



# The Scottish Parliament Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Parliamentary Year 2, No. 74, Session 6

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 8 February 2023

Note: (DT) signifies a decision taken at Decision Time.

The meeting opened at 2.00 pm.

- 1. Portfolio Questions:** Questions on Covid-19 Recovery and Parliamentary Business, and then on Finance and the Economy, were answered by a Cabinet Secretary and Ministers.
- 2. Ministerial Statement:** The Minister for Transport (Jenny Gilruth) made a statement and answered questions on A9 Dualling Update.
- 3. Addressing the Crisis in NHS Dentistry:** Alex Cole-Hamilton moved S6M-07812—That the Parliament believes that there is a crisis in NHS dentistry; notes that the number of NHS dental check-ups and treatments being conducted are dramatically below pre-COVID-19 pandemic levels; further notes with concern that the number of dentists who are carrying out NHS work has fallen in 11 NHS boards, with the chair of the British Dental Association’s Scottish Dental Practice Committee warning of a “wholesale exodus” from the sector; understands that most dentists are not accepting new NHS patients and that polling has shown that many of those registered have been unable to get appointments; believes that the lack of government action to resolve this is leaving people in pain and will cause wider mouth health issues to be missed, and calls on the Scottish Government to rewrite the NHS Recovery Plan so that it includes dentistry fully and properly recognises the importance of dentists in the course of the recovery, and to urgently reform the funding structures so that dentists can return to taking on NHS activity and enable more patients to be seen.

The Minister for Public Health, Women's Health and Sport (Maree Todd) moved amendment S6M-07812.3—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07812 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Addressing the Crisis in NHS Dentistry), leave out from the first “believes” to end and insert “recognises the impact that the COVID-19 pandemic had on the provision of dental services; thanks all NHS dentists, dental nurses and wider staff for their efforts to provide dental care for the people of Scotland; supports the reform of the NHS dentistry payment system to ensure that the recovery that has been seen in the last year can be built upon; understands that the bridging and multiplier arrangements supported significant increases in activity; notes that, since the start of the pandemic, dentistry has been provided with over £150 million of additional support to sustain the sector; further notes that 95.4% of people in Scotland are registered with a dentist, an increase of 44.3% since 2007; commends the work of the Childsmile programme, which is delivering preventative efforts to improve dental health now and in the future; welcomes the abolition of NHS dental charges for everyone under the age of 26, and supports the removal of all such charges by the end of the current parliamentary session.”

Sandesh Gulhane moved amendment S6M-07812.2—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07812 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Addressing the Crisis in NHS Dentistry), insert at end “; believes that a root and branch reform of dental tariffs is required to ensure that dentists can holistically manage oral health; recognises what it sees as increasingly worrying reports from dentists of poor child oral hygiene, especially in areas with higher deprivation, and a growing requirement for early tooth extractions, and believes that the Scottish Government's lack of a dentistry recovery plan will only exacerbate this growing health inequality.”

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 53, Against 67, Abstentions 0).

Paul Sweeney moved amendment S6M-07812.1—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07812 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Addressing the Crisis in NHS Dentistry), after “Scottish Government to” insert “provide an update to the Parliament on the progress made in delivering on its Oral Health Improvement Plan, which was published over five years ago.”.

After debate, amendment S6M-07812.3 was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 67, Against 53, Abstentions 0). As a result, amendment S6M-07812.1 was pre-empted.

The motion, as amended, was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 65, Against 55, Abstentions 0).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved—

That the Parliament recognises the impact that the COVID-19 pandemic had on the provision of dental services; thanks all NHS dentists, dental nurses and wider staff for their efforts to provide dental care for the people of Scotland; supports the reform of the NHS dentistry payment system to ensure that the recovery that has been seen in the last year can be built upon; understands that the bridging and multiplier arrangements supported significant increases in activity; notes that, since the start of the pandemic, dentistry has been provided with over £150 million of additional support to sustain the sector; further notes that 95.4% of people in Scotland are registered with a dentist, an increase of 44.3% since 2007; commends the work of the Childsmile programme, which is delivering preventative efforts to improve dental health now and in the future; welcomes the abolition of NHS dental charges for everyone under the age of 26, and supports the removal of all such charges by the end of the current parliamentary session.

**4. Investing in the Future of Social Care:** Alex Cole-Hamilton moved S6M-07813—That the Parliament thanks all those who work in the social care sector for their dedication, but believes that they have been undervalued for years; acknowledges that there is a shortage of staff working throughout social care; believes that this shortage is impacting the waiting times of those who require care packages and leading to year-on-year increases in delayed discharges, which the Scottish Government promised to eradicate within a year in 2015, contributing to the crisis in the NHS, and calls on the Scottish Government and its social care partners to reward staff with better pay, conditions and career progression, backed by the introduction of powerful national bargaining beginning in 2023-24, the acceleration of new national standards and entitlements for users, and the abolition of the SNP-Scottish Green Party administration’s plans for a National Care Service, which will not address the problems, will consume considerable staff time, and will cut the funds available for social care.

The Minister for Mental Wellbeing and Social Care (Kevin Stewart) moved amendment S6M-07813.3—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07813 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Investing in the Future of Social Care), leave out from “but” to end and insert “and welcomes that increased funding is being delivered to ensure that all adult social care workers are paid at least the real Living Wage, and notes the desire to go further when possible; recognises that social care recruitment has faced the devastating impact of Brexit and an immovable visa system and immigration system from the UK Government; notes the impact that increased energy costs and high inflation are having on care service operators; supports the creation of the National Care Service to end the postcode lottery of care, help deliver fair work national pay bargaining for the adult social care sector, and ensure ethical commissioning of services as well as better support for unpaid carers; believes that the voices of people with lived experience must be central to the development of the National Care Service, and commends that the National Care Service will be built on local co-design and local delivery of services.”

After debate, the amendment was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 67, Against 53, Abstentions 0). As a result, amendment S6M-07813.2 was pre-empted.

Craig Hoy moved amendment S6M-07813.2—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07813 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Investing in the Future of Social Care), leave out from “, backed” to end and insert “; further calls on the Scottish Government to explain why it took back £331 million from the struggling social care sector, at a time when the sector is urgently calling for more investment; urges the Scottish Government to scrap its plans for a National Care Service, which has been derided by a variety of stakeholders, including unions, local government and Scottish Parliament committees, and calls on the Scottish Government to establish a Local Care Service underpinned by a Local Care Guarantee, which will ensure that people in Scotland are able to access social care in their local area.”

Paul O’Kane moved amendment S6M-07813.1—

As an amendment to motion S6M-07813 in the name of Alex Cole-Hamilton (Investing in the Future of Social Care), insert at end “, and further calls on the Scottish Government to immediately uplift social care pay to £12 per hour with a plan to raise it to £15 per hour and, as recommended in the Feeley Review, remove non-residential care charges.”

After debate, the amendment was disagreed to ((DT) by division: For 21, Against 95, Abstentions 4).

The motion, as amended, was agreed to ((DT) by division: For 67, Against 53, Abstentions 0).

Accordingly, the Parliament resolved—

That the Parliament thanks all those who work in the social care sector for their dedication, and welcomes that increased funding is being delivered to ensure that all adult social care workers are paid at least the real Living Wage, and notes the desire to go further when possible; recognises that social care recruitment has faced the devastating impact of Brexit and an immovable visa system and immigration system from the UK Government; notes the impact that increased energy costs and high inflation are having on care service operators; supports the creation of the National Care Service to end the postcode lottery of care, help deliver fair work national pay bargaining for the adult social care sector, and ensure ethical commissioning of services as well as better support for unpaid carers; believes that the voices of people with lived experience must be central to the development of the National Care Service, and commends that the National Care Service will be built on local co-design and local delivery of services.

**5. Business Programme:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07836—That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business—

Tuesday 21 February 2023

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Topical Questions (if selected)

*followed by* Stage 3 Proceedings: Budget (Scotland) (No. 2) Bill

*followed by* Committee Announcements

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Wednesday 22 February 2023

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Rural Affairs and Islands; Health and Social Care

*followed by* Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party Business

*followed by* Legislative Consent Motion: Shark Fins Bill - UK Legislation

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Approval of SSIs (if required)

5.10 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Thursday 23 February 2023

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

*followed by* Members' Business

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Social Justice, Housing and Local Government

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: Retained EU Law (Revocation and Reform) Bill - UK Legislation

*followed by* Scottish Government Debate: Marking One Year of War in Ukraine

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

Tuesday 28 February 2023

2.00 pm Time for Reflection

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Topical Questions (if selected)

*followed by* Economy and Fair Work Committee Debate: Retail and Town Centres in Scotland

*followed by* Committee Announcements

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Wednesday 1 March 2023

2.00 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.00 pm Portfolio Questions: Constitution, External Affairs and Culture; Justice and Veterans

*followed by* Scottish Government Business

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

*followed by* Approval of SSIs (if required)

5.00 pm Decision Time

*followed by* Members' Business

Thursday 2 March 2023

11.40 am Parliamentary Bureau Motions

11.40 am General Questions

12.00 pm First Minister's Questions

*followed by* Members' Business

2.30 pm Parliamentary Bureau Motions

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions: Education and Skills

*followed by* Scottish Government Business

*followed by* Business Motions

*followed by* Parliamentary Bureau Motions

5.00 pm Decision Time

(b) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 20 February 2023, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.

The motion was agreed to.

**6. Stage 1 Timetable:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07837—That the Parliament agrees that consideration of the Children (Care and Justice) (Scotland) Bill at stage 1 be completed by 23 June 2023.

The motion was agreed to.

**7. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07838—That the Parliament agrees that the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Transfer of Functions of the Council Tax Reduction Review Panel) Regulations 2023 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**8. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07839—That the Parliament agrees that the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland Local Taxation Chamber and Upper Tribunal for Scotland (Composition) Regulations 2023 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**9. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07840—That the Parliament agrees that the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Transfer of Functions of Valuation Appeals Committees) Regulations 2023 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**10. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07841—That the Parliament agrees that the Upper Tribunal for Scotland (Transfer of Valuation for Rating Appeal Functions of the Lands Tribunal for Scotland) Regulations 2023 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**11. Approval of SSI:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07842—That the Parliament agrees that the Community Care (Personal Care and Nursing Care) (Scotland) Amendment Regulations 2023 [draft] be approved.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**12. Committee Meeting Times:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07843—That the Parliament agrees that, under Rule 12.3.3B of Standing Orders, the Public Audit Committee can meet, if necessary, at the same time as Members' Business on Thursday 23 February 2023.

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**13. Parliamentary Recess Dates:** The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam), on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, moved S6M-07844—That the Parliament agrees, further to motion S6M-04616 and under Rule 2.3.1, that the parliamentary recess dates of 1 July to 27 August 2023 (inclusive) be replaced with 1 July to 3 September 2023 (inclusive).

The motion was agreed to (DT).

**14. Decision Time:** The Parliament took decisions on items 3, 4, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12 and 13 as noted above.

**15. Cervical Cancer Prevention Week:** The Parliament debated S6M-07546 in the name of Ruth Maguire — That the Parliament recognises that 23 to 29 January 2023 is Cervical Cancer Prevention Week, which encourages women to reduce their risk of the disease by promoting the steps that they can take to look after their health; understands that cervical cancer is the fourth most common cancer among women globally, with nine new diagnoses and two women losing their lives every day in the UK; is concerned by the reported statistic from Jo's Cervical Cancer Trust that one in three women and people with a cervix do not take up their screening invite; highlights tools such as the HPV vaccination and cervical screening, which

can help screen and prevent, and, it considers, one day end, cervical cancer; notes the support for the global strategy for cervical cancer elimination, which suggests that each country should meet the 90-70-90 targets by 2030; acknowledges that these targets are for 90% of girls to be fully vaccinated with the HPV vaccine by the age of 15, for 70% of women to be screened using a high-performance test by the age of 35, and again by the age of 45, and for 90% of women with pre-cancer to be treated, and 90% of women with invasive cancer to be managed; understands that cervical cancer is preventable and curable, as long as it is detected early and managed effectively, and notes the calls for all women and people with a cervix to attend invitations to screening appointments and vaccinations.

**16. Final Report of the Independent Oversight and Assurance Group on Tayside's Mental Health Services:** The Parliament debated S6M-07514 in the name of Michael Marra — That the Parliament welcomes the publication of the final report from the Independent Oversight and Assurance Group on Tayside's Mental Health Services; understands that the report tracks progress against the 51 recommendations made by Dr David Strang in his report, Trust and Respect; recognises that the group has met with staff, third sector and community groups, patients and families while compiling the report; notes the view that progress has been made, including on changes of leadership and clarifying of roles; believes that the report also highlights key areas where recommendations have not seen sufficient action taken, including in the areas of strategic planning, staff appraisals, governance and public performance reporting; thanks the oversight group and all those who contributed to its work, and notes the calls for reassurances that outstanding recommendations will be enacted.

The meeting closed at 7.27 pm.

**David McGill**  
Clerk of the Parliament  
8 February 2023



## **Appendix**

**(Note: this Appendix does not form part of the Minutes)**

### **Subordinate Legislation**

#### **Affirmative Instruments**

The following instrument was laid before the Parliament on 8 February 2023 and is subject to the affirmative procedure—

Cost of Living (Tenant Protection) (Scotland) Act 2022 (Incidental Provision)  
Regulations 2023 [draft]

laid under section 12(5)(a) of the Cost of Living (Tenant Protection) (Scotland)  
Act 2022

---

---

Published by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

---

All documents are available on  
the Scottish Parliament website at:

[www.parliament.scot/documents](http://www.parliament.scot/documents)

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact  
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000 or 0800 092 7500

Email: [sp.info@parliament.scot](mailto:sp.info@parliament.scot)

Live chat on [parliament.scot](http://parliament.scot)

You can write to us in any language or contact us  
using the Text Relay service or in British Sign  
Language through [contactScotland-BSL](http://contactScotland-BSL).

---

---

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

The Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website -  
[www.parliament.scot](http://www.parliament.scot) or by contacting Public Information.

