

You can write to us in any language or contact us  
using the Text Relay service or in British Sign

Language through [contactScotland-BSL](http://contactScotland-BSL).

---

---

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website -  
[www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by contacting Public Information.